# **60-Day Notice of Violation**

SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d)

Date: November 3, 2021

**To:** Current President/CEO, Votum Enterprises LLC at Corporate HQ;

Ernie Hermann, or Current President/CEO, Marshalls, TJX Companies, Inc., Marmaxx Operating

Corp (at HQ);

California Attorney General's Office;

District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and

City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los Angeles

From: Sara Hammond

Re: Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq.

#### I. INTRODUCTION

My name is Sara Hammond, a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. I seek to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and, if possible, to improve human health by reducing hazardous substances contained in such items. This Notice is provided to the public agencies listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65"). As noted above, notice is also being provided to the alleged violators, Votum Enterprises LLC and Marshalls and related entities (hereinafter referred to collectively as the alleged "Violators"). The alleged violations covered by this Notice consist of the product exposures, routes of exposure, and type of harm potentially resulting from exposure to the toxic chemical ("listed chemical") identified below, as follows:

Product Exposure: See Section VII. Exhibit A

Listed Chemical: Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate ("DEHP")

Routes of Exposure: Ingestion, Dermal

Types of Harm: Cancer, Birth Defects and Other Reproductive Harm

# II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATION (PRODUCT EXPOSURE)

The specific type of product that is causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that is covered by this Notice, is listed under "Product Category/Type" in Section VII below. All products within the category covered by this Notice shall be referred to hereinafter as the "products." Exposures to the listed chemical from the use of the products have been occurring without the clear and reasonable warning required by Proposition 65, dating as far back as October 15, 2021. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical resulting from contact with the products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the listed chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the products.

California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the products, are exposed to the listed chemical. By way of example, consumers and other individuals, including women of childbearing age, ingest the listed chemical when they, among other activities, touch the products and transfer the listed chemical from the products to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after contact with the products stops. Additionally, consumers and other individuals, including women of childbearing age, are exposed to the listed chemical through direct dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle, touch or otherwise use the products. The California State Plan for Occupational Safety and Health incorporates the provisions of Proposition 65, as

approved by Federal OSHA on June 6, 1997. This approval specifically placed certain conditions with regard to occupational exposures on Proposition 65, including that it does not apply to the conduct of manufacturers occurring outside the State of California. The approval also provides that an employer may use the means of compliance in the general hazard communication requirements to comply with Proposition 65. It also requires that supplemental enforcement is subject to the supervision of the California Occupational Safety and Health Administration. Accordingly, any settlement, civil complaint, or substantive court orders in this matter must be submitted to the Attorney General.

#### III. CONTACT INFORMATION

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to me through my counsel's office at the following address:

Sara Hammond c/o Joseph D. Agliozzo Joseph D. Agliozzo, Law Corporation 1601 N. Sepulveda Blvd, #649 Manhattan Beach, CA 90266 Telephone: (424) 241-3614

## IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For general information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's ("OEHHA") Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900. For the Violator's reference, I have attached a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" which has been prepared by OEHHA.

## V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, I intend to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the alleged Violator unless such Violator enters into a binding written agreement to: (1) recall products already sold or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those who have received such products; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the DEHP exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). If the alleged Violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and expensive litigation, please feel free to contact my counsel identified in Section III above. It should be noted that neither my counsel nor I can: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any district or city attorney who received this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with me will resolve my claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

#### VI. ADDITIONAL NOTICE INFORMATION

Identified below is a specific example of a product recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California that is within the category or type of offending product covered by this Notice. Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors and/or manufacturers of the example within the category or type of product are also provided below. I believe and allege that the sale of the offending products also has occurred without the requisite Proposition 65 "clear and reasonable".

warning" at one or more locations and/or via other means including, but not limited to, transactions made over-the-counter, business-to-business, through the internet and/or via a catalog by the Violator and other retailers and distributors of the manufacturer.

Product(s)*	Retailer(s)	Manufacturer(s)/Distributor(s)/ Importers
Be Magical Nail polish kit case SKU_127210352797800399 UPC_840234602911	Marshalls Stores	Votum Enterprises LLC
Limited Too Tea-Rific Nail Polish set case SKU_1272103527985000399 UPC_0192040552202		

## VII. EXHIBIT A

Product Category/Type	Such As*	Toxin
Nail Polish Kit Reusable	Be Magical Nail polish kit case	Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate
bags as described above	SKU_127210352797800399	(DEHP)
	UPC_840234602911	
	Limited Too Tea-Rific Nail Polish	
	set case	
	SKU_1272103527985000399	
	UPC_0192040552202	

<sup>\*</sup>The specifically identified example of the type of product that is subject to this Notice is for the recipient's benefit to assist in its investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the listed chemical from other items within the product category/type listed in Exhibit A. It is important to note that this example is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product of the type listed under "Product Category/Type" in Exhibit A. Further, it is this citizen's position that the alleged Violator is obligated to continue to conduct in good faith an investigation into other specific products within the type or category described above that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the notice recipient's custody or control) during the relevant period so as to ensure that the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

# **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Joseph D. Agliozzo, hereby declare:

- (1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- (2) I am the attorney for the noticing party.
- (3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
- (4) Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

(5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Joseph D. Agliozzo

Dated: November 3, 2021

# PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action; my business address is 1601 N. Sepulveda Boulevard, #649 Manhattan Beach CA 90266.

On November 3, 2021, I served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY (APPENDIX A) (SERVED ONLY ON ALLEGED VIOLATOR);

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND** 

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS (SERVED ONLY ON THE ATTORNEY GENERAL)

on the entities listed below via First Class Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, along with an unsigned copy of this declaration, addressed to the entity listed below and providing each envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Current CEO/President Votum Enterprises LLC 1 Cardinal Dr Little Falls, NJ 07424-1638	Ernie Hermann, President/CEO (or current President/CEO) TJX Companies, Inc. 770 Cochituate Road Framingham MA 01701 – 4672	
	Ernie Hermann, President/CEO (or current President/CEO) Marmaxx Operating Corp. 770 Cochituate Road Framingham MA 01701 – 4672	

as well as by providing copies of the above documents electronically uploaded or emailed to the public enforcers according to directions from their respective offices, and/or by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, along with an unsigned copy of this declaration, addressed to each party listed below, and served as follows:

Electronically Uploaded to the Attorney General's website:	The Attorney General of the State of California;
By placing each envelope in a United States Postal Service mailbox, postage prepaid, or at the	The District Attorney for Each of the 58 counties in California; and
request of the District or City Attorney, emailing a copy of the notice to the specified address:	The City Attorney for Los Angeles, San Diego, San Jose, San Francisco and Sacramento

A list of addresses for each of these recipients is attached.

Executed on November 3, 2021, at Manhattan Beach, California.

**Service List** 

<u>Service List</u>						
The Honorable Michael Atwell	The Honorable Sally O. Moreno	The Honorable Jeffrey Rosen	The Honorable Mara W. Elliott			
Alpine County District Attorney	Madera County District Attorney	Santa Clara County Dist Attorney	Office of the City Atty, San Diego			
P.O. Box 248	209 West Yosemite Avenue	70 West Hedding St, West Wing	1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620			
Markleeville, CA 96120	Madera, CA 93637	San Jose, CA 95110	San Diego, CA 92101			
The Honorable Todd Riebe	The Honorable Lori Frugoli	The Honorable Jeffrey S. Rosell	Can Diego, Ort 52 To 1			
Amador County District Attorney	Marin County District Attorney	Santa Cruz County Dist Attorney				
708 Court Street	3501 Civic Center DR, Suite 145	701 Ocean Street, Room 200				
Jackson, CA 95642	San Rafael, CA 94903	Santa Cruz, CA 95060				
The Honorable Michael Ramsey	The Honorable Walter Wall	The Hon Stephanie A. Bridgett	Via Email:			
Butte County District Attorney	Mariposa County Dist. Attorney	Shasta County District Attorney				
25 County Center Drive, Suite 245	5101 Jones Street P.O. Box 730	1355 West Street				
Oroville, CA 95965	Mariposa, CA 95338	Redding, CA 96001				
The Honorable Richard Doyle	The Honorable C. David Eyster	The Honorable Sandra Groven	Nancy O'Malley DA Alameda Cty			
The honorable hichard boyle						
Office of the City Atty, San Jose	Mendocino County Dist Attorney	Sierra County District Attorney	7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650			
200 East Santa Clara St, 16th FL	100 N. State Street, RM G-10	100 Courthouse Square, RM B1	Oakland, CA 94621			
	P.O. Box 1000	P.O. Box 457	CEPDProp65@acgov.org			
San Jose, CA 95113	Ukiah, CA 95482	Downieville, CA 95936				
The Hon. Matthew R. Beauchamp	The Honorable Kimberly Lewis	The Hon James Kirk Andrus	Paul Zellerbach, DA Riverside Cty			
Colusa County District Attorney	Merced County District Attorney	Siskiyou County District Attorney	3072 Orange Street			
346 Fifth Street, Suite 101	550 West Main Street	311 4 <sup>th</sup> Street	Riverside, CA 92501			
Colusa, CA 95932	Merced, CA 95340	Yreka, CA 96097	Prop65@rivcoda.org			
Del Norte County District Attorney	The Honorable Samuel D. Kyllo	The Hon Krishna A. Abrams	Christopher Dalbey, DDA SB Cty			
450 H Street, RM 171	Modoc County District Attorney	Solano County District Attorney	1112 Santa Barbara St.			
Crescent City, CA 95531	204 South Court ST, Suite 202	675 Texas Street, Suite 4500	Santa Barbara, CA 93101			
	Alturas, CA 96101	Fairfield, CA 94533	DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us			
The Honorable Vern Pierson	The Honorable Tim Kendall	The Honorable Jill Ravitch	Stacey Grassini, DDA CC County			
El Dorado County District Attorney	Mono County District Attorney	Sonoma County District Attorney	900 Ward Street			
778 Pacific Street	278 Main Street, P.O. Box 617	600 Administration Dr, RM 212 J	Martinez, CA 94553			
Placerville, CA 95667	Bridgeport, CA 93517	Santa Rosa, CA 95403	sgrassini@contracostada.org			
The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp	The Honorable Clifford Newell	The Honorable Birgit Fladager	Gregory Alker, ADA SF County			
Fresno County District Attorney	Nevada County District Attorney	Stanislaus County Dist Attorney	732 Brannan Street			
		832 12th Street. Suite 300				
2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000	201 Commercial Street		San Francisco, CA 94103			
Fresno, CA 93721	Nevada City, CA 95959	Modesto, CA 95354	gregory.alker@sfgov.org			
The Honorable Dwayne Stewart	The Honorable Todd Spitzer	The Hon Amanda L. Hopper	Jeff W. Reisig, DA Yolo County			
Glenn County District Attorney	Orange County District Attorney	Sutter County District Attorney	301 Second Street			
P.O. Box 430	300 N. Flower Street	463 Second Street, Suite 102	Woodland, CA 95695			
Willows, CA 95988	Santa Ana, CA 92703	Yuba City, CA 95991	cfepd@yolocounty.org			
The Honorable Maggie Fleming	The Honorable R. Scott Owens	The Honorable Matthew Rogers	Dije Ndreu, DDA Monterey Cty			
Humboldt County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney	Tehama County District Attorney	1200 Aguajito Road			
825 5th Street, Fourth Floor	10810 Justice Center Dr. St 240	444 Oak Street, Room L	Monterey, CA 93940			
Eureka, CA 95501	Roseville, CA 95678	Red Bluff, CA 96080				
		·	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us			
The Honorable Gilbert Otero	The Honorable David Hollister	The Hon Donna Daly	Valerie Lopez, Dep. City Atty			
Imperial County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney	Trinity County District Attorney	Off of the City Atty, San Francisco			
940 West Main Street, Suite 102	520 Main Street, Room 404	P.O. Box 310	1390 Market Street, 7th Floor			
El Centro, CA 92243	Quincy, CA 95971	11 Court Street	San Francisco, CA 94102			
		Weaverville, CA 96093	Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org			
The Honorable Thomas Hardy	The Hon Anne Marie Schubert	The Honorable Tim Ward	Allison Haley, DA Napa County			
Inyo County District Attorney	Sacramento Cty Dist. Attorney	Tulare County District Attorney	1127 First Street, Suite C			
P.O. Box Drawer D	901 G Street	221 South Mooney Blvd, Rm 224	Napa. CA 94559			
Independence, CA 93526	Sacramento, CA 95814	Visalia, CA 93291-4593	CEPD@countyofnapa.org			
The Honorable Cynthia Zimmer	The Honorable Candice Hooper	The Honorable Laura L. Krieg	Eric J. Dobroth, DDA			
Kern County District Attorney	San Benito County Dist Attorney	Tuolumne County Dist Attorney	San Luis Obispo County			
1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4 <sup>th</sup> Floor	419 4th Street	423 North Washington Street	County Govt Center Annex, 4th Fl			
Bakersfield, CA 93301	Hollister, CA 95023	Sonora, CA 9537	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408			
			edobroth@co.slo.ca.us			
The Honorable Keith Fagundes	The Honorable Jason Anderson	The Honorable Gregory D. Totten	The Honorable Barbara Yook			
Kings County District Attorney	San Bernardino Cty. Dist. Att.	Ventura County District Attorney	Calaveras County District Atty			
1400 West Lacey Boulevard	303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor	800 South Victoria Ave, Ste 314	891 Mountain Ranch Road			
Hanford, CA 93230	San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	Ventura, CA 93009	San Andreas, CA 95249			
114111014, 071 00200	Jan Bomardino, OA 32410-0002	Vollara, 071 00000	Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us			
The Hanarable Cuses I I/ress	The Han Cummer Ctanhan	The Hanarahla Clint Cours	Via upload:			
The Honorable Susan J. Krones	The Hon Summer Stephan	The Honorable Clint Curry	via upioau:			
Lake County District Attorney	San Diego County Dist Attorney	Yuba County District Attorney				
255 North Forbes Street	330 West Broadway Street	215 Fifth Street				
Lakeport, CA 95453	San Diego, CA 92101	Marysville, CA 95901				
The Hon Stacie Montgomery	The Hon Tori Verber Salazar	The Honorable Mike Feuer	Office of the California Attorney			
Lassen County District Attorney	San Joaquin Cty Dist Attorney	Off of the City Atty, Los Angeles	General Proposition 65			
2950 Riverside Drive, Suite 102	P.O. Box 990	James K. Hahn City Hall East	Enforcement Reporting ATTN:			
Susanville, CA 96130	Stockton, CA 95201	200 North Main Street, Suite 800	Prop 65 Coordinator			
Cacarrenio, O/COOTOO	0.000.001, 07.00201	Los Angeles, CA 90012	P.O. Box 70550			
The Hanarable Jestia Lassy	The Han Stephen M Magatatt					
The Honorable Jackie Lacey	The Hon Stephen M. Wagstaffe	The Hon Susan Acala Wood	Oakland, CA 94612-0550			
LA County District Attorney	San Mateo County Dist Attorney	Off of the City Atty, Sacramento	https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-			
211 W. Temple Street, Suite 1200	400 County Center, 3 <sup>rd</sup> Floor	915 I Street, 4th Floor	day-notice			
Los Angeles, CA 90012	Redwood City, CA 94063	Sacramento, CA 95814				