



ATTORNEYS AT LAW

Tel: 619-629-0527  
noam@entornolaw.com  
jake@entornolaw.com  
craig@entornolaw.com

225 Broadway, Suite 1900  
San Diego, CA 92101

June 24, 2022

**Via Certified Mail**

Chattem, Inc.  
c/o Stacy Apgar  
55 Corporate Dr  
Bridgewater, NJ 08807-1265

Walmart Inc.  
CT Corporation System  
330 N Brand Blvd STE 700  
Glendale, CA 91203

**Re: Proposition 65 Notice of Violation**

To Whom It May Concern:

We represent Environmental Health Advocates, Inc., an organization in the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. This letter serves as notice that the parties listed above are in violation of Proposition 65, the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, commencing with section 25249.5 of the Health and Safety Code (“Proposition 65”). In particular, the violations alleged by this notice consist of types of harm that may potentially result from exposures to the toxic chemical Benzophenone. This chemical was listed as a carcinogen on June 22, 2012.

The specific type of product that is causing exposures in violation of Proposition 65 is sunscreen, including but not limited to:

	<b><u>Product Name</u></b>	<b><u>Manufacturer</u></b>	<b><u>Distributor/Retailer</u></b>
1.	Goldbond Age Defense hand cream SPF3	Chattem, Inc.	Walmart Inc.

The route of exposure for the violations is dermal absorption by consumers. These exposures occur through the reasonably foreseeable use of the product. The sales of this product have been occurring since at least February 2022, are continuing to this day and will continue to occur as long as the product subject to this notice is sold to and used by consumers.

Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the exposures to Benzophenone caused by ordinary use of the product. The Parties are

in violation of Proposition 65 by failing to provide such warning to consumers and as a result of the sales of this product, exposures to Benzophenone have been occurring without proper warnings.

Pursuant to Proposition 65, notice and intent to sue shall be provided to violators 60-days before filing a complaint. This letter provides notice of the alleged violation to the parties listed above and the appropriate governmental authorities. A summary of Proposition 65 is attached.

EHA identifies Fred Duran as a responsible individual within the entity.

If you have any questions or wish to discuss any of the above, please contact me.

Sincerely,

**ENTORNO LAW LLP.**

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Noam Glick". The signature is written in a cursive style.

Noam Glick

Jake Schulte  
Craig M. Nicholas

Enclosures

## CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

I, Noam Glick, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that “reasonable and meritorious case for the private action” means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: June 24, 2022



Noam Glick, Attorney at Law

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Ali Harris, declare that I am over the age of 18 years, and am not a party to the within action. I am employed in the County of San Diego, California, where the mailing occurs; and my business address is 225 Broadway, 19<sup>th</sup> Floor, San Diego, California 92101.

On June 24, 2022, I served the following documents: **(1) 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.7(d); (2) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; (3) PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY; and (4) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENT (served only on the Attorney General)** on the parties listed below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each party and depositing it at my business address with the U.S. Postal Service for delivery by Certified Mail with the postage thereon fully prepaid:

### **Via Certified Mail**

Walmart Inc.  
CT Corporation System  
330 N Brand Blvd STE 700  
Glendale, CA 91203

Chattem, Inc.  
c/o Stacy Apgar  
55 Corporate Dr  
Bridgewater, NJ 08807-1265

On June 24, 2022, I served the California Attorney General (via website Portal) by uploading a true and correct copy thereof as a PDF file via the California Attorney General's website.

On June 24, 2022, I transmitted via electronic mail the above-listed documents to the electronic mail addresses of the City and/or District Attorneys who have specifically authorized e-mail service and the authorization appears on the Attorney General's web site.

### **See Attached Service List**

On June 24, 2022, I served the following persons and/or entities at the last known address by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope and depositing it at my business address with the U.S. Postal Service for delivery with the postage thereon fully prepaid, and addressed as follows:

### **See Attached Service List**

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on June 24, 2022, at San Diego, California.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Ali Harris

## Appendix A

### OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA PROTECTION AGENCY THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACTION 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead and Toxic Enforcement Act 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65") A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide law. The reader is directed to the statute and its implementing regulations (See citations below) for further information.

Proposition 65 appears in California law as Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code Regulations, Sections 250000 through 27000.

#### **WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?**

*The "Governor's List"* Proposition 65 requires the Governor to publish a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm. This list must be updated at least once a year. Over 725 chemicals have been listed as of November 16, 2001. Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under this law. Businesses that produce, use, release, or otherwise engage in activities involving those chemicals must comply with the

following:

***Clear and Reasonable Warnings.*** A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed. Exposures are exempt from the warning requirement if they occur less than twelve months after the date of the listing of the chemical.

***Prohibition from discharges into drinking water.*** A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Discharges are exempt from this requirement if they occur less than twenty months after the date of the listing of chemical.

#### **DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?**

Yes. The law exempts:

***Governmental agencies and public water utilities.*** All agencies of the federal, State or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

***Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer.*** For chemicals that are listed as known to the State to cause cancer (“carcinogens”), a warning is not required if the business can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses “no significant risk.” This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70- year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific “no significant risk” levels for more than 250 listed carcinogens.

***Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question.*** For chemicals known to the State to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm (“reproductive toxicants”), a warning is not required if the business can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the “no observable effect level (NOEL),” divided by a 1,000- fold safety or uncertainty factor. The “no observable effect level” is the highest dose level which has not been associated with an observable adverse reproductive or developmental effect.

***Discharge that do not result in a “significant amount” of the listed chemical entering into any source of drinking water.*** The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a “significant amount” of the list chemical has not, does not, or will not enter any drinking water source, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A “significant amount” means any

detectable amount; expect an amount that would meet the “ no significant risk” or “no observable effect” test if an individual were exposed to such an amount in drinking water.

#### **HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?**

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys (those in cities with a population exceeding 750,000). Lawsuit may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. A notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in regulations (Title 27. California Code of Regulations, Section 25903). A private party may not pursue an enforcement action directly under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an action within sixty days of notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court of law to stop committing the violation.

#### ***FOR FURTHER INFORMATION...***

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment’s Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916)445-6900

## SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612	The Honorable Stacey Montgomery Lassen County District Attorney 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130	The Honorable Candice Hooper San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th Street, Second Floor Hollister, CA 95203	The Honorable Gregg Cohen Tehama County District Attorney 444 Oak Street, Room L Red Bluff, CA 96080
The Honorable Terese Drabec Alpine County District Attorney 270 Laramie Street, PO BOX 248 Markieville, CA 96120	The Honorable Jackie Lacey Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012	The Honorable Michael Ramos San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	The Honorable Eric Heryford Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
The Honorable Todd Riebe Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642	The Honorable David Linn Madera County District Attorney 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637	The Honorable Bonnie Dumanis San Diego County District Attorney 330 W. Broadway Street San Diego, CA 92101	The Honorable Tim Ward Tulare County District Attorney 221 South Mooney Boulevard, Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93291-4593
The Honorable Michael Ramsay Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965	The Honorable Edward Berberian Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903	The Honorable George Gascon San Francisco County District Attorney 850 Bryant Street, Room 322 San Francisco, CA 94103	The Honorable Laura Krieg Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370
The Honorable Barbara Yook Calaveras County District Attorney 991 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249	The Honorable Thomas Cooke Mariposa County District Attorney 5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338	The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar San Joaquin County District Attorney 222 East Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95201	The Honorable Gregory Totten Ventura County District Attorney 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009
The Honorable John Poyner Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street Colusa, CA 95932	The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendocino County District Attorney 100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482	The Honorable Dan Dow San Luis Obispo County District Atty 1035 Palm Street, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	The Honorable Jeff Reisig Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695
The Honorable Mark Peterson Contra Costa County District Attorney 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553	The Honorable Larry Morse II Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340	The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	The Honorable Patrick McGrath Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901
The Honorable Dale Trigg Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531	The Honorable Jordan Funk Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101	The Honorable Joyce Dudley Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101	The Honorable Mike Feuer Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles 800 City Hall East 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012
The Honorable Vern Pierson El Dorado County District Attorney 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667	The Honorable Tim Kendall Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517	The Honorable Jeffrey Rosen Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 95110	The Honorable James Sanchez Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 I Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814
The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulara Street, #1000 Fresno, CA 93721	The Honorable Dean Filipo Monterey County District Attorney P.O. Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902	The Honorable Jeff Roseff Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060	The Honorable Jan Goldsmith Office of the City Attorney, San Diego 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1820 San Diego, CA 92101
The Honorable Dwayne Stewart Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988	The Honorable Allison Haley Napa County District Attorney 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559	The Honorable Stephen Carlton Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001	The Honorable Dennis Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102
The Honorable Maggie Fleming Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, Fourth Floor Eureka, CA 95501	The Honorable Clifford Newell Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959	The Honorable Lawrence Allen Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square Downsville, CA 95936	The Honorable Richard Doyle Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 18th Floor San Jose, CA 95113
The Honorable Gilbert Otero Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243	The Honorable Tony Rackauckas Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701	The Honorable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097	Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 85 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 85 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550
The Honorable Thomas Hardy Inyo County District Attorney P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526	The Honorable R. Scott Owens Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678	The Honorable Krishna Abrams Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533	
The Honorable Lisa Green Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301	The Honorable David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971	The Honorable Jill Ravitch Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403	
The Honorable Keith Fagundas Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230	The Honorable Michael Hestrin Riverside County District Attorney 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501	The Honorable Birgit Fladager Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354	
The Honorable Donald Anderson Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes Street Lakeport CA 95453	The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento CA 95814	The Honorable Amanda Hopper Sutter County District Attorney 463 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City CA 95991	

## **E-Mail Service List**

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney  
CONTRA COSTA COUNTY  
900 Ward Street  
Martinez, CA 94553  
[sggrassini@contracostada.org](mailto:sggrassini@contracostada.org)

Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator  
LASSEN COUNTY  
220 S. Lassen Street  
Susanville, CA 96130  
[mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us](mailto:mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us)

Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney  
MONTEREY COUNTY  
1200 Aguajito Road  
Monterey, CA 93940  
[Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us](mailto:Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us)

Allison Haley, District Attorney  
NAPA COUNTY  
1127 First Street, Suite C  
Napa, CA 94559  
[CEPD@countyofnapa.org](mailto:CEPD@countyofnapa.org)

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney  
RIVERSIDE COUNTY  
3072 Orange Street  
Riverside, CA 92501  
[Prop65@rivcoda.org](mailto:Prop65@rivcoda.org)

Barbara Yook, District Attorney  
CALAVERAS COUNTY  
891 Mountain Ranch Rd.  
San Andreas, CA 95249  
[Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us](mailto:Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us)

Alethea M. Sargent, Assistant District  
Attorney SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY  
350 Rhode Island Street  
San Francisco, CA 94103  
[alethea.sargent@sfgov.org](mailto:alethea.sargent@sfgov.org)

Summer Stephan, District Attorney  
SAN DIEGO COUNTY  
330 West Broadway  
San Diego, CA 92101  
[SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcdca.org](mailto:SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcdca.org)

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City  
Attorney  
CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
1200 Third Avenue  
San Diego, CA 92101  
[CityAttyCrimProp65@sandiego.gov](mailto:CityAttyCrimProp65@sandiego.gov)

Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney  
CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO  
1390 Market Street, 7th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
[Valerie.Lopez@sfcityattv.org](mailto:Valerie.Lopez@sfcityattv.org)

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney  
SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY  
County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor  
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408  
[edobroth@co.slo.ca.us](mailto:edobroth@co.slo.ca.us)

Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney  
SANTA CLARA COUNTY  
70 W Hedding St  
San Jose, CA 95110  
[EPU@da.sccgov.org](mailto:EPU@da.sccgov.org)

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney  
SONOMA COUNTY  
600 Administration Drive  
Sonoma, CA 95403  
[jbarnes@sonoma-county.org](mailto:jbarnes@sonoma-county.org)

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney  
TULARE COUNTY  
221 S Mooney Blvd  
Visalia, CA 95370  
[Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us](mailto:Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us)

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney  
VENTURA COUNTY  
800 S Victoria Ave  
Ventura, CA 93009  
[daspecialops@ventura.org](mailto:daspecialops@ventura.org)

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney  
YOLO COUNTY  
301 Second Street  
Woodland, CA 95695  
[cfepd@yolocounty.org](mailto:cfepd@yolocounty.org)

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney  
SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY  
222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202  
Stockton, CA 95202  
[DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org](mailto:DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org)

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney  
SANTA BARBARA COUNTY  
1112 Santa Barbara St.  
Santa Barbara, CA 93101  
[DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us](mailto:DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us)

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney  
ALAMEDA COUNTY  
7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650  
Oakland, CA 94621  
[CEPDProp65@acgov.org](mailto:CEPDProp65@acgov.org)

Barbara M. Yook, District Attorney  
CALAVERAS COUNTY  
891 Mountain Ranch Road  
San Andreas CA 95249  
[Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us](mailto:Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us)

David Hollister, District Attorney  
PLUMAS COUNTY  
520 Main St.  
Quincy, CA 95971  
[davidhollister@countyofplumas.com](mailto:davidhollister@countyofplumas.com)

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney  
SACRAMENTO COUNTY  
901 G Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
[Prop65@sacda.org](mailto:Prop65@sacda.org)

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney  
SANTA CRUZ COUNTY  
701 Ocean Street  
Santa Cruz, CA 95060  
[Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us](mailto:Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us)

Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney  
MERCED COUNTY  
550 West Main Street  
Merced, CA 95340  
[Prop65@countyofmerced.com](mailto:Prop65@countyofmerced.com)

Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney  
NEVADA COUNTY  
201 Commercial Street  
Nevada City, CA 95959  
[DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us](mailto:DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us)

Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney  
INYO COUNTY  
168 North Edwards Street  
Independence, CA 93526  
[inyoda@inyocounty.us](mailto:inyoda@inyocounty.us)

Walter W. Wall, District Attorney  
MARIPOSA COUNTY  
P.O. Box 730  
Mariposa, CA 95338  
[mcda@mariposacounty.org](mailto:mcda@mariposacounty.org)

Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney  
PLACER COUNTY  
10810 Justice Center Drive  
Roseville, CA 95678  
[prop65@placer.ca.gov](mailto:prop65@placer.ca.gov)

District Attorney  
ORANGE COUNTY  
700 Civic Center Drive West  
Santa Ana, CA 92701  
[Prop65Notice@da.ocgov.com](mailto:Prop65Notice@da.ocgov.com)