

## SIXTY DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION

*California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986  
(Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq.) (“Proposition 65”)*

DATE: 1/31/2022

TO: Mineral Fusion Natural Brands LLC  
California Attorney General’s Office;  
District Attorney’s Office for 58 Counties; and  
City Attorneys for Los Angeles, Sacramento, San Diego, San Jose, and San Francisco

FROM: Piyush Yadav

RE: Supplemental Proposition 65 Notice (December 2020 AG Notice No. 2020-03301):  
Titanium Dioxide (airborne, unbound particles of respirable size) in Certain Loose Powder Cosmetic Products

### I. INTRODUCTION

My name is Piyush Yadav. I am a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. I seek to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and, if possible, to improve human health by reducing hazardous substances contained in such items.

I have identified violations of California’s Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (“Proposition 65”), which is codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.*, with respect to the products identified below in Exhibit A. These violations by have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged violator, Mineral Fusion Natural Brands LLC (Mineral Fusion), failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products.

Please allow this letter to serve as notice of these violations to Mineral Fusion and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d), I intend to file a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

### II. GENERAL PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For general information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment’s (“OEHHA”) Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or visit their website at <http://oehha.ca.gov/proposition-65>. I have enclosed with this letter a copy of a summary of Proposition 65 prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment.

### III. LISTED CHEMICAL

The violations involve exposure to the chemical Titanium Dioxide (airborne, unbound particles of respirable size). Effective September 2, 2011, the State of California officially listed Titanium dioxide

(airborne, unbound particles of respirable size) as a chemical known to cause cancer.

#### **IV. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATION (PRODUCT EXPOSURE )**

Mineral Fusion knowingly and intentionally exposed and continues to knowingly and intentionally expose consumers within the State of California to Titanium Dioxide (airborne, unbound particles of respirable size). The warning prong of Proposition 65 states that “[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual...” *Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6*.

The specific types of products that are causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are listed in Exhibit A below. All products within the type covered by this Notice shall be referred to hereinafter as the “Products.” Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least the dates stated in Exhibit A, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until these known toxic chemicals are either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemicals. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. Mineral Fusion violated Proposition 65 because it failed to provide persons using these Products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to these chemicals, including by failing to have a warning on product labels for Products sold in California and failing to have a warning on the webpages where the Products are sold to purchasers in California.

Through the act of buying, acquiring and using any and all of the Products, California citizens are exposed to Titanium Dioxide (airborne, unbound particles of respirable size) when used in a standard manner, including as indicated on the product labels. The route of exposure to this chemical has been and continues to be inhalation. Inhalation of the listed chemical occurs when the Products are applied to the skin and face as directed, which releases respirable-sized particles of titanium dioxide into the air. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the carcinogenic hazards of airborne titanium dioxide.

#### **V. CONTACT INFORMATION**

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to me through my counsel’s office at the following address:

Elizabeth Kramer  
Erickson Kramer Osborne LLP  
44 Tehama Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
Telephone: (415) 635-0631  
Email: elizabeth@eko.law

## **VI. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS**

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, I intend to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against Mineral Fusion unless it agrees in a binding written instrument to: (1) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposure to the identified chemicals, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings compliant with Proposition 65 to all persons located in California who purchased the above products in the last three years. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned exposures to the identified chemicals, as well as expensive and time-consuming litigation.

If Mineral Fusion is interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and expensive litigation, please feel free to contact my counsel identified in Section V above. It should be noted that neither my counsel nor I can: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; or (2) speak for the Attorney General or any district or city attorney who received this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with me will resolve my claims, such agreement may not satisfy public enforcement officials.

## **VII. VIOLATING PRODUCTS (EXHIBIT A)**

### **Mineral SPF 30 Brush-On Sun Defense (17.3% titanium dioxide)**

Further, it is this citizen's position that Mineral Fusion is obligated to continue to conduct in good faith an investigation into other specific products within the type or category described above that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the notice recipient's custody or control) during the relevant period so as to ensure that the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Elizabeth Kramer, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 1/31/2022, Supplemental sixty-day Notice of Violation (“Notice”) in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the Notice have violated California Health and Safety Code § 25249.6, by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
2. I am the attorney for the noticing party, Piyush Yadav.
3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that “reasonable and meritorious case for the private action” means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff’s case can be established, and the information did not prove that the alleged Violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute;
5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), *i.e.*, (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: 1/31/2022

/s/ Elizabeth Kramer  
Elizabeth Kramer  
Attorney for Piyush Yadav

**PROOF OF SERVICE PURSUANT TO 27 CCR § 25903**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action. My business address is 44 Tehama Street, San Francisco, CA. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred.

On 1/31/2022, I served the following documents:

SUPPLEMENTAL SIXTY DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION CAL. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.5 *ET SEQ.*;  
PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY;  
CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties listed below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery as indicated below:

Counsel for the company to whom the Notice is addressed (served electronically by agreement);  
City and District Attorneys listed in Attached Service List (First Class Mail).

Also on 1/31/2022, I transmitted via electronic mail the above-listed documents to the electronic mail addresses of the City and/or District Attorneys who have specifically authorized e-mail service and the authorization appears on the Attorney General's website. (See Attached Electronic Service List.)

Also on 1/31/2022, I served the California Attorney General (via website Portal) by uploading a true and correct copy thereof as a PDF file via the California Attorney General's website. Also on 1/31/2022, I also served the California Attorney General a true and correct copy of the CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS.

Dated: 1/31/2022

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Elizabeth Kramer  
Elizabeth Kramer  
Attorney for Piyush Yadav

## SERVICE LIST

District Attorney,  
ALPINE COUNTY  
P.O. Box 248  
Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney,  
AMADOR COUNTY  
708 Court Street, #202  
Jackson, CA 95642  
District Attorney,

BUTTE COUNTY  
25 County Center Drive  
Administration Building  
Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney,  
COLUSA COUNTY  
346 5th Street, Suite 101  
Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney,  
DEL NORTE COUNTY  
450 H Street, Room 171  
Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney,  
EL DORADO COUNTY  
778 Pacific Street  
Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney,  
FRESNO COUNTY  
2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000  
Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney,  
GLENN COUNTY  
P.O. Box 430  
Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney,  
HUMBOLDT COUNTY  
825 5th Street  
Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney,  
IMPERIAL COUNTY  
940 West Main Street, Suite 102  
El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney,  
KERN COUNTY  
1215 Truxtun Avenue  
Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney,  
KINGS COUNTY  
1400 West Lacey Blvd.  
Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney,  
LAKE COUNTY  
255 N. Forbes Street  
Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney,  
LOS ANGELES COUNTY  
211 W. Temple Street, Suite 1200  
Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney,  
MADERA COUNTY  
209 West Yosemite Avenue  
Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney,  
MARIN COUNTY  
3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130  
San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney,  
MARIPOSA COUNTY  
P.O. Box 730  
Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney,  
MENDOCINO COUNTY  
P.O. Box 1000  
Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney,  
MERCED COUNTY  
550 West Main Street  
Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney  
MODOC COUNTY  
204 S. Court Street, Room 202  
Alturas, CA 96101

District Attorney,  
MONO COUNTY  
P.O. Box 2053  
Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546

District Attorney,  
NEVADA COUNTY  
201 Commercial Street  
Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney,  
ORANGE COUNTY  
401 Civic Center Drive W  
Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney,  
PLACER COUNTY  
10810 Justice Center Drive  
Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney,  
PLUMAS COUNTY  
520 Main Street, Room 404  
Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney,  
SAN BENITO COUNTY  
419 4th Street  
Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney,  
SAN BERNADINO COUNTY  
303 W. Third Street  
San Bernardino, CA 92415

## **SERVICE LIST (Cont'd)**

District Attorney,  
SAN MATEO COUNTY  
400 County Center,  
Third Floor  
Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney,  
SHASTA COUNTY  
1355 West Street  
Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney,  
SIERRA COUNTY  
100 Courthouse Square  
Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney,  
SISKIYOU COUNTY  
P.O. Box 986  
Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney,  
SOLANO COUNTY  
675 Texas Street, Suite 4500  
Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney,  
STANISLAUS COUNTY  
832 12th Street, Suite 300  
Modesto, CA 95353

District Attorney,  
SUTTER COUNTY  
446 Second Street, Suite 102  
Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney,  
TEHAMA COUNTY  
P.O. Box 519  
Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney,  
TRINITY COUNTY  
P.O. Box 310  
Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney,  
TUOLUMNE COUNTY  
423 No. Washington Street  
Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney,  
YUBA COUNTY  
215 Fifth Street, Suite 152  
Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney  
200 N Main St, Suite 1800  
Los Angeles, CA 90012

Sacramento City Attorney  
915 I Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814

San Diego City Attorney  
1200 Third Ave #1620  
San Diego, CA 92101

San Francisco City Attorney  
1 Dr Carlton B Doodlett PL  
San Francisco, CA 94102

San Jose City Attorney  
200 E. Santa Clara St., 16<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Jose, CA 95113

Office of the California  
Attorney General  
Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting  
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000  
Oakland, CA 94612

## ELECTRONIC SERVICE LIST

**Nancy O'Malley**  
ALAMEDA COUNTY  
District Attorney  
CEPDProp65@acgov.org

**Barbara Yook**  
CALAVERAS COUNTY  
District Attorney  
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

**Stacey Grassini**  
CONTRA COSTA COUNTY  
Deputy District Attorney  
sgrassini@contracostada.org

**Thomas L. Hardy**  
District Attorney  
INYO COUNTY  
inyoda@inyocounty.us

**Michelle Latimer**  
LASSEN COUNTY  
Program Coordinator  
mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

**Dije Ndreu**  
MONTEREY COUNTY  
Deputy District Attorney  
Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

**Gary Lieberstein**  
NAPA COUNTY  
District Attorney  
CEPD@countyofnapa.org

**Paul E. Zellerbach**  
RIVERSIDE COUNTY  
District Attorney  
Prop65@rivcoda.org

**Anne Marie Schubert**  
SACRAMENTO COUNTY  
District Attorney  
Prop65@sacda.org

**Mark Ankcorn**  
SAN DIEGO COUNTY  
Deputy District Attorney  
CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

**Gregory Alker**  
SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY  
Assistant District Attorney  
gregory.alker@sfgov.org

**Tori Verber Salazar**  
SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY  
DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

**Eric J. Dobroth**  
SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY  
Deputy District Attorney  
edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

**Christopher Dalbey**  
SANTA BARBARA COUNTY  
Deputy District Attorney  
DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

**Yen Dang**  
SANTA CLARA COUNTY  
Supervising Deputy District Attorney  
EPU@da.sccgov.org

**Jeffrey S. Rosell**  
SANTA CRUZ COUNTY  
District Attorney  
Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

**Stephan R. Passalacqua**  
SONOMA COUNTY  
District Attorney  
jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

**Phillip J. Cline**  
TULARE COUNTY  
District Attorney  
Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

**Gregory D. Totten**  
VENTURA COUNTY  
District Attorney  
daspecialops@ventura.org

**Jeffery W. Reisig**  
YOLO COUNTY  
District Attorney  
cfepd@yolocounty.org