

## COVID-19 STATEMENT

Please be advised that the citizen enforcer issuing the enclosed sixty-day notice is taking into consideration the backdrop of the coronavirus that has gripped much of the country and globe alike, while following the process set forth under California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 *et seq.* and its implementing regulations.

We have communicated with the California Attorney General's Office that if it needs a reasonable amount of additional time before deciding whether to exercise its primary jurisdiction under the statute, my client will stand down for a mutually agreeable period. That said, if the parties can reach an out-of-court agreement in furtherance of the public health after the requisite waiting period, and with the required information uploaded to the Department of Justice's website, my client will conclude such negotiations since it will not only provide a substantial benefit to the public, but also avoid the need to involve the judiciary during a time that its resources are stretched.

In sum, my client is neither oblivious nor insensitive to the impact of COVID-19 as it relates to people of all ages especially the most vulnerable. At the same time, our client is continuing on a reduced pace to investigate and, potentially enforce, the right-to-know toxics initiative passed in 1986 by California voters.

Please feel free to contact me directly with any questions regarding the underlying claims in the enclosed document. As always, my client will negotiate financial terms (e.g., civil fines) in good faith after the non-monetary terms such as reformulation have been agreed upon between the parties.



# SIXTY-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION

SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)

**DATE:** February 17, 2021

**TO:** Alibaba Group Holding Ltd – Chief Executive Officer;  
Alibaba Group (U.S.) Inc. – Chief Executive Officer;  
California Attorney General’s Office; and  
District Attorneys and Certain City Attorneys Throughout California

**FROM:** Paul Wozniak

My name is Paul Wozniak. I am a citizen of the State of California acting in furtherance of the public interest. I seek to promote awareness of exposures to certain toxic chemicals in products sold in California and, if possible, to improve human health by reducing hazardous substances contained in such items. This notice is provided to the public agencies listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code §25249.6 *et seq.* (Proposition 65). As noted above, this letter is also being provided to the alleged violator, Alibaba Group Holding Ltd and Alibaba Group (U.S.) Inc., which are persons in the course of doing business in California (Violator). The violations covered by this notice consist of the product exposure, routes of exposure and types of harm potentially resulting from exposure to the hazardous substance identified below (listed chemical), as follows:

Products:	Sauna Suits
Listed Chemical:	di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP)
Routes of Exposure:	Ingestion and Dermal
Types of Harm:	Birth Defects and Other Reproductive Harm

## **I. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATION (CONSUMER PRODUCT EXPOSURE)**

Examples of sauna suits that are causing consumer exposures and potentially occupational exposures, in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this letter, are listed on Exhibit A. All such products covered by this notice shall be referred to hereinafter as the “Products.” Exposures to the listed chemical from the use of the Products have been occurring without the “clear and reasonable warning” required by Proposition 65, dating as far back as February 17, 2018. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical resulting from the use of the Products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the identified toxicant.

California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring, receiving or utilizing the Products, are exposed to the listed chemical. By way of example, consumers, workers and other individuals, including women of childbearing age and men, ingest the listed chemical when they, among other activities, wear or touch the Products and transfer the listed chemical from the Products to their skin or mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after one or more contacts with the Products ceases.

Additionally, consumers, workers and other individuals, including women of childbearing age and men, are exposed to the listed chemical through direct dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle, wear, touch or otherwise use the Products. Further, there are reasonably foreseeable uses of the Products that result in direct ingestion.

The California State Plan for Occupational Safety and Health incorporates the provisions of Proposition 65, as approved by Federal OSHA on June 6, 1997. This approval specifically placed certain conditions with regard to occupational exposures on Proposition 65, including that it does not apply to the conduct of manufacturers occurring outside the State of California so long as they are based in the United States. The approval also provides that a United States employer may use the means of compliance in the general hazard communication requirements to comply with Proposition 65. It also requires that supplemental enforcement be subject to the supervision of the California Occupational Safety and Health Administration.

Any settlement, civil complaint or substantive court orders in this matter must be submitted to the state Attorney General. Additionally, it is important to note that the sale of the Products through online means of transaction must provide the customer with a clear and reasonable warning for the risk of reproductive toxicity pursuant to Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations, including 27 CCR §25600.2(d) if the Violator's role is limited to retailer.

## **II. CONTACT INFORMATION**

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to me through my counsel's office at the following address, email and/or telephone number:

Paul Wozniak  
c/o Clifford A. Chanler  
Chanler, LLC  
72 Huckleberry Hill Road  
New Canaan, CT 06840-3801  
clifford@chanlerllc.com  
Telephone: (203) 594-9246

## **III. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION**

For general information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's (OEHHA) Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900. For the Violator's reference, I have attached a copy of "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary" which has been prepared by OEHHA.

#### **IV. POTENTIAL RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS**

Based on the assertions set forth in this notice, I intend to file a citizen enforcement action against the Violator unless such alleged person in the course of doing business enters into a binding written agreement (and/or upstream party enters into an agreement which would resolve the relevant branded products shipped to the Violator) to: (a) recall Products already sold or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those who have received such Products; (b) provide “clear and reasonable warnings” for Products sold in the future or, preferably, reformulate such Products to eliminate potential exposures to DEHP (or undertake best efforts to ensure upstream entities in the chain of commerce such as manufacturers or exporters do so); and (c) pay an appropriate civil fine, if any, based on the factors enumerated in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b). If the alleged Violator is particularly interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to litigation, please feel free to contact my counsel identified in Section II above. It should be noted that neither my counsel nor I can finalize any settlement until after the statutory sixty-day notice period has expired for any covered products, unless there are voluntary compliance commitments made by the Violator; nor speak for the state Attorney General, any state district attorney or the four city attorneys who received this notice.

#### **V. ADDITIONAL NOTICE INFORMATION**

Certain Products that were recently purchased or observed as being available for purchase or use in California that are covered by this notice are photographed and identified on Exhibits A and B attached hereto. Based on publicly available information and belief, the vendor, supplier, seller, exporter or other person in the course of doing business are also provided on Exhibit A. I allege that the sale of the offending Products has also occurred without the requisite Proposition 65 “clear and reasonable warning” including, but not limited to, transactions made through the internet.<sup>1 2</sup>

The specifically identified examples of the Products that are subject to this notice are for the recipient’s benefit to assist in its investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the listed chemical from other items within the definition of Products. It is important to note that these examples are not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. Further, it is this citizen’s position that the alleged Violator is obligated to continue to conduct in good faith an investigation into other sauna suits described above that may have been manufactured, imported, distributed, sold, shipped, stored, marketed online or within the notice recipient’s control during the relevant period so as to ensure that the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

---

<sup>1</sup> If the manufacturer or supplier of one or more of the specific Products does not have a known agent for process of service in California or employs less than ten employees as defined by the operative regulation, then the online retail seller is alleged to have heightened regulatory responsibilities beyond 27 CCR §25600.2(d) especially if the Violator is also an importer or fulfills additional upstream roles in the commercial marketplace.

<sup>2</sup> In accordance with 27 CCR §25600.2(g), please “promptly” answer the questions on **Exhibit C**, and return with receipt confirmation to Paul Wozniak c/o Clifford Chanler, Chanler, LLC, 72 Huckleberry Hill Road, New Canaan, CT 06840, or via email to [clifford@chanlerllc.com](mailto:clifford@chanlerllc.com), on or before **March 1, 2021**.

## Exhibit A

<i><b>Products</b></i>	<i><b>Supplier/Manufacturer</b></i>
Custom Fitness Sweat PVC Plastic Sauna Suit, As Illustrated in <b>Exhibit B</b> <sup>3</sup>	Nantong Jingu Plastic Product Co., Ltd.
Fitness High Quality Waterproof PVC Sauna Suit Sweat Clothes for Gym Exercise Sauna Suit Weight Loss Bodybuilding, As Illustrated in <b>Exhibit B</b> <sup>3</sup>	Jiangyin SWY Clothes Co., Ltd.
PVC Exercise Sauna Suit, As Illustrated in <b>Exhibit B</b> <sup>3</sup>	Xinyi Yuan Qing Garment Co., Ltd.

---

<sup>3</sup> Exhibit B includes product labels on one or two sides of the products assuming there is any identifying information on the immediate container and/or snapshots of the online marketing sites, some of which may be redacted but in no event is any health hazard warning included in such redaction.

## Exhibit B

Custom Fitness Sweat PVC Plastic Sauna Suit



PVC Exercise Sauna Suit



Fitness High Quality Waterproof PVC Sauna Suit  
Sweat Clothes for Gym Exercise Sauna Suit Weight  
Loss Bodybuilding



## **Exhibit C**

As it relates to *each* of the Products, including those identified on **Exhibit A**, provide the full legal entity name and any known contact information (on or before March 1, 2021) for:

- (a) Any and all manufacturers
- (b) Any and all producers
- (c) Any and all packagers
- (d) Any and all direct vendors
- (e) Any and all exporters
- (f) Any and all shippers, and
- (g) Any and all sellers

Please email the above-requested information to the address provided in Section II. Thank you.



## PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within action. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 72 Huckleberry Hill Road, New Canaan, CT 06840.

On February 17, 2021, I caused to be served the following documents:

**SIXTY-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH  
HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND  
THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986  
(PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY**

XXXX **By First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service representative.

Alibaba Group Holding Ltd  
Chief Executive Officer  
400 South El Camino Real, Suite 400  
San Mateo, CA 94402

**SIXTY-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH  
HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); AND  
CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

XXXX **By Federal Express** I deposited in a box inside of the FedEx Office Print & Ship Center located at 464 Main Avenue, Norwalk, CT 06851, maintained by Federal Express, an express carrier service, for collection and overnight mailing, a true and correct copy of the foregoing documents, in a sealed envelope designated by said express service carrier addressed to each interested party as set forth below, with delivery fees paid or provided for.

CT Corporation System  
Attn: Agent for Service of Process  
For Alibaba Group (U.S.) Inc.  
818 Seventh Street, Suite 930  
Los Angeles, CA 90017

XXXX **By Electronic Mail** by sending true and correct copies of the above documents to the electronic notification addresses on the attached "Email Service List" and email courtesy copy to counsel:

Carey Ramos, Esq., Quinn Emanuel, careyramos@quinnemanuel.com

**SIXTY-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH  
HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND  
CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS**

XXXX **By Electronic Upload** by causing true and correct copies of the above documents to be uploaded to the California Attorney General's website at the web address on the attached "Electronic Upload Service List."

Executed on February 17, 2021, in New Canaan, Connecticut.



---

Lorent Guimaraes

# CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Clifford A. Chanler, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice has violated Health and Safety Code §25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings;
2. I am the attorney for the noticing party;
3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the *alleged* exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action and/or the listed chemical in substantially similar products and exposes individuals through the same potential routes;
4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that “reasonable and meritorious case for the private action” means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff’s case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged Violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute;
5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate under Health and Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2) including (i) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (ii) certain facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: February 17, 2021



---

Clifford A. Chanler

# EMAIL SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Michael Atwell  
Alpine County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 248  
Markleeville, CA 96120  
daoffice@alpinecountyca.gov

The Honorable Todd Riebe  
Amador County District Attorney  
708 Court Street  
Jackson, CA 95642  
amadorda@amadorgov.org

The Honorable Michael Ramsey  
Butte County District Attorney  
25 County Center Drive, Suite 245  
Oroville, CA 95965  
DA@ButteCounty.net

Michelle Latimer  
Lassen County Program Coordinator  
220 S. Lassen Street  
Susanville, CA 96130  
mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

The Honorable David Hollister  
Plumas County District Attorney  
520 Main Street, Room 404  
Quincy, CA 95971  
davidhollister@countyofplumas.com

The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp  
Fresno County District Attorney  
2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000  
Fresno, CA 93721  
damail@fresnocountyca.gov

The Honorable Maggie Fleming  
Humboldt County District Attorney  
825 5th Street, Fourth Floor  
Eureka, CA 95501  
districtattorney@co.humboldt.ca.us

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney  
Alameda County  
7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650  
Oakland, CA 94621  
CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Allison Haley, District Attorney  
Napa County  
1127 First Street, Suite C  
Napa, CA 94559  
CEPD@countyofnapa.org

The Honorable Phillip J. Cline  
Tulare County District Attorney  
221 South Mooney Boulevard  
Visalia, CA 93291-4593  
Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar  
San Joaquin County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 990  
222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202  
Stockton, CA 95201  
DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

The Honorable Clifford Newell  
Nevada County District Attorney  
201 Commercial Street  
Nevada City, CA 95959  
DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us

The Honorable Donna Daly  
Trinity County District Attorney  
P.O. Box 310  
11 Court Street  
Weaverville, CA 96093  
trinityjournal@dcacable.net

The Honorable Jackie Lacey  
Los Angeles County District Attorney  
211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200  
Los Angeles, CA 90012  
info@da.lacounty.gov

The Honorable Sally O. Moreno  
Madera County District Attorney  
209 West Yosemite Avenue  
Madera, CA 93637  
Sally.Moreno@co.madera.ca.gov

The Honorable Thomas Hardy  
Inyo County District Attorney  
P.O. Box Drawer D  
Independence, CA 93526  
inyoda@inyocounty.us

Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney  
Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco  
1390 Market Street, 7th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatt.org

The Honorable C. David Eyster  
Mendocino County District Attorney  
100 North State Street, Room G-10  
P.O. Box 1000  
Ukiah, CA 95482  
enviroh@mendocinocounty.org

The Honorable Kimberly Lewis  
Merced County District Attorney  
550 West Main Street  
Merced, CA 95340  
Prop65@countyofmerced.com

The Honorable Samuel D. Kylo  
Modoc County District Attorney  
204 South Court Street, Suite 202  
Alturas, CA 96101  
da@co.modoc.ca.us

The Honorable Tim Kendall  
Mono County District Attorney  
278 Main Street  
P.O. Box 617  
Bridgeport, CA 93517  
districtattorney@mono.ca.gov

The Honorable Jeannine M. Pacioni  
Monterey County District Attorney  
1200 Aguajito Road  
Monterey, CA 93940  
Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

The Honorable Jill R. Ravitch  
Sonoma County District Attorney  
600 Administration Drive  
Sonoma, CA 95403  
jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney  
Office of the City Attorney, San Diego  
1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620  
San Diego, CA 92101  
CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney  
Yolo County  
301 Second Street  
Woodland, CA 95695  
cfejd@yolocounty.org

The Honorable Jason Anderson  
San Bernardino County District Attorney  
303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor  
San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502  
da@sbcda.org

Alethea Sargent, Assistant District Attorney  
San Francisco District Attorney's Office  
350 Rhode Island Street N. Bldg., 400N  
San Francisco, CA 94103  
Alethea.sargent@sfgov.org

The Honorable Laura L. Krieg  
Tuolumne County District Attorney  
423 North Washington Street  
Sonora, CA 95370  
da@tuolumnecounty.ca.gov

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney  
Contra Costa County  
900 Ward Street  
Martinez, CA 94553  
sgrassini@contracostada.org

The Honorable Susan J. Krones  
Lake County District Attorney  
255 North Forbes Street  
Lakeport, CA 95453  
Susan.Krones@lakecountyca.gov

The Honorable Jeffrey S. Rosell  
Santa Cruz County District Attorney  
701 Ocean Street, Room 200  
Santa Cruz, CA 95060  
Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

The Honorable Summer Stephan  
San Diego County District Attorney  
330 West Broadway Street  
San Diego, CA 92101  
SanDiegoDAProp65@sdccda.org

The Honorable Sandra Groven  
Sierra County District Attorney  
100 Courthouse Square, Room B1  
P.O. Box 457  
Downieville, CA 95936  
sgroven@sierracounty.ca.gov

The Honorable Walter Wall  
Mariposa County District Attorney  
5085 Bullion Street  
P.O. Box 730  
Mariposa, CA 95338  
mcda@mariposacounty.org

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney  
Santa Barbara County  
1112 Santa Barbara St.  
Santa Barbara, CA 93101  
DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

The Honorable Barbara Yook  
Calaveras County District Attorney  
891 Mountain Ranch Rd.  
San Andreas, CA 95249  
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney  
Riverside County  
3072 Orange Street  
Riverside, CA 92501  
Prop65@rivcoda.org

The Honorable Cynthia Zimmer  
Kern County District Attorney  
1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4th Floor  
Bakersfield, CA 93301  
caomailbox@kerncounty.com

The Honorable Gregory D. Totten  
Ventura County District Attorney  
800 South Victoria Avenue, Suite 314  
Ventura, CA 93009  
daspecialops@ventura.org

The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert  
Sacramento County District Attorney  
901 G Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Prop65@sacda.org

The Honorable Morgan Briggs Gire  
Placer County District Attorney  
10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240  
Roseville, CA 95678  
Prop65@placer.ca.gov

The Honorable Richard Doyle  
Office of the City Attorney, San Jose  
200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor  
San Jose, CA 95113  
cao.main@sanjoseca.gov

The Honorable James Kirk Andrus  
Siskiyou County District Attorney  
311 4th Street  
Yreka, CA 96097  
da@siskiyouda.org

The Honorable Krishna A. Abrams  
Solano County District Attorney  
675 Texas Street, Suite 4500  
Fairfield, CA 94533  
SolanoDA@solanocounty.com

Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney  
Santa Clara County  
70 West Hedding Street  
San Jose, CA 95110  
EPU@da.sccgov.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney  
San Luis Obispo County  
County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor  
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408  
edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

The Honorable Susan Alcalá Wood  
Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento  
915 I Street, 4th Floor  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
clerk@cityofsacramento.org

# **ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST**

Office of the California Attorney General  
Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting  
ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator  
P.O. Box 70550  
Oakland, CA 94612-0550  
<https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice>