

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

Tel: 619-629-0527 noam@entornolaw.com jake@entornolaw.com craig@entornolaw.com 225 Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, CA 92101

October 18, 2022

Via Certified Mail

Boisset – Lamar Elaine LLC c/o John Mackie 400 B Street, Suite 400 Santa Rosa, CA 95401

Raymond Vineyard & Cellar, Incorporated c/o John Mackie 100 B Street, Suite 400 Santa Rosa, CA 95401 Oakville Grocery Co. No. 1 Attn: Legal Dept. 7856 St. Helena Highway Oakville, CA 94562

Jean-Claude Boisset Wines U.S.A., Inc. c/o John Mackie 100 B Street, Suite 400 Santa Rosa, CA 95401

Re: Amended Proposition 65 Notice of Violation This notice amends the second amended notice AG# 2022-00861 dated May 3, 2022. This amendment includes Jean-Claude Boisset Wines U.S.A., Inc. as a manufacturer.

To Whom It May Concern:

We represent Environmental Health Advocates, Inc., an organization in the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. This letter serves as notice that the parties listed above are in violation of Proposition 65, the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, commencing with section 25249.5 of the Health and Safety Code ("Proposition 65"). In particular, the violations alleged by this notice consist of types of harm that may potentially result from exposures to the toxic chemical Lead. Lead was listed as a developmental and reproductive toxin on February 27, 1987 and listed as a carcinogen on October 1, 1992.

The type of product that is causing exposures in violation of Proposition 65 is truffle tapenade, including but not limited to:

| | Product Name | Manufacturer | Distributor/Retailer |
|----|------------------|------------------------------------|----------------------------|
| 1. | Oakville Grocery | Boisset – Lamar Elaine LLC / | Oakville Grocery Co. No. 1 |
| | Porcini Truffle | Raymond Vineyard & Cellar, | |
| | Tapenade | Incorporated / | |
| | | Oakville Grocery Co. No. 1 / Jean- | |
| | | Claude Boisset Wines U.S.A., Inc. | |

The routes of exposure to the chemical(s) in violation include ingestion by consumers. These exposures occur through the reasonably foreseeable use of the product. The sales of this product have been occurring since at least February 2022, are continuing to this day and will continue to occur as long as the product subject to this notice is sold to and used by consumers.

Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the exposures to Lead caused by ordinary use of the product. The Parties are in violation of Proposition 65 by failing to provide such warning to consumers and as a result of the sales of this product, exposures to Lead have been occurring without proper warnings.

Pursuant to Proposition 65, notice and intent to sue shall be provided to violators 60-days before filing a complaint. This letter provides notice of the alleged violation to the parties listed above and the appropriate governmental authorities. A summary of Proposition 65 is attached.

EHA identifies Fred Duran as a responsible individual within the entity.

If you have any questions or wish to discuss any of the above, please contact me.

ENTORNO LAW, LLP

Noon Slick

Noam Glick

Jake Schulte Craig Nicholas

Enclosures

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

I, Noam Glick, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: October 18, 2022

Noon Slit

Noam Glick, Attorney at Law

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Jordyn Naylor, declare that I am over the age of 18 years, and am not a party to the within action. I am employed in the County of San Diego, California, where the mailing occurs; and my businessaddress is 225 Broadway, 19th Floor, San Diego, California 92101.

On October 18, 2022, I served the following documents: (1) 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.7(d); (2) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; (3) PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY; and (4) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENT (served only on the Attorney General) on the parties listed below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each party and depositing it at my business address with the U.S. Postal Service for delivery by Certified Mail with the postage thereon fully prepaid:

Via Certified Mail

Boisset – Lamar Elaine LLC c/o John Mackie 400 B Street, Suite 400 Santa Rosa, CA 95401

Raymond Vineyard & Cellar, Incorporated c/o John Mackie 100 B Street, Suite 400 Santa Rosa, CA 95401 Oakville Grocery Co. No. 1 Attn: Legal Dept. 7856 St. Helena Highway Oakville, CA 94562

Jean-Claude Boisset Wines U.S.A., Inc. c/o John Mackie 100 B Street, Suite 400 Santa Rosa, CA 95401

On October 18, 2022, I served the California Attorney General (via website Portal) by uploading a trueand correct copy thereof as a PDF file via the California Attorney General's website.

On October 18, 2022, I transmitted via electronic mail the above-listed documents to the electronic mail addresses of the City and/or District Attorneys who have specifically authorized e-mail service and the authorization appears on the Attorney General's web site.

See Attached Service List

On October 18, 2022, I served the following persons and/or entities at the last known address by placing true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope and depositing it at my business address with the U.S.Postal Service for delivery with the postage thereon fully prepaid, and addressed as follows:

See Attached Service List

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on October 18, 2022, at San Diego, California.

Jordyn Naylor

^oJordyn Naylor

Appendix A

OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA PROTECTION AGENCY THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACTION 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead and Toxic Enforcement Act 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65") A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide law. The reader is directed to the statue and its implementing regulations (See citations below) for further information.

Proposition 65 appears in California law as Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code Regulations, Sections 250000 through 27000.

WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

The "Governor's List" Proposition 65 requires the Governor to publish a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm. This list must be updated at least once a year. Over 725 chemicals have been listed as of November 16, 2001. Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under this law. Businesses that produce, use, release, or otherwise engage in activities involving those chemicals must comply with the following:

Clear and Reasonable Warnings. A

business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that is will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed. Exposures are exempt from the warning requirement if they occur less than twelve months after the date of the listing of the chemical.

Prohibition from discharges into drinking

water. A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Discharges are exempt from this requirement if they occur less than twenty months after the date of the listing of chemical.

DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. The law exempts:

Governmental agencies and public water utilities. All agencies of the federal, State or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

Exposures that pose no significant risk of

cancer. For chemicals that are listed as known to the State to cause cancer ("carcinogens"), a warning is not required if the business can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70- year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "no significant risk" levels for more than 250 listed carcinogens.

Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question. For chemicals known to the State to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm ("reproductive toxicants"), a warning is not required if the business can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at

will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level (NOEL)," divided by a 1,000- fold safety or uncertainty factor. The "no observable effect level" is the highest dose level which has not been associated with an observable adverse reproductive or developmental effect.

Discharge that do not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering into any source of drinking water.

The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the list chemical has not, does not, or will not enter any drinking water source, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount; expect an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" or "no observable effect" test if an individual were exposed to such an amount in drinking water.

HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought be the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys (those in cities with a population exceeding 750,000). Lawsuit may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. A notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in regulations (Title 27. California Code of Regulations, Section 25903). A private party may not pursue an enforcement action directly under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an action within sixty days of notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court of law to stop committing the violation.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION....

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment=s Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916)445-6900

SERVICE LIST

| The Honorable Nancy O'Malley | The Honorable Stacey Montgomery | The Honorable Candice Hooper | The Honorable Gregg Cohen |
|---|--|--|--|
| Alameda County District Attorney | Lassen County District Attorney | San Benito County District Attorney | Tehama County District Attorney |
| 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 | 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. B | 419 4th Street, Second Floor | 444 Oak Street, Room L |
| Oakland, CA 94612 | Susanville, CA 96130 | Hollister, CA 95203 | Red Bluff, CA 96080 |
| The Honorable Terese Drabec | The Honorable Jackie Lacey | The Honorable Michael Ramos | The Honorable Eric Heryford |
| Alpine County District Attorney | Los Angeles County District Attorney | San Bernardino County District Attorney | Trinity County District Attorney |
| 270 Laramie Street, PO BOX 248 | 211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200 | 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor | P.O. Box 310 |
| Markieeville, CA 96120 | Los Angeles, CA 90012 | San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502 | Weaverville, CA 96093 |
| The Honorable Todd Riebe | The Honorable David Linn | The Honorable Bonnie Dumanis | The Honorable Tim Ward |
| Amador County District Attorney | Madera County District Attorney | San Diego County District Attorney | Tulare County District Attorney |
| 708 Court Street | 209 West Yosemite Avenue | 330 W. Broadway Street | 221 South Mooney Boulevard, Rm 224 |
| Jackson, CA 95642 | Madera, CA 93637 | San Diego, CA 92101 | Visalia, CA 93291-4593 |
| The Honorable Michael Ramsey | The Honorable Edward Berberian | The Honorable George Gascon | The Honorable Laura Krieg |
| Butte County District Attorney | Marin County District Attorney | San Francisco County District Attorney | Tuolumne County District Attorney |
| 25 County Canter Drive | 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 | 850 Bryant Street, Room 322 | 423 North Washington Street |
| Orovilla, CA 95965 | San Rafael, CA 94903 | San Francisco, CA 34103 | Sonora, CA 95370 |
| The Honorable Barbara Yook | The Honorable Thomas Cooke | The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar | The Honorable Gregory Totten |
| Calaveras County District Attorney | Mariposa County District Attorney | San Joaquin County District Attorney | Ventura County District Attorney |
| 991 Mountain Ranch Road | 5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730 | 222 East Weber Avenue, Room 202 | 800 South Victona Avenue |
| San Andreas, CA 95249 | Mariposa, CA 95338 | Stockton, CA 35201 | Ventura, CA 93009 |
| The Honorable John Poyner | The Honorable C. David Eyster | The Honorable Dan Dow | The Honorable Jeff Reisig |
| Colusa County District Attorney | Mendocino County District Attornay | San Luis Obispo County District Atty | Yolo County District Attorney |
| 346 Filth Street | 100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000 | 1035 Palm Street, 4th Floor | 301 Second Street |
| Colusa, CA 95932 | Ukiah, CA 95482 | San Luis Obispo, CA 33408 | Woodland, CA 95895 |
| The Honorable Mark Peterson | The Honorable Larry Morse II | The Honorable Stephen Wagstalfe | The Honorable Patrick McGrath |
| Contra Costa County District Attorney | Marced County District Attorney | San Mateo County District Attorney | Yuba County District Attorney |
| 900 Ward Street | 550 W. Main Street | 400 County Center, Third Floor | 215 Fifth Street |
| Martinez, CA 94553 | Merced, CA 95340 | Redwood City, CA 94063 | Marysville, CA 95901 |
| The Honorable Dale Trigg Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531 | The Honorable Jordan Funk Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101 | The Honorable Joyce Dudley Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 | The Honorable Mike Feuer Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles 800 City Hall East 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012 |
| The Honorable Vern Pierson | The Honorable Tim Kendall | The Honorable Jeffrey Rosen | The Honorable James Sanchez |
| El Dorado County District Attorney | Mono County District Attorney | Santa Clara County District Attorney | Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento |
| 778 Pacific Street | P.O. Box 617 | 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing | 915 I Street, 4th Floor |
| Placerville, CA 95667 | Bridgeport, CA 93517 | San Jose, CA 95110 | Sacramento, CA 95814 |
| The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp | The Honorable Dean Flippo | The Honorable Jeff Rosel! | The Honorable Jan Goldsmith |
| Fresno County District Altorney | Monterey County District Attorney | Santa Cruz County District Attorney | Office of the City Attorney, San Diego |
| 2220 Tulara Street, #1000 | P.O. Box 1131 | 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 | 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620 |
| Fresno, CA 93721 | Salinas, CA 93902 | Santa Cruz, CA 95060 | San Diego, CA 92101 |
| The Honorable Dwayne Stewart Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988 | The Honorable Allison Haley Napa County District Attornay 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559 | The Honorable Stephen Carlton Shasta County District Altorney 1355 West Street ReddIng, CA 96001 | The Honorable Dennis Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102 |
| The Honorable Maggie Fleming | The Honorable Clifford Newell | The Honorable Lawrence Allen | The Honorable Richard Doyle |
| Humboldi County District Attorney | Nevada County District Attorney | Sierra County Districl Attorney | Office of the City Altorney, San Jose |
| 825 5th Street, Fourth Floor | 201 Commercial Street | 100 Courthouse Square | 200 East Santa Clara Street, 18th Floor |
| Eureka, CA 95501 | Nevada City, CA 95959 | Downieville, CA 95936 | San Jose, CA 95113 |
| The Honorable Gilbert Otero Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243 | The Honorable Tony Rackauckas Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701 | The Honorable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097 | Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 |
| The Honorable Thomas Hardy | The Honorable R. Scott Owens | The Honorable Krishna Abrams | |
| Inyo County District Attorney | Placer County District Attorney | Solano County District Attorney | |
| P.O. Drawer D | 10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240 | 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 | |
| Independence, CA 93526 | Roseville, CA 95678 | Fairfield, CA 94533 | |
| The Honorable Lisa Green Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 De Honorable Keilt Erounde | The Honorable David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971 | The Honorable Jill Ravitch Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403 | |
| The Honorable Keilh Fagundas | The Honorable Michael Hestrin | The Honorable Birgit Fladager | |
| Kings County District Attorney | Riverside County District Attorney | Stanislaus County District Attorney | |
| 1400 West Lacey Boulevard | 3960 Orange Street | 832 12th Street, Suite 300 | |
| Hanford, CA 93230 | Riverside, CA 92501 | Modesto, CA 95354 | |
| The Honorable Donald Anderson | The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert | The Honorable Amanda Hopper | |
| Lake County District Attorney | Sacramento County District Attorney | Sutter County District Attorney | |
| 255 North Forbes Street | 901 G Street | 463 Second Street, Suite 102 | |
| Lakeport CA 95453 | Sacramento CA 95814 | Yuba City CA 95991 | |

E-Mail Service List

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney CONTRA COSTA COUNTY 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator LASSEN COUNTY 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 <u>mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us</u>

Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney MONTEREY COUNTY 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey ,CA 93940 <u>Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us</u>

Allison Haley, District Attorney NAPA COUNTY 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559 <u>CEPD@countyofnapa.org</u>

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney RIVERSIDE COUNTY 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 <u>Prop65@rivcoda.org</u>

Barbara Yook, District Attorney CALAVERAS COUNTY 891 Mountain Ranch Rd. San Andreas, CA 95249 <u>Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us</u>

Alethea M. Sargent, Assistant District Attorney SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY 350 Rhode Island Street San Francisco, CA 94103 <u>alethea.sargent@sfgov.org</u>

Summer Stephan, District Attorney SAN DIEGO COUNTY 330 West Broadway San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney CITY OF SAN DIEGO 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101 <u>CityAttyCrimProp65@sandiego.gov</u>

Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor San Francisco, CA 94102 Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 <u>edobroth@co.slo.ca.us</u>

Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney SANTA CLARA COUNTY 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110_ EPU@da.sccgov.org

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney SONOMA COUNTY 600 Administration Drive Sonoma, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney TULARE COUNTY 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 <u>Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us</u>

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney VENTURA COUNTY 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney YOLO COUNTY 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 <u>cfepd@yolocounty.org</u>

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney SANTA BARBARA COUNTY 1112 Santa Barbara St. Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney ALAMEDA COUNTY 7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 <u>CEPDProp65@acgov.org</u>

Barbara M. Yook, District Attorney CALAVERAS COUNTY 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas CA 95249 Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us David Hollister, District Attorney PLUMAS COUNTY 520 Main St. Quincy, CA 95971 davidhollister@countyofplumas.com

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney SACRAMENTO COUNTY 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 <u>Prop65@sacda.org</u>

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney SANTA CRUZ COUNTY 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 <u>Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us</u>

Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney MERCED COUNTY 550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 <u>Prop65@countyofmerced.com</u>

Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney NEVADA COUNTY 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959 DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us

Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney INYO COUNTY 168 North Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526 inyoda@inyocounty.us

Walter W. Wall, District Attorney MARIPOSA COUNTY P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 <u>mcda@mariposacounty.org</u>

Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney PLACER COUNTY 10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov

District Attorney ORANGE COUNTY 700 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701 Prop65Notice@da.ocgov.com