

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)

DATE: June 29, 2023
To: Walmart Inc.
California Attorney General's Office;
District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and
City Attorney's Office for Los Angeles, San Diego, San Jose, and San Francisco.

From: MONARCH Action LLC

I. INTRODUCTION

MONARCH Action LLC is a limited liability company organized to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in California and to improve public health and safety. This Notice is provided to the parties listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code §25249.6, et seq. (commonly referred to as "Proposition 65"). The violations alleged by this Notice consist of product exposures, routes of exposures, and types of harm that may potentially result from exposures to the toxic chemical ("listed chemical") identified below:

Retailer(s)	Walmart Inc.
Manufacturer(s)/Distributor(s)	Innovative Home Creations, Ltd.
Product Category/Type	Craft Caddy
Listed Chemical	DEHP (Di [2-Ethylhexyl] Phthalate)
Routes of Exposure	Touch, Oral, Dermal absorption
Types of Harm	Carcinogen, Birth Defects, and Reproductive Toxicity

II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATION

The specific type of product that is causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and which is the subject of this Notice, is listed above in the "Product Category/Type" section. All products *within the type* covered by this Notice shall be referred to hereinafter as the "products." The failure to warn regarding the above Listed Chemical relates back to February 20, 2023 is the subject of this Notice. As a result of the failure to warn, exposures to the Listed Chemical have been occurring without the clear and responsible warnings required by Proposition 65. Without proper warnings, California citizenry are unable to make informed decisions whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

Exposure to consumers includes, but is not limited to, absorption through the skin, hand-to-mouth contact, oral contact, or inhalation. Exposure may continue to occur for a significant period after the initial contact.

III. CONTACT INFORMATION

Please direct all questions concerning this Notice to our counsel's offices at the following address: Daniel N. Greenbaum, Esq., GREENBAUM LAW FIRM, 7120 Hayvenhurst Ave., Ste. 320, Van Nuys, CA 91406, Phone: (310) 200-2631, Fax: (424) 243-7689, Email: dgreenbaum@greenbaumlawfirm.com.

IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For general information concerning Proposition 65, feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") in the Proposition 65 Implementation Office or to visit their website at <http://oehha.ca.gov/proposition-65>. **For the alleged Violator(s), please see the attached copy of Appendix A (Proposition 65: A Summary) and Appendix B (Special Compliance Procedure) prepared by OEHHA.**

V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, we intend to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the alleged Violator(s), unless such Violator enters into a binding written agreement to either (1) recall products already sold or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those whom have received such products; (2) reformulate such products to eliminate exposures to the listed chemicals; or, at a minimum, (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future.

If the alleged Violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and expensive litigation, please feel free to contact the counsel identified above. It should be noted that we cannot: (A) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day Notice period elapses; or (B) speak for the Attorney General or any public agency who received this Notice.

VI. PRODUCT INFORMATION

Identified below are specific examples of products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase in California that is within the **category or type of product** covered by this Notice. We allege the sale of the products occurred without the requisite Proposition 65 "clear and reasonable warnings." We identify the specific product for all recipients' benefit to assist the investigation of potential exposure to the Listed Chemical from other items within the **Product Category**. This exemplar product does *not* represent an exhaustive or comprehensive identification potentially violative products.

<u>Product Category</u>	<u>Specific Product</u>	<u>Manufacturer</u>
Craft Caddy	Innovative Home Creations Free Standing Craft Caddy with 3 Pockets Item # 165623	Innovative Home Creations Ltd

The alleged Violator(s) are best situated to identify **any and all** products within the Product Category. Therefore, the Violator(s) are obligated to conduct an investigation into **any and all** other products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, or shipped during the relevant period to ensure the requisite toxic warnings are provided.

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

I, Daniel N. Greenbaum, hereby declare:


(1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

(2) I am the attorney for the noticing party.

(3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

(4) Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

(5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

June 29, 2023	Daniel N. Greenbaum	
<i>Date</i>	<i>Name</i>	<i>Signature</i>

PROOF OF SERVICE


I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case or action. My business address is: **7120 Hayvenhurst Ave., Suite 320, Van Nuys CA 91406**. A True and Correct copy of the document entitled **NOTICE OF VIOLATION** will be served or was served in the manner stated below:

- I. First Class Mail: On June 29, 2023, I caused to be served the following persons and/or entities at the last known addresses by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope with the USPS, postage prepaid, and addressed as follows:

Attn: CEO or President	Walmart Home Office, 702 SW 8th St Bentonville, AR 72716
------------------------	---

- II. California Attorney General (via website Portal): On June 29, 2023, I uploaded a true and correct copy thereof as a PDF file via the California Attorney General’s website.
- III. District and City Attorneys (via U.S. Mail): On June 29, 2023, I caused to be served the following persons and/or entities at the last known addresses by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope in the United States Mail, first class, postage prepaid, and addressed as follows: **SEE ATTACHED FOR FULL SERVICE LIST**
- IV. District and City Attorneys (via email): On June 29, 2023, I served the following persons and/or entities at the last known electronic addresses via email (the transmission was reported as sent without error: cfepd@yolocounty.org; sgrassini@contracosta.org; Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us; epu@da.sccgov.org; CEPD@countyofnapa.org; jbarnes@sonoma-county.org; Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us; cdalbey@co.santa-barbara.ca.us; CityAttyCrimProp65@sandiego.gov; CEPDProp65@acgov.org; mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us; Prop65@rivcoda.org; Prop65@sacda.org; EPU@da.sccgov.org; CityAttyCrimProp65@sandiego.gov; gregory.alker@sfgov.org; edobroth@co.slo.ca.us; DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org; daspecialops@ventura.org; Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us; valerie.lopez@sfcityatty.org; Prop65env@co.calaveras.ca.us.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California and the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct.

June 29, 2023	Megan Newman	
<i>Date</i>	<i>Name</i>	<i>Signature</i>

District Attorney
ALPINE COUNTY
PO Box 248
Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney
AMADOR COUNTY
708 Court Street, #202
Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney
BUTTE COUNTY
25 County Center Drive —
Administration Building
Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney
COLUSA COUNTY
346 5th Street, Suite. 101
Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney
DEL NORTE COUNTY
450 H Street, Room 171
Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney
EL DORADO COUNTY
778 Pacific St.
Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney
FRESNO COUNTY
2220 Tulare Street, Suite.
1000
Fresno, CA 93721

District Attorney
GLENN COUNTY
PO Box 430
Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney
HUMBOLDT COUNTY
825 5th Street
Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney
IMPERIAL COUNTY
940 West Main Street,
Suite. 102
El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney
INYO COUNTY
168 North Edwards
Independence, CA 93526

District Attorney
KERN COUNTY
1215 Truxtun Avenue
Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney
KINGS COUNTY
1400 West Lacey Blvd.
Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney
LAKE COUNTY
255 N. Forbes Street
Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney
LOS ANGELES
COUNTY
210 W. Temple Street
Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney
MADERA COUNTY
209 West Yosemite Avenue
Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney
MARIN COUNTY
3501 Civic Center Drive,
Room 130
San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney
MARIPOSA COUNTY
PO BOX 730
Mariposa, CA 95338

District Attorney
MENDOCINO COUNTY
PO BOX 1000
Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney
MERCED COUNTY
550 West Main Street
Merced, CA 95340

District Attorney
MODOC COUNTY
204 S. Court Street, Room
202
Alturas, CA 96101

District Attorney
MONO COUNTY
PO BOX 2053
Mammoth Lakes, CA
93546

District Attorney
NEVADA COUNTY
201 Commercial Street
Nevada City, CA 95959

District Attorney
ORANGE COUNTY
401 Civic Center Drive
West
Santa Ana, CA 92701

District Attorney
PLACER COUNTY
10810 Justice Center Drive
Roseville, CA 95678

District Attorney
PLUMAS COUNTY
520 Main Street, Rm 404
Quincy, CA 95971

District Attorney
SAN BENITO COUNTY
419 4th Street
Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney
SAN BERNARDINO
COUNTY
303 W. Third Street
San Bernardino, CA 92415

District Attorney
SAN MATEO COUNTY
400 County Ctr, Third Fl
Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney
SHASTA COUNTY
1355 West Street
Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney
SIERRA COUNTY
100 Courthouse Square
Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney
SISKIYOU COUNTY
PO BOX 986
Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney
SOLANO COUNTY
675 Texas St, Suite 4500
Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney
STANISLAUS COUNTY
832 12th Street, Suite 300
Modesto, CA 95353

District Attorney
SUTTER COUNTY
446 Second Street, Suite
102
Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney
TEHAMA COUNTY
PO BOX 519
Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney
TRINITY COUNTY
PO BOX 310
Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney
TUOLUMNE COUNTY
423 No. Washington Street
Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney
YUBA COUNTY
215 Fifth Street, Suite. 152
Marysville, CA 95901

Hydee Feldstein Soto
City Attorney
CITY OF LOS ANGELES
200 N. Main Street
Los Angeles, CA 90012

Nora Frimann
City Attorney
CITY OF SAN JOSE
200 East Santa Clara Street
San Jose, CA 95113

Mara W. Elliott
City Attorney
CITY OF SAN DIEGO
1200 Third Ave., Ste 1620
San Diego, CA 92101

David Chiu
City Attorney
CITY OF SAN
FRANCISCO
City Hall, Rm 234
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett
Pl.
San Francisco, CA 94102