

Main Post Office, P.O. Box 751 Berkeley, CA 94701

June 28, 2022

## NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.5 ET SEQ.

Attorney General Rob Bonta c/o Proposition 65 Coordinator Office of the Attorney General P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

## Re: Cadmium in Sunflower Seed Butter Products

Dear Attorney General,

As You Sow ("AYS") is a 501(c)(3) non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, toxics reduction, the promotion of and improvement of human health, the improvement of worker and consumer rights, environmental education and the protection of the environment, and corporate accountability. AYS is based in Berkeley, California, and was incorporated in 1992 under the laws of the State of California.

AYS has documented violations of California's Safe Drinking Water & Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), codified at Health & Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq; specifically Section 25249.6, which provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." This letter serves to provide notification of these violations to Sprouts Farmers Market Inc. and public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to section 25249.7(d) of the statute, AYS intends to bring an enforcement action sixty days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

A summary of the statute and its implementing regulations, which was prepared by the lead agency designated under the statute, is enclosed with the notices served upon the violator(s). The specific details of the violations that are the subject of this notice are provided below.

Alleged violator(s). The names of the violator(s) covered by this notice are:

• Sprouts Farmers Market Inc.

**Chemical(s).** These violations involve exposures to cadmium from the products listed below. The State of California has officially listed cadmium as cadmium is known to cause cancer and birth defects or reproductive harm. *See* Chemicals Known to the State to Cause Cancer or Reproductive Toxicity, available at <a href="http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65\_list/Newlist.html">http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65\_list/Newlist.html</a>.

**Consumer products.** The products that are the subject of this notice are sunflower seed butter products that contain cadmium and are, at any time, manufactured, distributed, or sold by the alleged violator(s), including but not limited to the following:

- Organic Sunflower Butter Unsalted & Unsweetened Cream
- Sunflower Butter Creamy

which are manufactured, distributed and/or sold in California by Sprouts Farmers Market Inc.

**Route of exposure.** Use of the products identified in this notice result in human exposures to cadmium. The route of exposure is ingestion. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the products regarding the health hazards of cadmium.

**Duration of violation.** These ongoing violations have occurred on every day since at least June 28, 2021, as well as every day since the products were introduced in the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until these known toxic cadmium levels are removed from the products.

Pursuant to Title 11, Cal. Code Regs. section 3100, a certificate of merit is attached hereto.

In keeping with its public interest mission and to expeditiously rectify this ongoing violation of California law, *As You Sow* is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter without engaging in costly and protracted litigation. If you are interested in discussing this issue, please contact Jonathan Kirkland at <u>jkirkland@asyousow.org</u> or (510) 735-8158 x734.

Sincerely,

f elles

Danielle Fugere

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

(for As You Sow's Notice of Proposition 65 Violation on Sprouts Farmers Market Inc.)

I, Jonathan Kirkland, declare:

This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties in the notice have violated section 25249.6 of the Health and Safety Code by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

I am Staff Attorney of the noticing party.

I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General has attached to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in section 25249.7(h)(2) of the Health and Safety Code, i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: June 28, 2022

Jonathan Kirkland

Enclosure (Attorney General Copy only)

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States and over the age of 18 years. My business address is: Main Post Office, P.O. Box 751, Berkeley, CA 94701.

On June 28, 2022, I served the following documents:

- Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq.
- Certificate of Merit
- "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary"

on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below, and depositing it at a United States Postal Service Office for delivery by Certified Mail:

COMPANY'S	Sprouts Farmers Market, Inc.
ADDRESS	c/o Corporate Service Company
	251 Little Falls Drive
	Wilmington, DE 19808

On June 28, 2022, I served the following documents:

- Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq.
- Certificate of Merit

on each of the District Attorneys on the service list attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the service list attached hereto and depositing it at a United States Postal Service mail box for delivery by First Class Mail.

On June 28, 2022, I served the following documents on the Attorney General using the Attorney General's Proposition 65 electronic Notice Filing Form (<u>https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice</u>):

- Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq.
- Certificate of Merit, including Supporting Documentation Required by Title 11, C.C.R. § 3102

Executed on June 28, 2022, at Berkeley, California.

Jesus Diaz

The Honorable Nancy E. O'Malley Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612

The Honorable Michael Atwell Alpine County District Attorney P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

The Honorable Todd Riebe Amador County District Attorney 708 Court St., Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642

The Honorable Michael Ramsey Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive Administration Building Oroville, CA 95965

The Honorable Barbara Yook Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Rd. San Andreas, CA 95249

The Honorable Matthew R. Beauchamp Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth St., Ste. 101 Colusa, CA 95932

The Honorable Diana Becton Contra Costa County District Attorney 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

The Honorable Katherine Micks Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H St., Suite 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

The Honorable Vernon Pierson El Dorado County District Attorney 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667

The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp Fresno County District Attorney 2220 <u>Tulare S</u>t., Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721 The Honorable Dwayne Stewart Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

The Honorable Maggie Fleming Humboldt County District Attorney 825 Fifth St., Floor 4 Eureka, CA 95501

The Honorable Gilbert Otero Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main St., Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243

The Honorable Thomas L. Hardy Inyo County District Attorney P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526

The Honorable Thomas L. Hardy Inyo County District Attorney 168 North Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526

The Honorable Cynthia Zimmer Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Ave. Bakersfield, CA 93301

The Honorable Keith Fagundes Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Blvd. Hanford, CA 93230

The Honorable Susan Krones Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes St. Lakeport, CA 95453

The Honorable S. Melyssah Rios Lassen County District Attorney 2950 Riverside Drive, Suite 102 Susanville, CA 96130

The Honorable George Gascón Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple St., Ste. 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012 Mike Feuer Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Rm. 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable Sally Moreno Madera County District Attorney 209 West Yosemite Ave. Madera, CA 93637

The Honorable Lori Frugoli Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Dr., Room 145 San Rafael, CA 94903-4164

The Honorable Walter Wall Mariposa County District Attorney P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendocino County District Attorney P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

The Honorable Kimberly Lewis Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340

The Honorable Cynthia Campbell Modoc County District Attorney 204 South Court St., Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

The Honorable Jeanine Pacioni Monterey County District Attorney P.O. Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902

The Honorable Allison Haley Napa County District Attorney 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559

The Honorable Jesse Wilson Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial St. Nevada City, CA 95959 The Honorable Todd Spitzer Orange County District Attorney 300 N. Flower St. Santa Ana, CA 92703

The Honorable Michael Hestrin Riverside County District Attorney 3960 Orange St. Riverside, CA 92501

The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814

The Honorable Candice Hooper-Mancino San Benito County District Attorney 419 Fourth Street Hollister, CA 95023

The Honorable Jason Anderson San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West Third St. San Bernardino, CA 92415

Mara W. Elliot San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 Third Ave., Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable Summer Stephan San Diego County District Attorney 330 West Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable Chesa Boudin San Francisco County District Attorney 880 Bryant St., Floor 3 San Francisco, CA 94103

David Chiu San Francisco City Attorney's Office City Hall, Room 234, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Pl. San Francisco, CA 94102

The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar San Joaquin County District Attorney P.O. Box 990 Stockton, CA 95201-0990 The Honorable Morgan Briggs Gire Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Dr., Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678

Nora Frimann San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara St. San Jose, CA 95113

The Honorable Dan Dow San Luis Obispo County District Attorney 1035 Palm St., 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

The Honorable Stephen M. Wagstaffe San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Floor 3 Redwood City, CA 94063

> The Honorable Joyce Dudley Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara St. Santa Barbara, CA 93101

The Honorable Jeffrey F. Rosen Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 West Hedding St., West Wing San Jose, CA 95110

The Honorable Jeffrey S. Rosell Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean St., Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

The Honorable Stephanie A. Bridgett Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

The Honorable Sandra Groven Sierra County District Attorney P.O. Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936

The Honorable J. Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097 The Honorable David D. Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main St., Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

The Honorable Krishna A. Abrams Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas St., Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

The Honorable Jill Ravitch Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Dr., Room 212-J Santa Rosa, CA 95403

The Honorable Birgit Fladager Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th St., Ste. 300 Modesto, CA 95353

The Honorable Amanda L. Hopper Sutter County District Attorney 463 Second St., #102 Yuba City, CA 95991

The Honorable Matthew Rogers Tehama County District Attorney P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

The Honorable James E. Gandy Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

The Honorable Tim Ward Tulare County District Attorney 221 South Mooney Blvd., Room 224 Visalia, CA 93291

The Honorable Laura Krieg Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 North Washington St. Sonora, CA 95370

The Honorable Erik Nasarenko Ventura County District Attorney 800 South Victoria Ave., Suite 314 Ventura, CA 93009 The Honorable Jeff Reisig Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second St. Woodland, CA 95695 The Honorable Clint Curry Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth St., Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901 The Honorable Wayne Philips Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093