

## 60 DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET ESQ. (PROPOSITION 65)

May 16, 2023

CC:

Ashley Buchanan, CEO Michaels Stores Procurement Company, Inc 2475 Esters Blvd, Suite 100 DFW Airport, TX 75261

CEO/President MSPCI 3939 W John Carpenter Freeway Irving, TX 75063 Michaels Stores Procurement Company, Inc. c/o Csc - Lawyers Incorporating Service, Reg. Agent 2710 Gateway Oaks Drive, Suite 150N Sacramento, CA 95833

California Attorney General's Office; District Attorney's Offices for All California Counties; and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento, and Los Angeles

### I. INTRODUCTION

Consumer Protection Group, LLC ("CPG") is the noticing entity, acting in the interest of the general public. It seeks to reduce or eliminate the presence of hazardous substances in consumer products sold in California, and to ensure that California consumers are aware of the presence of such substances in consumer goods so that they can make an educated effort to limit their own exposure where deemed necessary.

This Notice is provided to the public agencies listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.6, *et seq.* ("Proposition 65"). As noted above, notice is provided to the violator, Michaels Stores Procurement Company, Inc (the "Violator"). The violations covered by this Notice consist of the product exposures, routes of exposure, and type of harm potentially resulting from exposure to the toxic chemical ("listed chemical") identified as follows:

Product Exposures:	Artist Loft Bush Set – Storage Case
Chemical:	Di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP)
Routes of Exposure:	Ingestion, Dermal Absorption
Types of Harm:	Cancer, Developmental Toxicity, and
	Male Reproductive Toxicity



## **II. PRODUCT AND TIME OF VIOLATIONS**

The specific type of product that is causing consumer exposures in violations of Proposition 65, and that is covered by this Notice which includes but is not limited to: "Artist's Loft" "Multi Purpose Long and Short Handle Brush Set" "25pc" "necessities" "Distributed by MSPCI 3939 W John Carpenter Fwy Irving, TX 75063" "149448" "46391-2021-06" "Made in China" "UPC No. 400100730355" ("Noticed Product").

Ongoing violations have occurred each day between May 16, 2020, and May 16, 2023, as well as every day since the products were introduced for sale in California. These violations will continue until clear and reasonable warnings are provided prior to exposure of the identified chemical. The method of warning should be a label on the product itself.

As a result of sales of this product, exposures to the listed chemical have been occurring without clear and reasonable warnings as required by Proposition 65. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical, California consumers lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the toxic chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the products.

California consumers are exposed to the listed chemical by buying, acquiring, or utilizing the products. By way of example but not limitation, direct exposures occur when people (including children) handle the Noticed Product. The concentration of the chemical present within the Noticed Product constitutes a significant chemical dose exposure to consumers through their use of the Noticed Product. Exposure to the contaminants present within the noticed product may also occur through hand to mouth ingestion under typical and foreseeable use of the Noticed Product.

Per Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, section 25600.2(g) (2018) the retail seller noticed on this 60day notice is hereby requested to promptly provide the names and contact information for the manufacturers, producers, packagers, importers, suppliers, and/or distributors of the products identified in this Notice.

## **III. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION**

For general information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment 's ("OEHHA") Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900. For the Violator' reference, attached is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary," which has been prepared by OEHHA.



#### IV. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Consistent with goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these violations corrected, CPG is interested in seeking a resolution of this matter that includes a binding written agreement by the Violators to: (1) recall any products already sold, or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provide to those who have received such products; (2) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemical, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemical, as well as expensive and time-consuming litigation. It should be noted that counsel cannot (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; or (2) speak for the California Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who has received this notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with CPG will resolve its claims; such an agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to CPG at the following address:

Jonathan M. Genish, Esq. BLACKSTONE LAW, A.P.C. 8383 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 745 Beverly Hills, CA 90211 Telephone (310) 622-4278 Email: jgenish@blackstonepc.com

Sincerely,

BLACKSTONE LAW, APC Jonathan M. Genish, Esq.

# **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

I, Jonathan M. Genish, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached Sixty-Day Notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the Notice have violated Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings;
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party;
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action;
- 4. Based on the information obtained through these consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that 'reasonable and meritorious case for the private action' means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established, and the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute; and
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health & Safety Code§ 25249.7(11)(2) (*i.e.*, (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons).

Dated: May 16, 2023

Jonathan M. Genish, Esq.

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Kevin Vaz, hereby declare:

- 1. I am, and was at the time of service hereinafter mentioned, a resident of the State of California, over the age of eighteen years, and not a party to the within action. My business address is 8383 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 745, Beverly Hills, CA 90211.
- 2. On May 16, 2023, I served the following documents:
  - 60-Day Notice of Violations
  - Certificate of Merit
  - Appendix "A" "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary", and Appendix "B" "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): Special Compliance Procedure".
  - Certificate of Service

on the following party by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below, and depositing it at a United States Postal Service Office for delivery both by Certified Mail:

Ashley Buchanan, CEO	Michaels Stores Procurement Company, Inc.
Michaels Stores Procurement Company, Inc	c/o Csc - Lawyers Incorporating Service, Reg. Agent
2475 Esters Blvd, Suite 100	2710 Gateway Oaks Drive, Suite 150N
DFW Airport, TX 75261	Sacramento, CA 95833

CEO/President MSPCI 3939 W John Carpenter Freeway Irving, TX 75063

- 3. On May 16, 2023, I served the following documents:
  - 60-Day Notice of Violations
  - Certificate of Merit: Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7 (d)
  - Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy): Factual information sufficient to establish the basis of the certificate of merit sent only to the office of the California Attorney General via link at oag.ca.gov/prop65
  - Certificate of Service
- 4. On May 16, 2023, I served the following documents:
  - 60-Day Notice of Violations
  - Certificate of Merit
  - Certificate of Service

on each of the following parties by causing a true and correct .PDF copy thereof to be sent via electronic mail to the party listed below, pursuant to Cal. Code Regs., title. 27, § 25903(c)(1):

Alameda County District Attorney	San Francisco Deputy City Attorney
<u>CEPDProp65@acgov.org</u>	Valerie.Lopez@sfcityattorney.org
Calaveras County District Attorney	San Joaquin County District Attorney
<u>Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us</u>	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org
Contra Costa County District	San Luis Obispo County District
Attorney	Attorney
<u>sgrassini@contracostada.org</u>	<u>edobroth@co.slo.ca.us</u>
Inyo County District Attorney	Santa Barbara County District Attorney
inyoda@inyocounty.us	DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
Lassen County District Attorney	Santa Clara County District Attorney
mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	<u>EPU@da.sccgov.org</u>
Monterey County District Attorney	Santa Cruz District Attorney
<u>Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us</u>	<u>Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us</u>
Napa County District Attorney CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Sonoma County District Attorney jbarnes@sonoma- county.org
Riverside County District Attorney <u>Prop65@rivcoda.org</u>	Tulare County District Attorney   Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
Sacramento County District Attorney <u>Prop65@sacda.org</u>	Ventura County District Attorney <u>daspecialops@ventura.org</u>
San Diego County District Attorney	Yolo County District Attorney
CityAttyCrimProp65@sandiego.gov	<u>cfepd@yolocounty.org</u>
San Francisco Ass. District Attorney alethea.sargent@sfgov.org	

I also sent the above to the following parties mentioned on the service list attached hereto by placing a true and correct .PDF copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the service list attached hereto, and depositing it at a United States Postal Service Office for delivery by First Class Mail.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated: May 16, 2023

Kevin Vaz

Alpine County District Attorney P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street #202 Jackson, CA 95642

Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965

Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932

Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

El Dorado County District Attorney 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667

Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501

Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243

Inyo County District Attorney P.O. Drawer D 168 N Edwards St Independence, CA 93526

Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4th Floor Bakersfield, CA 93301

Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple Street Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012

Madera County District Attorney 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

#### SERVICE LIST

Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

Mariposa County District Attorney 5101Jones Street, P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

Mendocino County District Attorney 100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

Modoc County District Attorney 204 5. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101

Mono County District Attorney 278 Main St Bridgeport, CA 93517

Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

Orange County District Attorney 300 N Flower Street Santa Ana, CA 92703

Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678

Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th Street, Second Floor Hollister, CA 95203

San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502

San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square Downieville, CA 95936

Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533 Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354

Sutter County District Attorney 466 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991

Tehama County District Attorney 444 Oak Street, Room L Red Bluff, CA 96080

Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles City Hall East 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012

Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 I Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814

Office of the City Attorney, San Diego 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 234 San Francisco, CA 94102

Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113