



BROWN BEAR LAW
A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORP

Brown Bear Law, APC
818-457-1543
shant@brownbearlaw.com
PO Box 573423
Tarzana, CA 91357

December 1, 2020

Whole Foods Market California Inc.
Whole Foods Market Inc.
550 Bowie St.
Austin, TX 78703

Frontier Cooperative
3021 78th St.
Norway, IA 52318

Frontier Cooperative Herbs
c/o CT Corporation System
818 West Seventh Street, Suite 930
Los Angeles, CA 90017

Amazon.com Services LLC
Amazon.com Inc. c/o Corporation Service
Company
251 Little Falls Drive
Wilmington DE 19808

60-Day Notice of Violation

Sent in Compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

To: Whole Foods Market California Inc., Whole Foods Market Inc., Frontier Cooperative Herbs, Frontier Cooperative, Amazon.com Services LLC, Amazon.com Inc. and the public prosecutors listed on the proof of service attached hereto:

I. INTRODUCTION

Brown Bear Law, APC represents Citizens of California Safety Corp, a California Corporation with an interest in protecting the general public, which includes promoting awareness of exposure to toxic chemicals, reducing exposure to hazardous substances found in consumer products, and the promotion and improvement of human health. This correspondence shall serve as a 60 day notice Whole Foods Market California Inc., Whole Foods Market Inc., Frontier Cooperative Herbs, Frontier Cooperative, Amazon.com Services LLC, Amazon.com Inc., (hereinafter “Violators”) are in violation of the California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq.

Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249 states in relevant part “No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual”

This correspondence serves to provide notification that the Violators and elected prosecutors. Unless, notice is provided that the appropriate public enforcement agencies are diligently prosecuting said violations, Brown Bear Law, APC intends to bring an enforcement action on behalf of Citizens of California Safety Corp sixty days or more after service of said notice.

II. VIOLATIONS

Product Types/Categories: The specific types or categories of products that are causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, include the following:

Product Name	UPC
Simply Organic Thyme	089836186133
Simply Organic Cinnamon	089836185136

The products listed above are products recently purchased and/or are available for purchase for use in California. Although, attempts have been made to diligently search for each and every product offered by the Violators, the list above may not be exhaustive.

Each of the products listed involve exposures to the Proposition 65-listed chemical “lead” through ingestion, and exposure to the skin (dermal) such as touching the product. Lead is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. Lead is hereinafter referred to as the “Listed Chemical”. As a result of the Violators failing to provide reasonable warnings, individuals in California have been exposed to the listed chemical since at least from November 9, 2020 without the proper warning. Thus, California citizens lacked the information necessary to make an informed decision to reduce the risk of the listed chemical from reasonable and foreseeable use.

III. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators’ reference, attached is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" which has been prepared by Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“OEHHA”). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA or visit their website.

IV. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Brown Bear Law, APC, intends to file a private enforcement action pursuant to Proposition 65 on behalf of Citizens of California Safety Corp unless the Violators agree to enter into a binding enforceable written instrument to (1) recall the listed products to avoid continued exposure or undertake diligent efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those who already received such products; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b). In order to avoid costly litigation, if the alleged Violators are interested in resolving this dispute, please feel free to contact counsel Shant Vayvayan,

Brown Bear Law, APC, PO Box 573423, Tarzana, CA 91357, (818)-457-1543, shant@brownbearlaw.com. It should be noted pursuant to Proposition 65 a Private Enforcer cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; or (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement will resolve my claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

V. PRESERVATION OF EVIDENCE

This Notice also serves as a demand that the Notice Recipients preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in the Covered Products; purchase and sales information for Covered Products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to the Covered Products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in Covered Products; and representative exemplars of each specific model falling within the Covered Products. This demand applies to all relevant evidence for Covered Products sold in the State of California, as far back as November 9, 2020, through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

VI. CONTACT INFORMATION

Plaintiff has retained me as legal counsel in this matter. Please direct all communications related to this Notice of Violation to the following:

Shant Vayvayan, Esq.
Brown Bear Law, APC
P.O. Box 573423
Tarzana, CA 91357
shant@brownbearlaw.com

Sincerely,



Shant Vayvayan

cc: California Attorney General's Office; District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose and Los Angeles

Attachments: Certificate of Merit; Proof of Service; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary (Whole Foods Market California Inc., Whole Foods Market Inc., Frontier Cooperative Herbs, Frontier Cooperative, Amazon.com Services LLC, Amazon.com Inc.); and Confidential Information in Support of Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Only)

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT
Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Shant Vayvayan, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.


2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that “reasonable and meritorious case for the private action” means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff’s case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) certain facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: December 1, 2020



Shant Vayvayan

PROOF OF SERVICE BY MAIL - 1013(a)(3) 2015.5 C.C.P.

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

I am a resident of the County aforesaid; I am over the age of eighteen years and not a party to the within entitled action; my business address is P.O. Box 573423, Tarzana CA, 91357.

On **12/1/20**, I served the within documents:

- 1. 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d);**
- 2. PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY (not sent to the public enforcement agencies);**
- 3. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT;**
- 4. CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION IN SUPPORT OF CERTIFICATE OF MERIT (Attorney General Only)**

by placing a true copy thereof enclosed in a sealed envelope with postage for first class mail thereon fully prepaid in Los Angeles, California, in the United States mail addresses attached hereto as **Exhibit A**:

by electronic service through transmission via electronic mail the documents listed above to each addresses attached hereto as Exhibit B:

Additionally, on this date, I uploaded the documents listed above to the California Attorney General via its website:

Office of the California
Attorney General Proposition 65
Enforcement Reporting ATTN:
Prop 65 Coordinator
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000
P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
<http://oag.ca.gov/prop65>

:

I declare under penalty of perjury that under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated: December 1, 2020



Shant Vayvayan

EXHIBIT A

U.S. MAIL SERVICE

Whole Foods Market California Inc. Whole Foods Market Inc. Agent for Service CT Corporation System 818 W 7th St #930 Los Angeles, CA 90017	Frontier Cooperative Herbs c/o CT Corporation System 818 West Seventh Street, Suite 930 Los Angeles, CA 90017	Amazon.com Services LLC Amazon.com Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington DE 19808
Alpine County District Attorney P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012	San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center Redwood City, CA 94063
Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642	Madera County District Attorney 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637	Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001
Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965	Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Suite 145 San Rafael, CA 94903	Sierra County District Attorney P.O. Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936
Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932	Mariposa County District Attorney P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338	Siskiyou County District Attorney 311 4th Street Yreka, CA 96097
Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531	Mendocino County District Attorney P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482	Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533
El Dorado County District Attorney 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667	Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340	Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354
Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721	Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101	Sutter County District Attorney 463 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991
Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988	Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517	Tehama County District Attorney 444 Oak Street, Room L Red Bluff, CA 96080
Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, Fourth Floor Eureka, CA 95501	Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959	Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243	Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701	Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370
Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4th Floor Bakersfield, CA 93301	Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678	Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

<p>Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230</p>	<p>Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971</p>	<p>Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles James K. Hahn City Hall East 200 North Main Street, 8th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012</p>
<p>Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453</p>	<p>San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th Street Hollister, CA 95023</p>	<p>San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502</p>
<p>San Diego County District Attorney 330 W. Broadway Street San Diego, CA 92101</p>	<p>Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113</p>	<p>Frontier Cooperative 3021 78th St. Norway, IA 52318</p>
<p>Whole Foods Market California Inc. Whole Foods Market Inc. 550 Bowie St. Austin, TX 78703</p>		

EXHIBIT B

ELECTRONIC SERVICE

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney Alameda County District Attorney 7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acgov.org	Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org	Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
Allison Haley District Attorney 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559. CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Dr Sonoma, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org
Alethea M. Sargent , Assistant District Attorney 350 Rhode Island Street San Francisco, CA 94103 alethea.sargent@sfgov.org	Jeffrey S. Rosell , District Attorney Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
Yen Dang Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org	Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org	Mark Ankorn, Deputy City Attorney City of San Diego 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org	Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara St. Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org	Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney Sacramento County 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org	Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
Barbara Yook, District Attorney Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road. San Andreas, CA 95249 Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney Inyo County 168 North Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526 inyoda@inyocounty.us	Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney City of San Francisco 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor San Francisco, CA 94102 Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org