

**VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL  
INTERNATIONAL**

Current Chief Executive Officer or President  
Conservas De Cambados SL  
Lg de Porto, s / n - Barrantes  
36636 | Ribadumia (Pontevedra)  
Spain

**VIA ELECTRONIC FILING**

State of California Department of Justice  
  
Office of Attorney General of California  
Filing link: [oag.ca.gov/prop65](http://oag.ca.gov/prop65)

Current Chief Executive Officer or President  
Conservas De Cambados, S.L  
Rúa do Porto Nº 4 - Barrantes  
36636 Ribadumia (Pontevedra)  
Spain

**VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL**

District Attorneys of California Counties  
and City Attorneys, as in the Certificate of  
Service

CA L'Espinaler, S.L.  
Progrés, 47 Pol. Ind. Els Garrofers  
08340 Vilassar De Mar (Barcelona)  
Spain

**VIA E-MAIL**

District Attorneys of California Counties  
and City Attorneys, as in the Certificate of  
Service

Conservas Hijos De Ramón Peña, SL  
Polígono Industrial do Salnés, Rúa Grenla, 6  
36636 Ribadumia- Pontevedra  
Spain

Conservas La Brujula S.L.  
Pol. Ind. Do Salnes.CL Central 6.  
36636 Barrantes (Ribadumia)  
Spain

**VIA CERTIFIED FIRST CLASS MAIL**

Matt Caputo or Current Chief Executive  
Officer or President  
Tony Caputo's Market & Deli  
314 West 300 South  
Salt Lake City, UT

Matt Caputo or Current Chief Executive  
Officer or President  
Tony Caputo's Market & Deli  
314 West 300 South  
Salt Lake City, UT

Matt Caputo or Current Chief Executive  
Officer or President  
Tony Caputo's Market & Deli  
1516 S. 1500 E.  
Salt Lake City, UT

801-486-6615

Matt Caputo or Current Chief Executive  
Officer or President  
Tony Caputo's Market & Deli  
c/o Tony or Matt Caputo  
3684 East Kaibab Cir  
Salt Lake City, UT 84109

Matt Caputo or Current Chief Executive  
Officer or President  
Tony Caputo's Market & Deli  
4670 Holladay Village Plaza Unit 101,  
Holladay, UT

RE: Lead and Tony Caputo's Market & Deli, Conservas de Cambados, CA L'Espinaler, S.L.,  
 lead Conservas Hijos De Ramón Peña, SL, and Conservas La Brujula S.L.'s products  
 compounds  
 in

August 11, 2021

## 60-DAY NOTICE OF INTENT TO SUE

*for violations of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986*

Dear alleged violators and public enforcement agencies,

Poulsen Law P.C. represents The Chemical Toxin Working Group, Inc., a California non-profit corporation, doing business as Healthy Living Foundation Inc. (“HLF,” “Noticing Party”), a non-profit consumer health organization engaged in supporting public health, implementing measures reducing the amount of chemical toxins in consumer products, improvement of worker and consumer safety from chemical exposures, as well as publishing comparative results of testing foods and consumer products and educating public.

HLF has enforced a large number of Cal. Health & Safety Code violations in the public interest and developed an extensive expertise in prosecuting manufacturers and distributors of food and consumer products for violations of health laws and consumer safety. These cases have resulted in significant public benefit, including reformulation of products to remove toxic chemicals to make them safer, and putting label warnings on products tested as contaminated with lead, cadmium, acrylamide, dioxane, or removing them from the California market.

HLF’s Chief Officer David Steinman is a journalist, a publisher and an author of a bestseller *Diet For A Poisoned Planet* (Crown ed., 1990, Ballantine 2d ed., 1992, Running Press 3d ed., 2007); his major books also include *The Safe Shopper’s Bible* (Macmillan ed., 1995, Wiley 2d ed., 2000), *The Breast Cancer Prevention Program* (Macmillan ed., 1997), *Living Healthy In A Toxic World* (Perseus ed., 1996), *Safe Trip To Eden: Ten Steps To Save The Planet Earth From The Global Warming Meltdown* (Running Press ed., 2007), along with many publications in periodicals and other media.

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, codified in the California Health & Safety Code sections 25249.5, et seq. (“Proposition 65”), requires that a 60-day notice of intent to sue be provided to a violator of Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6.

With this notice of violation (Notice), HLF gives a written notice of the alleged violation, bringing this action in the public interest as defined under the Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d), seeking to prosecute the alleged continuing noncompliance and to warn consumers about their exposure to the violative chemical(s), or reduce and/or eliminate consumer exposures from product(s) (collectively, the “Specified Products” and each a “Specified Product”) listed in the table below, which are manufactured, distributed and/or sold by Conservas de Cambados, CA L'Espinaler, S.L., Conservas Hijos De Ramón Peña, SL, Conservas La Brujula S.L., and Tony Caputo's Market & Deli (referred to collectively as the “Noticed Parties”).

This Notice covers the violations of Proposition 65 that are currently known to the Noticing Party from information now available as specifically related to the violating products listed below and manufactured, distributed or/and sold by and through the Noticed Parties. HLF is continuing its investigation that may reveal further violations.

The Specified Product(s) subject to this Notice, the chemical(s) in the Specified Product(s) identified as exceeding allowable levels, and the Noticed Parties responsible for sales of the Specified Products, are as follows:

<b>Specified Products</b>	<b>Violative chemical</b>	<b>Noticed Party</b>
<p>Conservas de Cambados mussels from Galicia in Marinade, including but not limited to:</p> <p>Conservas de Cambados mussels from Galicia in Marinade, SKU: 8413610701335, King size 6/8</p>	Lead and lead compounds	Conservas de Cambados, and Tony Caputo's Market & Deli
<p>Espinaler Mussels in marinade, including but not limited to:</p> <p>Espinaler Mussels in marinade, SKU: 8427230995791</p>	Lead and lead compounds	CA L'Espinaler, S.L. and Tony Caputo's Market & Deli
<p>Espinaler Mussels in pickled sauce, including but not limited to:</p> <p>Espinaler Mussels in pickled sauce, SKU: 8427230012719</p>	Lead and lead compounds	CA L'Espinaler, S.L. and Tony Caputo's Market & Deli
<p>Ramon Pena Mussels in Pickled Sauce, including but not limited to:</p> <p>Ramon Pena Mussels in Pickled Sauce, SKU: 8426441162053</p>	Lead and lead compounds	Conservas Hijos De Ramón Peña, SL, Conservas La Brujula S.L., and Tony Caputo's Market & Deli

The primary route of exposure has been through ingestion.

Noticed Parties have manufactured, marketed, distributed and/or sold the Specified Products which, according to the test results, have exposed and continue to expose consumers within the State of California to lead.

Lead and lead compounds ("lead") is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause developmental toxicity, reproductive toxicity and cancer. Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 requires that a "clear and reasonable" warning be provided prior to exposure to chemicals listed under Proposition 65. The Noticed Parties are in violation of Proposition 65 because the Noticed Parties have failed to provide a warning to consumers that they are being exposed to lead. While in the course of doing business, the Noticed Parties are knowingly and intentionally exposing consumers to lead without first providing a "clear and reasonable" warning.

The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product's label. See Cal. Code Regs. tit. 27, § 25602, subd. (a)(3), and subd. (b) for internet purchases also at the point of sale, as applicable. The Noticed Parties have not provided any Proposition 65 warnings as required by law or any other appropriate warnings that persons handling, ingesting and/or otherwise using the Specified Products are being exposed to lead.

With respect to each Specified Product listed above, the violation commenced on the latter of the date that the Specified Product was first offered for sale in California or the date upon which California law codified the allowable level of the relevant chemical; has continued every day since the relevant date the violation commenced; and will continue every day henceforth until lead is removed from each Specified Product, reduced to allowable levels, or until a "clear and reasonable" warning is provided to consumers by the Noticed Parties, as applicable, in accordance with the law.

Pursuant to Title 27, C.C.R. § 25903(b), copies of the following documents are attached hereto for reference by the Notices Parties:

(i) "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary."

Pursuant to Title 11, C.C.R. § 3100, the "Certificate of Merit" is attached hereto.

HLF intends to file a lawsuit after 60 days based on the facts set forth in this Notice. Meanwhile we encourage a prompt resolution of this matter within the said period of 60 days where the Noticed Parties agree in a written agreement to (1) eliminate or reduce lead to an allowable level in the Specified Products or, as an alternative, (2) provide a Proposition 65-compliant warning on the label of the Specified Products and at the point of sale; and (3) pay applicable civil penalties and costs of bringing this action.

Prompt action of the Noticed Parties on this Notice will prevent further consumer exposures to a dangerous chemical without warning, therefore rectifying these alleged ongoing violations of the California law and afford the Noticed Parties the opportunity to avoid increasing costs associated with noncompliance and costly litigation.

Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to this office.

Sincerely,



Peter T. Sato, Esq. | CA

P o u l s e n l a w P.C.

282 11th Avenue, Suite 2612  
New York, New York, 10001  
Tel: + 1 646 776 5999  
Tel: +1 626 888 1906 Direct  
[ps@poulsenlaw.org](mailto:ps@poulsenlaw.org)  
[www.poulsenlaw.org](http://www.poulsenlaw.org)

## ATTACHMENTS

1. Certificate of Merit;
2. Confidential Factual Information supporting Certificate of Merit (to Attorney General only);
3. Certificate of Service;
4. Appendix “A” - “The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary” (to the Noticed Parties only);



To: California Attorney General  
 Notice of Violation: August 11, 2021  
 Noticing Party: Chemical Toxin Working Group Inc. dba Healthy Living Foundation Inc.  
 Noticed Parties: Conservas de Cambados, CA L'Espinaler, S.L., Conservas Hijos De Ramón Peña, SL, Conservas La Brujula S.L., and Tony Caputo's Market & Deli

August 11, 2021

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**  
**Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)**

*To the Notice of Violation*

I, Peter T. Sato, attorney at law, hereby declare:

This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

I am the attorney for the Noticing Party.

I have reviewed the facts of this case and have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience and expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, and/or other data regarding the alleged exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the attached Notice of Violation dated August 11, 2021 (the "Notice").

I have reviewed the laboratory testing results for the chemical subject to the Notice and rely on these results. The testing was conducted by a reputable accredited testing laboratory and by experienced scientists with doctoral and other degrees in relevant sciences. The facts, studies and other data derived through this investigation overwhelmingly demonstrate that the alleged violators have exposed persons to the listed chemical that is the subject of the Notice and is known to the State of California to cause reproductive and/or developmental harm, and/or cancer.

Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: August 11, 2021

NOTICE OF VIOLATION/CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE  
 CONSERVAS DE CAMBADOS, CA L'ESPINALER, S.L., CONSERVAS HIJOS DE RAMÓN  
 PEÑA, SL, CONSERVAS LA BRUJULA S.L., AND TONY CAPUTO'S MARKET & DELI

[www.PoulsenLaw.org](http://www.PoulsenLaw.org)

282 11<sup>th</sup> Avenue, #2612, New York, NY 10001



+1 (646) 776 5999

[contact@PoulsenLaw.org](mailto:contact@PoulsenLaw.org)

By:

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Peter T. Sato', with a long horizontal line extending to the right.

Peter T. Sato | CA

P o u l s e n l a w P.C.

282 11th Avenue, Suite 2612  
New York, New York, 10001  
Tel: + 1 646 776 5999  
Tel: +1 626 888 1906 Direct  
[ps@poulsenlaw.org](mailto:ps@poulsenlaw.org)  
[www.poulsenlaw.org](http://www.poulsenlaw.org)





I, Lucas Zahn, am over the age of eighteen years and am not a party to the action, process or case related to or arising out of the Notice of Violation being served under this Certificate of Service. My address is 1142 Hartzell Street, Pacific Palisades, CA 90272.

On August 11, 2021, between 11:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Time, I served the following documents:

1. Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq. by Conservas de Cambados, CA L'Espinaler, S.L., Conservas Hijos De Ramón Peña, SL, Conservas La Brujula S.L., and Tony Caputo's Market & Deli;
2. Certificate of Merit;
3. Appendix "A" - "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary;"

on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties below, and causing it to be deposited at a United States Postal Service Office in Los Angeles County, California, for delivery by **First Class Mail International**:

Current Chief Executive Officer or President Conservas De Cambados SL Lg de Porto, s / n - Barrantes 36636   Ribadumia (Pontevedra) Spain	Current Chief Executive Officer or President Conservas De Cambados, S.L Rúa do Porto Nº 4 - Barrantes 36636 Ribadumia (Pontevedra) Spain
CA L'Espinaler, S.L. Progrés, 47 Pol. Ind. Els Garrofers 08340 Vilassar De Mar (Barcelona) Spain	
Conservas Hijos De Ramón Peña, SL Polígono Industrial do Salnés, Rúa Grenla, 6 36636 Ribadumia- Pontevedra Spain	Conservas La Brujula S.L. Pol. Ind. Do Salnes.CL Central 6. 36636 Barrantes (Ribadumia) Spain

On August 11, 2021, between 11:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Time, I served the following documents:

4. Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq. by Conservas de Cambados, CA L'Espinaler, S.L., Conservas Hijos De Ramón Peña, SL, Conservas La Brujula S.L., and Tony Caputo's Market & Deli;
5. Certificate of Merit;
6. Appendix "A" - "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary;"

on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties below, and causing it to be deposited at a United States Postal Service Office in Los Angeles County, California, for delivery by **Certified Mail**:

NOTICE OF VIOLATION/CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE  
CONSERVAS DE CAMBADOS, CA L'ESPINALER, S.L., CONSERVAS HIJOS DE RAMÓN PEÑA, SL, CONSERVAS LA BRUJULA S.L., AND TONY CAPUTO'S MARKET & DELI



<p>Matt Caputo or Current Chief Executive Officer or President                  Tony Caputo's Market &amp; Deli                  314 West 300 South                  Salt Lake City, UT</p>	
<p>Matt Caputo or Current Chief Executive Officer or President                  Tony Caputo's Market &amp; Deli                  314 West 300 South                  Salt Lake City, UT</p>	<p>Matt Caputo or Current Chief Executive Officer or President                  Tony Caputo's Market &amp; Deli                  1516 S. 1500 E.                  Salt Lake City, UT                  801-486-6615</p>
<p>Matt Caputo or Current Chief Executive Officer or President                  Tony Caputo's Market &amp; Deli                  c/o Tony or Matt Caputo                  3684 East Kaibab Cir                  Salt Lake City, UT 84109</p>	<p>Matt Caputo or Current Chief Executive Officer or President                  Tony Caputo's Market &amp; Deli                  4670 Holladay Village Plaza Unit 101                  Holladay, UT</p>

On August 11, 2021, between 11:00 a.m. and 11:30 p.m. Pacific Time, I served the following documents:

1. Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq. by Conservas de Cambados, CA L'Espinaler, S.L., Conservas Hijos De Ramón Peña, SL, Conservas La Brujula S.L., and Tony Caputo's Market & Deli;
2. Certificate of Merit;
3. Confidential Factual Information and Supporting Documentation Required by Title 11, C.C.R. § 3102

on the following parties by filing electronically a true and correct copy thereof as permitted through the website of the California Office of the Attorney General via link at [oag.ca.gov/prop65](http://oag.ca.gov/prop65):

State of California Department of Justice;  
 Office of the Attorney General of California.

On August 11, 2021, between 11:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Time, I served the following documents:

1. Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq. by Conservas de Cambados, CA L'Espinaler, S.L., Conservas Hijos De Ramón Peña, SL, Conservas La Brujula S.L., and Tony Caputo's Market & Deli;
2. Certificate of Merit

on the following parties below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the District Attorney and City Attorney offices listed below, and causing each envelope to be deposited at a United States Postal Service mail box for delivery by First Class Mail:

<p>District Attorney Alpine County</p>	<p>District Attorney Lake County</p>	<p>District Attorney Sierra County</p>
--	--	--

NOTICE OF VIOLATION/CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE  
 CONSERVAS DE CAMBADOS, CA L'ESPINALER, S.L., CONSERVAS HIJOS DE RAMÓN PEÑA, SL, CONSERVAS LA BRUJULA S.L., AND TONY CAPUTO'S MARKET & DELI

PO Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	255 North Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453	PO Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936
District Attorney Amador County 708 Court Street, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642	District Attorney Los Angeles County Hall of Justice 211 West Temple St. Ste 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012	District Attorney Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097
District Attorney Butte County 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965	District Attorney Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637	District Attorney Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533
District Attorney Colusa County 310 6 <sup>th</sup> Street Colusa, CA 95932	District Attorney Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903	District Attorney Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354
District Attorney Del Norte County 450 H Street, Suite 171 Crescent City, CA 95531	District Attorney Mendocino County PO Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482	District Attorney Sutter County 446 Second Street Yuba City, CA 95991
District Attorney EL Dorado County 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667	District Attorney Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020	District Attorney Tehama County PO Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080
District Attorney Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721	District Attorney Orange County 300 N Flower St. Santa Ana, CA 92703	District Attorney Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
District Attorney Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988	District Attorney San Benito County 419 4 <sup>th</sup> Street Hollister, CA 95023	District Attorney Tuolumne County 423 North Washington St. Sonora, CA 95370
District Attorney Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Eureka, CA 95501	District Attorney San Bernardino County 316 No. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415	District Attorney Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901
District Attorney Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243	District Attorney San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012
District Attorney Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301	District Attorney Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001	San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16 <sup>th</sup> Floor San Jose, CA 95113



**POULSEN LAW P.C.**

District Attorney Kings County 1400 West Lacey Blvd. Hanford, CA 93230	District Attorney Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517	
---	---	--

On August 11, 2021, between 11:00 a.m. and 11:30 p.m. Pacific Time, I served the following documents:

1. Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq. by Conservas de Cambados, CA L’Espinaler, S.L., Conservas Hijos De Ramón Peña, SL, Conservas La Brujula S.L., and Tony Caputo's Market & Deli;
2. Certificate of Merit

on each of the parties below, all of which have requested electronic service only via the following email addresses:

Alameda County District Attorney CEPDProp65@acgov.org	Calaveras County District Attorney Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us
Contra Costa County District Attorney sgrassini@contracostada.org	Inyo County District Attorney inyoda@inyocounty.us
Lassen County District Attorney mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	Mariposa County District Attorney mca@mariposacounty.org
Merced County District Attorney Prop65@countyofmerced.com	Monterey County District Attorney Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
Napa County District Attorney CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Nevada County District Attorney DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us
Placer County District Attorney Prop65@placer.ca.gov	Plumas County District Attorney davidhollister@countyofplumas.com
Riverside County District Attorney Prop65@rivcoda.org	Sacramento County District Attorney Prop65@sacda.org
San Diego City Attorney CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov	San Diego County District Attorney SanDiegoDAProp65@sdca.org
San Francisco County District Attorney alethea.sargent@sfgov.org	San Francisco City Attorney Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org
San Joaquin County District Attorney DA DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	San Luis Obispo County District Attorney edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
Santa Barbara County District Attorney DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us	Santa Clara County District Attorney EPU@da.sccgov.org
Santa Cruz County District Attorney Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	Sonoma County District Attorney jbarnes@sonoma-county.org
Tulare County District Attorney Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us	Ventura County District Attorney daspecialops@ventura.org
Yolo County District Attorney cfepd@yolocounty.org	

I, Lucas Zahn, declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Signature *Lucas Zahn*

August 11, 2021

NOTICE OF VIOLATION/CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE  
 CONSERVAS DE CAMBADOS, CA L’ESPINALER, S.L., CONSERVAS HIJOS DE RAMÓN  
 PEÑA, SL, CONSERVAS LA BRUJULA S.L., AND TONY CAPUTO'S MARKET & DELI

[www.PoulsenLaw.org](http://www.PoulsenLaw.org)

282 11<sup>th</sup> Avenue, #2612, New York, NY 10001



+1 (646) 776 5999

[contact@PoulsenLaw.org](mailto:contact@PoulsenLaw.org)

1142 Hartzell Street,  
Pacific Palisades, CA 90272

NOTICE OF VIOLATION/CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE  
CONSERVAS DE CAMBADOS, CA L'ESPINALER, S.L., CONSERVAS HIJOS DE RAMÓN  
PEÑA, SL, CONSERVAS LA BRUJULA S.L., AND TONY CAPUTO'S MARKET & DELI