VOORHEES & BAILEY, LLP 535 Ramona Street; Suite 5 Palo Alto, CA 94301 650-313-2154

Container

60-Day Notice of Violation - California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

June 15, 2023

Notice Recipient: Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc.

Noticing Party: Audrey Kallander

Covered Products: Rain Gauges With Exterior Designs

Listed Chemical: Lead

Routes of Exposure: Ingestion; Dermal

Potential Harm: Birth Defects and Other Reproductive Harm

I. INTRODUCTION

This Sixty-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice") is provided by Audrey Kallander. Ms. Kallander is a private enforcer acting in the public interest pursuant to California Health & Safety Code section 25249.7(d). Ms. Kallander seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold and used in California and, if possible, to eliminate such exposures.

This Notice is provided to the alleged violator, Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc. (the "Notice Recipient"), as well as the California Attorney General's Office, the District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties, and the City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose and Los Angeles.

The Notice Recipient is hereby given notice that it has violated and continues to violate provisions of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, which is codified at California Health & Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq. ("Proposition 65"). Specifically, the Notice Recipient has violated and continues to violate the warning requirement of section 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code, which provides, "No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual...." The alleged violations that are the subject of this Notice are provided below.

II. ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

<u>Product Types/Categories</u>: The specific types or categories of products that are causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are Rain Gauges With Exterior Designs ("Covered Products").

Identified below is a specific example of Covered Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California (the "Exemplar Product"). Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors, and/or manufacturers of the Exemplar Product is also provided.

The Exemplar Product is identified for the Notice Recipient's benefit to assist in its investigation of the allegations set forth in this Notice. The Exemplar Product is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product falling within the specific types or categories of Covered Products at issue in this Notice. It is the private enforcer's position that the Notice Recipient is obligated to conduct a good-faith investigation into other specific products falling within the type or category of Covered Products that have been manufactured, imported, distributed, sold, shipped, stored, or are otherwise within the Notice Recipient's custody or control, so as to ensure the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

| Covered Products | Exemplar Product Information | |
|---------------------------|--|--|
| Rain Gauges With Exterior | Hobby Lobby Glass Rain Gauge | |
| Designs | Item #: 1483049 | |
| | Retailer: Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc. (Modesto, CA) | |
| | Manufacturer/Distributor: Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc. | |
| | | |

<u>Listed Chemical</u>: The alleged violations involve exposures to the Proposition 65-listed chemical lead. Lead is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. Lead is hereinafter referred to as the "Listed Chemical".

<u>Statement of Violations</u>: The Notice Recipient knowingly and intentionally exposed, and continues to knowingly and intentionally expose, consumers within the State of California to lead, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm, without first giving clear and reasonable warning of this exposure to such individuals. In particular, the Notice Recipient failed to provide a clear and reasonable warning to consumers that the Covered Products expose consumers to lead.

Route of Exposure: California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the Covered Products, are exposed to the Listed Chemical. Consumers ingest the Listed Chemical when they touch and handle the Covered Products, transfer the Listed Chemical from the Covered Products onto their fingers and hands, and transfer the Listed Chemical from their fingers and hands to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur

for a significant period after contact with the Covered Products. Consumers are exposed to the Listed Chemical through direct dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle or touch the Covered Products.

<u>Number and Duration of Violations</u>: Each and every sale of a Covered Product to a consumer in California without a clear and reasonable warning is a violation, including transactions made over-the-counter, through the internet, and/or via catalogue by the Notice Recipient and any other sellers of the Covered Products. These violations have been occurring since at least June 15, 2022, as well as every day since the Covered Products were first introduced and sold in the State of California, as far back as June 15, 2020. The violations are ongoing.

III. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) and Title 11, California Code of Regulations, section 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto. A second copy of the entire notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the Attorney General with all supporting documentation required by Section 3102 attached thereto.

IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION – A SUMMARY

A summary of Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead agency designated under Proposition 65, is enclosed with the copy of the Notice served on the Notice Recipient.

V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Ms. Kallander intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the Notice Recipient upon the expiration of the sixty-day notice period, provided no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

If the Notice Recipient is interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and expensive litigation, it should contact counsel at the address provided below. It should be noted that no settlement may be finalized before the sixty-day notice period has expired and only if no public prosecutor has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the alleged violation.

VI. PRESERVATION OF EVIDENCE

This Notice also serves as a demand that the Notice Recipient preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in the Covered Products; purchase and sales information for Covered Products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to the Covered Products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in Covered Products; and representative exemplars of each specific model falling within the Covered Products. This demand applies to all relevant evidence for Covered Products sold in the State of California, as far back as June 15, 2020, through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

VII. CONTACT INFORMATION

Ms. Kallander has retained me as legal counsel in this matter. Please direct all communications related to this Notice of Violation to the following:

Troy Bailey, Esq.
Voorhees & Bailey, LLP
535 Ramona Street; Suite 5
Palo Alto, CA 94301
troy@voorheesbailey.com

Sincerely

David Joshua Voorhees Voorhees & Bailey, LLP

Attorneys for Audrey Kallander

cc: California Attorney General's Office; District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties;

and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose and Los Angeles

Attachments: Certificate of Merit; Proof of Service; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic

Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary (*Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc. only*); and Confidential Information in Support of Certificate of Merit (*Attorney*

General Only)

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, David Joshua Voorhees, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice has violated Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) certain facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: June 15, 2023

David Joshua Voorhees

PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within action. I am employed in Santa Clara County, California. My business address is 535 Ramona Street; Suite 5, Palo Alto, CA 94301.

On June 15, 2023, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

XXXX **By First Class Certified Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative.

Kathie Craig; Registered Agent For Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc. 18400 Von Karmen Avenue; Suite 800 Irvine, CA 92612

On June 15, 2023, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); AND

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

XXXX **By First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each entity on the attached "U.S. Mail Service List" and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative, postage prepaid.

XXXX **By Electronic Mail** by sending true and correct copies of the above documents to the electronic notification (Email) address(es) on the attached "Electronic Mail Service List".

On June 15, 2023, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS

XXXX **By Electronic Upload** by causing true and correct copies of the above documents to be uploaded to the California Attorney General's website at the web address on the attached "Electronic Upload Service List".

Executed on June 15, 2023, at Palo Alto, California.

Cesar Gonzalez

U.S. Mail Service List

| Alpine County District Attorney | Los Angeles County District Attorney | San Mateo County District Attorney |
|---|--|--|
| P.O. Box 248 | 211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200 | 400 County Center |
| Markleeville, CA 96120 | Los Angeles, CA 90012 | Redwood City, CA 94063 |
| Amador County District Attorney | Madera County District Attorney | Shasta County District Attorney |
| 708 Court Street | 209 West Yosemite Avenue | 1355 West Street |
| Jackson, CA 95642 | Madera, CA 93637 | Redding, CA 96001 |
| Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965 | Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Suite 145 San Rafael, CA 94903 | Sierra County District Attorney P.O. Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936 |
| Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932 | Mendocino County District Attorney P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482 | Siskiyou County District Attorney 311 4th Street Yreka, CA 96097 |
| Del Norte County District Attorney | San Benito County District Attorney | Solano County District Attorney |
| 450 H Street, Room 171 | 419 4th Street | 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 |
| Crescent City, CA 95531 | Hollister, CA 95023 | Fairfield, CA 94533 |
| El Dorado County District Attorney | Modoc County District Attorney | Stanislaus County District Attorney |
| 778 Pacific Street | 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 | 832 12th Street, Suite 300 |
| Placerville, CA 95667 | Alturas, CA 96101 | Modesto, CA 95354 |
| Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230 | Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517 | Sutter County District Attorney 463 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991 |
| Glenn County District Attorney | Lake County District Attorney | Tehama County District Attorney |
| P.O. Box 430 | 255 North Forbes Street | 444 Oak Street, Room L |
| Willows, CA 95988 | Lakeport, CA 95453 | Red Bluff, CA 96080 |
| Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, Fourth Floor Eureka, CA 95501 | Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles James K. Hahn City Hall East 200 North Main Street, 8th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012 | Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093 |
| Imperial County District Attorney | San Bernardino County District Attorney | Tuolumne County District Attorney |
| 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 | 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor | 423 North Washington Street |
| El Centro, CA 92243 | San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502 | Sonora, CA 95370 |
| Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4th Floor Bakersfield, CA 93301 | | Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901 |

Electronic Upload Service List

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

Electronic Mail Service List

| | | _ |
|---|---|--|
| Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney | Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney | Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney |
| Alameda County District Attorney | Riverside County | San Luis Obispo County |
| 7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650 | 3072 Orange Street | County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor |
| Oakland, CA 94621 | Riverside, CA 92501 | San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 |
| CEPDProp65@acgov.org | Prop65@rivcoda.org | edobroth@co.slo.ca.us |
| | - report measuring | |
| Allison Haley, District Attorney | Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney | Jill Ravitch, District Attorney |
| Napa County | San Joaquin County | Sonoma County |
| 1127 First Street, Suite C | 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 | 600 Administration Dr |
| 1 | Stockton, CA 95202 | Santa Rosa, CA 95403 |
| Napa, CA 94559 | , | • |
| CEPD@countyofnapa.org | DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org | Jeannie.barnes@sonoma-county.org |
| Alexandra Grayner, Assistant DA | Jeffrey S. Rosell , District Attorney | Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney |
| San Francisco County | Santa Cruz County | Monterey County |
| 350 Rhode Island Street | 701 Ocean Street | 1200 Aguajito Road |
| San Francisco, CA 94103 | Santa Cruz, CA 95060 | Monterey, CA 93940 |
| alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org | | ** |
| alexandra.grayner@sigov.org | Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us | Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us |
| Bud Porter | Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney | Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney |
| Supervising Deputy District Attorney | Yolo County | City of San Diego |
| Santa Clara County | 301 Second Street | 1200 Third Avenue |
| 70 W Hedding St | Woodland, CA 95695 | San Diego, CA 92101 |
| San Jose, CA 95110 | cfepd@yolocounty.org | CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov |
| 1 | crepa@yorocounty.org | CityAttyF10p03@sandleg0.gov |
| EPU@da.sccgov.org | Devin Chandler, Executive Assistant | Christopher Dalboy |
| Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney | • | Christopher Dalbey, |
| Ventura County | Lassen County | Deputy District Attorney |
| 800 S Victoria Ave | 220 S. Lassen Street | Santa Barbara County |
| Ventura, CA 93009 | Susanville, CA 96130 | 1112 Santa Barbara St. |
| daspecialops@ventura.org | dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us | Santa Barbara, CA 93101 |
| | | DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us |
| Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney | Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney | Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney |
| Contra Costa County | Sacramento County | Tulare County |
| 900 Ward Street | 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 | 221 S Mooney Blvd |
| Martinez, CA 94553 | Prop65@sacda.org | Visalia, CA 95370 |
| sgrassini@contracostada.org | ,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,, | Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us |
| -6 | | Tropose community |
| Barbara Yook, District Attorney | Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney | Henry Lifton, Deputy City Attorney |
| Calaveras County | Inyo County | City of San Francisco |
| 891 Mountain Ranch Road. | 168 North Edwards Street | 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor |
| San Andreas, CA 95249 | Independence, CA 93526 | San Francisco, CA 94102 |
| • | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | • |
| Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us | inyoda@inyocounty.us | Prop65@sfcityatty.org |
| Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney | Walter W. Wall, District Attorney | Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney |
| Merced County | Mariposa County | Nevada County |
| 550 W. Main Street | P.O. Box 730 | 201 Commercial Street |
| Merced, CA 95340 | Mariposa, CA 95338 | Nevada City, CA 95959 |
| Prop65@countyofmerced.com | mcda@mariposacounty.org | DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us |
| Troposecountyonnercea.com | mcda@manposacounty.org | האם ויאם האם ויאם ויאם ויאם ויאם ויאם ויאם ויאם וי |
| Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney | David Hollister, District Attorney | Summer Stephan, District Attorney |
| Placer County | Plumas County | San Diego County |
| 10810 Justice Center Drive | 520 Main Street | 330 W. Broadway Street |
| Roseville, CA 95678 | Quincy, CA 95971 | San Diego, CA 92101 |
| prop65@placer.ca.gov | davidhollister@countyofplumas.com | SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org |
| · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | 2 , , , , , , , , , , , , | |
| Orange County District Attorney | Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney | Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney |
| 300 North Flower Street | 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor | 2100 Tulare Street |
| Santa Ana, CA 92703 | San Jose, CA 96113 | Fresno, CA 93721 |
| Prop65Notice@da.ocgov.com | Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov | consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov |
| | | . 2 |
| | | |
| | 1 | |