# LAW OFFICES BRODSKY SMITH

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534,2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

#### August 16, 2023

	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
President/CEO	President/CEO
The Quaker Oats Company	The Quaker Oats Company
c/o CT Corporation System	c/o CT Corporation System
820 Bear Tavern Rad	208 So. LaSalle Street, Suite 814
West Trenton, NJ 08628	Chicago, IL 60604-1101
Member/Manager	President/CEO
Albertsons Companies, LLC	Albertsons Companies, Inc.
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o CT Corporation System
Corporation Trust Center	1555 W. Shoreline Drive, Suite 100
1209 Orange Street	Boise, ID 83702
Wilmington, DE 19801	
President/CEO	
Albertsons Companies, Inc.	
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	
Corporation Trust Center	
1209 Orange Street	
Wilmington, DE 19801	

### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Precila Balabbo ("Balabbo"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Balabbo has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

### I. <u>DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION</u>

- 1. Enforcer: Precila Balabbo, 285 6<sup>th</sup> Street, Unit 209, San Pedro, CA 90731; (Ph) 818-434-4023.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): The Quaker Oats Company; Albertsons Companies, Inc.; Albertsons Companies, LLC
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least August 16, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
- 4. Listed Chemical: Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Strawberries and Cream Instant Oatmeal	Quaker Strawberries and Cream Instant Oatmeal
	UPC# 030000570517

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through ingestion. When foods contaminated with the Listed Chemical are consumed, ingestion of the Listed Chemical will occur which will increase BLLs. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Balabbo against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Balabbo's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

these violations of California law quickly rectified, Balabbo is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Balabbo has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

### Attachments

Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

### Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

### I, Evan J. Smith, hereby declare:

- (1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- (2) I am the attorney for the noticing party, Precila Balabbo.
- (3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- (4) Based on the information obtained through these consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator(s) will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- (5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: August 16, 2023

Evan J. Smith

Attorney for Precila Balabbo

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within action. My business address is 2 Bala Plaza, Suite 805, Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania. I am employed in Montgomery County where the mailing occurred.

On August 16, 2023 I served the following documents: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary on the following entities and individuals listed below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

President/CEO	President/CEO
The Quaker Oats Company	The Quaker Oats Company
c/o CT Corporation System	c/o CT Corporation System
820 Bear Tavern Rad	208 So. LaSalle Street, Suite 814
West Trenton, NJ 08628	Chicago, IL 60604-1101
Member/Manager	President/CEO
Albertsons Companies, LLC	Albertsons Companies, Inc.
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o CT Corporation System
Corporation Trust Center	1555 W. Shoreline Drive, Suite 100
1209 Orange Street	Boise, ID 83702
Wilmington, DE 19801	
President/CEO	
Albertsons Companies, Inc.	
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	
Corporation Trust Center	
1209 Orange Street	
Wilmington, DE 19801	

On August 16, 2023, I served the following documents: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary on each of the individuals on the service list attached hereto as Appendix B by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed August 16, 2023, in Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania.

Evan J. Smith

## ELECTRONIC MAIL SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley	The Honorible Fori Verber Saltar	Honorable Anne Marie Schubert
Mulameda Couply District Attorney	San Josquin County District Automov	Sammento County District Attorney
Viro Uakport Street Strite 650	222 E. Weber Avenue, Rosen 202	901 G Street
Oakland, CA 94621	Stackion, CA 95262	Secremento, CA 95814
CEPEPmp65@acgiv.org	DACompiner Envisonmental@sjedn.org	PropóS@sacda.ocg
The Honorable Allison Haley	The Honorable Jeffrey 3. Rosell	The Honorable Summer Stephan
Napa County District Attorney 1127 First St., Suite C	Sunta Cruz County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney
Napa, CA 94559	DOL Ocean Street	300 West Broadway
CEPD@samb s	Sunta Cruz, CA 95060	San Diego, CA 92101
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Preprist DA@sameeneeeunty.us	SanDiagoDAProp65@sdcda.org
The Honorable Jeff W. Reisig	Michella Latimer, Program Coordinator	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
Yolo County District Attorney	Lassen County	City of San Diego
301 Second Street	220 S. Lassen Street	1200 Third Avenue
Woodland, CA 95695	Susanville, CA 96130	San Diego, CA 92101
efeadla volocounty org	matamentaco, pissero, esa, ess	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
Bud Porter	Alethan M. Sargent	Christopher Dalbey,
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Assistant District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney
banta Clara County	Son Francisco District Attorney's Office	Sam Barbara County
70 W Hedding Street	350 Rhode Island Street	I i 12 Santa Barbara Street
San Jose, CA 95110	San Francisco, CA 94103	Santa Barbara, CA 93101
SPUmes.secgov.org	alethen_sargatti@afgrey.org	DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.co.us
he Honorable Gregory D. Totten,	The Honorable Barbara Yook	Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney
entura County District Attorney	Calaveras County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney
UU S Victoria Avenue	891 Mountain Ranch Road	1390 Market Street, 7" Floor
entura, CA 93-009	San Andreas, CA 95249	San Francisco, CA 94102
aspecialops@ventura.org	Propiseny@co.culaveros.cu.us	A STAND OF THE STANDARD OF THE
tacey Grassini	Brie J. Dobroth	Valeric Lapez@sfcityatty.org
Deputy District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney	Jeannine M. Pacioni
ontra Costa County	San Luis Obispo County	Deputy District Attorney
00 Ward Street	County Govt Center Amnex, 4th Floor	Monterey County
fartinez, CA 94553	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	1200 Aguajito Road
sarsini@contracostada.org	cuotrotholea sto ca.es	Monterey, CA 93940
te Honorable Thomas Hardy	Fin Second C 20 111 1 214	Prop65DA@co.montercy.ca.us
W County District Attorney	The Remarable Phillip 1. Chao	The Honosable Clifford Newell
74 N. Edwards Street	Tolore County District Astorney	Mevada County District Attorney
dependence CA 93526	221 S Mouncy Blwd	201 Commercial Street
yoda@inyocounty.us	Visalia, CA 95370	Nevada City, CA 95959
ie Flonorable Paul E. Zellerbach	Propós@eo.miare.ca.us	DA.Propfi@so_nevada.ca.us
verside County District Attorney	The Monorable Stephan Passalacqua	The Honorable David Hollistor
72 Orange Street	Sationic County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attomey
verside CA 92501	500 Administration Drive	520 Main Street, Room, 404
epis@rivcoda.org	Sonome, CA 95403	Quincy, CA 95971
is Honorable Walter W. Wall	ibenesiosonome-county.org	davidbollister@countyofplumas.com
aripaga Caust Discover W Wall	The Monorable Kimmerly Lewis	The Honorable Morgan Briggs Circ
oripesa County District Attorney  O. Box 730	Microsol County District Attention	Placer County District Attorney
- NOA / 3U	550 West Main Street	10810 Justice Center Drive
ariposa, CA 95338	Mercod, CA 95340	Roseville, CA 95678
sta@nuringsnogeney.org	Propos@counterfragreed.com	prop65@placer.ca.gov
TE V. Frimann City Attorney	Lisa A. Smilleamp, District Attorney	an year owners out go
O.E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	2100 Tulare Street	T.
OE. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor a Jose, CA 96113		
opesition65notices@sampeseca.gov	Fresno, CA 93721	t
TOTAL CONTROL OF THE PROPERTY	consumeratoreation after a snocenative g	ov I 1

# ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST

Office of the California Attorney General
Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting
ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator
P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-nexice

# SERVICE LIST

The Honotable Nancy O'Malley	The Honorable Stacey Montgomery	The Honorable Candice Hooper	The Honorable Gragg Cohen Tehama County District Attorney 444 Oak Streat, Room C Red Bluff, CA 96080
Alanteda County District Attorney	Lassan County District Altorney	San Benito County District Altorney	
1225 Fallon Street, Room 900	280 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8	419 4th Street, Second Floor	
Oakland, CA 94612	Susanville, CA 96120	Hollister, CA 95203	
The Honorable Terese Drabec Alpine County District Attorney 270 Leramie Street, PO 80X 248 Marklesville, OA 98120	The Honorable Jackie Lacey Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 Wast Tample Street, Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012	The Honorable Michael Ramos San Bernardino County Olstict Attorney 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	The Honorable Eric Harylord Trinity County Olstriot Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaveruffle, CA 96093
The Honorable Todd Riebe	The Honorable Bavid Linn	The Honorable Bonnie Ournanis	The Honorable Tim Ward Tulare County District Attorney 221 South Monney Soulevard, Rim 224 Vigatin, CA 98291-4593
Amador County District Attorney	Madera County District Attorney	San Olego County District Allorney	
708 Court Street	209 West Yosemite Avenue	330 W. Broadway Street	
Jackson, CA 96842	Madera, CA 98687	San Diego, CA 92101	
The Managable Michael Plantsay	The Noncrable Sovrant Betberlan	The Honorable George Gascon	The Honorable Laura Kiteg
Butte County District Attorney	Marin County Claffel Attorney	San Francisco County District Attorney	Tuolumne County Distriol Altorney
25 County Center Orive	3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130	650 Bryant Street, Room 322	423 North Washington Street
Oroville, CA 95965	San Rafael, CA 94903	San Francisco, CA 94103	Sonora, CA 95370
The Honorable Sarbara Yook	The Hondrable Thomas Cooke Maripose County District Attorney 5101 Janes Street, F.O. Box 730 Maripose, CA 95338	The Honorable Turi Verber Salazar	The Honorable Gregory Tolten
Calaveras County Cistriat Attomay		San Joaquin County District Attorney	Ventura County District Attorney
891 Mountain Randa Road		222 East Weber Avenue, Room 202	900 South Victoria Avenue
San Andress, CA 95249		Stockton, CA 95201	Ventura, CA 93009
The Honorable John Poyner	The Konorable C. David Eyster	The Kongratife Can Dow	The Handable Jeff Relaig
Coluse County District Attorney	Mendadiric County District Attorney	San Luís Obispo County District Ally	Yalo County District Altomey
346 Fifth Street	160 North State Street, P.O. Slox 1000	1035 Palm Street, 4th Floor	301 Second Street
Coluse, OA 95932	Ukiah, CA 95482	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Woodland, OA \$5695
The Honorable Mark Paterson Contra Costa County District Attorney 900 Ward Street Martinez, GA 94553 The Honorable Dale Tripg	The Honorable Larry Morse II Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340	The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	The Honorable Patrick McGraft Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Maryayille, CA 95301
Del Riado Gaunty District Attorney 450 H Streat, Room 171 Crascent City, CA 95531	The Honorable Jordan Funk Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101	The Honorabio Joyce Oudley Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101	The Honorable Mike Feter Office of the City Altomey, Los Angeles 800 City Hall East 200 Nutrih Main Street Lus Angeles, CA 80012
The Honorabla Varn Plerson 21 Ogrado Gognty District Attorney 778 Poello-Street Placarylla, CA 95957	The Handrable Tim Kendall Mano County Olstrict Attorney P.O. Box 617 Bildgeout, CA 98517	The Honorable Jeffrey Hosen Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 Wast Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 95110	The Honorable James Sanchez Office of the City Attorney, Sawamento 915   Sireat, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95514
the Handroble Like Smitteamp	The Honorable Dean Filippo	The Honorable Jelf Rosell Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Osean Street, Roam 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95050	The Honorable Jan Goldsmith
Fesno County District Astorney	Menteray County District Attorney		Office of the City Attorney, San Diego
2220 Tutara Street, #1000	P.O. Box 1131		1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620
Feano, OA 90721	Salines, CA \$3502		San Diego, CA 92101
The Honardille Dwayne Stewart	The Konorable Allison Haley	The Hunorable Stephen Carlton	The Honorable Dennis Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco 1 Or. Carlton B. Goodleit Place San Francisco, QA 94102
Slann County District Attorney	Napa County District Attorney	Shasta County District Attorney	
P.O. Box 430	1127 First Street, Suite C	1355 Wast Street	
Willows, CA 95988	Napa, CA 94559	Radding, CA 86001	
frie Hongrable Maggie Fleming	The Honorable Ollford Newell	The Honorable Lawrence Allen	The Honorable Richard Doyle Office of the City Allomey, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113
Hunboldt Caung Distriot Attorney	Nevada County Bishlot Attorney	Slerra County District Attorney	
125 Sile Steet, Faurth Pieer	201 Commercial Street	100 Couthouse Square	
Eureka, CA 95501	Nevada City. CA 95959	Downleylile, CA 95936	
The Honorable Gibret Otess Impetal Reanty Bistelst Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243	The Henerable Tony Rackauckas Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701	The Hanorable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 966 Yrska, CA 95097	Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 68 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prog 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Outdand, OA 94912-0550
The Honorable Thomas Hardy	The Hungrable R. Scott Owens	The Hengrable Klishna Abrams	
Inyo County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney	Sulano County District Attorney	
P.O. Drawer D	10810 Justice Center Orive, Suite 240	975 Texas Street, Sulte 4500	
Independence, CA \$3526	Resealle, CA 95678	Fainleld, CA 94533	
The Honorable Lisa Green Kam County District Attorney 1215 Trustun Avenue 8848rsfield, CA 93301	The Hongrable David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney \$20 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971	The Honorable Jlli Flavitch Senoma County District Astorney 600 Administration Orive, Floorn 212 Santa Rosa, CA \$5403.	7
The Honorable Keith Fagundas	The Honorable Michael Hestrin	The Honoradie Birgit Fladager	
Kings County District Altomay	Riverside County District Attorney	Stanislaus County Disirlot Attorney	
1480 Yest Lazay Boulevard	3960 Orange Street	832 12th Street, Suite 300	
Hanlord, CA 99230	Riverside, CA 92501	Modesto, CA 95354	
The Honorable Donald Anderson	The Hondrable Anne Marle Schubert	The Hundrable Amanda Hopper	
Lake County Olstrict Attorney	Sagramento County District Attorney	Sutter County District Attorney	
255 North Forbas Street	901 G Street	463 Second Street, Suite 102	
Lakegort CA 95453	Sagramento CA 95814	Yuba Cily CA 95991	

### APPENDIX A

# OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and OEHHA implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information.

FOR INFORMATION CONCERNING THE BASIS FOR THE ALLEGATIONS IN THE NOTICE RELATED TO YOUR BUSINESS, CONTACT THE PERSON IDENTIFIED ON THE NOTICE.

The text of Proposition 65 (Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13) is available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65law72003.html. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 25102 through 27001.1 These implementing regulations are available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65Regs.html.

## WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

The "Proposition 65 List." Under Proposition 65, the lead agency (OEHHA) publishes a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or reproductive toxicity. Chemicals are placed on the Proposition 65 list if they are known to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, such as damage to

All further regulatory references are to sections of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations unless otherwise indicated. The statute, regulations and relevant case law are available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html.

female or male reproductive systems or to the developing fetus. This list must be updated at least once a year. The current Proposition 65 list of chemicals is available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65\_list/Newlist.html.

Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under Proposition 65. Businesses that produce, use, release or otherwise engage in activities involving listed chemicals must comply with the following:

Clear and reasonable warnings. A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical unless an exemption applies. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed to that chemical. Some exposures are exempt from the warning requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

**Prohibition from discharges into drinking water.** A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Some discharges are exempt from this requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

### DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. You should consult the current version of the statute and regulations (http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html) to determine all applicable exemptions, the most common of which are the following:

Grace Period. Proposition 65 warning requirements do not apply until 12 months after the chemical has been listed. The Proposition 65 discharge prohibition does not apply to a discharge or release of a chemical that takes place less than 20 months after the listing of the chemical.

Governmental agencies and public water utilities. All agencies of the federal, state or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

Businesses with nine or fewer employees. Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employe a total of nine or fewer employees. This includes all employees, not just those present in California.

Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer. For chemicals that are listed under Proposition 65 as known to the State to cause cancer, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "No Significant Risk Levels" (NSRLs) for many listed carcinogens. Exposures below these levels are exempt from the warning requirement. See OEHHA's website at:

http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of NSRLs, and Section 25701 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question. For chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level" divided by 1,000. This number is known as the Maximum Allowable Dose Level (MADL). See OEHHA's website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of MADLs, and Section 25801 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

**Exposures to Naturally Occurring Chemicals in Food.** Certain exposures to chemicals that naturally occur in foods (i.e., that do not result from any known human activity, including activity by someone other than the person causing the exposure) are exempt from the warning requirements of the law. If the chemical is a contaminant<sup>2</sup> it must be reduced to the lowest level feasible. Regulations explaining this exemption can be found in Section 25501

Discharges that do not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering any source of drinking water. The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the listed chemical has not, does not, or will not pass into or probably pass into a source of drinking water, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" level for chemicals that cause cancer or that is 1,000 times below the "no observable effect" level for chemicals that cause reproductive toxicity, if an individual were exposed to that amount in drinking water.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Section 25501(a)(4).

## HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys. Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. The notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in Section 25903 of Title 27 and sections 3100-3103 of Title 11. A private party may not pursue an independent enforcement action under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an enforcement action within sixty days of the notice

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court to stop committing the violation.

A private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. For the following types of exposures, the Act provides an opportunity for the business to correct the alleged violation:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure
  occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily
  intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

If a private party alleges that a violation occurred based on one of the exposures described above, the private party must first provide the alleged violator a notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form.

A copy of the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form is included in Appendix B and can be downloaded from OEHHA's website at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/p65law72003.html.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.

### APPENDIX B

# OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE

This Appendix B contains the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). Under the Act, a private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. These exposures are:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

A private party may not file an action against the alleged violator for these exposures, or recover in a settlement any payment in lieu of penalties any reimbursement for costs and attorney's fees, if the alleged violator has done all of the following within 14 days of being served notice:

- Corrected the alleged violation;
- Agreed to pay a civil penalty of \$500 (subject to change in 2019 and every five years thereafter) to the private party within 30 days; and

Notified the private party serving the notice in writing that the violation has been corrected

An alleged violator may satisfy these conditions only one time for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility or on the same premises. The satisfaction of these conditions does not prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney of a city of greater than 750,000 population, or any full-time city prosecutor with the consent of the district attorney, from filing an enforcement action against an alleged violator.

When a private party sends a notice of alleged violation that alleges one or more of the exposures listed above, the notice must include a notice of special compliance procedure, and a proof of compliance form to be completed by the alleged violator as directed in the notice.

The notice and proof of compliance form is reproduced here:

Date:

Page 1

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

### SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE PROOF OF COMPLIANCE

You are receiving this form because the Noticing Party listed above has alleged that you are violating California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 (Prop. 65).

The Noticing Party may not bring any legal proceedings against you for the alleged violation checked below if:

- (1) You have actually taken the corrective steps that you have certified in this form.
- (2) The Noticing Party has received this form at the address shown above, accurately completed by you, postmarked within 14 days of your receiving this notice.
- (3) The Noticing Party receives the required \$500 penalty payment from you at the address shown above postmarked within 30 days of your receiving this notice.
- (4) This is the first time you have submitted a Proof of Compliance for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility on the same premises.

## PART 1: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE NOTICING PARTY OR ATTORNEY FOR THE NOTICING PARTY

The alleged violation is for an exposure to: (check one)

Alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent on-site consumption is permitted by law.
A chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises for immediate consumption on or off premises to the extent: (1) the chemical was not intentionally added; and (2) the chemical was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination.
Environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises.
Chemicals known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking noncommercial vehicles.
IMPORTANT NOTES:
(1) You have no potential liability under California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 if your business has nine (9) or fewer employees.  (2) Using this form will NOT prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney, or a prosecutor in whose jurisdiction the violation is alleged to have occurred from filing an action over the same alleged violations, and that in any such action, the amount of civil penalty shall be reduced to reflect any payment made at this time.
Date: Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party: Address: Phone number:
PART 2: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE ALLEGED VIOLATOR OR AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE

Certification of Compliance

Accurate completion of this form will demonstrate that you are now in compliance with California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 for the alleged violation listed above. You must complete and submit the form below to the Noticing Party at the address shown above, postmarked within 14 days of you receiving this notice.

I hereby agree to pay, within 30 days of completion of this notice, a civil penalty of \$500 to the Noticing Party only and certify that I have complied with Health and Safety Code §25249.6 by (check only one of the following):

[] Posting a warning or warnings about the alleged exposure that complies with the law, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; [] Posting the warning or warnings demanded in writing by the Noticing Party, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; OR [] Eliminating the alleged exposure, and attaching a statement accurately describing how the alleged exposure has been eliminated.
Certification  My statements on this form, and on any attachments to it, are true, complete, and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and are made in good faith. I have carefully read the instructions to complete this form. I understand that if I make a false statement on this form, I may be subject to additional penalties under the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65).
Signature of alleged violator or authorized representative Date
Name and title of signatory

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.