LAW OFFICES

### **BRODSKY SMITH**

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

June 22, 2023

President/CEO	President/CEO	
Certified International Corp.	Certified International Corp.	
c/o Andrew J. Santulli	PO Box 6	
36 Vanderbilt Ave.	Pleasantville, NY 10570-0006	
Pleasantville, NY 10570		
President/CEO	President/CEO	
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx	
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Trust Company	
Corporation Trust Center	Corporation Trust Center	
1209 Orange Street	1209 Orange Street	
Wilmington, DE 19801	Wilmington, DE 19801	
President/CEO		
The TJX Companies, Inc.		
c/o CT Corporation System		
155 Federal St., Suite 700		
Boston, MA 02110		

### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Gabriel Espinoza ("Espinoza"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Espinoza has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Gabriel Espinoza, 3924 Carlin Ave., Lynwood, CA 90262-5204; (Ph) 310.863.2852.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): Certified International Corp.; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJMaxx
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least June 22, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Teapot	Certified International Teapot
	UPC# 730384370887

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Espinoza against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Espinoza's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

these violations of California law quickly rectified, Espinoza is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Espinoza has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

### Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

### I, Evan J. Smith, hereby declare:

- (1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- (2) I am the attorney for the noticing party, Gabriel Espinoza.
- (3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- (4) Based on the information obtained through these consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator(s) will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- (5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: June 22, 2023

Evan J. Smith

Attorney for Gabriel Espinoza

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within action. My business address is 2 Bala Plaza, Suite 805, Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania. I am employed in Montgomery County where the mailing occurred.

On June 22, 2023 I served the following documents: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary on the following entities and individuals listed below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

President/CEO	President/CEO	
Certified International Corp.	Certified International Corp.	
c/o Andrew J. Santulli	PO Box 6	
36 Vanderbilt Ave.	Pleasantville, NY 10570-0006	
Pleasantville, NY 10570		
President/CEO	President/CEO	
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc. dba TJ Maxx	
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Trust Company	
Corporation Trust Center	Corporation Trust Center	
1209 Orange Street	1209 Orange Street	
Wilmington, DE 19801	Wilmington, DE 19801	
President/CEO		
The TJX Companies, Inc.		
c/o CT Corporation System		
155 Federal St., Suite 700		
Boston, MA 02110		

On June 22, 2023, I served the following documents: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary on each of the individuals on the service list attached hereto as Appendix B by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed June 22, 2023, in Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania.

Evan J. Smith

### ELECTRONIC MAIL SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley Alameda County District Attorney 1776 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPPP1065@acsiv.org	The Honorible Lori Verhor Salzer San longuin Councy District Anticusy 222 E. Weber Avgune, Rosim 202 Sincklon, CA SIGE DACCOMiner Savikannaental (disjedn.org	Honorable Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814
The Honorable Allison Haley	The Florerable Jeffrey S. Rosell	Prop65@secda.org The Honorable Summer Stephan
Napa County District Attorney	Sunta Cruz County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney
11 2/ First St., Suite C	10 Ocean Street	900 West Broadway
Napa, CA 94559	Sunty Cruz, CA 95060	San Diego, CA 92101
CEPD@countyofnaps.org	ProphsDA@santgerazeounty.us	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
The Honorable Jeff W. Reisig	Michella Latimer, Program Coordinator	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
Yolo County District Attorney	Lassen County	
Pot Second Street	220 S. Lassen Street	City of San Diego
Woodland, CA 95695	Susaville, CA 96130	1200 Third Avenue
eseguayolocounty.org	relations by board	San Diego, CA 92101
Bud Porter	mlatimosidico jassen, eq. us	CityAttvProp65@sandiego.gov
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Aleibea M. Sargent	Christopher Dalboy,
Santa Clara County	Assistant District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney
70 W Hedding Street	San Francisco District Attorney's Office	Santa Barbara County
San Jose, CA 95110	350 Rhode Island Street	1112 Santa Barbara Street
PUnda sacgov org	San Francisco, CA 94103	Sente Barbora, CA 93101
The Harmankle C	alothen sargeru@sfgov.org	DAProp6S@co.santa-barbera_ca,us
The Honorable Gregory D. Totten,	The Honorable Barbara Yook	Walerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney
Centura County District Attorney 00 S Victoria Avenue	Calaveres Consily District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney
entura, CA 93009	891 Mountain Ranch Road	1390 Market Street, 7th Flour
oneita, CA 93009	San Andreas, CA 95249	San Francisco, CA 94102
aspecialops@ventura.org	Propisitive of the Propisition o	Valorie Lopez@afcityatty.org
tacey Grassini	Bric J. Dobroth	Deannine M. Pacioni
eputy District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney
ontra Costa County	San Luis Obispo County	Monterey County
00 Ward Street	County Govt Center Annex, 4" Floor	
lartinez, CA 94553	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	1200 Aguajito Road
rassini@contracostada.org	sidesthile sie ea as	Monterey, CA 93940
te Honorable Thomas Hardy	The Reducible Phillip 1. Office	Prop65DA@co.montercy.ca.us
County District Attorney	The residence suring 1 Cure	The Honorable Clifford Newell
N. Edwards Street	Tulore County District Asterney	Nevada County District Attorney
dependence, CA 93526	221 S Mooney Blvd	201 Commercial Street
voda@invacounty.us	Visilia, CA 95370	Nevada City, CA 95959
e Honorable Paul E. Zellerbach	Proposition miace, ca.us	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us
verside County District Attorney	The Honorable Stephan Passalacqua	The Flororable David Hollister
72 Orange Street	Sanoma County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney
verside CA 92501	500 Administration Drive	520 Main Street, Room, 404
**************************************	Sonoma, CA 95403	Quincy, CA 95971
m65@rivcoda_org	ibunes@sonome-county.org	davidirollister@countyofplumas.co
Honorable Walter W. Wall	The Hunoimble Kingherly Lewis	The Honorable Morgan Briggs Circ
THE PROPERTY AND THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY	Marcal County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney
7. DOX (30)	550 West Main Stead	10810 Justice Center Drive
riposa, CA 95338	Moreod, CA 95340	
Ba@maringsacounty org	Propis@countyofmercod.com	Roseville, CA 95678
ra V. Frimann City Attorney	r and the state of	prop65@placer.ca.gov
E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	Lisa A. Smitteamp, District Attemey	1
Jose, CA 96113	3 100 Tulare Street	
manifores of the same	Fresne, CA 93721	
position6Snotices@sanjoseca.gov	consumerare decition (diffres no country ca. go	v   *

## ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST

Office of the California Attorney General
Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting
ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator
P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
https://oag.ea.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

## SERVICE LIST

The Honocatile Nancy O'Nfellasy	The Honorable Stacey Montgomery	The Honorable Candice Hooper	The Honorable Gregg Cohen
Alaniada County District Attorney	Lassen County District Attorney	San Benito County District Attorney	Tehame County District Attorney
1225 Fallon Street, Room 900	220 South Lassen Street, Sta. 8	419 4th Street, Second Floor	444 Oak Street, Room L
Oakland, CA 94612	Susanville, CA 98130	Hollster, CA 95203	Red Bluff, CA 96080
The Henorable Terese Drabac	The Honorable Jackie Lacey	The Honorable Michael Ramos	The Honorable Eric Nerylord Trinity County Olstrict Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
Alpine County District Attorney	Los Angeles County District Attorney	San Bernardino County Olatrict Attorney	
270 Laramie Street, PO BOX 248	211 West Temple Street, Sulte 1200	303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor	
Marklesville, CA 98120	Los Angeles, CA 90012	San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	
The Honorable Todd Riebe	The Honorable David Linn	The Hanorable Bonnie Dumanis	The Honerable Tim Ward Tulare County District Attorney 221 South Mooney Boulevard, Rm 224 Visatia, CA 93231-4553
Amedor County Oblinict Atlorney	Madera County District Attorney	San Diego County DistMc/ Attorney	
708 Court Street	209 West Yosemite Avenue	330 W. Broadway Street	
Jackson, CA 95542	Madera, CA 98687	San Diego, GA 92101	
The Hancibble Michael Ramaray	The Honorable Edward Beiberlan	The Honorable George Gascon	The Honorable Laura Krieg
Butte County District Attorney	Marin County District Attorney	San Francisco County District Attorney	Tudlumne Counly District Altorney
25 County Center Drive	3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130	850 Bryant Street, Room 322	423 North Washington Street
Oroville, CA 95965	San Rafael, CA 94503	San Francisco, CA 94103	Sonora, CA 95370
The Hongrable Serbura Yook Calayeras County District Attorney 891 Mountein Rands Road Sait Andreas, CA 95249 The Hongrable John Poyner	The Honorable Thomas Cooke Mariposa County District Attorney 5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730 Maripose, CA 95338	The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar San Joaquin County District Afforney 222 East Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA \$5201	The Honerable Gregory Totten Ventura County District Attorney 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 98009
Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street Colusa, CA 95992	The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendocino County District Attorney 190 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 55482	The Honoratio Can Dow San Luis Obispo County District Alty 1035 Palm Street, 4th Floor San Luis Obisso, CA 93408	The Handrable Jeff Reisig Yalo County District Altamey 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 35635
The Honorable Mark Paterson	The Honorable Larry Morse II	The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe	The Honorable Paintek McGrain
Contra Costa County District Attorney	Merced County District Altorney	San Mateo County District Altorney	Yuba County District Attorney
900 Ward Street	550 W. Main Street	400 County Center, Third Floor	216 Fifth Street
Marlinez, CA 94553	Merced, CA 95340	Redwood City, CA 94063	Manysville, CA \$5501
The Honorable Dale Trigg	The Honorabie Jordan Funk	The Honorable Joyce Dudley	The Honorable Mike Feuer Office of the City Altomay, Los Angeles 800 City Hall East 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012
Del Marte County District Attorney	Modec County District Altorney	Santa Barbara Gounty District Attorney	
450 H Street, Room 171	204 S. Court Street, Suite 202	1112 Santa Barbara Street	
Crescent City, CA 95531	Alturas, CA 90101	Santa Barbara, CA 93101	
The Honerable Vern Plerson El Carade County District Attorney 778 Paullo Street Placetylle, CA 95967	The Handrable Tim Kendall Mano County District Attorney P.O. Sox 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517	The Honorable Jeffrey Hosen Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 West Hedding Streat, West Wing San Jose, CA 951 10	The Honorable James Sanchez Office of the City Attorney, Sasramento 915 I Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 93814
The Handsable Lisa Smitteamp Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulara Street, #1000 Fresno, OA 93721	The Honorable Oean Filippo Montarey County District Altorney P.O. Sox 1131 Salinas, CA 93902	The Honorable Jeff Rosell Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95050	The Honorable Jan Goldsmith Office of the City Attorney, San Diego 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1520 San Diego, CA 92101
The Honaratile Swayne Stewart	The Konorable Alifson Haley	The Honorable Stephen Carlton	The Honorable Dennis Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Prancisco 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, QA 34102
Glann County District Attorney	Napa County District Attorney	Shesta County District Attorney	
P.O. Box 430	1127 First Street, Suite C	1355 West Street	
Williaws, CA 95988	Napa, CA 94559	Redding, CA 99001	
ftie Hongrable Maggie Fferning	The Hongrable Ciliford Newell	The Honorable Lawrence Allen	The Honorable Richard Doyle Office of the City Altomey, San Jose 200 East Sante Clare Street, 16th Floor San Jose, OA 95113
Husboldt Caunty District Attorney	Newada County Bishict Attorney	Sterra County District Attorney	
125 3th Street, Fourth Floor	201 Commercial Street	100 Courthouse Square	
Eureka, CA 95501	Newada City, OA 95959	Downlaydle, CA 98936	
The Monorable Gibert Charo Impatial Chantly Bishlet Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243	The Honorable Tony Rackauckas Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701	The Hencrable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 996 Yreka, QA 96097	Office of the California Altorney Gener Proposition 55 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 55 Coundinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94012-0550
The Honorable Thomas Hardy hyo County District Attorney P.O. Drawer D ndependence, CA 93626 The Honorable Lisa Green	The Honorable R. Scott Owens Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Orive, Suite 240 Roseulle, CA 95678	The Hararable Kilshna Abrams Salano County District Altorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairlield, CA 34533	
Kem County District Attorney	The Honorable David Hollister	The Honorable JIII Flavitch	
1215 Truxtun Avenue	Plumas County District Attorney	Sonoma County District Attorney	
Bakersifeld, CA 93301	\$20 Main Street, Room 404	600 Administration Orive, Floom 212J	
The Honorable Keith Fagundas	Quincy, CA 95971	Santa Rosa, CA 95403	
Nings County District Attorney 1480 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 99230	The Honorable Michael Hestrin Riverside County District Attorney 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501	The Honorable Birgit Fladager Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354	
The Honorable Donald Anderson	The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert	The Honorable Amanda Hopper	
Lake County District Attorney	Sagramento County District Atterney	Suller County District Attorney	
255 North Forbes Street	901 G Street	463 Second Street, Sulle 102	
Lakeport CA 95453	Sagramento CA 95814	Yuba City CA 95991	

### APPENDIX A

## OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and OEHHA implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information.

FOR INFORMATION CONCERNING THE BASIS FOR THE ALLEGATIONS IN THE NOTICE RELATED TO YOUR BUSINESS, CONTACT THE PERSON IDENTIFIED ON THE NOTICE.

The text of Proposition 65 (Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13) is available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65law72003.html. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 25102 through 27001.1 These implementing regulations are available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65Regs.html.

## WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

The "Proposition 65 List." Under Proposition 65, the lead agency (OEHHA) publishes a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or reproductive toxicity. Chemicals are placed on the Proposition 65 list if they are known to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, such as damage to

All further regulatory references are to sections of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations unless otherwise indicated. The statute, regulations and relevant case law are available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html.

female or male reproductive systems or to the developing fetus. This list must be updated at least once a year. The current Proposition 65 list of chemicals is available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65 list/Newlist.html.

Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under Proposition 65. Businesses that produce, use, release or otherwise engage in activities involving listed chemicals must comply with the following:

Clear and reasonable warnings. A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical unless an exemption applies. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed to that chemical. Some exposures are exempt from the warning requirement under certain circumstances discussed below

**Prohibition from discharges into drinking water.** A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Some discharges are exempt from this requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

## DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. You should consult the current version of the statute and regulations (http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html) to determine all applicable exemptions, the most common of which are the following:

Grace Period. Proposition 65 warning requirements do not apply until 12 months after the chemical has been listed. The Proposition 65 discharge prohibition does not apply to a discharge or release of a chemical that takes place less than 20 months after the listing of the chemical.

Governmental agencies and public water utilities. All agencies of the federal, state or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

Businesses with nine or fewer employees. Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employe a total of nine or fewer employees. This includes all employees, not just those present in California.

Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer. For chemicals that are listed under Proposition 65 as known to the State to cause cancer, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "No Significant Risk Levels" (NSRLs) for many listed carcinogens. Exposures below these levels are exempt from the warning requirement. See OEHHA's website at:

http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of NSRLs, and Section 25701 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question. For chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level" divided by 1,000. This number is known as the Maximum Allowable Dose Level (MADL). See OEHHA's website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of MADLs, and Section 25801 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures to Naturally Occurring Chemicals in Food. Certain exposures to chemicals that naturally occur in foods (i.e., that do not result from any known human activity, including activity by someone other than the person causing the exposure) are exempt from the warning requirements of the law. If the chemical is a contaminant<sup>2</sup> it must be reduced to the lowest level feasible. Regulations explaining this exemption can be found in Section 25501.

Discharges that do not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering any source of drinking water. The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the listed chemical has not, does not, or will not pass into or probably pass into a source of drinking water, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" level for chemicals that cause cancer or that is 1,000 times below the "no observable effect" level for chemicals that cause reproductive toxicity, if an individual were exposed to that amount in drinking water.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Section 25501(a)(4).

### HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys. Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. The notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in Section 25903 of Title 27 and sections 3100-3103 of Title 11. A private party may not pursue an independent enforcement action under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an enforcement action within sixty days of the notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court to stop committing the violation.

A private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. For the following types of exposures, the Act provides an opportunity for the business to correct the alleged violation:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

If a private party alleges that a violation occurred based on one of the exposures described above, the private party must first provide the alleged violator a notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form.

A copy of the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form is included in Appendix B and can be downloaded from OEHHA's website at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/p65law72003.html.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.

#### APPENDIX B

# OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE

This Appendix B contains the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). Under the Act, a private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. These exposures are:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared
  and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for
  immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was
  not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar
  preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or
  beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

A private party may not file an action against the alleged violator for these exposures, or recover in a settlement any payment in lieu of penalties any reimbursement for costs and attorney's fees, if the alleged violator has done all of the following within 14 days of being served notice:

- Corrected the alleged violation;
- Agreed to pay a civil penalty of \$500 (subject to change in 2019 and every five years thereafter) to the private party within 30 days; and

 Notified the private party serving the notice in writing that the violation has been corrected.

An alleged violator may satisfy these conditions only one time for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility or on the same premises. The satisfaction of these conditions does not prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney of a city of greater than 750,000 population, or any full-time city prosecutor with the consent of the district attorney, from filing an enforcement action against an alleged violator.

When a private party sends a notice of alleged violation that alleges one or more of the exposures listed above, the notice must include a notice of special compliance procedure, and a proof of compliance form to be completed by the alleged violator as directed in the notice.

The notice and proof of compliance form is reproduced here:

Date:

Page 1

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

# SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE PROOF OF COMPLIANCE

You are receiving this form because the Noticing Party listed above has alleged that you are violating California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 (Prop. 65).

The Noticing Party may <u>not</u> bring any legal proceedings against you for the alleged violation checked below if:

- (1) You have actually taken the corrective steps that you have certified in this form.
- (2) The Noticing Party has received this form at the address shown above, accurately completed by you, postmarked within 14 days of your receiving this notice.
- (3) The Noticing Party receives the required \$500 penalty payment from you at the address shown above postmarked within 30 days of your receiving this notice.
- (4) This is the first time you have submitted a Proof of Compliance for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility on the same premises.

# PART 1: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE NOTICING PARTY OR ATTORNEY FOR THE NOTICING PARTY

The alleged violation is for an exposure to: (check one)

Alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent on-site consumption is permitted by law.
A chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises for immediate consumption on or off premises to the extent: (1) the chemical was not intentionally added; and (2) the chemical was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination.
Environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises.
Chemicals known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking noncommercial vehicles.
IMPORTANT NOTES:
(1) You have no potential liability under California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 if your business has nine (9) or fewer employees.  (2) Using this form will NOT prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney, or a prosecutor in whose jurisdiction the violation is alleged to have occurred from filing an action over the same alleged violations, and that in any such action, the amount of civil penalty shall be reduced to reflect any payment made at this time.
Date: Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

# PART 2: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE ALLEGED VIOLATOR OR AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE

Address:

Phone number:

Certification of Compliance

Accurate completion of this form will demonstrate that you are now in compliance with California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 for the alleged violation listed above. You must complete and submit the form below to the Noticing Party at the address shown above, postmarked within 14 days of you receiving this notice.

I hereby agree to pay, within 30 days of completion of this notice, a civil penalty of \$500 to the Noticing Party only and certify that I have complied with Health and Safety Code §25249.6 by (check only one of the following):

[] Posting a warning or warnings about the alleged exposure that complies with the law, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; [] Posting the warning or warnings demanded in writing by the Noticing Party, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; OR [] Eliminating the alleged exposure, and attaching a statement accurately describing how the alleged exposure has been eliminated.
My statements on this form, and on any attachments to it, are true, complete, and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and are made in good faith. I have carefully read the instructions to complete this form. I understand that if I make a false statement on this form, I may be subject to additional penalties under the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65).
Signature of alleged violator or authorized representative Date
Name and title of signatory

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.