## LAW OFFICES BRODSKY SMITH

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877.534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516,741,4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

### August 31, 2023

President/CEO	President/CEO
Plant Works Nutrition, Inc.	The Sports Basement, Inc.
c/o John Peirano	c/o Eric Prosnitz
40 Bolla Avenue	610 Old Mason Street
Alamo, CA 94507	San Francisco, CA 94129
President/CEO	
The Sports Basement, Inc.	
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	
Corporation Trust Center	
1209 Orange Street	
Wilmington, DE 19801	

### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Gabriel Espinoza ("Espinoza"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Espinoza has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- 1. Enforcer: Gabriel Espinoza, 3924 Carlin Ave. Lynwood, CA 90262; (Ph) 424-285-4896.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): Plant Works Nutrition, Inc.; The Sports Basement, Inc.
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least August 31, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
- **4. Listed Chemical**: Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Protein Powder (Vanilla)	Plant Works Protein Powder (Vanilla Flavor)
	UPC# 860903002606

1. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through ingestion. When foods contaminated with the Listed Chemical are consumed, ingestion of the Listed Chemical will occur which will increase BLLs. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

#### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Espinoza against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Espinoza is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Espinoza's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

Espinoza has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

### Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

### I, Evan J. Smith, hereby declare:

- (1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- (2) I am the attorney for the noticing party, Gabriel Espinoza.
- (3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- (4) Based on the information obtained through these consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator(s) will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- (5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: August 31, 2023

Evan I Smith

Attorney for Gabriel Espinoza

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within action. My business address is 2 Bala Plaza, Suite 805, Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania. I am employed in Montgomery County where the mailing occurred.

On August 31, 2023 I served the following documents: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary on the following entities and individuals listed below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

President/CEO	President/CEO	
Plant Works Nutrition, Inc.	The Sports Basement, Inc.	
c/o John Peirano	c/o Eric Prosnitz	
40 Bolla Avenue	610 Old Mason Street	
Alamo, CA 94507	San Francisco, CA 94129	-
President/CEO		
The Sports Basement, Inc.		
c/o The Corporation Trust Company		
Corporation Trust Center		
1209 Orange Street		
Wilmington, DE 19801		

On August 31, 2023, I served the following documents: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary on each of the individuals on the service list attached hereto as Appendix B by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed August 31, 2023, in Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania.

Evan J. Smith

### ELECTRONIC MAIL SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley	The Homerible Tori Verber Salzar	Honorable Anne Marie Schubert
Mameda County District Attorney	San Josephin County District Astomov	Sammento County District Attorney
7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650	222 E. Weber Avointe, Room 202	901 G Street
Oakland, CA 94621	Stackton, CA 45262	Sagramento, CA 95814
CEPDProp65@aggiv.org	DAConspiner Environmental (Insieda, org	ProntS@secda.oct
The Honorable Allison Haley Napa County District Attorney	The Honorable Jeffrey 3. Rosell	The Honorable Summer Stephan
1127 First St., Suite C	Sunta Cruz County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney
Napa, CA 94559	201 Ocean Street	200 West Broadway
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Sunty Cruz, CA 95060	San Diego, CA 92101
bu to	ProphSDA@suntagnizzeoung.us	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
The Honorable Jeff W. Reisig	Midbella Latimer, Program Coordinator	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street	Lassen County	City of San Diego
Wastlant Charten	220 S. Lassen Street	200 Third Avenue
Woodland, CA 95695	Susasville, CA 96130	San Diego, CA 92101
efendialyolocounty.org	tulatimes@co. hissen.co.us	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
Bud Porter	Alethea M. Sargent	Christopher Dalbey,
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Assistant District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney
Santa Clara County	San Francisco District Attorney's Office	Saura Barbara County
70 W Redding Street	350 Rhode Island Street	1 12 Santa Barbara Street
San Jose, CA 95110	San Francisco, CA 94103	Santa Barbura, CA 93101
PUDea secrov org	alethen sargeni@afgery.org	DAProges@co.senta-barbara.ca.us
he Honorable Gregory D. Totten,	The Honorable Barbara Yook	Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney
entura County District Attorney	Calments County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney
UU S Victoria Avenue	891 Mountain Ranch Road	1390 Market Street, 7th Floor
entura, CA 93009	San Andreas, CA 95249	San Francisco, CA 94102
aspecialops@ventura.org	Propis Enviceo on averas ca us	Valerie Lapez@afeityaity.org
tacey Grassini	Erfe J. Dobroth	Jeannine M. Pacioni
eputy District Attorney	Denity District Attorney	
ontra Costa County	San Luis Obispo County	Deputy District Attorney
30 Ward Street	County Govt Center Armex, 4" Floor	Monterey County
artinez, CA 94553	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	1200 Aguajito Road
Sassini@comitagostada oru	CA 93408	Monterey, CA 93940
te Honorable Thomas Hardy	edolizoth@ko.sto.ca.us	Prop65DA@co.momercy.ca.us
De County District Attorney	The Rememble Phillip I. Chae	The Honorable Clifford Newell
& M. Edwards Street	Tuluse County District Asterney	Nevada County District Attorney
dependence, CA 93526	2215 Mooney Blvd	201 Commercial Street
Koda@nayocounty, us	Visalia, CA 95370	Nevada City, CA 95959
le Floriorable Paul E. Zellerbach	Escapis (along tuines, co. us	DA Panné S@co-nevada.ca.us
Verside Court Division Letterbach	The Honorable Stephan Passalacqua	The Floriorable David Hollister
Verside County District Attorney 72 Orange Street	Senomin County District Attorney	Plamas County District Attorney
verside CA 92501	500 Administration Drive	\$20 Main Street, Room 404
7 See CA 92501	Sonoma, CA, 95403	Duiney, CA 95971
mana property of the control of the	ibunesitisonome-county.org	devideallister@countyofphanas.com
d Honorable Walter W. Wall	The Honorable Kimberly Lowis	The Honorable Morgan Briggs Gre
EBOSS COURTY District Attorney	Merced County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney
A Box 730	530 West Main Street	10810 Justice Center Drive
riposa, CA 95338	Morond, CA 95340	Roseville, CA 95678
#4@mariagsacasus or are	Principal Computation of the Com	
W. Frimann City Attorney	Propos@soustyofmercod,com	prog65@placer.ca,gov
E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	Lisn A. Smitteamp, District Atterney	1
a Jose, CA 96113	2190 Twiase Street	1
retarision 65 - 1	Fresno, CA 93721	
position6Snotices@sanjeseca.gov	consumerarofection afternocounty cag	VO

## ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST

Office of the California Attorney General
Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting
ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator
P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-netice

## SERVICE LIST

The Nonesable Nancy O'Malkey Alemada County District Atternay 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94512	The Honorable Stacey Montgomery Lassen County Obstrict Attorney 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8	San Benito County District Altomay 419 4th Street, Second Floor	The Honorable Gregg Cohen Tehama County District Attorney 444 Oak Strest, Room L Red Sluff, CA 98080
	Suranville, CA 98130	Hallister, CA 95203	
The Hongrable Terese Orabec Alpine County District Attorney	The Honorable Jackie Lacey	The Honorable Michael Ramos	The Honorable Eric Herylord Trinity County Obstrict Attorney
270 Laramie Street, PO BOX 248	Los Angeles County District Attorney 21   West Temple Street, Suite 1200	San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor	P.O. Box 310
Markleaville, CA 95120	Los Angeles, CA 96012	San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	Weaverville, CA 96093
The Honorable Todd Siebe	The Henorable David Unn	The Honorable Bonnie Ournanis	The Honorable Tim Ward
Amador County District Attorney	Madera County District Attorney	San Disgo County District Attorney	Tistere County District Attempty
708 Court Street	209 West Yosemite Avenue	330 W. Broadway Street	221 South Monney Boulevard, Rin 224
Jackson, CA 95642 The Handridde (Scheel Flemsay	Madera, CA 99697	San Diego, CA 92101	Visalia, CA 93291-4593 The Honorable Laura Krieg
Butte County Clairiet Attorney	The Hondrable Sovrard Berberlan	The Honorable George Gascon	Tudlumne County District Attorney
25 County Egnler Drive	Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Orivo, Room 130	San Francisco County District Attorney 850 Bryant Street, Room 322	429 North Washington Street
Oroville, CA 95965	San Ralgel, CA 94909	San Francisco, CA 94103	Золога, CA 95370
The Hendrable Barbera Yook	The Honorable Thomas Cooke	The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar	The Honorable Gregory Totten
Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Randa Road	Mariposa County District Attorney	San Joaquin County District Afterney	Ventura Gounty District Attorney
San Andreas, CA 95249	5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730	222 East Weber Avenue, Floom 202	800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009
The Honorable John Sounce	Marinosa, CA 95338	Stockton, CA 95201	The Hongable Jeff Reisig
Colusa County District Attorney	The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendocine County District Attorney	The Honorabla Can Dow San Luis Obispo County District Ally	Yolo County District Altorney
346 7 Inn Street	100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000	1035 Palm Street, 4th Floor	301 Second Sireel
Celusa, CA 95932	Ukiah, CA 95482	San Luis Obisoo, CA 93408	Woodland, CA 95695
The Honorable Mark Peterson Contra Costa County Olstrict Attorney	The Honorable Larry Morse II	The Honorable Slephen Wagstaffe	The Honorable Patrick McGrath
900 Ward Street	Merced County District Attorney 350 W. Main Street	San Maleo County District Altorney	Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fish Street
Marlinez, CA 94553	Merced, CA,95340	400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94069	Marusville, CA 95901
The Henombia Data Trian	The Honorable Jordan Funk	The Honorable Jayce Dudley	The Honorable Mike Fauer
Del Marto County District Attorney	Madec County District Attorney	Sania Barbara County District Attorney	Office of the City Altomey, Los Angeles
450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531	204 S. Court Street, Suite 202	1112 Santa Barbara Street	800 City Hall East
TOWNS TO STREET OF THE STREET	Alluras, CA 96101	Santa Barbara, CA 93101	200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012
The Honorable Vern Plerson	The Honorable Tim Kendall	The Honorable Jeffrey Rosen	The Florerable James Sanchez
El Ugrado County District Attorney	Mono County District Attorney	Santa Clara County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento
/ / O Patilla Street	P.O. Box 617	70 West Hedding Street, West Wing	915   Sireel, 4th Floor
Placerville, CA 95667	Bridgeport, CA 93517	San Jose, CA 95110	Sacramento, CA 95814
The Henomotile Lich Smitteamp Fresho County District Attorney	The Honorable Dean Plippo	The Honorable Jeff Rosell	The Honorable Jan Goldsmith Office of the City Altomey, San Diego
2220 Tulara Street, #1000	Monteray County District Attorney	Sanla Gruz County District Attorney	1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620
Meng. 08 99724	P.O. Box 1131 Salines, CA 93902	701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95050	San Diego, CA92101
The Honorable Commo Standard	The Honorable Allison Haley	The Honorable Slephen Carlion	1 The Hongrable Dennis Herrera
CHERT COUNTY DISTrict Attorney	Napa Gounty District Attorney	Shasta County District Attorney	Office of the Cily Altomey, San
P.U. Box 430	1127 First Street, Sulte C	1355 West Street	Francisco
Willows, CA 95988	Nape, GA 94559	Redding, CA 96001	1 Or. Carlton 8. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102
The Hongrable Maggle Fleming	The Moneyable Cities 1 1	1 The University Lawrence Street	The Honosphia Rightard Cavia
I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I	The Hongrable Olliford Newell Newada County District Attorney	The Honorable Lawrence Allen Sterra County District Attorney	Office of the City Allomey, San Jose
des ain augu, Fourth Floor	201 Commercial Street	100 Courthouse Square	200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor
Eureka, CA 95501	Nevada City, CA 95959	Downleville, CA 95996	San Jese, CA 95113
The Honorable Gibrert Otero	The Honorable Tony Rackauckas	The Honorable James Kirk Andrus	Office of the California Attorney Gener
imperial County Eistelet Attorney 940 West Main Street, Saile 102	Orange County District Attorney	Siskiyau County District Attorney	Proposition 66 Enforcement Reporting ATTM: Prop 66 Coordinator
El Centro, CA 92243	401 Civic Center Drive West	P.O. 80X 986	1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000
	Santa Ana, CA 92701	Yraka, CA 96097	Oakland, CA 94912-9950
The Honorable Thomas Hardy	The Honorable R. Soutt Owens	The Henerable Kilshna Abrems	1
inyo County District Attorney	Placer County District Atterney	Salano County District Attorney	1
P.O. Drawer D	10810 Justice Center Orive, Suite 240	675 Texas Street, Suite 4500	1
Independence, CA 99526 The Honorable Lisa Green	Roseville, CA 95675	Faidleld, CA 94593	
Kem County District Attorney	The Hongrable David Holflater	The Honorable Jill Playlon	1
1215 Custon America	Plumas County District Attorney	Senema County District Attorney	. 1
Bakerslield, CA 99301	520 Main Street, Hoom 404	600 Administration Orive, Room 212J	14
The Honorable Kaith Facundae	Quincy, CA 95971	Santa Rosa, CA 95403.	The state of the s
NINGS County Elistrics Attrices	The Honorable Michael Hestrin	The Honorable Birgit Fladager	F .
1400 Tyest Easty Boulevard	Riverside County District Attorney 3960 Orange Street	Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 13th Street, Suite 300	ł.
Hanford, CA 93230	Riverside, CA 92501	Modesto, CA 95354	
The Honorable Donald Anderson	The Henerable Anne Marie Schubert	The Honorable Amanda Hopper	
Lake County District Attorney	Sagramento County District Attorney	Sutter County District Afformey	1
	I aminima addition district withings		
ZSS North Forbes Street Lakeport CA 95453	901 G Street	463 Second Street, Suite 102	1

#### APPENDIX A

# OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and OEHHA implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information.

FOR INFORMATION CONCERNING THE BASIS FOR THE ALLEGATIONS IN THE NOTICE RELATED TO YOUR BUSINESS, CONTACT THE PERSON IDENTIFIED ON THE NOTICE.

The text of Proposition 65 (Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13) is available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65law72003.html. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 25102 through 27001.1 These implementing regulations are available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65Regs.html.

## WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

The "Proposition 65 List." Under Proposition 65, the lead agency (OEHHA) publishes a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or reproductive toxicity. Chemicals are placed on the Proposition 65 list if they are known to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, such as damage to

All further regulatory references are to sections of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations unless otherwise indicated. The statute, regulations and relevant case law are available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html.

female or male reproductive systems or to the developing fetus. This list must be updated at least once a year. The current Proposition 65 list of chemicals is available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65\_list/Newlist.html.

Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under Proposition 65.

Businesses that produce, use, release or otherwise engage in activities involving listed chemicals must comply with the following:

Clear and reasonable warnings. A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical unless an exemption applies. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed to that chemical. Some exposures are exempt from the warning requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

**Prohibition from discharges into drinking water.** A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Some discharges are exempt from this requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

### DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. You should consult the current version of the statute and regulations (http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html) to determine all applicable exemptions, the most common of which are the following:

Grace Period. Proposition 65 warning requirements do not apply until 12 months after the chemical has been listed. The Proposition 65 discharge prohibition does not apply to a discharge or release of a chemical that takes place less than 20 months after the listing of the chemical.

Governmental agencies and public water utilities. All agencies of the federal, state or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

**Businesses with nine or fewer employees.** Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employs a total of nine or fewer employees. This includes all employees, not just those present in California.

Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer. For chemicals that are listed under Proposition 65 as known to the State to cause cancer, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "No Significant Risk Levels" (NSRLs) for many listed carcinogens. Exposures below these levels are exempt from the warning requirement. See OEHHA's website at:

http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of NSRLs, and Section 25701 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question. For chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level" divided by 1,000. This number is known as the Maximum Allowable Dose Level (MADL). See OEHHA's website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of MADLs, and Section 25801 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated

**Exposures to Naturally Occurring Chemicals in Food.** Certain exposures to chemicals that naturally occur in foods (i.e., that do not result from any known human activity, including activity by someone other than the person causing the exposure) are exempt from the warning requirements of the law. If the chemical is a contaminant<sup>2</sup> it must be reduced to the lowest level feasible. Regulations explaining this exemption can be found in Section 25501.

Discharges that do not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering any source of drinking water. The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the listed chemical has not, does not, or will not pass into or probably pass into a source of drinking water, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" level for chemicals that cause cancer or that is 1,000 times below the "no observable effect" level for chemicals that cause reproductive toxicity, if an individual were exposed to that amount in drinking water.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Section 25501(a)(4).

### HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys. Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. The notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in Section 25903 of Title 27 and sections 3100-3103 of Title 11. A private party may not pursue an independent enforcement action under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an enforcement action within sixty days of the notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court to stop committing the violation.

A private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. For the following types of exposures, the Act provides an opportunity for the business to correct the alleged violation:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared
  and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for
  immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was
  not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar
  preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or
  beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure
  occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily
  intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

If a private party alleges that a violation occurred based on one of the exposures described above, the private party must first provide the alleged violator a notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form.

A copy of the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form is included in Appendix B and can be downloaded from OEHHA's website at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/p65law72003.html.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.

#### APPENDIX B

## OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE

This Appendix B contains the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). Under the Act, a private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. These exposures are:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

A private party may not file an action against the alleged violator for these exposures, or recover in a settlement any payment in lieu of penalties any reimbursement for costs and attorney's fees, if the alleged violator has done all of the following within 14 days of being served notice:

- Corrected the alleged violation;
- Agreed to pay a civil penalty of \$500 (subject to change in 2019 and every five years thereafter) to the private party within 30 days; and

Notified the private party serving the notice in writing that the violation has been corrected.

An alleged violator may satisfy these conditions only one time for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility or on the same premises. The satisfaction of these conditions does not prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney of a city of greater than 750,000 population, or any full-time city prosecutor with the consent of the district attorney, from filling an enforcement action against an alleged violator.

When a private party sends a notice of alleged violation that alleges one or more of the exposures listed above, the notice must include a notice of special compliance procedure, and a proof of compliance form to be completed by the alleged violator as directed in the notice.

The notice and proof of compliance form is reproduced here:

Date:

Page 1

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

# SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE PROOF OF COMPLIANCE

You are receiving this form because the Noticing Party listed above has alleged that you are violating California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 (Prop. 65).

The Noticing Party may <u>not</u> bring any legal proceedings against you for the alleged violation checked below if:

- (1) You have actually taken the corrective steps that you have certified in this form.
- (2) The Noticing Party has received this form at the address shown above, accurately completed by you, postmarked within 14 days of your receiving this notice.
- (3) The Noticing Party receives the required \$500 penalty payment from you at the address shown above postmarked within 30 days of your receiving this notice.
- (4) This is the first time you have submitted a Proof of Compliance for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility on the same premises.

# PART 1: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE NOTICING PARTY OR ATTORNEY FOR THE NOTICING PARTY

The alleged violation is for an exposure to: (check one)

Alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent on-site consumption is permitted by law.	
A chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises for immediate consumption on or off premises to the extent: (1) the chemical was not intentionally added; and (2) the chemical was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination.	
Environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises.	
Chemicals known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking poncommercial vehicles.	

### IMPORTANT NOTES:

(1) You have no potential liability under California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 if your business has nine (9) or fewer employees.

(2) Using this form will NOT prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney, or a prosecutor in whose jurisdiction the violation is alleged to have occurred from filing an action over the same alleged violations, and that in any such action, the amount of civil penalty shall be reduced to reflect any payment made at this time.

Date:

Page 2

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

# PART 2: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE ALLEGED VIOLATOR OR AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE

Certification of Compliance

Accurate completion of this form will demonstrate that you are now in compliance with California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 for the alleged violation listed above. You must complete and submit the form below to the Noticing Party at the address shown above, postmarked within 14 days of you receiving this notice.

I hereby agree to pay, within 30 days of completion of this notice, a civil penalty of \$500 to the Noticing Party only and certify that I have complied with Health and Safety Code \$25249.6 by (check only one of the following):

[] Posting a warning or warnings about the alleged exposure that complies with the law, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; [] Posting the warning or warnings demanded in writing by the Noticing Party, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; OR [] Eliminating the alleged exposure, and attaching a statement accurately describing how the alleged exposure has been eliminated.
My statements on this form, and on any attachments to it, are true, complete, and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and are made in good faith. I have carefully read the instructions to complete this form. I understand that if I make a false
statement on this form, I may be subject to additional penalties under the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65).
Signature of alleged violator or authorized representative Date
Name and title of signatory

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.