#### LAW OFFICES

#### **BRODSKY & SMITH**

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE, 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

#### April 6, 2023

President/CEO	President/CEO	
Absolute Hot New York Corp.	Absolute Hot New York Corp.	
c/o Diversified Corporate Services Int'l, Inc.	c/o Hyon-Chung Kim	
18560 N. Bay Road,	19 Harbor Park Drive	
Sunny Isles Beach, FL 33160	Port Washington, NY 11050	
President/CEO	President/CEO	
Absolute Hot New York Corp.	ABSNY GmbH	
c/o Sundoc Filings	Alfredstrasse 356, 45133 Essen,	
7801 Folsom Blvd., #202	Nordhein-Westfalen Germany	
Sacramento, CA 95826	·	
President/CEO	President/CEO	
Burlington Coat Factory Warehouse Corporation	Burlington Stores, Inc.	
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Trust Company	
Corporation Trust Center	Corporation Trust Center	
1209 Orange Street	1209 Orange Street	
Wilmington, DE 19801	Wilmington, DE 19801	
President/CEO	President/CEO	
Burlington Coat Factory of Texas, Inc.	Burlington Coat Factory of Texas, Inc.	
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o CT Corporation System	
Corporation Trust Center	28 Liberty Street	
1209 Orange Street	New York, NY 10005	
Wilmington, DE 19801		

#### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky & Smith ("Brodsky Smith") represents Precila Balabbo ("Balabbo"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Balabbo has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

#### I. <u>DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION</u>

- Enforcer: Precila Balabbo, 285 W. 6<sup>th</sup> Street, Unit 209, San Pedro, CA 90731; (Ph) 818-434-4023.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): Absolute Hot New York Corp.; ABSNY GmbH; Burlington Store, Inc.; Burlington Coat Factory Warehouse Corporation; Burlington Coat Factory of Texas, Inc.
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least April 6, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
- **4. Product: Listed Chemical**: Diethanolamine (DEA) is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product	
Growth Serum	Absolute New York Brows and Lashes Growth Serum	
	UPC# 8 88432 94470 9	

6. **Description of Exposure:** The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal exposure. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

#### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Balabbo against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Balabbo's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Balabbo is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Balabbo has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky & Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

#### CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

#### I, Evan J. Smith, hereby declare:

- (1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- (2) I am the attorney for the noticing party, Precila Balabbo.
- (3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- (4) Based on the information obtained through these consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator(s) will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- (5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: April 6, 2023

Evan J. Smith

Attorney for Precila Balabbo

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within action. My business address is 2 Bala Plaza, Suite 805, Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania. I am employed in Montgomery County where the mailing occurred.

On April 6, 2023, I served the following documents: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary on the following entities and individuals listed below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

President/CEO Absolute Hot New York Corp. c/o Diversified Corporate Services Int'l, Inc. 18560 N. Bay Road, Sunny Isles Beach, FL 33160	President/CEO Absolute Hot New York Corp. c/o Hyon-Chung Kim 19 Harbor Park Drive Port Washington, NY 11050
President/CEO Absolute Hot New York Corp. c/o Sundoc Filings 7801 Folsom Blvd., #202 Sacramento, CA 95826	President/CEO ABSNY GmbH Alfredstrasse 356, 45133 Essen, Nordhein-Westfalen Germany
President/CEO Burlington Coat Factory Warehouse Corporation c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801	President/CEO Burlington Stores, Inc. c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801
President/CEO Burlington Coat Factory of Texas, Inc. c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801	President/CEO Burlington Coat Factory of Texas, Inc. c/o CT Corporation System 28 Liberty Street New York, NY 10005

On April 6, 2023, I served the following documents: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary on each of the individuals on the service list attached hereto as Appendix B by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed on April 6, 2023, in Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania.

Evan J. Smith

### ELECTRONIC MAIL SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Nancy O'Mailey Alameda County District Attorney 7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acgiv.org	The Homerible Tori Verher Salzar San Joaquin County District Attorney 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95262	Honorable Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814	
The Hannahla Alli	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcdn.org	Prop65@sacda.org	
The Honorable Allison Haley Napa County District Attorney	The Honorable Jeffrey S. Rosell	The Honorable Summer Stephan	
1127 First St., Suite C	Sunta Cruz County District Attorney	an Diego County District Attorney	
Napa, CA 94559	70! Ocean Street	300 West Broadway	
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Sunta Cruz, CA 95060	San Diego, CA 92101	
bu V County ot napa, org	Prepfi5DA@santacruzeounty.us	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org	
The Honorable Jeff W. Reisig	Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney	
Yolo County District Attorney	Lassen County	City of San Diego	
301 Second Street	220 S. Lassen Street	1200 Third Avenue	
Woodland, CA 95695	Susanville, CA 96130	San Diego, CA 92101	
sept@yolocounty.org	mlatimer@co.jassen.ca.us	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov	
Bud Porter	Alethea M. Sargent	Christopher Dalbey,	
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Assistant District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney	
Santa Clara County	San Francisco District Attorney's Office	Sauta Barbara County	
0 W Hedding Street	350 Rhode Island Street	1112 Santa Barbara Street	
an Jose, CA 95110	CA 95110 See Francisco CA 94103		
PU@da.sccgov.org	alethea.sargent@sfgov.org	DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us	
he Honorable Gregory D. Totten,	The Honorable Barbara Yook	Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney	
entura County District Attorney	Calaverus County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney	
00 S Victoria Avenue	891 Mountain Ranch Road	1390 Market Street, 7th Floor	
entura, CA 93009	San Andreas, CA 95249	San Francisco, CA 94102	
aspecialops@ventura.org	Propositiny@co.culaveras.cn.us	Valerie Lopez@afcityatty.org	
tacey Grassini	Bric J. Dobroth	Deannine M. Pacioni	
eputy District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney	
ontra Costa County	San Luis Obispo County	Monterey County	
00 Ward Street	County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor	1200 Aguajito Road	
fartinez, CA 94553	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Monterey, CA 93940	
cassini@contracostada.org	edobroth@co.slo.ea.us	Prop65DA@co.montercy.ca.us	
he Honorable Thomas Hardy	The Honorable Phillip I. Cline	The Honorable Clifford Newell	
yo County District Attorney	Fulure County District Attorney	Nevada County District Attorney	
8 N. Edwards Street	221 S Mooney Blvd	201 Commercial Street	
dependence, CA 93526	Visalia, CA 95370	Nevada City, CA 95959	
yoda@inyocounty.us	Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us	
ie Honorable Paul E. Zellerbach	The Honorable Stephan Passalacqua	The Flonorable David Hollister	
verside County District Attorney	Senoma County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney	
12 Orange Street	660 Administration Drive	520 Main Street, Room 404	
verside, CA 92501	Sonoma, CA 95403	Ouiney, CA 95971	
ep65@rivcoda.org	ibanes@sonoma-county.org	davidhallister@countyofplumas.com	
e Honorable Walter W Wall	The Honorable Kinnberly Lewis	The Honorable Morgan Briggs Gire	
Iriposa County District Attorney	Merced County District Attorney		
D. Box 730	530 West Main Street	Placer County District Attorney	
ariposa, CA 95338	Married CA 95240	10810 Justice Center Drive	
da@mariposacounty.org	Mercod, CA 95346	Roseville, CA 95678	
ra V. Frimann, City Attorney	Propos@countyofmerced.com	prop65@placer.ca.gov	
E Santa Class St	Lisa A. Smitteamp, District Attorney		
DE. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	2100 Tulare Street		
Jose, CA 96113	Fresno, CA 93721		
position65notices@sanjeseca.gov	consumerprotection@freshoceuntyca.gov	. *	

## **ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST**

Office of the California Attorney General
Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting
ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator
P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550

https://oag.ea-gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

## **SERVICE LIST**

The Honorable Nancy O'Mailey	The Honorable Stacey Montgomery	The Honorable Candice Hooper	The Honorable Gragg Cohan
Alameda County District Attorney	Lassen County Olstrict Attorney	San Benito County District Altomey	Tahama County District Attorney
1225 Fallon Street, Room 900	220 South Lassen Street, Sta. 8	419 4th Street, Second Floor	444 Oak Street, Hoom L
Oakland, CA 94612	Susanville, CA 96130	Hollister, CA 95203	Red Bluff, CA 96080
The Honorable Terese Drabac	The Honorable Jackie Lacey	The Honorabte Michael Flamos	The Honorable Eric Herylord
Alpine County District Attorney	Los Angeles County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney	Trinity County District Attorney
270 Laramie Street, PO BOX 248	211 West Temple Street, Sulte 1200	303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor	P.O. Box 310
Markieeville, OA 96120	Los Angeles, CA 90012	San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	Weaverville, CA 96093
The Hongrable Todd Riebe	The Honorable David Linn	The Honorable Bonnie Durnanis	The Honorable Tim Ward
Amador County District Attorney	Madera County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney	Tulare County District Attorney
708 Court Street	209 West Yosemite Avenue	330 W, Broadway Street	221 South Mooney Boulevard, Rm 224
Jackson, CA 96642	Madera, CA 93637	San Diego, CA 92101	Visalia, CA 93291-4593
The Hancrable Michael Ramsay	The Honorable Edward Berberian	The Honorable George Gascon	The Honorable Laura Krieg
Butte County District Attorney	Marin County District Attorney	San Francisco County District Attorney	Tuolumne Counly District Attorney
25 County Center Drive	3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130	650 Bryant Street, Room 322	423 North Washington Street
Oroville, CA 95965	San Ralgel, CA 94903	San Francisco, CA 94103	Sonora, CA 95370
The Honorable Barbara Yook	The Honorable Thomas Cooke	The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar	The Honorable Gregory Tolten
Calaveras County District Attorney	Marlposa County District Attorney	San Joaquin County District Altorney	Ventura County District Attorney
891 Mountain Banch Road	5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730	222 East Weber Avenue, Room 202	800 South Victoria Avenue
San Andreas, CA 95249	Mariposa, CA 95338	Stockton, CA 95201	Ventura, CA 93009
The Honorable John Poyner	The Honorable C. David Eyster	The Honorable Dan Dow	The Honorable Jeff Reisig
Coluse County District Attorney	Mendocino County District Attorney	San Luis Obispo Gounty District Atty	Yolo County District Altomey
345 Fifth Street	100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000	1035 Palm Street, 4th Floor	301 Second Street
Coluse, CA 95932	Uklah, CA 95482	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Woodland, CA 95695
The Hönorable Mark Peterson	The Figure 1 The Figure 1 The Figure 1 The Figure 2 The F	The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe	The Honorable Pairick McGraih
Contra Costa County District Attorney		San Mateo County District Attorney	Yuba County District Attorney
900 Ward Street		400 County Center, Third Floor	215 Fifth Streel
Martinez, CA 94553		Redwood City, CA 94063	Marysville, CA 95901
The Honorable Date Trigg Dat Norte County District Attorney 150 H Streat, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531	The Honorable Jordan Funk Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101	The Honorable Joyce Dudley Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101	The Honorable Mike Feuer Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles 800 City Hall East 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 80012
The Honorable Vern Plerson	The Honorable Tim Kendall	The Honorable Jeffrey Rosen	The Honorable James Sanchez Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 I Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814
El Dorado County District Attorney	Mono County District Attorney	Sanla Clara County District Attorney	
178 Pacilio Street	P.O. Box 617	70 Wast Hedding Streat, West Wing	
Placerville, CA 95667	Bridgeport, CA 93617	San Jese, CA 95110	
The Handrable Liza Smitteamp	The Honorable Dean Flippo	The Honorable Jeff Rosell	The Honorable Jan Goldsmith
Tresno County District Attorney	Monterey County District Attorney	Santa Cruz County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney, San Diego
1220 Tulate Street, #1000	P.O. 80x 1131	701 Ocean Street, Room 200	1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620
Teato, CA 93721	Salines, CA 99902	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	San Diego, OA 92101
he Honorable Dwayne Stewart Slann County District Attorney 2.O. Box 430 Villows, CA 95988	The Honorable Allison Haley Napa County District Attorney 1127 First Street, Sulte C Napa, CA 94559	The Honorable Slephen Carlton Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Streat Redding, CA 96001	The Hongrable Dennis Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102
he Flongrable Maggle Fleming	The Honorable Clifford Newell	The Honorable Lawrence Allen	The Honorable Richard Doyle Office of the City Altomey, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113
funiboldt County District Attorney	Nevada County District Attorney	Sierra County District Attorney	
25 5th Street, Fourth Floor	201 Commercial Street	100 Courthouse Square	
tureke, CA 95501	Nevada Cily, CA 95959	Downleville, CA 95936	
he Nancreble Gibert Otero mperial Caunty Bistrict Attorney 40 West Main Streat, Suile 102 Il Centro, CA 92249	The Honorable Tony Rackauckes Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701	The Honorable James Kirk Andrus Sisklyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 988 Yreka, CA 96097	Office of the California Altorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Sireet, Suite 2000 Oakland, OA 94812-0550
he Honorable Thomas Hardy	The Honorable R. Scott Owens	The Honorable Krishna Abrams	37.00.00
nyo County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney	Solano County Olstrict Attorney	
. O. Drawer D	10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240	675 Toxas Street, Suite 4500	
ndependence, CA 93526	Rosewille, CA 95678	Fairfield, CA 94533	
he Honorable Lisa Green	The Honorable David Hollister	The Honorable JIII Ravitoh	
em County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney	Sonoma County District Attorney	
215 Truxtun Avenue	520 Main Street, Room 404	600 Administration Drive, Room 212J	
lakeralisid, CA 93301	Quincy, CA 95971	Santa Rosa, CA.95403	
he Honorable Keith Fagundas	The Honorable Michael Hestrin	The Honorable Blight Fladager	
Kings County Eistrict Attorney	Riverside County District Attorney	Stanislaus County Obstrict Attorney	
480 West Lacey Boulevard	3980 Orange Street	832 12th Street, Suite 300	
Janiord, CA 93230	Riverside, CA 92501	Modesto, CA 95354	
he Honorable Donald Anderson	The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert	The Honorable Amanda Hopper	
ake County District Attorney	Sagramento County District Attorney	Sulter County District Attorney	
55 North Forbes Street	901 G Street	463 Second Street, Sulte 102	
akeport CA 95453	Sagramento CA 95814	Yuba City CA 95991	

#### APPENDIX A

## OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and OEHHA implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information.

FOR INFORMATION CONCERNING THE BASIS FOR THE ALLEGATIONS IN THE NOTICE RELATED TO YOUR BUSINESS, CONTACT THE PERSON IDENTIFIED ON THE NOTICE.

The text of Proposition 65 (Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13) is available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65law72003.html. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 25102 through 27001.1 These implementing regulations are available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65Regs.html.

## WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

The "Proposition 65 List." Under Proposition 65, the lead agency (OEHHA) publishes a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or reproductive toxicity. Chemicals are placed on the Proposition 65 list if they are known to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, such as damage to

All further regulatory references are to sections of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations unless otherwise indicated. The statute, regulations and relevant case law are available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html.

female or male reproductive systems or to the developing fetus. This list must be updated at least once a year. The current Proposition 65 list of chemicals is available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65\_list/Newlist.html.

Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under Proposition 65. Businesses that produce, use, release or otherwise engage in activities involving listed chemicals must comply with the following:

Clear and reasonable warnings. A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical unless an exemption applies. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed to that chemical. Some exposures are exempt from the warning requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

**Prohibition from discharges into drinking water.** A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Some discharges are exempt from this requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

### DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. You should consult the current version of the statute and regulations (http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html) to determine all applicable exemptions, the most common of which are the following:

Grace Period. Proposition 65 warning requirements do not apply until 12 months after the chemical has been listed. The Proposition 65 discharge prohibition does not apply to a discharge or release of a chemical that takes place less than 20 months after the listing of the chemical.

Governmental agencies and public water utilities. All agencies of the federal, state or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

**Businesses with nine or fewer employees.** Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employs a total of nine or fewer employees. This includes all employees, not just those present in California.

Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer. For chemicals that are listed under Proposition 65 as known to the State to cause cancer, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "No Significant Risk Levels" (NSRLs) for many listed carcinogens. Exposures below these levels are exempt from the warning requirement. See OEHHA's website at:

http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of NSRLs, and Section 25701 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

**Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question.** For chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level" divided by 1,000. This number is known as the Maximum Allowable Dose Level (MADL). See OEHHA's website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of MADLs, and Section 25801 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

**Exposures to Naturally Occurring Chemicals in Food.** Certain exposures to chemicals that naturally occur in foods (i.e., that do not result from any known human activity, including activity by someone other than the person causing the exposure) are exempt from the warning requirements of the law. If the chemical is a contaminant<sup>2</sup> it must be reduced to the lowest level feasible. Regulations explaining this exemption can be found in Section 25501.

**Discharges that do not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering any source of drinking water.** The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the listed chemical has not, does not, or will not pass into or probably pass into a source of drinking water, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" level for chemicals that cause cancer or that is 1,000 times below the "no observable effect" level for chemicals that cause reproductive toxicity, if an individual were exposed to that amount in drinking water.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Section 25501(a)(4).

### HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys. Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. The notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in Section 25903 of Title 27 and sections 3100-3103 of Title 11. A private party may not pursue an independent enforcement action under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an enforcement action within sixty days of the notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court to stop committing the violation.

A private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. For the following types of exposures, the Act provides an opportunity for the business to correct the alleged violation:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared
  and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for
  immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was
  not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar
  preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or
  beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure
  occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily
  intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

If a private party alleges that a violation occurred based on one of the exposures described above, the private party must first provide the alleged violator a notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form.

A copy of the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form is included in Appendix B and can be downloaded from OEHHA's website at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/p65law72003.html.

## FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.

#### APPENDIX B

# OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE

This Appendix B contains the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). Under the Act, a private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. These exposures are:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared
  and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for
  immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was
  not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar
  preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or
  beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

A private party may not file an action against the alleged violator for these exposures, or recover in a settlement any payment in lieu of penalties any reimbursement for costs and attorney's fees, if the alleged violator has done all of the following within 14 days of being served notice:

- Corrected the alleged violation;
- Agreed to pay a civil penalty of \$500 (subject to change in 2019 and every five years thereafter) to the private party within 30 days; and

 Notified the private party serving the notice in writing that the violation has been corrected.

An alleged violator may satisfy these conditions only one time for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility or on the same premises. The satisfaction of these conditions does not prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney of a city of greater than 750,000 population, or any full-time city prosecutor with the consent of the district attorney, from filing an enforcement action against an alleged violator.

When a private party sends a notice of alleged violation that alleges one or more of the exposures listed above, the notice must include a notice of special compliance procedure, and a proof of compliance form to be completed by the alleged violator as directed in the notice.

The notice and proof of compliance form is reproduced here:

Date:

Page 1

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

# SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE PROOF OF COMPLIANCE

You are receiving this form because the Noticing Party listed above has alleged that you are violating California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 (Prop. 65).

The Noticing Party may <u>not</u> bring any legal proceedings against you for the alleged violation checked below if:

- (1) You have actually taken the corrective steps that you have certified in this form.
- (2) The Noticing Party has received this form at the address shown above, accurately completed by you, postmarked within 14 days of your receiving this notice.
- (3) The Noticing Party receives the required \$500 penalty payment from you at the address shown above postmarked within 30 days of your receiving this notice.
- (4) This is the first time you have submitted a Proof of Compliance for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility on the same premises.

# PART 1: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE NOTICING PARTY OR ATTORNEY FOR THE NOTICING PARTY

The alleged violation is for an exposure to: (check one)

## IMPORTANT NOTES:

(1) You have no potential liability under California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 if your business has nine (9) or fewer employees.

(2) Using this form will NOT prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney, or a prosecutor in whose jurisdiction the violation is alleged to have occurred from filing an action over the same alleged violations, and that in any such action, the amount of civil penalty shall be reduced to reflect any payment made at this time.

Date:

Page 2

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

## PART 2: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE ALLEGED VIOLATOR OR AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE

Certification of Compliance

Accurate completion of this form will demonstrate that you are now in compliance with California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 for the alleged violation listed above. You must complete and submit the form below to the Noticing Party at the address shown above, postmarked within 14 days of you receiving this notice.

I hereby agree to pay, within 30 days of completion of this notice, a civil penalty of \$500 to the Noticing Party only and certify that I have complied with Health and Safety Code §25249.6 by (check only one of the following):

[] Posting a warning or warnings about the alleged exposure that complies with the law, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; [] Posting the warning or warnings demanded in writing by the Noticing Party, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; OR [] Eliminating the alleged exposure, and attaching a statement accurately describing how the alleged exposure has been eliminated.
My statements on this form, and on any attachments to it, are true, complete, and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and are made in good faith. I have carefully read the instructions to complete this form. I understand that if I make a false statement on this form, I may be subject to additional penalties under the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65).
Signature of alleged violator or authorized representative Date
Name and title of signatory

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.