VOORHEES & BAILEY, LLP 535 Ramona Street; Suite 5 Palo Alto, CA 94301 650-313-2154

60-Day Notice of Violation - California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

June 15, 2023

Notice Recipients: IG Design Group Americas, Inc.;

Walmart Inc.

Noticing Party: Audrey Kallander

Covered Products: Ceramic Mugs With Exterior Designs

Listed Chemical: Lead

Routes of Exposure: Ingestion; Dermal

Potential Harm: Birth Defects and Other Reproductive Harm

I. INTRODUCTION

This Sixty-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice") is provided by Audrey Kallander. Ms. Kallander is a private enforcer acting in the public interest pursuant to California Health & Safety Code section 25249.7(d). Ms. Kallander seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold and used in California and, if possible, to eliminate such exposures.

This Notice is provided to the alleged violators, IG Design Group Americas, Inc. and Walmart Inc. (the "Notice Recipients"), as well as the California Attorney General's Office, the District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties, and the City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose and Los Angeles.

The Notice Recipients are hereby given notice that they have violated and continue to violate provisions of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, which is codified at California Health & Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq. ("Proposition 65"). Specifically, the Notice Recipients have violated and continue to violate the warning requirement of section 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code, which provides, "No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual...." The alleged violations that are the subject of this Notice are provided below.

II. ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

<u>Product Types/Categories</u>: The specific types or categories of products that are causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are Ceramic Mugs With Exterior Designs ("Covered Products").

Identified below is a specific example of Covered Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California (the "Exemplar Product"). Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors, and/or manufacturers of the Exemplar Product is also provided.

The Exemplar Product is identified for the Notice Recipients' benefit to assist in their investigation of the allegations set forth in this Notice. The Exemplar Product is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product falling within the specific types or categories of Covered Products at issue in this Notice. It is the private enforcer's position that the Notice Recipients are obligated to conduct a good-faith investigation into other specific products falling within the type or category of Covered Products that have been manufactured, imported, distributed, sold, shipped, stored, or are otherwise within the Notice Recipients' custody or control, so as to ensure the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

Covered Products	Exemplar Product Information	
Ceramic Mugs With Exterior	IG Design "The Boss" Ceramic Mug	
Designs	UPC: 1 96610 07159 9	
	Retailer: Walmart Inc. (Fresno, CA)	
	Manufacturer/Distributor: IG Design Group Americas,	
	Inc.	

<u>Listed Chemical</u>: The alleged violations involve exposures to the Proposition 65-listed chemical lead. Lead is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. Lead is hereinafter referred to as the "Listed Chemical".

<u>Statement of Violations</u>: The Notice Recipients knowingly and intentionally exposed, and continue to knowingly and intentionally expose, consumers within the State of California to lead, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm, without first giving clear and reasonable warning of this exposure to such individuals. In particular, the Notice Recipients failed to provide a clear and reasonable warning to consumers that the Covered Products expose consumers to lead.

<u>Route of Exposure</u>: California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the Covered Products, are exposed to the Listed Chemical. Consumers ingest the Listed Chemical when their lips and mouth come into contact with the Covered Products. Consumers also ingest the Listed Chemical when they touch and handle the Covered Products, transfer the

Listed Chemical from the Covered Products onto their fingers and hands, and transfer the Listed Chemical from their fingers and hands to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after contact with the Covered Products. Consumers are exposed to the Listed Chemical through direct dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle or touch the Covered Products.

<u>Number and Duration of Violations</u>: Each and every sale of a Covered Product to a consumer in California without a clear and reasonable warning is a violation, including transactions made over-the-counter, through the internet, and/or via catalogue by the Notice Recipients and any other sellers of the Covered Products. These violations have been occurring since at least June 15, 2022, as well as every day since the Covered Products were first introduced and sold in the State of California, as far back as June 15, 2020. The violations are ongoing.

III. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) and Title 11, California Code of Regulations, section 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto. A second copy of the entire notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the Attorney General with all supporting documentation required by Section 3102 attached thereto.

IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION – A SUMMARY

A summary of Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead agency designated under Proposition 65, is enclosed with the copy of the Notice served on the Notice Recipients.

V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Ms. Kallander intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the Notice Recipients upon the expiration of the sixty-day notice period, provided no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

If the Notice Recipients are interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and expensive litigation, they should contact counsel at the address provided below. It should be noted that no settlement may be finalized before the sixty-day notice period has expired and only if no public prosecutor has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the alleged violation.

VI. PRESERVATION OF EVIDENCE

This Notice also serves as a demand that the Notice Recipients preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in the Covered Products; purchase and sales information for Covered Products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to the Covered Products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in Covered Products; and representative exemplars of each specific model falling within the Covered Products. This demand applies to all relevant evidence for Covered Products sold in the State of California, as far back as June 15, 2020, through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

VII. CONTACT INFORMATION

Ms. Kallander has retained me as legal counsel in this matter. Please direct all communications related to this Notice of Violation to the following:

Troy Bailey, Esq. Voorhees & Bailey, LLP 535 Ramona Street; Suite 5 Palo Alto, CA 94301 troy@voorheesbailey.com

Sincerely,

David Joshua Voorhees Voorhees & Bailey, LLP

Attorneys for Audrey Kallander

cc: California Attorney General's Office; District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties;

and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose and Los Angeles

Attachments: Certificate of Merit; Proof of Service; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic

Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary (IG Design Group

Americas, Inc., and Walmart Inc. only); and Confidential Information in Support

of Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Only)

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, David Joshua Voorhees, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) certain facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: June 15, 2023

David Joshua Voorhees

PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within action. I am employed in Santa Clara County, California. My business address is 535 Ramona Street; Suite 5, Palo Alto, CA 94301.

On June 15, 2023, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

XXXX **By First Class Certified Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative.

IG Design Group Americas, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 2 Sun Court; Suite 400 Peachtree Corners, GA 30092 Walmart Inc. c/o CT Corporation System 330 North Brand Blvd.; Suite 700 Glendale, CA 91203

On June 15, 2023, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); AND

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

XXXX **By First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each entity on the attached "U.S. Mail Service List" and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative, postage prepaid.

XXXX **By Electronic Mail** by sending true and correct copies of the above documents to the electronic notification (Email) address(es) on the attached "Electronic Mail Service List".

On June 15, 2023, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS

XXXX **By Electronic Upload** by causing true and correct copies of the above documents to be uploaded to the California Attorney General's website at the web address on the attached "Electronic Upload Service List".

Executed on June 15, 2023, at Palo Alto, California.

Cesar Gonzalez

U.S. Mail Service List

Alpine County District Attorney	Los Angeles County District Attorney	San Mateo County District Attorney
P.O. Box 248	211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200	400 County Center
Markleeville, CA 96120	Los Angeles, CA 90012	Redwood City, CA 94063
Amador County District Attorney	Madera County District Attorney	Shasta County District Attorney
708 Court Street	209 West Yosemite Avenue	1355 West Street
Jackson, CA 95642	Madera, CA 93637	Redding, CA 96001
Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965	Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Suite 145 San Rafael, CA 94903	Sierra County District Attorney P.O. Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936
Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932	Mendocino County District Attorney P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482	Siskiyou County District Attorney 311 4th Street Yreka, CA 96097
Del Norte County District Attorney	San Benito County District Attorney	Solano County District Attorney
450 H Street, Room 171	419 4th Street	675 Texas Street, Suite 4500
Crescent City, CA 95531	Hollister, CA 95023	Fairfield, CA 94533
El Dorado County District Attorney	Modoc County District Attorney	Stanislaus County District Attorney
778 Pacific Street	204 S. Court Street, Suite 202	832 12th Street, Suite 300
Placerville, CA 95667	Alturas, CA 96101	Modesto, CA 95354
Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230	Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517	Sutter County District Attorney 463 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991
Glenn County District Attorney	Lake County District Attorney	Tehama County District Attorney
P.O. Box 430	255 North Forbes Street	444 Oak Street, Room L
Willows, CA 95988	Lakeport, CA 95453	Red Bluff, CA 96080
Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, Fourth Floor Eureka, CA 95501	Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles James K. Hahn City Hall East 200 North Main Street, 8th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012	Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
Imperial County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney	Tuolumne County District Attorney
940 West Main Street, Suite 102	303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor	423 North Washington Street
El Centro, CA 92243	San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	Sonora, CA 95370
Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4th Floor Bakersfield, CA 93301		Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

Electronic Upload Service List

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

Electronic Mail Service List

		_
Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney	Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney	Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney
Alameda County District Attorney	Riverside County	San Luis Obispo County
7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650	3072 Orange Street	County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor
Oakland, CA 94621	Riverside, CA 92501	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408
CEPDProp65@acgov.org	Prop65@rivcoda.org	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
	The Control of the Co	
Allison Haley, District Attorney	Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney	Jill Ravitch, District Attorney
Napa County	San Joaquin County	Sonoma County
1127 First Street, Suite C	222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202	600 Administration Dr
1	Stockton, CA 95202	Santa Rosa, CA 95403
Napa, CA 94559	,	•
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	Jeannie.barnes@sonoma-county.org
Alexandra Grayner, Assistant DA	Jeffrey S. Rosell , District Attorney	Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney
San Francisco County	Santa Cruz County	Monterey County
350 Rhode Island Street	701 Ocean Street	1200 Aguajito Road
San Francisco, CA 94103	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	Monterey, CA 93940
alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org		**
alexandra.grayner@sigov.org	Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
Bud Porter	Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Yolo County	City of San Diego
Santa Clara County	301 Second Street	1200 Third Avenue
70 W Hedding St	Woodland, CA 95695	San Diego, CA 92101
San Jose, CA 95110	cfepd@yolocounty.org	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
1	crepa@yorocounty.org	CityAttyF10p03@sandleg0.gov
EPU@da.sccgov.org	Devin Chandler, Executive Assistant	Christopher Dalboy
Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney	•	Christopher Dalbey,
Ventura County	Lassen County	Deputy District Attorney
800 S Victoria Ave	220 S. Lassen Street	Santa Barbara County
Ventura, CA 93009	Susanville, CA 96130	1112 Santa Barbara St.
daspecialops@ventura.org	dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us	Santa Barbara, CA 93101
		DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney	Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney	Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney
Contra Costa County	Sacramento County	Tulare County
900 Ward Street	901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814	221 S Mooney Blvd
Martinez, CA 94553	Prop65@sacda.org	Visalia, CA 95370
sgrassini@contracostada.org	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
-6		Tropose community
Barbara Yook, District Attorney	Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney	Henry Lifton, Deputy City Attorney
Calaveras County	Inyo County	City of San Francisco
891 Mountain Ranch Road.	168 North Edwards Street	1390 Market Street, 7th Floor
San Andreas, CA 95249	Independence, CA 93526	San Francisco, CA 94102
•	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	•
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	inyoda@inyocounty.us	Prop65@sfcityatty.org
Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney	Walter W. Wall, District Attorney	Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney
Merced County	Mariposa County	Nevada County
550 W. Main Street	P.O. Box 730	201 Commercial Street
Merced, CA 95340	Mariposa, CA 95338	Nevada City, CA 95959
Prop65@countyofmerced.com	mcda@mariposacounty.org	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us
Troposecountyonnercea.com	mcda@manposacounty.org	האם ויאם האם ויאם ויאם ויאם ויאם ויאם ויאם ויאם וי
Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney	David Hollister, District Attorney	Summer Stephan, District Attorney
Placer County	Plumas County	San Diego County
10810 Justice Center Drive	520 Main Street	330 W. Broadway Street
Roseville, CA 95678	Quincy, CA 95971	San Diego, CA 92101
prop65@placer.ca.gov	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	2 , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
Orange County District Attorney	Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney	Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney
300 North Flower Street	200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	2100 Tulare Street
Santa Ana, CA 92703	San Jose, CA 96113	Fresno, CA 93721
Prop65Notice@da.ocgov.com	Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov	consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov
		. 2
	1	