

20062 SW Birch St, Suite 200 Newport Beach, CA 92660 Office: 949.200.8755 Facsimile: 866.843,8308

Facsimile: 866.843.8308 P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

October 13, 2022

AMENDED NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 *ET SEQ.* (PROPOSITION 65)

Re: This notice amends the original notice of violation AG #2022-01145 dated June 3, 2022. This amendment adds Sunny Dell Foods, LLC, as an Alleged Violator.

Dear Alleged Violators and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

I represent CalSafe Research Center, Inc. ("CRC"), 4533 MacArthur Blvd., Ste. 165, Newport Beach, CA 92660; Tel. (949) 630-0413. CRC's Executive Director is Eric Fairon. CRC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

CRC has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq., with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violators identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violators and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), CRC intends to pursue a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

<u>General Information about Proposition 65</u>. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is enclosed with this letter served to the alleged Violators identified below.

<u>Alleged Violators</u>. The names of the person/company covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the "Violators") are:

- 1. Topco Associates, LLC
- 2. Stater Bros. Markets
- 3. Sunny Dell Foods, LLC



20062 SW Birch St, Suite 200 Newport Beach, CA 92660 Office: 949.200.8755 Facsimile: 866.843.8308

P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

<u>Consumer Products and Listed Chemical</u>. The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

Culinary Tours, Nonpareil Capers, UPC#011225245206

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

It should be noted that CRC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

Route of Exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the recommended use of these products. Consequently, the route of exposure to this chemical has been and continues to be through ingestion.

Approximate Time Period of Violations. Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least April 3, 2022, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemical. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violators violated Proposition 65 because they failed to provide persons ingesting these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to this chemical.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, CRC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violators to: (1) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemical, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings compliant with Proposition 65 to all persons located in California who purchased the above products in the last three years. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemical, as well as an expensive and time-consuming litigation.

CRC has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this matter. Please direct all communications regarding this Amended Notice of Violation to my attention at the law



20062 SW Birch St, Suite 200 Newport Beach, CA 92660 Office: 949.200.8755 Facsimile: 866.843.8308

Facsimile: 866.843.8308 P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

office address and telephone number indicated on the letterhead or at P65@ManningLawOffice.com.

Sincerely,

Joseph R. Manning, Jr.

765@ManningLawOffice.com

Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

OEHHA Summary (to Alleged Violators only)

Factual Information in Support of Certificate of Merit (to AG only)



20062 SW Birch St, Suite 200 Newport Beach, CA 92660 Office: 949.200.8755 Facsimile: 866.843,8308

Facsimile: 866.843.8308 P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Re: Calsafe Research Center, Inc.'s Amended Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Topco Associates, LLC, Stater Bros. Markets, and Sunny Dell Foods, LLC

I, Joseph R. Manning, Jr., declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established, and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: October 13, 2022

Joseph R. Manning, Jr.

P65@ManningLawOffice.com



20062 SW Birch St, Suite 200 Newport Beach, CA 92660 Office: 949.200.8755 Facsimile: 866.843.8308 P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE PURSUANT TO 27 CCR § 25903

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States and over the age of 18 years of age. My business address is 20062 S.W. Birch, Newport Beach, CA 92660. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Newport Beach, California.

On October 13, 2022 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Standard Time, I served the following documents: AMENDED NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties listed below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

| Topco Associates, | Randy Skoda | Stater Bros. Market | Peter J. Van Helden |
|-------------------|----------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
| LLC | Topco Associates, | Sean S. Varner | Stater Bros. Market |
| Ricardo Celaya | LLC | 3750 University | 301 South |
| 3330 W Mineral | 3600 W. Mineral King | Avenue, Suite 610, | Tippecanoe Avenue, |
| King, Ste G | Ave., Suite E, | Riverside, CA | San Bernardino, CA |
| Visalia, CA 93291 | Visalia, CA 93291 | 92501 | 92408 |
| Gary Caligiuri | | | |
| Sunny Dell Foods, | | | |
| Inc. | | | |
| 135 North Fifth | | | |
| Street | | | |
| | | | |

On October 13, 2022 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Standard Time, I verified the following documents AMENDED NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT INCLUDING A SUMMARY OF CONFIDENTIAL FACTUAL INFORMATION; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1) were served on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was uploaded on the

Oxford, PA 19363



20062 SW Birch St, Suite 200 Newport Beach, CA 92660 Office: 949.200.8755

Facsimile: 866.843.8308 P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On October 13, 2022 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Standard Time, I verified the following documents **AMENDED NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** were served on the following parties when a true and correct copy thereof was sent via electronic mail to each of the parties listed below:

| Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney | Barbara Yook, District Attorney | | |
|---|--------------------------------------|--|--|
| Alameda County | Calaveras County | | |
| 7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650 | 891 Mountain Ranch Road | | |
| Oakland, CA 94621 | San Andreas, CA 95249 | | |
| CEPDProp65@acgov.org | Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us | | |
| Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney | Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney | | |
| Contra Costa County | Inyo County | | |
| 900 Ward Street | 168 North Edwards Street | | |
| Martinez, CA 94553 | Independence, CA 93526 | | |
| sgrassini@contracostada.org | inyoda@inyocounty.us | | |
| Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator | Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney | | |
| Lassen County | Monterey County | | |
| 220 S. Lassen Street | 1200 Aguajito Road | | |
| Susanville, CA 96130 | Monterey, CA 93940 | | |
| mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us | Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us | | |
| Allison Haley, District Attorney | Michael Hestrin, District Attorney | | |
| Napa County | Riverside County | | |
| 1127 First Street, Suite C | 3072 Orange Street | | |
| Napa, CA 94559 | Riverside, CA 92501 | | |
| CEPD@countyofnapa.org | Prop65@rivcoda.org | | |
| Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney | Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney | | |
| Sacramento County | San Diego City Attorney | | |
| 901 G Street | 1200 Third Avenue | | |
| Sacramento, CA 95814 | San Diego, CA 92101 | | |



20062 SW Birch St, Suite 200 Newport Beach, CA 92660 Office: 949.200.8755 Facsimile: 866.843.8308

P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

| Prop65@sacda.org | CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov | | |
|--|--|--|--|
| Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney | Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney | | |
| San Francisco County | San Francisco City Attorney | | |
| 732 Brannan Street | 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor | | |
| San Francisco, CA 94103 | San Francisco, CA 94102 | | |
| gregory.alker@sfgov.org | Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org | | |
| Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney | Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney | | |
| San Joaquin County | San Luis Obispo County | | |
| 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 | County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor | | |
| Stockton, CA 95202 | San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 | | |
| DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org | edobroth@co.slo.ca.us | | |
| Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney | Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney | | |
| Santa Barbara County | Santa Clara County | | |
| 1112 Santa Barbara Street | 70 W Hedding St | | |
| Santa Barbara, CA 93101 | San Jose, CA 95110 | | |
| DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us | EPU@da.sccgov.org | | |
| Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney | Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney | | |
| Sonoma County | Tulare County | | |
| 600 Administration Dr | 221 S Mooney Blvd | | |
| Sonoma, CA 95403 | Visalia, CA 95370 | | |
| jbarnes@sonoma-county.org | Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us | | |
| Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney | Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney | | |
| Ventura County | Yolo County | | |
| 800 S Victoria Ave | 301 Second Street | | |
| Ventura, CA 93009 | Woodland, CA 95695 | | |
| daspecialops@ventura.org | cfepd@yolocounty.org | | |

On October 13, 2022 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Standard Time, I served the following documents: **AMENDED NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** on each parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by First Class Mail.

Executed on October 13, 2022, in Newport Beach, California.



20062 SW Birch St, Suite 200 Newport Beach, CA 92660 Office: 949.200.8755 Facsimile: 866.843.8308 P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

Krystal Garzon



20062 SW Birch St, Suite 200 Newport Beach, CA 92660 Office: 949.200.8755

Facsimile: 866.843.8308 P65@manninglawoffice.com

CONSUMER ATTORNEYS

Service List

| District Attorney, Alpine County | District Attorney, Madera County | District Attorney, San Mateo County |
|---|--|--|
| P.O. Box 248 | 209 West Yosemite Avenue | 400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor |
| Markleeville, CA 96120 | Madera, CA 93637 | Redwood City, CA 94063 |
| District Attorney, Amador County | District Attorney, Marin County | District Attorney, Shasta County |
| 708 Court Street, Suite 202 | 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 | 1355 West Street |
| Jackson, CA 95642 | San Rafael, CA 94903 | Redding, CA 96001 |
| District Attorney, Butte County | District Attorney, Mariposa County | District Attorney, Sierra County |
| 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 | Post Office Box 730 | 100 Courthouse Square, 2nd Floor |
| Oroville, CA 95965 | Mariposa, CA 95338 | Downieville, CA 95936 |
| District Attorney, Colusa County | District Attorney, Mendocino County | District Attorney, Siskiyou County |
| 310 6 th Street | Post Office Box 1000 | Post Office Box 986 |
| Colusa, CA 95932 | Ukiah, CA 95482 | Yreka, CA 96097 |
| District Attorney, Del Norte County | District Attorney, Merced County | District Attorney, Solano County |
| 450 H Street, Room 171 | 550 W. Main Street | 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 |
| Crescent City, CA 95531 | Merced, CA 95340 | Fairfield, CA 94533 |
| District Attorney, El Dorado County | District Attorney, Modoc County | District Attorney, Stanislaus County |
| 778 Pacific St | 204 S Court Street, Room 202 | 832 12th Street, Ste 300 |
| Placerville, CA 95667 | Alturas, CA 96101-4020 | Modesto, CA 95354 |
| District Attorney, Fresno County | District Attorney, Mono County | District Attorney, Sutter County |
| 2100 Tulare St., | Post Office Box 617 | 463 2nd Street |
| Fresno, CA 93721 | Bridgeport, CA 93517 | Yuba City, CA 95991 |
| District Attorney, Glenn County | District Attorney, Nevada County | District Attorney, Tehama County |
| Post Office Box 430 | 201 Commercial Street | Post Office Box 519 |
| Willows, CA 95988 | Nevada City, CA 95959 | Red Bluff, CA 96080 |
| District Attorney, Humboldt County | District Attorney, Placer County | District Attorney, Trinity County |
| 825 5th Street 4th Floor | 10810 Justice Center Drive, Ste 240 | Post Office Box 310 |
| Eureka, CA 95501 | Roseville, CA 95678 | Weaverville, CA 96093 |
| District Attorney, Imperial County | District Attorney, Plumas County | District Attorney, Tuolumne County |
| 940 West Main Street, Ste 102 | 520 Main Street, Room 404 | 423 N. Washington Street |
| El Centro, CA 92243 | Quincy, CA 95971 | Sonora, CA 95370 |
| District Attorney, Kern County | District Attorney, San Benito County | District Attorney, Yuba County |
| 1215 Truxtun Avenue | 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor | 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 |
| Bakersfield, CA 93301 | Hollister, CA 95023 | Marysville, CA 95901 |
| District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230 | Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012 | San Jose City Attorney's Office 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113 |
| District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453 | District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101 | District Attorney, Los Angeles County Hall of Justice 211 West Temple St., Ste 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012 |