# CLIFFWOOD LAW FIRM, PC

12100 WILSHIRE BLVD, SUITE 800 LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90025 (310)200-3227

#### **60-DAY NOTICE OF INTENT TO SUE**

for violations of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986

August 15, 2023

Current President or CEO DPI Specialty Foods, Inc. DPI Specialty Foods West, Inc. c/o CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service, Agent 2710 Gateway Oaks Drive, STE 150N Sacramento, CA 95833

Current President or CEO DPI Specialty Foods, Inc. DPI Specialty Foods West, Inc. Attn: Legal Department 601 S. Rockefeller Avenue Ontario, CA 91761

Current President or CEO Bar Harbor Foods Attn: Legal Dept. 1112 Cutler Rd Whiting, ME 04691 Current President or CEO Sea Watch International, Ltd. c/o The Prentice-Hall Corporation System, Inc., Agent 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington, DE 19808

Current President or CEO Mitsuwa Corporation DBA Mitsuwa Marketplace c/o Martin, Frost & Hill, P.C, Agent 3345 Bee Cave Rd, STE 105 Austin, TX 78746

#### Re: NOTICE OF VIOLATION AGAINST DPI SPECIALTY FOODS, INC., DPI SPECIALTY FOODS WEST, INC., BAR HARBOR FOODS, SEA WATCH INTERNATIONAL, LTD., MITSUWA CORPORATION DBA MITSUWA MARKETPLACE, of CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.6

To Whom It May Concern and to Public Prosecutors:

# This first Amendment amends notice number 2023-00641 filed on 03/06/2023 to add DPI Specialty Foods, Inc. and DPI Specialty Foods West, Inc. as Violators.

Clean Product Advocates, LLC ("CPA") is a California company acting in the interest of the general public seeking to further, among other causes, the protection of the environment, toxics reduction, the promotion and improvement of human health, the improvement of workers and consumer rights, environmental education and corporate accountability. As described below, CPA has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65" or "Act"), codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq. by DPI Specialty Foods, Inc., DPI Specialty Foods West, Inc., Bar Harbor Foods, Sea Watch International, Ltd., Mitsuwa Corporation DBA Mitsuwa Marketplace, (collectively the "Violators"). This letter serves to provide CPA's notification of these violations to the Violators and elected prosecutors. Pursuant to § 25249.7(d) of the statute, CPA intends to bring an enforcement action against the Violators sixty (60) days after the effective service of this

notice unless public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

The products which are causing exposure without a warning in violation of Proposition 65, are Chopped Sea Clams, including but not limited to UPC # 070718001019 ("Products") manufactured/distributed by DPI Specialty Foods, Inc., DPI Specialty Foods West, Inc., Bar Harbor Foods, Sea Watch International, Ltd., Mitsuwa Corporation DBA Mitsuwa Marketplace and offered for sale by retailers to California consumers.

Identified below is a specific example of Covered Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase in California (the "Exemplar Product"). Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors, importers, and/or manufacturers of the Exemplar Product are also provided. The Exemplar Product is identified for the Notice Recipients' benefit to assist in their investigation of the allegations set forth in this Notice. The Exemplar Product is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of products falling within the specific category of the Covered Products. The Exemplar Product is a representative of a class of products called "Chopped Sea Clams". It is the CPA's position that the Violators are obligated to conduct a good-faith investigation into other products falling within the category of the Covered Products, including variations thereof, which have been manufactured, imported, distributed, shipped, stored, or sold in the State of California.

Exemplar Product(s)	Violative chemical	Violators
Chopped Sea Clams	Lead	DPI Specialty Foods, Inc.
UPC: 070718001019		DPI Specialty Foods West, Inc.
		Bar Harbor Foods
		Sea Watch International, Ltd.
		Mitsuwa Corporation DBA Mitsuwa Marketplace

A copy of the Proposition 65 summary prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment is attached to the copy of this letter served to the Violators.

Because of this lack of a warning, consumers were exposed to the following chemicals without the proper required Proposition 65 warnings: 1) Lead. The route of exposure for this chemical is through ingestion. Such exposure can cause cancer, birth defects and other reproductive harm. Exposures to the listed chemical from the use of each Product have been occurring without the clear and reasonable warning required by Proposition 65, dating as far back as January 15, 2023 and will continue every day henceforth until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is removed from the Products. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effect of exposures to the listed chemical resulting from ingestion of the Products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the listed chemical from use of the Products.

CPA intends to file a private enforcement action as provided for in the Act for the alleged violations by the Violators, unless Violators agree in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) recall the listed products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals; or (2) affix clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning labels for the products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the exposures; and (3) pay applicable civil penalties and the costs of bringing this action.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, CPA is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter, and invites Violators, should they seek early resolution of this matter, to communicate directly with CPA's attorneys. Such resolution will avoid further unwarned consumer exposures, as well as resource intensive litigation.

Please direct all communication regarding this notice to CPA's attorney, Elham Shabatian (ellie@cliffwoodlaw.com), Cliffwood Law Firm PC, 12100 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 800, Los Angeles, CA 90025, 310-200-3227.

Sincerely,

Elham Shabatian CLIFFWOOD LAW FIRM, PC

Cc: see attached distribution list

Attachments:

- 1. Certificate of Merit;
- 2. Certificate of Service;
- 3. Appendix "A" "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary" (to the Noticed Parties only);
- 4. Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy); Factual information sufficient to establish basis of the certificate of merit (only sent to Attorney General)

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

Re: Clean Product Advocates, LLC's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by DPI Specialty Foods, Inc., DPI Specialty Foods West, Inc., Bar Harbor Foods, Sea Watch International, Ltd., Mitsuwa Corporation DBA Mitsuwa Marketplace.

I, Elham Shabatian, attorney at law, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am the attorney for the Noticing Party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, and/or other data regarding the alleged exposures to the listed chemical that is the cause of action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: August 15, 2023

Elham Shabatian

#### **PROOF OF SERVICE**

I, Elham Shabatian, am over the age of 18 and am not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 12100 Wilshire Blvd, Suite 800, Los Angeles, CA 90025

On August 15, 2023, I served the following documents:

- 1. 60-Day Notice of Intent to Sue Under Health and Safety Code section 25249.6
- 2. Certificate of Merit; Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7 (d)
- 3. Certificate of Merit (Attorney General Copy); Factual information sufficient to establish basis of the certificate of merit (*only sent to Attorney General*)
- 4. The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

on the alleged violator (s) listed below via First Class Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing a true and correct copy in a sealed envelope, addressed to the entity listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Current President or CEO	Current President or CEO	Current President or CEO
Sea Watch International, Ltd.	Bar Harbor Foods	DPI Specialty Foods, Inc.
c/o The Prentice-Hall Corporation	Attn: Legal Dept.	DPI Specialty Foods West, Inc.
System, Inc., Agent	1112 Cutler Rd	c/o CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service, Agent
251 Little Falls Drive	Whiting, ME 04691	2710 Gateway Oaks Drive, STE 150N
Wilmington, DE 19808		Sacramento, CA 95833
Current President or CEO	Current President or CEO	
Mitsuwa Corporation DBA Mitsuwa	DPI Specialty Foods, Inc.	
Marketplace	DPI Specialty Foods West, Inc.	
c/o Martin, Frost & Hill, P.C, Agent	Attn: Legal Department	
3345 Bee Cave Rd, STE 105	601 S. Rockefeller Avenue	
Austin, TX 78746	Ontario, CA 91761	

as well as by filing electronically a true and correct copy thereof as permitted through the website of the California Office of the Attorney General via link at oag.ca.gov/prop65:

State of California Department of Justice

Office of the Attorney General of California

Filing link: oag.ca.gov/prop65

Copies of the notice were provided to the public enforcers by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the District Attorney and City Attorney offices the parties listed on the attached Distribution List. The District Attorney and City Attorney offices that have requested electronic service only were served electronically via the email addresses listed on the Distribution List.

I declare under penalty of perjury that under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Signature

August 15, 2023

Elham Shabatian

CLIFFWOOD LAW FIRM, PC 12100 Wilshire Blvd, Suite 800 ♦ Los Angeles, CA 90025 ♦ ellie@cliffwoodlaw.com

### DISTRIBUTION LIST

District Attorney Alpine County	District Attorney Lake County	District Attorney Sierra County			
PO Box 248	255 North Forbes Street	PO Box 457			
Markleeville, CA 96120	Lakeport, CA 95453	Downieville, CA 95936			
District Attorney Amador County	District Attorney Los Angeles County	District Attorney's Office Siskiyou			
708 Court Street, Suite 202	Hall of Justice 211 W. Temple St. Ste 1200	County Courthouse			
Jackson, CA 95642	Los Angeles, CA 90012	311 Fourth Street, Room 204			
		Yreka, CA 96097			
District Attorney Butte County	District Attorney Madera County	District Attorney Solano County			
25 County Center Drive, Suite 245	209 West Yosemite Avenue	675 Texas Street, Ste 4500			
Oroville, CA 95965	Madera, CA 93637	Fairfield, CA 94533			
District Attorney Colusa County	District Attorney Marin County	District Attorney Stanislaus County			
310 6th Street	3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130	832 12th Street, Ste 300			
Colusa, CA 95932	San Rafael, CA 94903	Modesto, CA 95354			
District Attorney Del Norte County	District Attorney Mendocino County	District Attorney Sutter County			
450 H Street, Suite 171	PO Box 1000	446 Second Street			
Crescent City, CA 95531	Ukiah, CA 95482	Yuba City, CA 95991			
District Attorney EL Dorado County	District Attorney Modoc County	District Attorney Tehama County			
778 Pacific Street	204 S Court Street, Room 202	PO Box 519			
Placerville, CA 95667	Alturas, CA 96101-4020	Red Bluff, CA 96080			
District Attorney Mono County	District Attorney Orange County	District Attorney Trinity County			
Post Office Box 617	300 N Flower St.	Post Office Box 310			
Bridgeport, CA 93517	Santa Ana, CA 92703	Weaverville, CA 96093			
District Attorney Glenn County	District Attorney San Benito County	District Attorney Tuolumne County			
Post Office Box 430	419 4th Street	423 North Washington St.			
Willows, CA 95988	Hollister, CA 95023	Sonora, CA 95370			
District Attorney Humboldt County	District Attorney San Bernardino County	District Attorney Yuba County			
825 5th Street 4th Floor	316 No. Mountain View Avenue	215 Fifth Street, Suite 152			
Eureka, CA 95501	San Bernardino, CA 92415	Marysville, CA 95901			
District Attorney Imperial County	District Attorney San Mateo County	Los Angeles City Attorney's Office			
940 West Main Street, Suite 102	400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor	City Hall East 200 N. Main St., Suite 800			
El Centro, CA 92243	Redwood City, CA 94063	Los Angeles, CA 90012			
District Attorney Kern County	District Attorney Shasta County	District Attorney Kings County			
1215 Truxtun Avenue	1355 West Street	1400 West Lacey Blvd.			
Bakersfield, CA 93301	Redding, CA 96001	Hanford, CA 93230			
Alameda County District Attorney	Calaveras County District Attorney	Contra Costa County District Attorney			
CEPDProp65@acgov.org	Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	sgrassini@contracostada.org			
Inyo County District Attorney	Lassen County District Attorney	Mariposa County District Attorney			
inyoda@inyocounty.us	mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	mcda@mariposacounty.org			
Merced County District Attorney	Monterey County District Attorney	Napa County District Attorney			
Prop65@countyofmerced.com	Pro65DA@co.monterey.ca.us	CEPD@countyofnapa.org			
Nevada County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney			
DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us	Prop65@placer.ca.gov	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com			
Riverside County District Attorney	Sacramento County District Attorney	San Diego City Attorney			
Prop65@rivcoda.org	Prop65@sacda.org	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov			
San Diego County District Attorney	San Francisco County District Attorney	San Francisco City Attorney			
SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org	alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org	Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org			
San Joaquin County District Attorney DA	San Luis Obispo County District Attorney	Santa Barbara County District Attorney			
DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us			
Santa Clara County District Attorney	Santa Cruz County District Attorney	Sonoma County District Attorney			
EPU@da.sccgov.org	Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	jbarnes@sonoma-county.org			
Tulare County District Attorney	Ventura County District Attorney	Yolo County District Attorney			
Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us	daspecialops@veutura.org	cfepd@yolocounty.org			
San Jose City Attorney's Office	District Attorney Fresno	District Attorney of Roseville			
proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov	consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov	pwp65@place.ca.gov			
proposition of the state of the					

#### **APPENDIX A**

## OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA PROTECTION AGENCY THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACTION 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the Lead and Toxic Enforcement Act 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65") A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide law. The reader is directed to the statue and its implementing regulations (See citations below) for further information.

Proposition 65 appears in California law as Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code Regulations, Sections 250000 through 27000.

#### WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

*The "Governor's List"* Proposition 65 requires the Governor to publish a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm. This list must be updated at least once a year. Over 725 chemicals have been listed as of November 16, 2001. Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under this law. Businesses that produce, use, release, or otherwise engage in activities involving those chemicals must comply with the following:

*Clear and Reasonable Warnings*. A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed.

Exposures are exempt from the warning requirement if they occur less than twelve months after the date of the listing of the chemical.

*Prohibition from discharges into drinking water.* A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Discharges are exempt from this requirement if they occur less than twenty months after the date of the listing of chemicals.

#### DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. The law exempts:

*Governmental agencies and public water utilities.* All agencies of the federal, State or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

CLIFFWOOD LAW FIRM, PC

12100 Wilshire Blvd, Suite 800 ♦ Los Angeles, CA 90025 ♦ ellie@cliffwoodlaw.com

*Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer.* For chemicals that are listed as known to the State to cause cancer ("carcinogens"), a warning is not required if the business can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70- year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "no significant risk" levels for more than 250 listed carcinogens.

*Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question.* For chemicals known to the State to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm ("reproductive toxicants"), a warning is not required if the business can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level (NOEL)," divided by a 1,000- fold safety or uncertainty factor. The "no observable effect level" is the highest dose level which has not been associated with an observable adverse reproductive or developmental effect.

Discharge that does not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering into any source of drinking water. The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the list chemical has not, does not, or will not enter any drinking water source, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount; expect an amount that would meet the " no significant risk" or "no observable effect" test if an individual were exposed to such an amount in drinking water.

# HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys (those in cities with a population exceeding 750,000). Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violations (Title 27. California Code of Regulations, Section 25903). A private party may not pursue an enforcement action directly under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an action within sixty days of notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court of law to stop committing the violation.

# FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ....

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment=s Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916)445-6900