

Facsimile: 866.843.8308 P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

9/30/2021

NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ. (PROPOSITION 65)

Dear Alleged Violators and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

I represent CalSafe Research Center, Inc. ("CRC"), 4533 MacArthur Blvd., Ste. 230, Newport Beach, CA 92660; Tel. (949) 630-0413. CRC's Executive Director is Eric Fairon. CRC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

CRC has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq., with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violators identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violators and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), CRC intends to pursue a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

General Information about Proposition 65. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is enclosed with this letter served to the alleged Violators identified below.

<u>Alleged Violators</u>. The names of the person/company covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the "Violators") are:



P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

House of Spices (India) Inc. 127-40 Willets Point Blvd Flushing NY 11368

Wholesome Choice 18040 Culver Drive Irvine CA 92612

<u>Consumer Products and Listed Chemical</u>. The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

LAXMI, Ginger Powder, UPC# 2324617660

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

It should be noted that CRC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

<u>Route of Exposure</u>. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the recommended use of these products. Consequently, the route of exposure to this chemical has been and continues to be through ingestion.

Approximate Time Period of Violations. Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least June 28, 2021, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemical. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violators violated Proposition 65 because they failed to provide persons ingesting these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to this chemical.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, CRC is interested in seeking a



P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violators to: (1) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemical, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings compliant with Proposition 65 to all persons located in California who purchased the above products in the last three years. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemical, as well as an expensive and time-consuming litigation.

CRC has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this matter. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice of Violation to my attention at the law office address and telephone number indicated on the letterhead or at P65@ManningLawOffice.com.

Sincerely

Joseph R. Manning, Jr.

P65@ManningLawOffice.com

Attachments

Certificate of Merit

Certificate of Service

OEHHA Summary (to Alleged Violators only)

Factual Information in Support of Certificate of Merit (to AG only)



P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Re: Calsafe Research Center, Inc.'s Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by House of Spices (India) Inc., and Wholesome Choice.

I, Joseph R. Manning, Jr., declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the factor, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: September 30, 2021

Joseph R. Manning, Jr.

P65@ManningLawOffice.com



20062 SW Birch St, Suite 200 Newport Beach, CA 92660 Office: 949.200.87.55 Facsimile: 866.843.8308 P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE PURSUANT TO 27 CCR § 25903

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States and over the age of 18 years of age. My business address is 20062 S.W. Birch, Newport Beach, CA 92660. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Newport Beach, California.

On September 30, 2021 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Standard Time, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties listed below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

House of Spices (India) Inc. – Headquarters 3000 Marcus Avenue Suite 2W10 Lake Success, NY 11042

Sam Nayyeri CEO 18040 Culver Dr, Irvine, CA, 92612, United States

On September 30, 2021 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Standard Time, I verified the following documents NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT INCLUDING A SUMMARY OF CONFIDENTIAL FACTUAL INFORMATION; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1) were served on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was uploaded on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice:

Office of the California Attorney General



P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On September 30, 2021 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Standard Time, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** were served on the following parties when a true and correct copy thereof was sent via electronic mail to each of the parties listed below:

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney	Barbara Yook, District Attorney	
Alameda County	Calaveras County	
7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650	891 Mountain Ranch Road	
Oakland, CA 94621	San Andreas, CA 95249	
CEPDProp65@acgov.org	Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	
Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney	Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney	
Contra Costa County	Inyo County	
900 Ward Street	168 North Edwards Street	
Martinez, CA 94553	Independence, CA 93526	
sgrassini@contracostada.org	inyoda@inyocounty.us	
Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator	Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney	
Lassen County	Monterey County	
220 S. Lassen Street	1200 Aguajito Road	
Susanville, CA 96130	Monterey, CA 93940	
mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us	
Allison Haley, District Attorney	Michael Hestrin, District Attorney	
Napa County	Riverside County	
1127 First Street, Suite C	3072 Orange Street	
Napa, CA 94559	Riverside, CA 92501	
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Prop65@rivcoda.org	
Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney	
Sacramento County	San Diego City Attorney	
901 G Street	1200 Third Avenue	
Sacramento, CA 95814	San Diego, CA 92101	
Prop65@sacda.org	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov	
Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney	Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney	



P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

San Francisco County	San Francisco City Attorney	
732 Brannan Street	1390 Market Street, 7th Floor	
San Francisco, CA 94103	San Francisco, CA 94102	
gregory.alker@sfgov.org	Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org	
Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney	Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney	
San Joaquin County	San Luis Obispo County	
222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202	County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor	
Stockton, CA 95202	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	
DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	
Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney	Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney	
Santa Barbara County	Santa Clara County	
1112 Santa Barbara Street	70 W Hedding St	
Santa Barbara, CA 93101	San Jose, CA 95110	
DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us	EPU@da.sccgov.org	
Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney	Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney	
Sonoma County	Tulare County	
600 Administration Dr	221 S Mooney Blvd	
Sonoma, CA 95403	Visalia, CA 95370	
jbarnes@sonoma-county.org	Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us	
Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney	Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney	
Ventura County	Yolo County	
800 S Victoria Ave	301 Second Street	
Ventura, CA 93009	Woodland, CA 95695	
daspecialops@ventura.org	cfepd@yolocounty.org	

On September 30, 2021 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Standard Time, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** on each parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by First Class Mail.



20062 SW Birch St, Suite 200 Newport Beach, CA 92660 Office: 949.200.8755

Facsimile: 866.843.8308 P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

Executed on September 30, 2021, in Newport Beach, California.

Marilyn Sanchez

Service List

District Attorney, Alpine County	District Attorney, Madera County	District Attorney, San Diego County
P.O. Box 248	209 West Yosemite Avenue	330 West Broadway, Suite 1300
Markleeville, CA 96120	Madera, CA 93637	San Diego, CA 92101
District Attorney, Amador County	District Attorney, Marin County	District Attorney, San Mateo County
708 Court Street, Suite 202	3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130	400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor
Jackson, CA 95642	San Rafael, CA 94903	Redwood City, CA 94063
District Attorney, Butte County	District Attorney, Mariposa County	District Attorney, Shasta County
25 County Center Drive, Suite 245	Post Office Box 730	1355 West Street
Oroville, CA 95965	Mariposa, CA 95338	Redding, CA 96001
District Attorney, Colusa County	District Attorney, Mendocino County	District Attorney, Sierra County
346 Fifth Street Suite 101	Post Office Box 1000	100 Courthouse Square, 2 st Floor
Colusa, CA 95932	Ukiah, CA 95482	Downieville, CA 95936
District Attorney, Del Norte County	District Attorney, Merced County	District Attorney, Siskiyou County
450 H Street, Room 171	550 W. Main Street	Post Office Box 986
Crescent City, CA 95531	Merced, CA 95340	Yreka, CA 96097
District Attorney, El Dorado County	District Attorney, Modoc County	District Attorney, Solano County
778 Pacific St	204 S Court Street, Room 202	675 Texas Street, Ste 4500
Placerville, CA 95667	Alturas, CA 96101-4020	Fairfield, CA 94533
District Attorney, Fresno County	District Attorney, Mono County	District Attorney, Stanislaus County
2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000	Post Office Box 617	832 12th Street, Ste 300
Fresno, CA 93721	Bridgeport, CA 93517	Modesto, CA 95354
District Attorney, Glenn County	District Attorney, Nevada County	District Attorney, Sutter County
Post Office Box 430	201 Commercial Street	463 2nd Street
Willows, CA 95988	Nevada City, CA 95959	Yuba City, CA 95991
District Attorney, Humboldt County	District Attorney, Orange County	District Attorney, Tehama County
825 5th Street 4th Floor	300 N. Flower Street	Post Office Box 519
Eureka, CA 95501	Santa Ana, CA 92703	Red Bluff, CA 96080
District Attorney, Imperial County	District Attorney, Placer County	District Attorney, Trinity County
940 West Main Street, Ste 102	10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240	Post Office Box 310
El Centro, CA 92243	Roseville, CA 95678	Weaverville, CA 96093



20062 SW Birch St, Suite 200 Newport Beach, CA 92660 Office: 949.200.8755

Facsimile: 866.843.8308 P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

District Attorney, Kern County	District Attorney, Plumas County	District Attorney, Tuolumne County
1215 Truxtun Avenue	520 Main Street, Room 404	423 N. Washington Street
Bakersfield, CA 93301	Quincy, CA 95971	Sonora, CA 95370
District Attorney, Kings County	District Attorney, San Benito County	District Attorney, Yuba County
1400 West Lacey Boulevard	419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor	215 Fifth Street, Suite 152
Hanford, CA 93230	Hollister, CA 95023	Marysville, CA 95901
District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453	Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012	San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113
District Attorney, Los Angeles County Hall of Justice 211 West Temple St., Ste 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012		