# VOORHEES & BAILEY, LLP 535 Ramona Street; Suite 5 Palo Alto, CA 94303 650-815-6022

Supplemental 60-Day Notice of Violation - California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

#### October 22, 2021

Notice Recipients:	Orly Shoe Corp.; Orly Maison LLC; Dolgen California, LLC; Old East Main Co.; Dollar General Corporation
Noticing Party:	Dennis Johnson
<b>Covered Products:</b>	Ceramic Mugs With Exterior Designs
Listed Chemical:	Lead
Routes of Exposure:	Ingestion; Dermal
Potential Harm:	Birth Defects and Other Reproductive Harm

#### I. INTRODUCTION

This Supplemental Sixty-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice") is provided by Dennis Johnson. Mr. Johnson is a private enforcer acting in the public interest pursuant to California Health & Safety Code section 25249.7(d). Mr. Johnson seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold and used in California and, if possible, to eliminate such exposures.

This Notice is provided to the alleged violators, Orly Shoe Corp., Orly Maison LLC, Dolgen California, LLC, Old East Main Co., and Dollar General Corporation (the "Notice Recipients"), as well as the California Attorney General's Office, the District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties, and the City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose and Los Angeles.

The Notice Recipients are hereby given notice that they have violated and continue to violate provisions of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, which is codified at California Health & Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq. ("Proposition 65"). Specifically, the Notice Recipients have violated and continue to violate the warning requirement of section 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code, which provides, "No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual...." The alleged violations that are the subject of this Notice are provided below.

### II. ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

<u>Product Types/Categories</u>: The specific types or categories of products that are causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are Ceramic Mugs With Exterior Designs ("Covered Products").

Identified below is a specific example of Covered Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California (the "Exemplar Product"). Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors, and/or manufacturers of the Exemplar Product is also provided.

The Exemplar Product is identified for the Notice Recipients' benefit to assist in their investigation of the allegations set forth in this Notice. The Exemplar Product is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product falling within the specific types or categories of Covered Products at issue in this Notice. It is the private enforcer's position that the Notice Recipients are obligated to conduct a good-faith investigation into other specific products falling within the type or category of Covered Products that have been manufactured, imported, distributed, sold, shipped, stored, or are otherwise within the Notice Recipients' custody or control, so as to ensure the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

Covered Products	Exemplar Product Information
Ceramic Mugs With Exterior	Old East Main Co. Ceramic Mug With Rose Gold Handle
Designs	UPC: 6 91466 14355 6
	Retailer: Old East Main Co.; Dolgen California, LLC,
	Dollar General Corporation (Woodland, CA)
	Manufacturer/Distributor: Orly Shoe Corp.; Orly Maison
	LLC

<u>Listed Chemical</u>: The alleged violations involve exposures to the Proposition 65-listed chemical lead. Lead is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. Lead is hereinafter referred to as the "Listed Chemical".

<u>Statement of Violations</u>: The Notice Recipients knowingly and intentionally exposed, and continue to knowingly and intentionally expose, consumers within the State of California to lead, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm, without first giving clear and reasonable warning of this exposure to such individuals. In particular, the Notice Recipients failed to provide a clear and reasonable warning to consumers that the Ceramic Mugs With Exterior Designs expose consumers to lead.

<u>Route of Exposure</u>: California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the Covered Products, are exposed to the Listed Chemical. Consumers ingest the Listed Chemical when their lips and mouth come into contact with the Covered Products. Consumers also

ingest the Listed Chemical when they touch and handle the Covered Products, transfer the Listed Chemical from the Covered Products onto their fingers and hands, and transfer the Listed Chemical from their fingers and hands to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after contact with the Covered Products. Consumers are exposed to the Listed Chemical through direct dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle or touch the Covered Products.

<u>Number and Duration of Violations</u>: Each and every sale of a Covered Product to a consumer in California without a clear and reasonable warning is a violation, including transactions made over-the-counter, through the internet, and/or via catalogue by the Notice Recipients and any other sellers of the Covered Products. These violations have been occurring since at least October 22, 2020, as well as every day since the Covered Products were first introduced and sold in the State of California, as far back as October 22, 2018. The violations are ongoing.

## III. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) and Title 11, California Code of Regulations, section 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto. A second copy of the entire notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the Attorney General with all supporting documentation required by Section 3102 attached thereto.

## IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION – A SUMMARY

A summary of Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead agency designated under Proposition 65, is enclosed with the copy of the Notice served on the Notice Recipients.

# V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Mr. Johnson intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the Notice Recipients upon the expiration of the sixty-day notice period, provided no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

If the Notice Recipients are interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to timeconsuming and expensive litigation, they should contact counsel at the address provided below. It should be noted that no settlement may be finalized before the sixty-day notice period has expired and only if no public prosecutor has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the alleged violation.

#### VI. PRESERVATION OF EVIDENCE

This Notice also serves as a demand that the Notice Recipients preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in the Covered Products; purchase and sales information for Covered Products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to the Covered Products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in Covered Products; and representative exemplars of each specific model falling within the Covered Products. This demand applies to all relevant evidence for Covered Products sold in the State of California, as far back as October 22, 2018, through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

#### VII. CONTACT INFORMATION

Mr. Johnson has retained me as legal counsel in this matter. Please direct all communications related to this Notice of Violation to the following:

Troy Bailey, Esq. Voorhees & Bailey, LLP 535 Ramona Street; Suite 5 Palo Alto, CA 94303 troy@voorheesbailey.com

Sincerely,

Josh Voorhees Voorhees & Bailey, LLP Attorneys for Dennis Johnson

cc: California Attorney General's Office; District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose and Los Angeles

Attachments: Certificate of Merit; Proof of Service; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary (Old East Main Co.; Dolgen California, LLC, Dolgen California, LLC, Old East Main Co., and Dollar General Corporation only); and Confidential Information in Support of Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Only)

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Josh Voorhees, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) certain facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: October 22, 2021

Josh Voorhees

#### **PROOF OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within action. I am employed in Santa Clara County, California. My business address is 535 Ramona Street; Suite 5, Palo Alto, CA 94303.

On October 22, 2021, I caused to be served the following documents:

# 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND**

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

XXXX **By First Class Certified Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative.

Dolgen California, LLC c/o CSC Lawyers Incorporating Service 2710 Gateway Oaks Drive; Suite 150N Sacrament, CA 95833

Current President/CEO Old East Main Co. 100 Mission Ridge Goodlettsville, TN 37072

Albert Antebi or Current President/CEO Orly Shoe Corp. 15 West 34th St, 7th Floor New York, NY 10001 Dollar General Corporation c/o Corporation Service Company 2908 Poston Ave. Nashville, TN 37203

Albert Antebi or Current President/CEO Orly Maison LLC 10 Roosevelt Avenue Deal, NJ 07723

Albert Antebi or Current President/CEO Orly Shoe Corp. 10 Roosevelt Avenue Deal, NJ 07723 On October 22, 2021, I caused to be served the following documents:

# 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); AND

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

XXXX **By First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each entity on the attached "U.S. Mail Service List" and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative, postage prepaid.

XXXX **By Electronic Mail** by sending true and correct copies of the above documents to the electronic notification (Email) address(es) on the attached "Electronic Mail Service List".

On October 22, 2021, I caused to be served the following documents:

# 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND** 

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS**

XXXX **By Electronic Upload** by causing true and correct copies of the above documents to be uploaded to the California Attorney General's website at the web address on the attached "Electronic Upload Service List".

Executed on October 22, 2021, at Palo Alto, California.

Josh Voorhees

# U.S. Mail Service List

Alpine County District Attorney P.O. Box 248	Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200	San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center
Markleeville, CA 96120	Los Angeles, CA 90012	Redwood City, CA 94063
Amador County District Attorney	Madera County District Attorney	Shasta County District Attorney
708 Court Street	209 West Yosemite Avenue	1355 West Street
Jackson, CA 95642	Madera, CA 93637	Redding, CA 96001
Butte County District Attorney	Marin County District Attorney	Sierra County District Attorney
25 County Center Drive, Suite 245	3501 Civic Center Drive, Suite 145	P.O. Box 457
Oroville, CA 95965	San Rafael, CA 94903	Downieville, CA 95936
Colusa County District Attorney	Mendocino County District Attorney	Siskiyou County District Attorney
346 Fifth Street, Suite 101	P.O. Box 1000	311 4th Street
Colusa, CA 95932	Ukiah, CA 95482	Yreka, CA 96097
Del Norte County District Attorney	San Benito County District Attorney	Solano County District Attorney
450 H Street, Room 171	419 4th Street	675 Texas Street, Suite 4500
Crescent City, CA 95531	Hollister, CA 95023	Fairfield, CA 94533
El Dorado County District Attorney	Modoc County District Attorney	Stanislaus County District Attorney
778 Pacific Street	204 S. Court Street, Suite 202	832 12th Street, Suite 300
Placerville, CA 95667	Alturas, CA 96101	Modesto, CA 95354
Fresno County District Attorney	Mono County District Attorney	Sutter County District Attorney
2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000	P.O. Box 617	463 Second Street, Suite 102
Fresno, CA 93721	Bridgeport, CA 93517	Yuba City, CA 95991
Glenn County District Attorney	Lake County District Attorney	Tehama County District Attorney
P.O. Box 430	255 North Forbes Street	444 Oak Street, Room L
Willows, CA 95988	Lakeport, CA 95453	Red Bluff, CA 96080
Humboldt County District Attorney	Orange County District Attorney	Trinity County District Attorney
825 5th Street, Fourth Floor	300 North Flower Street	P.O. Box 310
Eureka, CA 95501	Santa Ana, CA 92703	Weaverville, CA 96093
Imperial County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney	Tuolumne County District Attorney
940 West Main Street, Suite 102	303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor	423 North Washington Street
El Centro, CA 92243	San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	Sonora, CA 95370
Kern County District Attorney	Kings County District Attorney	Yuba County District Attorney
1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4th Floor	1400 West Lacey Boulevard	215 Fifth Street
Bakersfield, CA 93301	Hanford, CA 93230	Marysville, CA 95901
	Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles	
	James K. Hahn City Hall East	
	200 North Main Street, 8th Floor	
	Los Angeles, CA 90012	

# Electronic Upload Service List

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

# Electronic Mail Service List

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney	Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney	Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney
Alameda County District Attorney	Riverside County	San Luis Obispo County
7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650	3072 Orange Street	County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor
Oakland, CA 94621	Riverside, CA 92501	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408
CEPDProp65@acgov.org	Prop65@rivcoda.org	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
Allison Haley, District Attorney	Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney	Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney
Napa County	San Joaquin County	Sonoma County
1127 First Street, Suite C	222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202	600 Administration Dr
Napa, CA 94559	Stockton, CA 95202	Sonoma, CA 95403
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	jbarnes@sonoma-county.org
Alethea M. Sargent, Assistant DA	Jeffrey S. Rosell , District Attorney	Loopping MA Decient District Attorney
-		Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney
San Francisco County	Santa Cruz County	Monterey County
350 Rhode Island Street	701 Ocean Street	1200 Aguajito Road
San Francisco, CA 94103	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	Monterey, CA 93940
alethea.sargent@sfgov.org	Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
Bud Porter	Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Yolo County	City of San Diego
Santa Clara County	301 Second Street	1200 Third Avenue
70 W Hedding St	Woodland, CA 95695	San Diego, CA 92101
San Jose, CA 95110	cfepd@yolocounty.org	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
EPU@da.sccgov.org	siebale folocounty.org	sity ity roposesandiego.gov
Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney	Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator	Christopher Dalbey,
Ventura County	Lassen County	Deputy District Attorney
800 S Victoria Ave	220 S. Lassen Street	Santa Barbara County
		•
Ventura, CA 93009	Susanville, CA 96130	1112 Santa Barbara St.
daspecialops@ventura.org	mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	Santa Barbara, CA 93101
		DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney	Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney	Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney
Contra Costa County	Sacramento County	Tulare County
900 Ward Street	901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814	221 S Mooney Blvd
Martinez, CA 94553	Prop65@sacda.org	Visalia, CA 95370
sgrassini@contracostada.org		Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
Barbara Yook, District Attorney	Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney	Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney
Calaveras County	Inyo County	City of San Francisco
891 Mountain Ranch Road.	168 North Edwards Street	1390 Market Street, 7th Floor
San Andreas, CA 95249		San Francisco, CA 94102
	Independence, CA 93526	
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	inyoda@inyocounty.us	Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org
Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney	Walter W. Wall, District Attorney	Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney
Merced County	Mariposa County	Nevada County
550 W. Main Street	P.O. Box 730	201 Commercial Street
Merced, CA 95340	Mariposa, CA 95338	Nevada City, CA 95959
Prop65@countyofmerced.com	mcda@mariposacounty.org	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us
Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney	David Hollister, District Attorney	Summer Stephan, District Attorney
Placer County	Plumas County	San Diego County
10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240	520 Main Street	330 W. Broadway Street
-	Quincy, CA 95971	San Diego, CA 92101
Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
	Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney	
	200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	
	200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 96113	
	200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	