

LAW OFFICES
BRODSKY & SMITH, LLC

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900
BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212
877.534.2590
www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE
1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY
CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934
856.795.7250

NEW YORK OFFICE
240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD
MINEOLA, NY 11501
516.741.4977

PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE
TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805
BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004
610.667.6200

February 6, 2023

| | |
|--|---|
| Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 10300 Greenbriar Place Oklahoma City, OK 73159 | Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc. c/o Kathie Craig 18400 Von Karman Ave., Suite 800 Irvine, CA 92612 |
| Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington, DE 19808 | President/CEO Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc. 7707 SW 44 th Street Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73179 |

60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act¹

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky & Smith, LLC ("Brodsky Smith") represents Precila Balabbo ("Balabbo"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Balabbo has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

1. **Enforcer:** Precila Balabbo, 285 6th Street, Unit 209, San Pedro, CA 90731; (Ph) 818-434-4023.

¹ The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

2. **Alleged Violator(s):** Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc.
3. **Time Period of Exposure:** Violations have been occurring since at least February 6, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
4. **Listed Chemical:** Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity.
5. **Product:**

| Product ² | Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product |
|----------------------|---|
| Ceramic Milk Bottle | Sleigh Bell Bistro Ceramic Milk Bottle 5578141 |

6. **Description of Exposure:** The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through ingestion and dermal absorption exposure. When used for its intended purpose, the Product will be in contact with foods. The Listed Chemical will leach into the foods it comes into contact with. When foods contaminated with the Listed Chemical are consumed, ingestion of the Listed Chemical will occur which will increase BLLs. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Balabbo against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Balabbo is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

² The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Balabbo's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

Balabbo has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. **Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky & Smith, LLC, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.**

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'EJ Smith', written over a horizontal line.

Evan J. Smith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit

Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT
Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Evan J. Smith, hereby declare:

- (1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- (2) I am the attorney for the noticing party, Precila Balabbo.
- (3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- (4) Based on the information obtained through these consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator(s) will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- (5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: February 6, 2023



Evan J. Smith
Attorney for Precila Balabbo

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:


I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within action. My business address is 2 Bala Plaza, Suite 805, Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania. I am employed in Montgomery County where the mailing occurred.

On February 6, 2023, I served the following documents: **Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary** on the following entities and individuals listed below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

| | |
|---|---|
| President/CEO Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 10300 Greenbriar Place Oklahoma City, OK 73159 | President/CEO Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc. c/o Kathie Craig 18400 Von Karman Ave., Suite 800 Irvine, CA 92612 |
| President/CEO Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington, DE 19808 | President/CEO Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc. 7707 SW 44 th Street Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73179 |

On February 6, 2023, I served the following documents: **Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary** on each of the individuals on the service list attached hereto as Appendix B by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed February 6, 2023, in Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania.



Evan J. Smith

ELECTRONIC MAIL SERVICE LIST

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| The Honorable Nancy O'Malley Alameda County District Attorney 7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDP65@acgov.org | The Honorable Tori Verber Salzar San Joaquin County District Attorney 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org | Honorable Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org |
| The Honorable Allison Haley Napa County District Attorney 1127 First St., Suite C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org | The Honorable Jeffrey S. Rosell Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us | The Honorable Summer Stephan San Diego County District Attorney 300 West Broadway San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAP65@sdcda.org |
| The Honorable Jeff W. Reisig Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfeprd@yolocounty.org | Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us | Mark Ankcom, Deputy City Attorney City of San Diego 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov |
| Bud Porter Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 W Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110 BPUDa@da.sccgov.org | Alethea M. Sargent Assistant District Attorney San Francisco District Attorney's Office 350 Rhode Island Street San Francisco, CA 94103 alethea.sargent@sfgov.org | Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAP65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us |
| The Honorable Gregory D. Totten, Ventura County District Attorney 800 S Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org | The Honorable Barbara Yook Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249 Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us | Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney Office of the City Attorney 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor San Francisco, CA 94102 Valerie.Lopez@sfcityattty.org |
| Stacey Grassini Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org | Eric J. Dobroth Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us | Jeannine M. Pacioni Deputy District Attorney Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us |
| The Honorable Thomas Hardy Inyo County District Attorney 168 N. Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526 inyoda@inyocounty.us | The Honorable Phillip J. Cline Tulare County District Attorney 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us | The Honorable Clifford Newell Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959 DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us |
| The Honorable Paul E. Zellerbach Riverside County District Attorney 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org | The Honorable Stephan Passalacqua Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Drive Sonoma, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org | The Honorable David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971 davidhollister@countyofplumas.com |
| The Honorable Walter W. Wall Mariposa County District Attorney P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mda@mariposacounty.org | The Honorable Kimberly Lewis Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofmerced.com | The Honorable Morgan Briggs Gire Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov |
| Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 96113 Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov | Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney 2100 Tulare Street Fresno, CA 93721 consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov | |

ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST

Office of the California Attorney General
Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting
ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator
P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
<https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice>

SERVICE LIST

| | | | |
|--|---|---|--|
| The Honorable Nancy O'Malley Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612 | The Honorable Stacey Montgomery Lassen County District Attorney 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 96130 | The Honorable Candice Hooper San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th Street, Second Floor Hollister, CA 95203 | The Honorable Gregg Cohen Tehama County District Attorney 444 Oak Street, Room L Red Bluff, CA 96080 |
| The Honorable Terese Drabec Alpine County District Attorney 270 Laramie Street, PO BOX 248 Markleeville, CA 96120 | The Honorable Jackie Lacey Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012 | The Honorable Michael Ramos San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502 | The Honorable Eric Haryford Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093 |
| The Honorable Todd Riebe Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95842 | The Honorable David Linn Madera County District Attorney 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637 | The Honorable Bonnie Dumanis San Diego County District Attorney 330 W. Broadway Street San Diego, CA 92101 | The Honorable Tim Ward Tulare County District Attorney 221 South Mooney Boulevard, Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93291-4593 |
| The Honorable Michael Ramsey Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965 | The Honorable Edward Barberian Marlin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903 | The Honorable George Gascón San Francisco County District Attorney 850 Bryant Street, Room 322 San Francisco, CA 94103 | The Honorable Laura Krigel Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370 |
| The Honorable Barbara Yook Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249 | The Honorable Thomas Cooke Mariposa County District Attorney 5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 | The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar San Joaquin County District Attorney 222 East Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95201 | The Honorable Gregory Totten Ventura County District Attorney 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009 |
| The Honorable John Poyner Colusa County District Attorney 348 Fifth Street Colusa, CA 95932 | The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendocino County District Attorney 100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482 | The Honorable Dan Dow San Luis Obispo County District Atty 1035 Palm Street, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 | The Honorable Jeff Reisig Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 |
| The Honorable Mark Peterson Contra Costa County District Attorney 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 | The Honorable Larry Morse II Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340 | The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063 | The Honorable Patrick McGrath Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901 |
| The Honorable Dale Trigg Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531 | The Honorable Jordan Funk Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101 | The Honorable Joyce Dudley Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 | The Honorable Mike Feuer Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles 800 City Hall East 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012 |
| The Honorable Vern Pierson El Dorado County District Attorney 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667 | The Honorable Tim Kendall Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517 | The Honorable Jeffrey Rosen Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 95110 | The Honorable James Sanchez Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 I Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814 |
| The Honorable Lisa Smiltcamp Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulare Street, #1000 Fresno, CA 93721 | The Honorable Dean Filipo Monterey County District Attorney P.O. Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902 | The Honorable Jeff Rosell Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060 | The Honorable Jan Goldsmith Office of the City Attorney, San Diego 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101 |
| The Honorable Dwayne Stewart Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988 | The Honorable Allison Halsey Napa County District Attorney 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559 | The Honorable Stephen Carlton Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001 | The Honorable Dennis Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102 |
| The Honorable Maggie Fleming Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, Fourth Floor Eureka, CA 95501 | The Honorable Clifford Newell Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959 | The Honorable Lawrence Allen Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square Downsville, CA 95938 | The Honorable Richard Doyle Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113 |
| The Honorable Gilbert Otero Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243 | The Honorable Tony Rackauckas Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701 | The Honorable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097 | Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 |
| The Honorable Thomas Hardy Inyo County District Attorney P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526 | The Honorable R. Scott Owens Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678 | The Honorable Krishna Abrams Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533 | |
| The Honorable Lisa Green Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301 | The Honorable David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971 | The Honorable Jill Ravitch Sonoma County District Attorney 800 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403 | |
| The Honorable Keith Fagundas Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230 | The Honorable Michael Hestrin Riverside County District Attorney 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 | The Honorable Birgit Fladager Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354 | |
| The Honorable Donald Anderson Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453 | The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 | The Honorable Amanda Hopper Sutter County District Attorney 463 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991 | |

APPENDIX A

OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and OEHHA implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information.

FOR INFORMATION CONCERNING THE BASIS FOR THE ALLEGATIONS IN THE NOTICE RELATED TO YOUR BUSINESS, CONTACT THE PERSON IDENTIFIED ON THE NOTICE.

The text of Proposition 65 (Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13) is available online at: <http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65law72003.html>. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 25102 through 27001.¹ These implementing regulations are available online at: <http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65Regs.html>.

WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

The "Proposition 65 List." Under Proposition 65, the lead agency (OEHHA) publishes a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or reproductive toxicity. Chemicals are placed on the Proposition 65 list if they are known to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, such as damage to

¹ All further regulatory references are to sections of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations unless otherwise indicated. The statute, regulations and relevant case law are available on the OEHHA website at: <http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html>.

female or male reproductive systems or to the developing fetus. This list must be updated at least once a year. The current Proposition 65 list of chemicals is available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65_list/Newlist.html.

Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under Proposition 65. Businesses that produce, use, release or otherwise engage in activities involving listed chemicals must comply with the following:

Clear and reasonable warnings. A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical unless an exemption applies. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed to that chemical. Some exposures are exempt from the warning requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

Prohibition from discharges into drinking water. A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Some discharges are exempt from this requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. You should consult the current version of the statute and regulations (<http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html>) to determine all applicable exemptions, the most common of which are the following:

Grace Period. Proposition 65 warning requirements do not apply until 12 months after the chemical has been listed. The Proposition 65 discharge prohibition does not apply to a discharge or release of a chemical that takes place less than 20 months after the listing of the chemical.

Governmental agencies and public water utilities. All agencies of the federal, state or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

Businesses with nine or fewer employees. Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employs a total of nine or fewer employees. This includes all employees, not just those present in California.

Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer. For chemicals that are listed under Proposition 65 as known to the State to cause cancer, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "No Significant Risk Levels" (NSRLs) for many listed carcinogens. Exposures below these levels are exempt from the warning requirement. See OEHHA's website at:

<http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html> for a list of NSRLs, and Section 25701 *et seq.* of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question. For chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level" divided by 1,000. This number is known as the Maximum Allowable Dose Level (MADL). See OEHHA's website at: <http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html> for a list of MADLs, and Section 25801 *et seq.* of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures to Naturally Occurring Chemicals in Food. Certain exposures to chemicals that naturally occur in foods (i.e., that do not result from any known human activity, including activity by someone other than the person causing the exposure) are exempt from the warning requirements of the law. If the chemical is a contaminant² it must be reduced to the lowest level feasible. Regulations explaining this exemption can be found in Section 25501.

Discharges that do not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering any source of drinking water. The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the listed chemical has not, does not, or will not pass into or probably pass into a source of drinking water, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" level for chemicals that cause cancer or that is 1,000 times below the "no observable effect" level for chemicals that cause reproductive toxicity, if an individual were exposed to that amount in drinking water.

² See Section 25501(a)(4).

HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys. Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. The notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in Section 25903 of Title 27 and sections 3100-3103 of Title 11. A private party may not pursue an independent enforcement action under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an enforcement action within sixty days of the notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court to stop committing the violation.

A private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. For the following types of exposures, the Act provides an opportunity for the business to correct the alleged violation:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

If a private party alleges that a violation occurred based on one of the exposures described above, the private party must first provide the alleged violator a notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form.

A copy of the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form is included in Appendix B and can be downloaded from OEHHA's website at:
<http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/p65law72003.html>.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at
P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.

APPENDIX B

OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE

This Appendix B contains the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). Under the Act, a private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. These exposures are:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

A private party may not file an action against the alleged violator for these exposures, or recover in a settlement any payment in lieu of penalties any reimbursement for costs and attorney's fees, if the alleged violator has done *all* of the following within 14 days of being served notice:

- Corrected the alleged violation;
- Agreed to pay a civil penalty of \$500 (subject to change in 2019 and every five years thereafter) to the private party within 30 days; and

- Notified the private party serving the notice in writing that the violation has been corrected.

An alleged violator may satisfy these conditions only one time for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility or on the same premises. The satisfaction of these conditions does not prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney of a city of greater than 750,000 population, or any full-time city prosecutor with the consent of the district attorney, from filing an enforcement action against an alleged violator.

When a private party sends a notice of alleged violation that alleges one or more of the exposures listed above, the notice must include a notice of special compliance procedure, and a proof of compliance form to be completed by the alleged violator as directed in the notice.

The notice and proof of compliance form is reproduced here:

Date:

Page 1

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE
PROOF OF COMPLIANCE

You are receiving this form because the Noticing Party listed above has alleged that you are violating California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 (Prop. 65).

The Noticing Party may not bring any legal proceedings against you for the alleged violation checked below if:

- (1) You have actually taken the corrective steps that you have certified in this form.**
- (2) The Noticing Party has received this form at the address shown above, accurately completed by you, postmarked within 14 days of your receiving this notice.**
- (3) The Noticing Party receives the required \$500 penalty payment from you at the address shown above postmarked within 30 days of your receiving this notice.**
- (4) This is the first time you have submitted a Proof of Compliance for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility on the same premises.**

PART 1: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE NOTICING PARTY OR ATTORNEY FOR THE NOTICING PARTY

The alleged violation is for an exposure to: (check one)

___Alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent on-site consumption is permitted by law.

___A chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises for immediate consumption on or off premises to the extent: (1) the chemical was not intentionally added; and (2) the chemical was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination.

___Environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises.

___Chemicals known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking noncommercial vehicles.

IMPORTANT NOTES:

(1) You have no potential liability under California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 if your business has nine (9) or fewer employees.

(2) Using this form will NOT prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney, or a prosecutor in whose jurisdiction the violation is alleged to have occurred from filing an action over the same alleged violations, and that in any such action, the amount of civil penalty shall be reduced to reflect any payment made at this time.

Date:

Page 2

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

PART 2: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE ALLEGED VIOLATOR OR AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE

Certification of Compliance

Accurate completion of this form will demonstrate that you are now in compliance with California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 for the alleged violation listed above. You must complete and submit the form below to the Noticing Party at the address shown above, postmarked within 14 days of you receiving this notice.

I hereby agree to pay, within 30 days of completion of this notice, a civil penalty of \$500 to the Noticing Party only and certify that I have complied with Health and Safety Code §25249.6 by (check only one of the following):

- ☐ Posting a warning or warnings about the alleged exposure that complies with the law, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises;
- ☐ Posting the warning or warnings demanded in writing by the Noticing Party, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; OR
- ☐ Eliminating the alleged exposure, and attaching a statement accurately describing how the alleged exposure has been eliminated.

Certification

My statements on this form, and on any attachments to it, are true, complete, and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and are made in good faith. I have carefully read the instructions to complete this form. I understand that if I make a false statement on this form, I may be subject to additional penalties under the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65).

Signature of alleged violator or authorized representative Date

Name and title of signatory

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.