KAWAHITO LAW GROUP APC 300 Corporate Pointe, Suite 340 Culver City, CA 90230 Phone: 310-746-5300

Fax: 310-593-2520

JAMES K. KAWAHITO Direct Dial: 310-746-5302 jkawahito@kawahitolaw.com

September 14, 2022

# 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET. SEQ. (PROPOSITION 65)

Dear Alleged Violator(s) and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

The Kawahito Law Group APC represents EnviroProtect, LLC ("EnviroProtect") with respect to this matter. EnviroProtect is a California company acting in the interest of the general public seeking to further, among other causes, the protection of the environment, awareness of dangerous chemicals in consumer products, and corporate accountability. As described below, EnviroProtect has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65" or "Act"), codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. This letter serves to provide EnviroProtect's Notice of these violations. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the Act, EnviroProtect intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest sixty (60) days after effective service of this Notice unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

<u>General Information and Summary of Proposition 65</u>. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65 prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment is attached to this letter.

<u>Alleged Violators</u>. The name of the entity or entities covered by this Notice and who are alleged to be in violation of Proposition 65 (collectively the "Violators") are:

Walmart Inc.

Fantasia Accessories, Ltd.

702 SW 8<sup>th</sup> Street

1385 Broadway, 4th Floor

Bentonville, AR 72716

New York, New York 10018

**Consumer Product.** The products ("Products") which are causing an exposure without a warning in violation of Proposition 65, are:

Product(s)	Retailer(s)	Manufacturer(s)/Distributor(s)/ Importer(s)
Justice Bare-ly 6 Nail Polish Set (Component tested was the clear face of the reusable bag) UPC 043834250548 and similar products	Walmart	Fantasia Accessories, Ltd. Justice Brand Holdings LLC

September 14, 2022 Page 2

<u>Listed Chemical and Route of Exposure</u>. The chemical that is the subject of this Notice is Di-(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate ("DEHP"). The consumer exposures at issue result from the use of the Products in accordance with their intended use including the handling of the Products by hand. The primary routes of exposure are oral ingestion and dermal absorption. The types of harm from the chemicals at issue include Developmental Toxicity, Male Reproductive Toxicity, and Cancer.

Period of Exposure and Violation. Exposures to DEHP from the use of the Products have occurred each day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, but at a minimum since August 28, 2022. Moreover, these exposures will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the Products. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical resulting from contact with the Products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the listed chemical from reasonable foreseeable use of the Products.

Resolution of Noticed Claims. Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, EnviroProtect is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter to have the ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified. To that end, EnviroProtect intends to file a private enforcement action as provided for in the Act for the alleged violations by the Violators, unless Violators agree in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) recall the listed Products or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those who have received such Products; (2) reformulate the Products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals or affix clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning labels for Products sold in the future; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemicals, and avoid costly and time-consuming litigation.

To the extent you are interested in discussing a potential early resolution of this matter, you may communicate directly with EnviroProtect's attorneys using the below contact information.

<u>Contact Information</u>. Please direct all questions or issues concerning this Notice to EnviroProtect's counsel at the following address:

James Kawahito
Kawahito Law Group APC
300 Corporate Pointe, Suite 340
Culver City, CA 90230
tel. 310-746-5300
email jkawahito@kawahitolaw.com

September 14, 2022 Page 3

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service
OEHHA Summary (to Violators only)
Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

September 14, 2022 Page 4

#### CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

#### Re: EnviroProtect, LLC's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations

- I, James Kawahito, hereby declare:
  - 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  - 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.
  - 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
  - 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
  - 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: September 14, 2022

James Kawahito

September 14, 2022 Page 5

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 300 Corporate Pointe, Suite 340 Culver City, CA 90230.

On September 14, 2022 I served the following: 1. 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 2. Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d) 3. The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65); A Summary on the alleged Violators listed below via First Class Certified Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Walmart Inc. 702 SW 8<sup>th</sup> Street Bentonville, AR 72716

Fantasia Accessories, Ltd. 1385 Broadway, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, New York 10018

Walmart Inc. c/o 1505 Corporation CT Corporation System 330 N. Brand Blvd., Ste. 700 Glendale, CA 91203 Fantasia Accessories, Ltd. c/o Edward Azar 31 W. 34<sup>th</sup> Street New York, NY 10001

Justice Brand Holdings LLC c/o The Limited Liability Company 240 Madison Avenue, 15<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, NY 10016

On September 14, 2022 I served the following: 1. 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6; 2. Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d); 3. Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy); Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the certificate of merit On the following parties by uploading the foregoing documents at the webpage listed below:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement

https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

September 14, 2022 Page 6

On September 14, 2022 I served the following: 1. 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6; 2. Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d) to the public enforcers by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, with postage fully prepaid with the U.S. Postal Service, addressed to the parties listed on the attached Service List.

I declare under penalty of perjury that under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated: September 14, 2022

Sebastian Burnside

September 14, 2022 Page 7

## **SERVICE LIST**

Alameda County District Attorney	Alpine County District Attorney	Amador County District Attorney
1225 Fallon Street, Room 900	P.O. Box 248	708 Court Street, #202
Oakland, CA 94612	Markleeville, CA 96120	Jackson, CA 95642
Butte County District Attorney	Calaveras County District Attorney	Colusa County District Attorney
25 County Center Drive, Suite 245	891 Mountain Ranch Road	346 5th Street, Suite 101
Oroville, CA 95965	San Andreas, CA 95249	Colusa, CA 95932
Contra Costa County District	Del Norte County District Attorney	El Dorado County District Attorney
Attorney 900 Ward Street	450 H Street, Room 171	515 Main Street
	Crescent City, CA 95531	Placerville, CA 95667
Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org		
Fresno County District Attorney	Glenn County District Attorney	Humboldt County District Attorney
2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000	P.O. Box 430	525 5th Street, 4th Floor
Fresno, CA 93721	Willows, CA 95988	Eureka, CA 95501
Imperial County District Attorney	Inyo County District Attorney	Kern County District Attorney
940 West Main Street, Suite 102	230 W. Line Street	1215 Truxtun Avenue
El Centro, CA 92243	Bishop, CA 93514	Bakersfield, CA 93301
Kings County District Attorney	Lake County District Attorney	Lassen County District Attorney
1400 West Lacey Blvd.	255 N. Forbes Street	220 S. Lassen Street
Hanford, CA 93230	Lakeport, CA 95453	Susanville, CA 96130
		[field_prop65ctacts_title]
		mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us
Los Angeles County District	Madera County District Attorney	Marin County District Attorney
Attorney	209 West Yosemite Avenue	3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130
210 W. Temple St., 18 <sup>th</sup> Floor	Madera, CA 93637	San Rafael, CA 94903
Los Angeles, CA 90012		
Mariposa County District Attorney	Mendocino County District Attorney	Merced County District Attorney
P.O. Box 730	P.O. Box 1000	550 West Main Street
Mariposa, CA 95338	Ukiah, CA 9548	Merced, CA 95340
Modoc County District Attorney	Mono County District Attorney	Monterey County District Attorney
204 S. Court Street Room 202	P.O. Box 2053	1200 Aguajito Road
Alturas, CA 96101	Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546	Monterey, CA 93940
		Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
Napa County District Attorney	Nevada County District Attorney	Orange County District Attorney
931 Parkway Mall	201 Commercial Street	401 Civic Center Drive West
Napa, CA 94559	Nevada City, CA 95959	Santa Ana, CA 92701
CEPD@countyofnapa.org		
Placer County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney	Riverside County District Attorney
10810 Justice Center Drive	520 Main Street, Room 404	3072 Orange Street
Roseville, CA 95678	Quincy, CA 95971	Riverside, CA 92501
		Prop65@rivcoda.org
Sacramento County District Attorney	San Benito District Attorney	San Bernardino County District
901 G Street	419 4th Street	Attorney
Sacramento, CA 95814	Hollister, CA 95023	303 W. Third Street
Prop65@sacda.org		San Bernardino, CA 92415
San Diego County District Attorney	San Francisco County District	San Joaquin County District Attorney
330 W. Broadway, Suite 1300	Attorney	222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202
San Diego, CA 92101	732 Brannan Street	Stockton, CA 95202
	San Francisco, CA 94103	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org
	gregory.alker@sfgov.org	

September 14, 2022 Page 8

San Luis Obispo County District Attorney County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 [field_prop65ctacts_title] edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101
Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org	Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060	Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001
Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square Downieville, CA 95936 Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Dr Sonoma, CA 95403	Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097 Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95353	Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533 Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991
jbarnes@sonoma-county.org Tehama County District Attorney P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080	Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093	Tulare County District Attorney 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370	Ventura County District Attorney 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org	Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org
Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901	Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012	San Francisco, City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr Carlton B Goodlett Pl, San Francisco, CA 94102
San Diego City Attorney's Office 1200 Third Ave #1620, San Diego, CA 92101	San Jose City Attorney 200 E. Santa Clara St., 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95110	