

# 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION

SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH  
*Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq.*  
("Proposition 65")

---

**DATE:** August 3, 2023

**TO:** **MANUFACTURER**  
**Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd**  
29 Main Korangi Rd, Mehran Town  
Sector 23 Korangi Industrial Area,  
Karachi, Karachi City, Sindh 74900,  
Pakistan.

**DISTRIBUTOR**  
**Shah Distributors Inc**  
**Attn : Sourabh Roy (CEO)**  
6260 Chalet Dr  
Commerce, CA 90040

**GOVERNMENT OFFICES**  
California Attorney Office  
District Attorney's Office for All  
California Counties; and  
City Attorneys for San Francisco, San  
Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los  
Angeles

**FROM:** Healthy California LLC

## I. **INTRODUCTION**

**Healthy California LLC** ("HC") is the noticing entity, acting in the interest of the general public. It seeks to reduce or eliminate the presence of hazardous substances in consumer products sold in California, and to ensure that California consumers are aware of the presence of such substances in consumer goods so that they can make an educated effort to limit their own exposure where deemed necessary.

This Notice is provided to the public agencies listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, *et seq.* ("Proposition 65"). As noted above, notice is also being provided to the violators: **Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd, Shah Distributors Inc, India Spices & Groceries, Miramar Cash & Carry International Supermarket, CTOWN FARMERS MARKET, Balboa International Market, and North Park Produce** (the "Violators"). The violations covered by this Notice consists of a summary of Proposition 65, Statement of Violation, Number and Duration of Violation, Product Category/Type, Listed Chemical(s), Preservation of Evidence, Product Exposure, Routes of Exposure and type of harm resulting from exposure to the chemicals ("Listed Chemicals") as follows:

Product Exposure:	See Section VI. and VII. Exhibit A
Listed Chemical:	Lead
Routes of Exposure:	Ingestion and Dermal Absorption
Type of Harm:	Cancer, Birth Defect and other Reproductive Harm

**RETAILER**  
India Spices & Groceries  
Attn: **SURINDER KUMAR (CEO)**  
14441 Newport Ave, Tustin, CA 92780  
  
Miramar Cash & Carry International Supermarket  
9252 Miramar Rd, San Diego, CA 92126

CTOWN FARMERS MARKET  
611 E Grand Blvd, Corona, CA 92879

Pioneer Cash & Carry  
Attn: **Devraj K Keray (CEO)**  
11700 183rd St., CA 90701

Balboa International Market  
5905 Balboa Avenue, San Diego, CA 92111

North Park Produce  
Attn: **ROBERT MARCOS (CEO)**  
3551 El Cajon Blvd, CA 92104

## **II. STATEMENT OF VIOLATIONS**

The specific type of product that is causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that is covered by this Notice, is listed under “Product Category/Type” in section VI. and the specific toxicant(s)/Listed Chemical(s) is set forth in Exhibit A of Section VII. All products within the category covered by this Notice shall be referred to hereinafter as the “Covered Product(s)” or “Product(s)”. Exposures to the Listed Chemical from the use of the Products have been occurring without the “clear and reasonable warning” required by Proposition 65. The method of the warning should be a label on the product itself. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from contact with the Products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Products.

The Notice Recipients knowingly and intentionally exposed, and continue to knowingly and intentionally expose, consumers within the State of California to the Listed Chemical(s), a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm, without first giving clear and reasonable warning of this exposure to such individuals. In particular, the Notice Recipients failed to provide a clear and reasonable warning to consumers that the Listed Product exposes consumers to Listed Chemical(s).

## **III. NUMBER AND DURATION OF VIOLATIONS**

Each and every sale of a Covered Product to a consumer in California without a clear and reasonable warning is a violation, including transactions made over the counter, through the internet, and/or via catalogue by the Notice Recipients and any other sellers of the Covered Products. These violations have been occurring since at least from the date of purchase of product provided below in Section VI, will continue until “clear and reasonable warning” are provided prior to exposure of the Listed Chemicals.

## **IV. ROUTE OF EXPOSURE**

California consumers and other individuals, through the act of using and consuming the Covered Product, are exposed to the Listed Chemical. Consumers ingest the Listed Chemical by eating the Covered Product, or when they touch and handle the Covered Products, transfer the Listed Chemical from the Covered Products onto their fingers and hands, and transfer the Listed Chemical from their fingers and hands to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after contact with the Covered Products.

By way of example but not limitation, exposures occur when California Citizens use as an ingredient, eat, sample or otherwise ingest the product. These acts cause consumers and other individuals to be exposed to the Listed Chemical through the routine consumption of all or a portion of the product containing the Listed Chemical. People likely to be exposed include both children and adult including women of childbearing age.

## **V. PRODUCT CATEGORY/TYPE**

Identified below is a specific example of Covered Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California (the “Violating Product”). Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors, and/or manufacturers of the Violating Product is also provided.

The Violating Products are identified for the Notice Recipients’ benefit to assist in their investigation of the allegations set forth in this Notice. The Violating Product is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product falling within the specific type or category of Covered Products at issue in this Notice. It is the HC’s position that the Notice Recipients are obligated to conduct a good-faith investigation into other specific products falling within the type or category of Covered Products that have been manufactured, imported, distributed, sold,

shipped, stored, or are otherwise within the Notice Recipients' custody or control, so as to ensure the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

Product Category: Food

<u>Violating Product</u>	<u>Date of Purchase</u>	<u>Retailer(s)</u>	<u>Distributor(s)</u>	<u>Manufacturer(s)</u>	<u>Toxicant(s)</u>
SHAN ACHAR GOSHT	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	CTOWN FARMERS MARKET	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN PAYA	4/29/2023	India Spices & Groceries	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/16/2023	Miramar Cash & Carry International Supermarket	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN KOFTA	4/29/2023	India Spices & Groceries	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN KARAHI	4/29/2023	India Spices & Groceries	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	CTOWN FARMERS MARKET	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN NIHARI	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	CTOWN FARMERS MARKET	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN MEAT MASALA	4/15/2023	CTOWN FARMERS MARKET	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN CHICKEN WHITE KARAHI	10/16/2022	Balboa International Market	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN BUTTER CHICKEN	4/16/2023	Miramar Cash & Carry International Supermarket	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead

SHAN MALAY CHICKEN BIRYANI	4/29/2023	India Spices & Groceries	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN TIKKA SEEKH KABAB	4/29/2023	India Spices & Groceries	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	CTOWN FARMERS MARKET	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN PANI PURI MASALA	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	CTOWN FARMERS MARKET	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN KEEMA	4/29/2023	India Spices & Groceries	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/16/2023	Miramar Cash & Carry International Supermarket	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	CTOWN FARMERS MARKET	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN FRIED FISH	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN AALOO BHAI	7/29/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN CHICKEN MASALA	4/29/2023	India Spices & Groceries	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	CTOWN FARMERS MARKET	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- CHICKEN TIKKA	4/29/2023	India Spices & Groceries	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- FRIED CHOPS/STEAKS	10/16/2022	Balboa International Market	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- HALEEM	4/29/2023	India Spices & Groceries	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- KORMA	10/16/2022	Balboa International Market	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	10/16/2022	North Park Produce	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead

SHAN- KUNNA	10/16/2022	Balboa International Market	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- LAHORI CHARGA	4/15/2023	CTOWN FARMERS MARKET	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- MEAT & VEGETABLE	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- MUTTON ROAST MASALA	10/16/2022	Balboa International Market	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- PAV BHAJI	4/29/2023	India Spices & Groceries	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- SHAMI KABAB	10/16/2022	North Park Produce	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- PILAU BIRYANI	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	CTOWN FARMERS MARKET	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- VEGETABLE MASALA	4/29/2023	India Spices & Groceries	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- KITCHEN KING	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- PALAK PANEER	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- ZAFRANI GARAM MASALA POWDER	4/15/2023	CTOWN FARMERS MARKET	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- SHEER KHURMA	10/16/2022	Balboa International Market	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- Rogan Josh Masala	10/16/2022	North Park Produce	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- KAT A KAT	10/16/2022	North Park Produce	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- RASAM MASALA	10/16/2022	North Park Produce	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- FISH MASALA	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- CHICKEN 65	10/16/2022	North Park Produce	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- GARLIC POWDER	10/16/2022	North Park Produce	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead

SHAN- DRIED MANGO POWDER	10/16/2022	Balboa International Market	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- GINGER POWDER	10/16/2022	North Park Produce	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- HALEEM MIX	4/15/2023	Pioneer Cash & Carry	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead
SHAN- SHAHI HALEEM MIX	10/16/2022	North Park Produce	Shah Distributors Inc	Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd	Lead

**VI. EXHIBIT A – LISTED CHEMICAL**

<b><u>Toxicant(s)</u></b>
Lead

**VII. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS**

Consistent with goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these violations corrected, HC is interested in seeking a resolution of this matter that includes a binding written agreement by the Violators to: (1) recall any products already sold, or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provide to those who have received such products; (2) reformulate the Covered Product so as to eliminate further exposures to the Covered Chemical(s), or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposure to the Covered chemical(s), as well as expensive and time-consuming litigation. It should be noted that counsel cannot (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-daynotice period has expired; or (2) speak for the California Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who has received this notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with HC will resolve its claims; such an agreement maynot satisfy the public prosecutors.

Proposition 65 requires that notice of intent to sue be given to the violators(s) sixty (60) days before the suit isfiled. *Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)(1)*. With this letter, HC gives notice of the alleged violations to Violator and the appropriate governmental authorities. In absence of any action by the appropriate governmental authorities within sixty (60) calendar days of the sending of this notice HC may file suit. *See Cal. Code Civ. Proc. § 1013; Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)(1); and Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27 § 25903(d)(1)*. Per *Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 25600.2(g) (2018)* the retail seller noticed on this 60 Day Notice is hereby requested to promptly provide thenames and contact information for the manufacture(s), producer(s), packager(s), importer(s), supplier(s), and/or distributor(s) of the Listed Products in this Notice.

Healthy California LLC remains open and willing to discuss the possibilities of resolving itsgrievance short of formal litigation.

**VIII. PRESERVATION OF EVIDENCE**

This Notice also serves as a demand that the Notice Recipients preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic document and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence incudes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence of the Listed Chemicals in the Covered Product; purchase and sales information for Covered Products (i.e., list of purchasers and quantity sold; list of manufacture(s), producer(s), packager(s), importer(s), supplier(s),

and/or distributor(s) and quantity in each transaction, as well as current inventory of the Covered Product in stock); efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to the Covered Products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in Covered Products; and representative exemplars of each specific model falling within the Covered Products. This demand applies to all relevant evidence for Covered Products sold in the State of California, as far back as February 20, 2018 through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

#### **IX. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.6 and Title 11, California Code of Regulations, section 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto. A second copy of the entire notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the Attorney General with all supporting documentation required by section 3102 attached hereto.

#### **X. CONTACT INFORMATION**

Michael Vance, Manager  
Healthy California LLC.  
10407 Brookshire Avenue  
Downey, CA 90241  
Telephone: (562) 644-4185

Sincerely,

*Tyler Michael Vance*

Tyler Michael Vance, Esq.

[healthycalifornialawgroupllp@gmail.com](mailto:healthycalifornialawgroupllp@gmail.com)

Attachments: Certificate of Merit; Certificate of Service;  
The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary The  
Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): Special Compliance  
Procedure; Confidential Information in Support of Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Only)

APPENDIX A

ATTACHED ARE APPENDIX A AND B



## APPENDIX A

### OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

#### THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and OEHHA implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information.

FOR INFORMATION CONCERNING THE BASIS FOR THE ALLEGATIONS IN THE NOTICE RELATED TO YOUR BUSINESS, CONTACT THE PERSON IDENTIFIED ON THE NOTICE.

The text of Proposition 65 (Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13) is available online at: <http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65law72003.html>. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 25102 through 27001.<sup>1</sup> These implementing regulations are available online at: <http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65Regs.html>.

#### *WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?*

**The "Proposition 65 List."** Under Proposition 65, the lead agency (OEHHA) publishes a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or reproductive toxicity. Chemicals are placed on the Proposition 65 list if they are known to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, such as damage to

---

<sup>1</sup> All further regulatory references are to sections of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations unless otherwise indicated. The statute, regulations and relevant case law are available on the OEHHA website at: <http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html>.

female or male reproductive systems or to the developing fetus. This list must be updated at least once a year. The current Proposition 65 list of chemicals is available on the OEHHA website at: [http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65\\_list/Newlist.html](http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65_list/Newlist.html).

Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under Proposition 65. Businesses that produce, use, release or otherwise engage in activities involving listed chemicals must comply with the following:

***Clear and reasonable warnings.*** A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical unless an exemption applies. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed to that chemical. Some exposures are exempt from the warning requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

***Prohibition from discharges into drinking water.*** A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Some discharges are exempt from this requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

#### *DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?*

Yes. You should consult the current version of the statute and regulations (<http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html>) to determine all applicable exemptions, the most common of which are the following:

***Grace Period.*** Proposition 65 warning requirements do not apply until 12 months after the chemical has been listed. The Proposition 65 discharge prohibition does not apply to a discharge or release of a chemical that takes place less than 20 months after the listing of the chemical.

***Governmental agencies and public water utilities.*** All agencies of the federal, state or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

***Businesses with nine or fewer employees.*** Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employs a total of nine or fewer employees. This includes all employees, not just those present in California.

**Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer.** For chemicals that are listed under Proposition 65 as known to the State to cause cancer, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "No Significant Risk Levels" (NSRLs) for many listed carcinogens. Exposures below these levels are exempt from the warning requirement. See OEHHA's website at: <http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html> for a list of NSRLs, and Section 25701 *et seq.* of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

**Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question.** For chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level" divided by 1,000. This number is known as the Maximum Allowable Dose Level (MADL). See OEHHA's website at: <http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html> for a list of MADLs, and Section 25801 *et seq.* of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

**Exposures to Naturally Occurring Chemicals in Food.** Certain exposures to chemicals that naturally occur in foods (i.e., that do not result from any known human activity, including activity by someone other than the person causing the exposure) are exempt from the warning requirements of the law. If the chemical is a contaminant<sup>2</sup> it must be reduced to the lowest level feasible. Regulations explaining this exemption can be found in Section 25501.

**Discharges that do not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering any source of drinking water.** The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the listed chemical has not, does not, or will not pass into or probably pass into a source of drinking water, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" level for chemicals that cause cancer or that is 1,000 times below the "no observable effect" level for chemicals that cause reproductive toxicity, if an individual were exposed to that amount in drinking water.

---

<sup>2</sup> See Section 25501(a)(4).

## *HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?*

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys. Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. The notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in Section 25903 of Title 27 and sections 3100-3103 of Title 11. A private party may not pursue an independent enforcement action under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an enforcement action within sixty days of the notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court to stop committing the violation.

A private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. For the following types of exposures, the Act provides an opportunity for the business to correct the alleged violation:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

If a private party alleges that a violation occurred based on one of the exposures described above, the private party must first provide the alleged violator a notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form.

A copy of the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form is included in Appendix B and can be downloaded from OEHHA's website at:  
<http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/p65law72003.html>.

*FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...*

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at [P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov](mailto:P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov).

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.

## APPENDIX B

### OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

#### THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE

This Appendix B contains the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). Under the Act, a private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. These exposures are:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

A private party may not file an action against the alleged violator for these exposures, or recover in a settlement any payment in lieu of penalties any reimbursement for costs and attorney's fees, if the alleged violator has done *all* of the following within 14 days of being served notice:

- Corrected the alleged violation;
- Agreed to pay a civil penalty of \$500 (subject to change in 2019 and every five years thereafter) to the private party within 30 days; and

- Notified the private party serving the notice in writing that the violation has been corrected.

An alleged violator may satisfy these conditions only one time for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility or on the same premises. The satisfaction of these conditions does not prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney of a city of greater than 750,000 population, or any full-time city prosecutor with the consent of the district attorney, from filing an enforcement action against an alleged violator.

When a private party sends a notice of alleged violation that alleges one or more of the exposures listed above, the notice must include a notice of special compliance procedure, and a proof of compliance form to be completed by the alleged violator as directed in the notice.

The notice and proof of compliance form is reproduced here:

Date:

Page 1

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

**SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE**  
**PROOF OF COMPLIANCE**

You are receiving this form because the Noticing Party listed above has alleged that you are violating California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 (Prop. 65).

**The Noticing Party may not bring any legal proceedings against you for the alleged violation checked below if:**

- (1) You have actually taken the corrective steps that you have certified in this form.**
- (2) The Noticing Party has received this form at the address shown above, accurately completed by you, postmarked within 14 days of your receiving this notice.**
- (3) The Noticing Party receives the required \$500 penalty payment from you at the address shown above postmarked within 30 days of your receiving this notice.**
- (4) This is the first time you have submitted a Proof of Compliance for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility on the same premises.**

**PART 1: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE NOTICING PARTY OR ATTORNEY FOR THE NOTICING PARTY**

The alleged violation is for an exposure to: (check one)

\_\_\_Alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent on-site consumption is permitted by law.

\_\_\_A chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises for immediate consumption on or off premises to the extent: (1) the chemical was not intentionally added; and (2) the chemical was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination.

\_\_\_Environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises.

\_\_\_Chemicals known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking noncommercial vehicles.

**IMPORTANT NOTES:**

(1) You have no potential liability under California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 if your business has nine (9) or fewer employees.

(2) Using this form will NOT prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney, or a prosecutor in whose jurisdiction the violation is alleged to have occurred from filing an action over the same alleged violations, and that in any such action, the amount of civil penalty shall be reduced to reflect any payment made at this time.

Date:

Page 2

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

**PART 2: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE ALLEGED VIOLATOR OR AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE**

**Certification of Compliance**

Accurate completion of this form will demonstrate that you are now in compliance with California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 for the alleged violation listed above. You must complete and submit the form below to the Noticing Party at the address shown above, postmarked within 14 days of you receiving this notice.

I hereby agree to pay, within 30 days of completion of this notice, a civil penalty of \$500 to the Noticing Party only and certify that I have complied with Health and Safety Code §25249.6 by (check only one of the following):



Posting a warning or warnings about the alleged exposure that complies with the law, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises;

Posting the warning or warnings demanded in writing by the Noticing Party, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; OR

Eliminating the alleged exposure, and attaching a statement accurately describing how the alleged exposure has been eliminated.

**Certification**

My statements on this form, and on any attachments to it, are true, complete, and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and are made in good faith. I have carefully read the instructions to complete this form. I understand that if I make a false statement on this form, I may be subject to additional penalties under the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65).

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature of alleged violator or authorized representative

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
Name and title of signatory

*FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...*

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at [P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov](mailto:P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov).

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.

# CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Tyler Michael Vance, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code§ 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings;
2. I am the attorney for the noticing party;
3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the Listed Chemical that is the subject of this action;
4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute;
5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code§ 25249.7(h)(2) (*i.e.*, (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons).

DATE: August 3, 2023

*Tyler Michael Vance*

---

Tyler Michael Vance

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE PURSUANT TO 27 CCR § 25903**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to this case. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 5396 La Bodega Way, Fontana, CA 92336.

ON THE DATE SHOWN BELOW, I SERVE THE FOLLOWING DOCUMENTS:

- 1) **60-Day Notice of Violation of Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, ET SEQ.**
- 2) **The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary**
- 3) **Certificate of Merit pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)**

on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties listed below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

<b>Shan Foods Pvt. Ltd</b> 29 Main Korangi Rd, Mehran Town Sector 23 Korangi Industrial Area, Karachi, Karachi City, Sindh 74900, Pakistan	<b>Shah Distributors Inc</b> Attn : <b>Sourabh Roy (CEO)</b> 6260 Chalet Dr Commerce, CA 90040	<b>India Spices &amp; Groceries</b> Attn: <b>SURINDER KUMAR (CEO)</b> 14441 Newport Ave, Tustin, CA 92780	<b>Miramar Cash &amp; Carry International Supermarket</b> 9252 Miramar Rd, San Diego, CA 92126
<b>CTOWN FARMERS MARKET</b> 611 E Grand Blvd, Corona, CA 92879	<b>Pioneer Cash &amp; Carry</b> Attn: <b>Devraj K Keray (CEO)</b> 11700 183rd St., CA 90701	<b>Balboa International Market</b> 5905 Balboa Avenue, San Diego, CA 92111	North Park Produce Attn: <b>ROBERT MARCOS (CEO)</b> 3551 El Cajon Blvd, CA 92104

Additionally,

ON THE DATE SHOWN BELOW, I SERVE THE FOLLOWING DOCUMENTS:

- 1) **60-Day Notice of Violation of Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, ET SEQ.**
- 2) **The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary**
- 3) **Certificate of Merit pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)**
- 4) **Additional Supporting Factual Information Sufficient to establish the bases for the Certificate of Merit as required by Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)(1)**

on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was uploaded on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at: <https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice>:

Office of the California Attorney General  
Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting  
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000  
Oakland, CA 94612-0550

Additionally,

ON THE DATE SHOWN BELOW, I SERVE THE FOLLOWING DOCUMENTS:

- 1) **60-Day Notice of Violation of Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, *ET SEQ.***
- 2) **Certificate of Merit pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)**

on the following parties when a true and correct copy thereof was sent via electronic mail to each of the parties listed below:

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County  
900 Ward Street  
Martinez, CA 94553  
[sgrassini@contracostada.org](mailto:sgrassini@contracostada.org)

Dije Ndreu, Deputy District Attorney Monterey County  
1200 Aguajito Road  
Monterey, CA 93940  
[Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us](mailto:Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us)

Allison Haley, District Attorney Napa County  
931 Parkway Mall  
Napa, CA 94559  
[CEPD@countyofnapa.org](mailto:CEPD@countyofnapa.org)

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County  
3072 Orange Street  
Riverside, CA 92501  
[Prop65@rivcoda.org](mailto:Prop65@rivcoda.org)

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney Sacramento County  
901 G Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
[Prop65@sacda.org](mailto:Prop65@sacda.org)

Gregory Alker, Assistant District Attorney San Francisco County  
732 Brannan Street  
San Francisco, CA 94103  
[Gregory.alker@sfgov.org](mailto:Gregory.alker@sfgov.org)

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney Yolo County  
301 Second Street  
Woodland, CA 95695  
[District.Attorney@yolocounty.org](mailto:District.Attorney@yolocounty.org)

Tori Verber Salazar, San Joaquin County District Attorney  
222 E. Weber Ave, Suite 202  
Stockton, CA 95202  
[DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org](mailto:DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org)

District Attorney, Alameda County  
1225 Fallon Street, Suite 900  
Oakland, CA 94612-4208  
[CEPDProp65@acgov.org](mailto:CEPDProp65@acgov.org)

District Attorney, Inyo County  
PO Drawer D  
Independence, CA 93526-0604  
[inyoda@inyocounty.us](mailto:inyoda@inyocounty.us)

San Diego City Attorney's Office  
1200 3rd Avenue, STE  
1620 San Diego, CA 92101  
[CityAttyCrimProp65@sandiego.gov](mailto:CityAttyCrimProp65@sandiego.gov)

Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator Lassen County  
220 S. Lassen Street  
Susanville, CA 96130  
[mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us](mailto:mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us)

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County  
County Government Center Annex, 4 FL  
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408  
[edobroth@co.slo.ca.us](mailto:edobroth@co.slo.ca.us)

Yen Dang, Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County  
70 W. Hedding St.  
San Jose, C 95110  
[EPU@da.sccgov.org](mailto:EPU@da.sccgov.org)

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney Santa Cruz County  
701 Ocean Street  
Santa Cruz, CA 95060  
[Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us](mailto:Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us)

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney Sonoma County  
600 Administration Dr  
Sonoma, CA 95403  
[jbarnes@sonoma-county.org](mailto:jbarnes@sonoma-county.org)

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County  
221 S. Mooney Blvd  
Visalia, CA 95370  
[Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us](mailto:Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us)

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County  
800 S. Victoria Ave.  
Ventura, CA 93009  
[daspecialops@ventura.org](mailto:daspecialops@ventura.org)

San Francisco, City Attorney  
1 Dr Carlton B Goodlett PL Ste  
234 San Francisco, CA 94102-  
4604 [valerie.lopez@sfcityattv.org](mailto:valerie.lopez@sfcityattv.org)

District Attorney, Santa Barbara County  
1112 Santa Barbara Street  
Santa Barbara, CA 93101  
[DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us](mailto:DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us)

District Attorney, Calaveras County  
891 Mountain Ranch Road  
San Andreas, CA 95249  
[Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us](mailto:Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us)

San Jose City Attorney's Office 200  
East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor  
San Jose, CA 95113-1903  
[cao.main@sanjoseca.gov](mailto:cao.main@sanjoseca.gov)

Additionally,

ON THE DATE SHOWN BELOW, I SERVE THE FOLLOWING DOCUMENTS:

- 1) 60-Day Notice of Violation of Health & Safety Code§ 25249.5, *ET SEQ.*
- 2) Certificate of Merit pursuant to Health & Safety Code§ 25249.7(d)

on each of the parties on the Service List below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by First Class Mail.

Executed on August 3, 2023, in Fontana, California.

*Tyler Michael Vance*  
Tyler Michael Vance

### Service List

District Attorney, Orange County 401 West Civic Center Drive Santa Ana, CA 92701-4515	District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230-5905	District Attorney, Plumas County 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971-9116	District Attorney, Trinity County PO Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093-0310
District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120-0248	District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453-4759	District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor Hollister, CA 95023-3801	District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370-5525
District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642-2153	District Attorney, Los Angeles County Hall of Justice 211 West Temple St., Ste 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012-4086	District Attorney, San Bernardino County 303 West Third Street San Bernardino, CA 92415-0205	District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901-5737
District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive # 245 Oroville, CA 95965-3370	District Attorney, Madera County 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637-3534	District Attorney, San Diego County 330 West Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101-3826	Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012-4133
District Attorney, Sutter County 463 2nd Street Yuba City, CA 95991-5524	District Attorney, Marin County 350 I Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903-5207	District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063-1662	District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501-1107
District Attorney, Colusa County 346 Fifth Street Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932-2413	District Attorney, Mariposa County Post Office Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338-0730	District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301-4619	District Attorney, Tehama County PO Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080-0519
District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531-4021	District Attorney, Mendocino County 100 N State St # 10, Ukiah, CA 95482-4416	District Attorney, Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001-1652	District Attorney, Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive #240 Roseville, CA 95678-6231
District Attorney, El Dorado County 515 Main Street Placerville, CA 95667-5609	District Attorney, Merced County 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340-4716	District Attorney, Sierra County PO Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936-0457	District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, STE 300 Modesto, CA 95354-2327
District Attorney, Fresno County 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721-2107	District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020	District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097-0986	District Attorney, Imperial County 940 West Main Street, STE 102 El Centro, CA 92243-2880
District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988-0430	District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517-0617	District Attorney, Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533-6340	District Attorney, Nevada County 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959-2506