

#### ATTORNEYS AT LAW

Tel: 619-629-0527 noam@entornolaw.com jake@entornolaw.com craig@entornolaw.com 225 Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, CA 92101

October 18, 2022

## Via Certified Mail:

Stearn's Products, Inc. dba Derma E c/o Andre Mourna 2280 Ward Avenue Suite 100 Simi Valley, CA 93065 Ulta Salon, Cosmetics, & Fragrance, Inc. c/o CSC- Lawyers Incorporating Services 2710 Gateway Oaks Drive, Suite 150N Sacramento, CA 95833

**Re:** Proposition 65 Notice of Violation

This notice amends the original notice of violation AG 2022-01728. This notice corrects the address for the manufacturer.

To Whom It May Concern:

We represent Environmental Health Advocates, Inc., an organization in the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. This letter serves as notice that the parties listed above are in violation of Proposition 65, the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, commencing with section 25249.5 of the Health and Safety Code ("Proposition 65"). In particular, the violations alleged by this notice consist of types of harm that may potentially result from exposures to the toxic chemical Titanium dioxide (airborne, unbound particles of respirable size) ("TiO2"). This chemical was listed as a carcinogen on September 2, 2011.

The specific type of product that is causing exposures in violation of Proposition 65 is mineral powder including but not limited to:

	<b>Product Name</b>	<b>Manufacturer</b>	Distributor/Retailer
1.	Derma E Essentials Sun	Stearn's Products, Inc.	Ulta Salon, Cosmetics, &
	Protection Mineral Powder SPF 30	dba Derma E	Fragrance, Inc.

The routes of exposure for the violations include inhalation by consumers. These exposures occur through the reasonably foreseeable use of the product. The sales of this product have been occurring since at least August 2021, are continuing to this day and will

continue to occur as long as the product subject to this notice is sold to and used by consumers.

Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the exposures to TiO2 caused by ordinary use of the product. The Parties are in violation of Proposition 65 by failing to provide such warning to consumers and as a result of the sales of this product, exposures to TiO2 have been occurring without proper warnings.

Pursuant to Proposition 65, notice and intent to sue shall be provided to violators 60-days before filing a complaint. This letter provides notice of the alleged violation to the parties listed above and the appropriate governmental authorities. A summary of Proposition 65 is attached.

EHA identifies Fred Duran as a responsible individual within the entity.

If you have any questions or wish to discuss any of the above, please contact me.

Sincerely,

ENTORNO LAW LLP.

Roan Slub

Noam Glick Jake Schulte

Craig Nicholas

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

## I, Noam Glick, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: October 18, 2022

Noam Glick, Attorney at Law

Noam Blub

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Ali Harris, declare that I am over the age of 18 years, and am not a party to the within action. I am employed in the County of San Diego, California, where the mailing occurs; and my business address is 225 Broadway, 19<sup>th</sup> Floor, San Diego, California 92101.

On October 18, 2022, I served the following documents: (1) 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.7(d); (2) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; (3) PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY; and (4) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENT (served only on the Attorney General) on the parties listed below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each party and depositing it at mybusiness address with the U.S. Postal Service for delivery by Certified Mail with the postage thereon fullyprepaid:

### Via Certified Mail

Stearn's Products, Inc. dba Derma E c/o Andre Mourna 2280 Ward Avenue Suite 100 Simi Valley, CA 93065 Ulta Salon, Cosmetics, & Fragrance, Inc. c/o CSC- Lawyers Incorporating Services 2710 Gateway Oaks Drive, Suite 150N Sacramento, CA 95833

On October 18, 2022, I served the California Attorney General (via website Portal) by uploading a trueand correct copy thereof as a PDF file via the California Attorney General's website.

On October 18, 2022, I transmitted via electronic mail the above-listed documents to the electronic mail addresses of the City and/or District Attorneys who have specifically authorized e-mail serviceand the authorization appears on the Attorney General's web site.

#### **See Attached Service List**

On October 18, 2022, I served the following persons and/or entities at the last known address by placing atrue and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope and depositing it at my business address with the U.S. Postal Service for delivery with the postage thereon fully prepaid, and addressed as follows:

#### See Attached Service List

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is trueand correct.

Executed on October 18, 2022, at San Diego, California.

Ali Harris Ali Harris

### Appendix A

OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA PROTECTION AGENCY THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACTION 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead and Toxic Enforcement Act 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65") A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide law. The reader is directed to the statue and its implementing regulations (See citations below) for further information.

Proposition 65 appears in California law as Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code Regulations, Sections 250000 through 27000.

# WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

The "Governor's List" Proposition 65 requires the Governor to publish a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm. This list must be updated at least once a year. Over 725 chemicals have been listed as of November 16, 2001. Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under this law. Businesses that produce, use, release, or otherwise engage in activities involving those chemicals must comply with the

### following:

### Clear and Reasonable Warnings. A

business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that is will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed. Exposures are exempt from the warning requirement if they occur less than twelve months after the date of the listing of the chemical.

Prohibition from discharges into drinking water. A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Discharges are exempt from this requirement if they occur less than twenty months after the date of the listing of chemical.

## DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. The law exempts:

Governmental agencies and public water utilities. All agencies of the federal, State or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer. For chemicals that are listed as known to the State to cause cancer ("carcinogens"), a warning is not required if the business can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70- year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "no significant risk" levels for more than 250 listed carcinogens.

Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question. For chemicals known to the State to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm ("reproductive toxicants"), a warning is not required if the business can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level (NOEL)," divided by a 1,000- fold safety or uncertainty factor. The "no observable effect level" is the highest dose level which has not been associated with an observable adverse reproductive or developmental effect.

"significant amount" of the listed chemical entering into any source of drinking water. The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the list chemical has not, does not, or will not enter any drinking water source, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any

Discharge that do not result in a

detectable amount; expect an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" or "no observable effect" test if an individual were exposed to such an amount in drinking water.

## HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought be the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys (those in cities with a population exceeding 750,000). Lawsuit may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. A notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in regulations (Title 27. California Code of Regulations, Section 25903). A private party may not pursue an enforcement action directly under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an action within sixty days of notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court of law to stop committing the violation.

### FOR FURTHER INFORMATION....

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment=s Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916)445-6900

### E-Mail Service List

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney CONTRA COSTA COUNTY 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator LASSEN COUNTY 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney MONTEREY COUNTY 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey ,CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Allison Haley, District Attorney NAPA COUNTY 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney RIVERSIDE COUNTY 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org

Barbara Yook, District Attorney CALAVERAS COUNTY 891 Mountain Ranch Rd. San Andreas, CA 95249 Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

Alethea M. Sargent, Assistant District Attorney SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY 350 Rhode Island Street San Francisco, CA 94103 alethea.sargent@sfgov.org

Summer Stephan, District Attorney SAN DIEGO COUNTY 330 West Broadway San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney CITY OF SAN DIEGO 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyCrimProp65@sandiego.gov

Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor San Francisco, CA 94102 Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney SANTA CLARA COUNTY 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110\_EPU@da.sccgov.org

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney SONOMA COUNTY 600 Administration Drive Sonoma, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney TULARE COUNTY 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370\_ Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney VENTURA COUNTY 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney YOLO COUNTY 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney SANTA BARBARA COUNTY 1112 Santa Barbara St. Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney ALAMEDA COUNTY 7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Barbara M. Yook, District Attorney
CALAVERAS COUNTY
891 Mountain Ranch Road
San Andreas CA 95249
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

David Hollister, District Attorney PLUMAS COUNTY 520 Main St. Quincy, CA 95971 davidhollister@countyofplumas.com

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney SACRAMENTO COUNTY 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney SANTA CRUZ COUNTY 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney MERCED COUNTY 550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofmerced.com

Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney NEVADA COUNTY 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959 DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us

Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney INYO COUNTY 168 North Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526 inyoda@inyocounty.us

Walter W. Wall, District Attorney MARIPOSA COUNTY P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org

Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney PLACER COUNTY 10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov

District Attorney
ORANGE COUNTY
700 Civic Center Drive West
Santa Ana, CA 92701
Prop65Notice@da.ocgov.com

## **SERVICE LIST**

The Honorable Nancy O'Mailey	The Honorable Stacey Montgomery	The Honorable Candice Hooper	The Honorable Gregg Cohen
Alameda County District Attorney	Lassen County District Attorney	San Benito County District Altorney	Tehama County District Attorney
1225 Fallon Street, Room 900	220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8	419 4th Street, Second Floor	444 Oak Street, Room L
Oakland, CA 94612	Susanville, CA 96130	Hollister, CA 95203	Red Bluff, CA 96080
The Honorable Terese Drabec	The Honorable Jackie Lacey	The Honorable Michael Ramos	The Honorable Eric Heryford
Alpine County District Attorney	Los Angeles County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney	Trinity County District Attorney
270 Laramie Street, PO BOX 248	211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200	303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor	P.O. Box 310
Markieeville, CA 96120	Los Angeles, CA 90012	San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	Weaverville, CA 96093
The Honorable Todd Riebe	The Honorable David Linn	The Honorable Bonnie Dumanis	The Honorable Tim Ward
Amador County District Attorney	Madera County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney	Tulare County District Attorney
708 Court Street	209 West Yosernite Avenue	330 W. Broadway Street	221 South Mooney Boulevard, Rm 224
Jackson, CA 95642	Madera, CA 93637	San Diego, CA 92101	Visalia, CA 93291-4593
The Honorable Michael Ramsay	The Honorable Edward Berberian	The Honorable George Gascon	The Honorable Laura Krieg
Butte County District Attorney	Marin County District Attorney	San Francisco County District Attorney	Tuolumne County District Attorney
25 County Center Drive	3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130	850 Bryant Street, Room 322	423 North Washington Street
Oroville, CA 95965	San Rafael, CA 94903	San Francisco, CA 94103	Sonora, CA 95370
The Honorable Barbara Yook	The Honorable Thomas Cooke	The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar	The Honorable Gregory Totten Ventura County District Attorney 800 South Victona Avenue Ventura, CA 93009
Calaveras County District Attorney	Mariposa County District Attorney	San Joaquin County District Attorney	
991 Mountain Ranch Road	5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730	222 East Weber Avenue, Room 202	
San Andreas, CA 95249	Mariposa, CA 95338	Stockton, CA 95201	
The Honorable John Poyner	The Honorable C. David Eyster	The Honorable Dan Dow	The Honorable Jeff Reisig
Colusa County District Attorney	Mendocino County District Attornay	San Luis Obispo County District Alty	Yofo County District Attorney
346 Filth Street	100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000	1035 Palm Street, 4th Floor	301 Second Street
Colusa, CA 95932	Ukiah, CA 95482	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Woodland, CA 95695
The Honorable Mark Peterson	The Honorable Larry Morse II Marced County District Attorney 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340	The Honorable Stephen Wagstalfe	The Honorable Patrick McGrath
Contra Costa County District Attorney		San Mateo County District Attorney	Yuba County District Attorney
900 Ward Street		400 County Center, Third Floor	215 Fifth Street
Martinez, CA 94553		Redwood City, CA 94063	Marysville, CA 95901
The Honorable Dale Trigg	The Honorable Jordan Funk	The Honorable Joyce Dudley	The Honorable Mike Feuer Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles 800 City Hall East 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012
Oet Norte County District Attorney	Modoc County District Attorney	Santa Barbara County District Attorney	
450 H Street, Room 171	204 S. Court Street, Suite 202	1112 Santa Barbara Street	
Crescent City, CA 95531	Alturas, CA 96101	Santa Barbara, CA 93101	
The Honorable Vern Pierson El Dorado County District Attorney 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667	The Honorable Tim Kendall	The Honorable Jeffrey Rosen	The Honorable James Sanchez
	Mono County District Attorney	Santa Clara County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento
	P.O. Box 617	70 West Hedding Street, West Wing	915 I Street, 4th Floor
	Bridgeport, CA 93517	San Jose, CA 95110	Sacramento, CA 95814
The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp	The Honorable Dean Flippo	The Honorable Jeff Rosell	The Honorable Jan Goldsmith
Fresno County District Altorney	Monterey County District Attorney	Santa Cruz County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney, San Diego
2220 Tulare Street, #1000	P.O. Box 1131	701 Ocean Street, Room 200	1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620
Fresno, CA 93721	Salinas, CA 93902	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	San Diego, CA 92101
The Honorable Dwayne Stewart Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988	The Honorable Allison Haley Napa County District Attornay 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559	The Honorable Stephen Carlton Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street ReddIng, CA 96001	The Honorable Dennis Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102
The Honorable Maggie Fleming	The Honorable Clifford Newell	The Honorable Lawrence Allen	The Honorable Richard Doyle
Humboldt County District Attorney	Nevada County District Attorney	Sierra County District Attorney	Office of the City Altorney, San Jose
825 5th Street, Fourth Floor	201 Commercial Street	100 Courthouse Square	200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor
Eureka, CA 95501	Nevada City, CA 95959	Downieville, CA 95936	San Jose, CA 95113
The Honorable Gilbert Otero Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243	The Honorable Tony Rackauckas Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701	The Honorable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097	Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550
The Honorable Thomas Hardy	The Honorable R. Scott Owens	The Honorable Krishna Abrams	
Inyo County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney	Solano County District Attorney	
P.O. Drawer D	10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240	675 Texas Street, Suile 4500	
Independence, CA 93526	Roseville, CA 95678	Fairfield, CA 94533	
The Honorable Lisa Green	The Honorable David Hollister	The Honorable Jill Ravitch	
Kern County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney	Sonoma County District Attorney	
1215 Truxtun Avenue	520 Main Street, Room 404	600 Administration Drive, Room 212J	
Bakersfield, CA 93301	Quincy, CA 95971	Santa Rosa, CA 95403	
The Honorable Keilh Fagundas	The Honorable Michael Hestrin	The Honorable Birgit Fladager	
Kings County District Attorney	Riverside County District Attorney	Stanislaus County District Attorney	
1400 West Lacey Boulevard	3960 Orange Street	832 12th Street, Suite 300	
Hanford, CA 93230	Riverside, CA 92501	Modesto, CA 95354	
The Honorable Donald Anderson	The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert	The Honorable Amanda Hopper	
Lake County District Attorney	Sacramento County District Attorney	Sutter County District Attorney	
255 North Forbes Street	901 G Street	463 Second Street, Suite 102	
Lakeport CA 95453	Sacramento CA 95814	Yuba City CA 95991	