## **NOTICE OF VIOLATION**

California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

Lead in Saladitos

January 31, 2022

This Notice of Violation (the Notice) is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d).

- For general information regarding the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, see the attached summary provided by the California EPA (copies not provided to public enforcement agencies).
- This Notice is provided by the Environmental Democracy Project (EDP), 1401 21<sup>st</sup> Street, Suite R, Sacramento, CA 95811, (415) 658-5848. EDP is a nonprofit corporation dedicated to, among other things, holding corporations accountable for exposing consumers to toxic chemicals. John Banister is EDP's Chief Executive Officer. He is a responsible individual within EDP for purposes of this Notice.

# **Description of Violation:**

• Violators: The names and addresses of the violators are:

Alli & Rose, LLC 1422 East Main Street Lincolnton, NC 28092

## **Costco Wholesale Corporation**

999 Lake Drive Issaquah, WA 98027

- <u>Time Period of Exposure</u>: The violations have been occurring since at least January 31, 2021, and are ongoing.
- <u>Provision of Proposition 65</u>: This Notice covers California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6's warning provision.

- <u>Chemical(s) Involved</u>: The name of the listed chemical involved in these violations is lead and lead compounds (collectively, Lead). Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, developmental, and reproductive toxicity. Exposures to Lead occur from the ingestion of Saladitos.
- <u>Type of Product</u>: The specific type of product causing these violations is Saladitos. Saladitos are plums that are dried or covered with salt, sugar, or chili. Saladitos are eaten as candy or snack foods. Non-exclusive examples of this specific type of product are: Snakyard Saladitos, salted dried plums, UPC No. 8-10019-60082-1.
- <u>Description of Exposure</u>: This Notice addresses consumer exposures to Lead. Consumption of Saladitos results in human exposures to Lead. The route of exposure for the violations is direct ingestion pursuant to suggested and prescribed ingestion methods and serving sizes recommended by the manufacturer. Individuals in California are exposed to significant amounts of Lead when they ingest the Saladitos sold by the violators identified above. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the carcinogenic hazards and reproductive toxicity of Lead.

### **Resolution of Noticed Claims:**

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, EDP intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against each violator unless it agrees in a binding written instrument to: (1) recall products already sold; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the Lead exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(b). If Alli & Rose, LLC and Costco Wholesale Corporation are interested in resolving this dispute without resort to litigation, please feel free to contact EDP through its counsel identified below. It should be noted that EDP cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received EDP's 60-day Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with EDP will resolve EDP's claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

### **Preservation of Relevant Evidence:**

This Notice also serves as a demand that each alleged violator preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic

documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of Lead in Saladitos; purchase and sales information for such products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to such products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of Lead in such products; and representative exemplars of each unit of any such products sold by each alleged violator in the year preceding this Notice through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

Please direct any inquiries regarding this Notice to EDP's counsel Lucas Williams at Williams Environmental Law, 490 43rd Street, #23, Oakland, California 94609, (707) 849-5198, Lucas@williams-envirolaw.com

# EXHIBIT 1 January 31, 2022 Notice of Violation Lead in Saladitos

Names of Responsible Parties	Non-Exclusive Examples of the Products	Style, SKU, UPC or Further Description
Alli & Rose, LLC	Snakyard Dried Plums/Saladitos	Saladitos: 12.7 oz. Bag UPC: 8-10019-60082-1
Costco Wholesale Corporation	Snakyard Dried Plums/Saladitos	Saladitos: 12.7 oz. Bag UPC: 8-10019-60082-1

# CERTIFICATE OF MERIT Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

## I, Lucas Williams, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney with Williams Environmental Law, and I represent the noticing party, the Environmental Democracy Project.
- 3. Members of my firm, co-counsel, and I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of the Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code §

25249.7(h)(2), i.e. (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies or other data reviewed by those persons.

January 31, 2022

Lucas Williams Attorney for ENVIRONMENTAL DEMOCRACY PROJECT

# **SERVICE LIST**

Alli & Rose, LLC

c/o Lenka Dransfield (Manager) 1422 East Main Street, Lincolnton, NC 28092

**Costco Wholesale Corporation** 

c/o Walter C. Jelinek (CEO) 999 Lake Drive Issaquah, WA 98027

### **PROOF OF SERVICE**

I, Jacob Janzen, declare:

I am a citizen of the United States and employed in the County of Alameda, State of California. I am over the age of eighteen (18) years and not a party to this action. My business address is 490 43rd Street, #23, Oakland, CA 94609 and my email address is jake@williams-envirolaw.com.

On January 31, 2022 I served the following document(s) as indicated below:

NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT;

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT;** and

THE SAFE DRINKING AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986

(PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY (only sent to those on service list marked with an asterisk).

☑ BY MAIL: I am readily familiar with the firm's practice for collecting and processing mail with the United States Postal Service ("USPS"). Under that practice, mail would be deposited with USPS that same day with postage thereon fully prepaid at Oakland, California in the ordinary course of business. On this date, I placed sealed envelopes containing the above mentioned documents for collection and mailing following my firm's ordinary business practices addressed to the recipients and addresses indicated on the attached Service List.

■ BY ELECTRONIC MAIL: I transmitted a PDF version of the document(s) listed above via email to the following email addresses before 5 p.m. on the date executed:

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney 168 North Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526 inyoda@inyocounty.us Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

Bud Porter Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 95110 epu@da.sccgov.org Allison Haley, District Attorney Napa County 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Drive, Rm. 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County 221 S. Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95338 cfepd@yolocounty.org

Walter W. Wall, District Attorney Mariposa County P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org

Kimberley Lewis, District Attorney Merced County 550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofmerced.com

Jannine M Pacioni, Deputy DA Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959 DA.prop65@co.nevada.ca.us

Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240 Rosevile, CA 95678 Prop65@placer.ca.gov

David Hollister, District Attorney Plumas County 520 Main Street Quincy, CA 95971 davidhollister@countyofplumas.com

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sicda.org

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney, Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Valery Lopez, Deputy City Attorney 1390 Market Street, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94102 Valerie.lopez@sfcityatty.org

Summer Stephan, District Attorney San Diego County 330 West Broadway San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney San Diego County 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

Athea M. Sargeant, Assistant DA 350 Rhode Island Street San Francisco, CA 94103 Athea.sargeant@sfgov.org

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney Sacramento Country 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney Alameda County 7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Barbara Yook, District Attorney Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249 Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on January 31, 2022 at Oakland, California.

Jacob Janzen

### **SERVICE LIST**

District Attorney of Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney of Amador County 708 Court Street, Ste. 202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney of Butte County Administration Building 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney of Colusa County 346 Fifth Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney of Del Norte County 450 H Street, Ste. 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney of El Dorado County 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney of Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Ste. 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney of Glenn County P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney of Humboldt County 825 5th Street Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney of Imperial County 939 Main Street, Ste. 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney of Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 District Attorney of Kings County 1400 West Lacey Blvd. Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney of Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney of Los Angeles County Hall of Justice 211 W. Temple Street, Ste. 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210

District Attorney of Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney of Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Rm. 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney of Mendocino County P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney of Modoc County 204 S. Court Street, Rm. 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney of Mono County P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93546

District Attorney of Orange County 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney of San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Fl. Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney of San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415