# LAW OFFICES BRODSKY SMITH

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE, 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877,534,2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977

PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

#### September 29, 2023

Member/Manager	Member/Manager/Owner	
Sabik, LLC	Swiss Safe Products, LLC	
c/o Corporation Service Company	c/o LegalForce RAPC Worldwide	
251 Little Falls Drive	446 E. Southern Ave.	
Wilmington, DE 19808	Tempe, AZ 85282	
President/CEO	President/CEO	
Sierra Trading Post, Inc.	Sierra Trading Post, Inc.	
c/o CT Corporation System	c/o CT Corporation System	
155 Federal St., Suite 700	2232 Deli Range Blvd., Suite 200	
Boston, MA 02110	Cheyenne, WY 82009	
President/CEO	President/CEO	
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc. dba Sierra	
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Trust Company	
Corporation Trust Center	Corporation Trust Center	
1209 Orange Street	1209 Orange Street	
Wilmington, DE 19801	Wilmington, DE 19801	

### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Gabriel Espinoza ("Espinoza"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Espinoza has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

#### I. <u>DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION</u>

- Enforcer: Gabriel Espinoza, 3924 Carlin Ave., Lynwood, CA 90262-5204; (Ph) 424-285-4896.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): Sabik, LLC; Swiss Safe Products, LLC; Sierra Trading Post, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc.; The TJX Companies, Inc. dba Sierra
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least September 29, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
- **4. Listed Chemical**: Di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP). DEHP is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
First Aid Kit	Swiss Safe Premium First Aid Kit – 200 pc.
	X001ETZ1XX

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

#### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

#### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Espinoza against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Espinoza's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

these violations of California law quickly rectified, Espinoza is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Espinoza has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

#### I, Evan J. Smith, hereby declare:

- (1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- (2) I am the attorney for the noticing party, Gabriel Espinoza.
- (3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- (4) Based on the information obtained through these consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator(s) will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- (5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: September 29, 2023

Evan J. Smith

Attorney for Gabriel Espinoza

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within action. My business address is 2 Bala Plaza, Suite 805, Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania. I am employed in Montgomery County where the mailing occurred.

On September 29, 2023 I served the following documents: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary on the following entities and individuals listed below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Member/Manager	Member/Manager/Owner	
Sabik, LLC	Swiss Safe Products, LLC	
c/o Corporation Service Company	c/o LegalForce RAPC Worldwide	
251 Little Falls Drive	446 E. Southern Ave.	
Wilmington, DE 19808	Tempe, AZ 85282	
President/CEO	President/CEO	
Sierra Trading Post, Inc.	Sierra Trading Post, Inc.	
c/o CT Corporation System	c/o CT Corporation System	
155 Federal St., Suite 700	2232 Deli Range Blvd., Suite 200	
Boston, MA 02110	Cheyenne, WY 82009	
President/CEO	President/CEO	
The TJX Companies, Inc.	The TJX Companies, Inc. dba Sierra	
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Trust Company	
Corporation Trust Center	Corporation Trust Center	
1209 Orange Street	1209 Orange Street	
Wilmington, DE 19801	Wilmington, DE 19801	

On September 29, 2023, I served the following documents: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary on each of the individuals on the service list attached hereto as Appendix B by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed September 29, 2023, in Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania.

Evan J. Smith

Alameda County District Attorney 7775 Oskport Street, Suite 650 Oskland, CA 94621 CEPPP np05@acsiv.org	The Romenthic Tori Verbur Saizer San Josepha Councy Diseriet Automoy 222 E. Weber Averbue, Roma 202 Stacklan, CA. ISINZ BACONSPINCE Envisormental (Osioda ong	Stonorable Anne Marie Schubert Sammento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sagramento, CA 95814 Proposioscoda.org
The Honorable Allison Haley Napa County District Attorney 1127 First St., Suite C Napa, CA 94559	The fonorable Jeffrey S. Rosell Santa Cruz County District Attorney 201 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060	The Honorable Summer Stephan San Diego County District Attendey 300 West Broadway San Diego, CA 92101
CEPD@countyofnapa.ocg	Propins DA disposacione country us	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
The Honorable Jeff W. Reisig Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street	Midtella Latikner, Program Coordinator Lassen County	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney City of San Diego
Woodland, CA 95695	220 S. Lassen Street Susasville, CA 96130	1200 Third Avenue San Disgo, CA 92101
Bud Porter	minimus@co. hissen_co. 50	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 W Hedding Street	Aleibez M. Sargent Assistant District Attorney San Francisco District Attorney's Office	Christopher Dalbey Deputy District Attorney Same Barbara County
Sen Jose, CA 95110	350 Rhode Island Street San Francisco, CA 94103 Interior, sanganions are vices	1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101
The Honorable Gregory D. Totten,	The Honorable Barbara Yook	DAPrepos Goo santa-barbara ca us Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attomey
Ventura County District Attorney 800 S Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009	Calarguas County District Attorney 831 Mountain Ranch Road	Office of the City Attorney 1390 Market Street. 7th Flour
daspecialops@ventura.org	Son Andreas, CA 95249	San Francisco, CA 94102
Stacey Grassini	Ptenssany@co.calayegas.ca.us	Valenie Lapez@afcityatty.org
Deputy District Attorney	Este J. Dobroth	Demnine M. Pacioni
Contra Costa County	Deputy District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney
100 Ward Street	San Luis Obispo County	Monterey County
Aartinez, CA 94553	County Govt Center Armex, 4" Floor	2200 Aguajito Road
Sessitisi@contracostada.org	Sas Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Monterey, CA 93940
he Honorable Thomas Hardy	são iro sholtro, são, ca, es	Prop65DA@co.moraercy.ca.us
No County District Attorney	The Reguesable Phillip J. Chine	The Honosphe Clifford Newell
18 M. Edwards Street	Tolore County District Assuracy	Nevada County District Attorney
Espensionee CA 03526	221 S Mooney Blvd	201 Commercial Street
V2020 MR40COUNTY US	Visulia, CA 95370	Nevada City, CA 95959
ie Flonorable Paul E. Zellerbeck	Francis (Day aulars, ca. us	DA Psopfileso nevadu ca us
Processed Country District A +	The Honorable Stephan Passalacqua	The Honorable David Hollister
VE VIEDES Street	Samme County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney
verside CA 92501	300 Administration Drive	20 Main Street, Room 404
und miveda.org	Source, CA 95403	Quincy, CA 95971
Honorable Walter W Wall	ibners (desonvene-county.org	davidhollissen@countyofplumus.com
Paragonal District Attorney	The Henombie Kimberly Lewis	I he Honorable Morgan Briggs Circ
Box 730	Microsof Country District Atterney	Placer County District Attomay
Winosa CA 95338	330 West Main Street	10810 Justice Center Drive
26 marinden	Mercod, CA 95340	Roseville, CA 95678
Ma@muringsuccenty.org	Psypos@spuntyofms.ccd,com	pros65@placer.ca,gov
AE Santa Class St. Attorney	Lisa A. Smilleanna, Dispriet Attorney	
C. Gama Clara Street Late Class	2 i 00 Telarc Street	
Jose, CA 96113	Fresne, CA 93721	1
position65notices@empeseca.gov	sonsumerosofcarionalidrosoccentuca gr	

# ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST

Office of the California Attorney General
Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting
ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator
P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
https://oog.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-actice

# SERVICE LIST

The Honocatile Namey O'Malkey Alameda County District Atterney 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612	The Honorable Stacey Montgomery Lassen County District Attorney 220 South Lassen Street, Sta. 8 Susanville, CA 98130	The Honorable Candios Mooper San Banko County District Altomay 419 4th Street, Second Floor Hollister, CA 95203	The Honorable Grego Cohen Tehama County District Attorney 444 Oak Streat, Room L Red Stuff, CA 96080
The Hendrable Terese Orabec Alpine County District Attorney 270 Laranie Street, PO BOX 248 Marklesville, OA 98120	The Hongrable Jackie Lacey Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012	The Honarable Michael Flamos San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	The Honorable Edic Herylard Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 98093
The Honorabia Todd Riebe Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95542	The Henorable Bavid Linn Madera County District Attorney 208 West Yosamite Avanua Madera, CA 98697	The Honorable Sounie Durmants San Ologo County District Attorney 330 W. Broadway Street San Diego, GA 92101	The Honorable Tim Ward Tulare County District Altomey 221 South Mooney Soulevard, Rm 224 Visulia, CA 9221-9533
The Honorable Michael Plantsay Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Orive Oroville, CA 95965	The Honorable Yournet Belbestan Marin County Clarifot Attorney 3501 Civic Center Orive, Room 130 San Ratael, CA 94803	The Honorable George Gascon San Francisco Gounly District Attorney 650 Gryant Sirest, Room 322 San Francisco, CA 94103	The Honorable Caura Kideg Tuolumne County Olerica Attorney 429 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95970
The Honorable Sarbers Yook Calayeass County District Attorney 99! Mountain Randa Road San Andreas, CA 95249 The Konorable John Poyner Collega County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street	The Honorable Thomas Cooke Marigasa Caunty District Attorney 5101 Jones Sireat, P.O. Box 730 Marigosa, CA 95338 The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendacino Caunty District Attorney 100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000	The Handrable Ten Verber Salazzar San Jeaquin County District Aftorney 222 East Weber Avenue, Floorn 202 Stockton, Ay 52601 The Romatofe Dan Dow San Luis Obiego Gounty District Alty 1036 Pain Street, 4th Floor	The Honorable Gragery Totten Ventura County Clathick Attorney 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93999 The Honorable Jeff Reisig Yolo County Olstrick Altorney 301 Second Streel
Colusa, CA 35332 The Koncrable Mark Paterson Contra Costa County District Atlorney 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 34553	Ukiah, CA 95482 The Floorable Larry Morse I) Merced County District Attorney 350 W. Main Street	San Luis Chisao, CA 93498 The Henerable Slephen Wagstaffe San Maleo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor	Woodland, CA \$59\$5 The Honerable Patrick McGrath Yuba County Olstrict Attorney 215 Filth Street
The Honorable Dale Trigg Del Marte Gaunty District Attorney (30) H Street, Room 171 Cruscent City, CA 95531	Merged, CA 95340 The Honorable Jordan Funk Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101	Redwood City, Ca 34083 The Ronoreoffs Joyce Dudley Santa Bashara County District Aktomey 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 33101	Maryavilla, CA 55901 The Honorable Millio Feuer Office of the City Attorney, Las Angeles 800 City Hall East 200 North Main Street
The Honorable Vern Pierson El Darade Gounty District Attorney 778 Padillo Street Placarville, CA 93667	The Honorable Tim Kendall Mone County Olatrist Attorney P.O. Box 617 Gridgeport, CA 98517	The Honorable Joffrey Rosen Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 Wast Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 951 10	Lea Angeles, CA 98012 The Honorable James Sanchez Office of the City Altomey, Sacramento 915 I Sheet, 4th Ploor Sacramento, CA 95814
the Handroble Lina Smittanno resno County District Attorney 220 Tutare Street, #1000 resno, Or 89721 the Hondroble Dwayne Stewart	The Honorable Oean Plippo Monteray County District Altorney P.O. Sox 1131 Salines, CA \$8502	The Honorable Jeff Resell Santa Gruz Caenly District Attorney 701 Ossan Street, Room 200 Santa Gruz, CA 95060	The Honorable Jan Goldsmith Office of the City Attorney, San Olego 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1520 San Diego, CA 92101
P.O. Box 430 Williams, CA 95988	The Honorable Allison Haley Napa Gounty District Attorney 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559	The Honorable Stephen Cartion Shasta County District Attorney 1355 Wast Street Redding, CA 96001	The Hangshie Dennis Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco 1 Or. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, QA 34102
he Hongrable Maggle Freming lunwoldt County Blattot Attorney 195 ath ateat, Fourth Plac/ Lunka, CA 95561	The Honorable Olifford Nevvell Nevada County Bistilot Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, OA 95959	The Honorable Lawrence Alten Sleria Coupity District Attosney 100 Cousthouse Square Downleyille, CA 95936	The Honorable Plohard Doyle Office of the City Altomey, San Jose 200 East Sante Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 96113
The Monarchite Gigbert Steep mperial Returnty Chalatet Attorney 1400 West Main Steet, Suite 102 El Gentro, CA 92249	The Manorable Tony Rackauckas Orange Gounty District Attorney 401 Givic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701	The Honorable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyoù County District Attorney P.O. 80x 966 Yrska, CA 96097	Office of the California Attorney General Proposition of Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop So Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, OA 94912-9590
he Honorable Thomas Hardy nyo County District Altorney 'O. Drawer D ndspendence, CA 93926 The Honorable Lisa Green	The Honorable R. Scott Owens Placer County District Atterney 10810 Justice Center Orive, Suite 240 Reseville, CA 95678	The Honorable Kilshina Abrems Sulano County Olstvict Attorney 675 Texas Sireat, Sulte 4500 Fairlield, CA 94533	
in runoratie Lisa Green dam County District Attorney 215 Truxtun Avenue lakersileid, CA 93001 Tie Honorable Kelih Fagundas	The Honorable David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Guincy, CA 95971	The Honorable JIII Flavitoh Senoma County District Astorney 600 Administration Osive, Floora 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95408.	
fings County Relin Fagurdas fings County Ristint Attorney 400 West tateay Goulevard fanford, CA 99230 he Honorable Donald Anderson	The Honorable Michael Hastrin Alverside County Dietrict Attorney 3950 Orange Street Alverside, CA 92501	The Honorable Blight Fladager Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354	
ake County District Attorney 155 North Forbes Street aksport CA 95453	The Hundrable Anne Marie Schubert Sagramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sagramento CA 95814	The Hendrattle Amanda Hopper Suller County District Attorney 463 Second Street, Sulte 102 Yuba City CA 95991	

#### APPENDIX A

# OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and OEHHA implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information.

FOR INFORMATION CONCERNING THE BASIS FOR THE ALLEGATIONS IN THE NOTICE RELATED TO YOUR BUSINESS, CONTACT THE PERSON IDENTIFIED ON THE NOTICE.

The text of Proposition 65 (Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13) is available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65law72003.html. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 25102 through 27001.1 These implementing regulations are available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65Regs.html.

# WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

The "Proposition 65 List." Under Proposition 65, the lead agency (OEHHA) publishes a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or reproductive toxicity. Chemicals are placed on the Proposition 65 list if they are known to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, such as damage to

All further regulatory references are to sections of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations unless otherwise indicated. The statute, regulations and relevant case law are available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html.

female or male reproductive systems or to the developing fetus. This list must be updated at least once a year. The current Proposition 65 list of chemicals is available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65\_list/Newlist.html.

Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under Proposition 65. Businesses that produce, use, release or otherwise engage in activities involving listed chemicals must comply with the following:

Clear and reasonable warnings. A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical unless an exemption applies. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed to that chemical. Some exposures are exempt from the warning requirement under certain circumstances discussed below

Prohibition from discharges into drinking water. A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Some discharges are exempt from this requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

# DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. You should consult the current version of the statute and regulations (http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html) to determine all applicable exemptions, the most common of which are the following:

Grace Period. Proposition 65 warning requirements do not apply until 12 months after the chemical has been listed. The Proposition 65 discharge prohibition does not apply to a discharge or release of a chemical that takes place less than 20 months after the listing of the chemical.

Governmental agencies and public water utilities. All agencies of the federal, state or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

Businesses with nine or fewer employees. Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employe a total of nine or fewer employees. This includes all employees, not just those present in California.

Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer. For chemicals that are listed under Proposition 65 as known to the State to cause cancer, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "No Significant Risk Levels" (NSRLs) for many listed carcinogens. Exposures below these levels are exempt from the warning requirement. See OEHHA's website at:

http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of NSRLs, and Section 25701 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question. For chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level" divided by 1,000. This number is known as the Maximum Allowable Dose Level (MADL). See OEHHA's website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of MADLs, and Section 25801 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures to Naturally Occurring Chemicals in Food. Certain exposures to chemicals that naturally occur in foods (i.e., that do not result from any known human activity, including activity by someone other than the person causing the exposure) are exempt from the warning requirements of the law. If the chemical is a contaminant<sup>2</sup> it must be reduced to the lowest level feasible. Regulations explaining this exemption can be found in Section 25501.

Discharges that do not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering any source of drinking water. The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the listed chemical has not, does not, or will not pass into or probably pass into a source of drinking water, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" level for chemicals that cause cancer or that is 1,000 times below the "no observable effect" level for chemicals that cause reproductive toxicity, if an individual were exposed to that amount in drinking water.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Section 25501(a)(4).

### HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys. Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. The notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in Section 25903 of Title 27 and sections 3100-3103 of Title 11. A private party may not pursue an independent enforcement action under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an enforcement action within sixty days of the notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court to stop committing the violation.

A private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. For the following types of exposures, the Act provides an opportunity for the business to correct the alleged violation:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure
  occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily
  intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

If a private party alleges that a violation occurred based on one of the exposures described above, the private party must first provide the alleged violator a notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form.

A copy of the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form is included in Appendix B and can be downloaded from OEHHA's website at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/p65law72003.html.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.

#### APPENDIX B

# OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE

This Appendix B contains the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). Under the Act, a private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. These exposures are:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

A private party may not file an action against the alleged violator for these exposures, or recover in a settlement any payment in lieu of penalties any reimbursement for costs and attorney's fees, if the alleged violator has done all of the following within 14 days of being served notice:

- Corrected the alleged violation;
- Agreed to pay a civil penalty of \$500 (subject to change in 2019 and every five years thereafter) to the private party within 30 days; and

 Notified the private party serving the notice in writing that the violation has been corrected.

An alleged violator may satisfy these conditions only one time for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility or on the same premises. The satisfaction of these conditions does not prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney of a city of greater than 750,000 population, or any full-time city prosecutor with the consent of the district attorney, from filing an enforcement action against an alleged violator

When a private party sends a notice of alleged violation that alleges one or more of the exposures listed above, the notice must include a notice of special compliance procedure, and a proof of compliance form to be completed by the alleged violator as directed in the notice.

The notice and proof of compliance form is reproduced here:

Date

Page 1

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

### SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE PROOF OF COMPLIANCE

You are receiving this form because the Noticing Party listed above has alleged that you are violating California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 (Prop. 65).

The Noticing Party may not bring any legal proceedings against you for the alleged violation checked below if:

- (1) You have actually taken the corrective steps that you have certified in this
- (2) The Noticing Party has received this form at the address shown above, accurately completed by you, postmarked within 14 days of your receiving this notice.
- (3) The Noticing Party receives the required \$500 penalty payment from you at the address shown above postmarked within 30 days of your receiving this notice.
- (4) This is the first time you have submitted a Proof of Compliance for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility on the same premises.

# PART 1: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE NOTICING PARTY OR ATTORNEY FOR THE NOTICING PARTY

The alleged violation is for an exposure to: (check one)

Alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent on-site consumption is permitted by law.
A chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises for immediate consumption on or off premises to the extent: (1) the chemical was not intentionally added; and (2) the chemical was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination.
Environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises.
Chemicals known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking noncommercial vehicles.

# IMPORTANT NOTES:

(1) You have no potential liability under California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 if your business has nine (9) or fewer employees.

(2) Using this form will NOT prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney, or a prosecutor in whose jurisdiction the violation is alleged to have occurred from filing an action over the same alleged violations, and that in any such action, the amount of civil penalty shall be reduced to reflect any payment made at this time.

Date:

Page 2

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

### PART 2: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE ALLEGED VIOLATOR OR AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE

Certification of Compliance

Accurate completion of this form will demonstrate that you are now in compliance with California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 for the alleged violation listed above. You must complete and submit the form below to the Noticing Party at the address shown above, postmarked within 14 days of you receiving this notice.

I hereby agree to pay, within 30 days of completion of this notice, a civil penalty of \$500 to the Noticing Party only and certify that I have complied with Health and Safety Code §25249.6 by (check only one of the following):

[] Posting a warning or warnings about the alleged exposure that complies with the law, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; [] Posting the warning or warnings demanded in writing by the Noticing Party, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; OR [] Eliminating the alleged exposure, and attaching a statement accurately describing how the alleged exposure has been eliminated.
My statements on this form, and on any attachments to it, are true, complete, and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and are made in good faith. I have carefully read the instructions to complete this form. I understand that if I make a false statement on this form, I may be subject to additional penalties under the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65).
Signature of alleged violator or authorized representative Date
Name and title of signatory
FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.