

## NOTICE OF VIOLATION

### California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

Coconut Oil Diethanolamine Condensate (Cocamide DEA) in Liquid Soaps such as Hand Soap and Body Wash

October 25, 2023

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d).

- For general information regarding the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, see the attached summary provided by the California EPA (copies not provided to public enforcement agencies).
- This Notice is provided by the Center for Environmental Health ("CEH"), 2201 Broadway, Suite 508, Oakland, CA 94612, (510) 655-3900. CEH is a nonprofit corporation dedicated to protecting the environment, improving human health, and supporting environmentally sound practices. Kaya Allan Sugerman is the Illegal Toxic Threats Program Director of and a responsible individual within CEH.

#### Description of Violation:

- Violators: The names and addresses of the violators are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- Time Period of Exposure: The violations have been occurring since at least October 25, 2020, are continuing to this day and will continue to occur as long as the products subject to this Notice are sold to and used by California consumers.
- Provision of Proposition 65: This Notice covers the "warning provision" of Proposition 65, which is found at California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6.
- Chemical(s) Involved: The name of the listed chemical involved in these violations is coconut oil diethanolamine condensate ("Cocamide DEA").
- Type of Product: The specific type of product causing these violations are liquid soaps such as hand soap and body wash. Non-exclusive examples of these types of products are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- Description of Exposure: This Notice addresses consumer exposures to Cocamide DEA. Use of the products identified in this Notice results in human exposures to Cocamide DEA. The products contain Cocamide DEA as an intentionally added ingredient. The routes of exposure for the violations include dermal absorption and ingestion by consumers. These exposures occur through

the reasonably foreseeable use of the products when, for example, individuals apply the products to their skin. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the exposures to Cocamide DEA caused by ordinary use of the soap.

**Resolution of Noticed Claims:**

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, CEH intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the alleged violators unless such violators agree in a binding written instrument to: (1) recall products already sold; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the Cocamide DEA exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(b). If the alleged violators are interested in resolving this dispute without resort to expensive and time-consuming litigation, please feel free to contact CEH through its counsel identified below. It should be noted that CEH cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received CEH's 60-day Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with CEH will resolve its claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

**Preservation of Relevant Evidence:**

This Notice also serves as a demand that the alleged violators preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of Cocamide DEA in liquid soaps, including hand soap and body wash; purchase and sales information for such products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to such products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of Cocamide DEA in such products; and representative exemplars of each of the products sold by the alleged violators in the year preceding this Notice through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

Please direct any inquiries regarding this Notice to CEH's counsel, Patrick Carey, at Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117, (415) 913-7800, [pcarey@lexlawgroup.com](mailto:pcarey@lexlawgroup.com).

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**  
**Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)**

I, Patrick Carey, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney at Lexington Law Group, LLP, and I represent the noticing party, the Center for Environmental Health.

3. Members of my firm and I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that “reasonable and meritorious case for the private action” means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff’s case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of the Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

October 25, 2023



---

Patrick Carey  
Attorney for CENTER FOR  
ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

**EXHIBIT 1**  
**October 25, 2023 Notice of Violation**  
**Cocamide DEA in Liquid Soaps**  
**Such as Hand Soap and Body Wash**

Names and Addresses of Responsible Parties	Non-Exclusive Examples of the Products	SKU or Further Description
<p><b>The Clorox Company</b>  1221 Broadway  Oakland, CA 94612</p> <p><b>Brand Buzz, LLC</b>  1407 Broadway, Suite 601  New York, NY 10018</p>	<p>Clorox Fraganzia Hand Soap,  Spring Scent</p>	<p>UPC: 742797878386</p>
<p><b>Industrias Lavin de Mexico S.A. de C.V.</b>  C.I.V.A.C., Calle 9  Este No. 24 Jiutepec, Morelos  Mexico C.P.62578</p> <p><b>Family Dollar, LLC</b>  500 Volvo Parkway  Chesapeake, VA 22320</p>	<p>Nuvel Pink Grapefruit  Moisturizing Body Wash</p>	<p>SKU: 2097022</p>
<p><b>Industrias Lavin de Mexico S.A. de C.V.</b>  C.I.V.A.C., Calle 9  Este No. 24 Jiutepec, Morelos  Mexico C.P.62578</p>	<p>Nuvel Fresh Peach Hand Soap</p>	<p>UPC: 710632240124</p>

1 **PROOF OF SERVICE**

2 I, Star Beltman, declare:

3 I am a citizen of the United States and employed in the County of San Francisco, State of  
4 California. I am over the age of eighteen (18) years and not a party to this action. My business  
5 address is 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117 and my email address is  
sbeltman@lexlawgroup.com.

6 On October 25, 2023, I served the following document(s) on all interested parties in this  
7 action by placing a true copy thereof in the manner and at the addresses indicated below:

8 **NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND  
TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT;**

9 **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT;** and

10 **THE SAFE DRINKING AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986**  
11 **(PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY** (only sent to those on service list marked with an  
asterisk).

12  **BY MAIL:** I am readily familiar with the firm's practice for collecting and processing mail  
13 with the United States Postal Service ("USPS"). Under that practice, mail would be deposited  
14 with USPS that same day with postage thereon fully prepaid at San Francisco, California in the  
ordinary course of business. On this date, I placed sealed envelopes containing the above  
mentioned documents for collection and mailing following my firm's ordinary business practices.

15 *Please see attached service list.*

16  **BY ELECTRONIC MAIL:** I transmitted a PDF version of the document(s) listed above via  
17 email to the email address(es) indicated on the attached service list [or noted above] before 5 p.m.  
on the date executed.

18 Pamela Y. Price, Alameda District Attorney  
7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650  
19 Oakland, CA 94621  
CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Lisa A. Smittcamp, Fresno District Attorney  
2100 Tulare Street  
Fresno, CA 93721  
consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov

20 Barbara Yook, Calaveras District Attorney  
891 Mountain Ranch Rd.  
21 San Andreas, CA 95249  
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

Thomas L. Hardy, Inyo District Attorney  
168 North Edwards Street  
Independence, CA 93526  
inyoda@inyocounty.us

22 Stacey Grassini, Contra Costa Deputy  
23 District Attorney  
900 Ward Street  
24 Martinez, CA 94553  
sgrassini@contracostada.org

Devin Chandler, Lassen Program  
Coordinator  
2950 Riverside Dr  
Susanville, CA 96130  
dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us

25 James Clinchard, El Dorado Assistant  
26 District Attorney  
778 Pacific Street  
27 Placerville, CA 95667  
EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us

Lori E. Frugoli, Marin District Attorney  
3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 145  
San Rafael, CA 94903  
consumer@marincounty.org

1	Walter W. Wall, Mariposa District Attorney P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org	Mark Ankcorn, San Diego Deputy City Attorney 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
2		
3	Kimberly Lewis, Merced District Attorney 550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofmerced.com	Henry Lifton, San Francisco Deputy City Attorney 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor San Francisco, CA 94102 Prop65@sfcityatty.org
4		
5	Jeannine M. Pacioni, Monterey District Attorney 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us	Alexandra Grayner, San Francisco Assistant District Attorney 350 Rhode Island Street San Francisco, CA 94103 alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org
6		
7	Allison Haley, Napa District Attorney 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Tori Verber Salazar, San Joaquin District Attorney 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org
8		
9	Clifford H. Newell, Nevada District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959 DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us	Eric J. Dobroth, San Luis Obispo Deputy District Attorney County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
10		
11	Morgan Briggs Gire, Placer District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov	Christopher Dalbey, Santa Barbara Deputy District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara St. Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
12		
13	David Hollister, Plumas District Attorney 520 Main St. Quincy, CA 95971 davidhollister@countyofplumas.com	Nora V. Frimann, Santa Clara City Attorney 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 96113 Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov
14		
15	Paul E. Zellerbach, Riverside District Attorney 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org	Bud Porter, Supervising Santa Clara, Deputy District Attorney 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org
16		
17	Anne Marie Schubert, Sacramento District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org	Jeffrey S. Rosell, Santa Cruz District Attorney 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us
18		
19	Summer Stephan, San Diego District Attorney 330 West Broadway San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdacda.org	
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

1 Jill Ravitch, Sonoma District Attorney  
600 Administration Drive  
2 Santa Rosa, CA 95403  
Jeannie.Barnes@sonoma-county.org  
3

4 Phillip J. Cline, Tulare District Attorney  
221 S Mooney Blvd  
Visalia, CA 95370  
5 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us  
6

Gregory D. Totten, Ventura District  
Attorney  
800 S Victoria Ave  
Ventura, CA 93009  
daspecialops@ventura.org

Jeff W. Reisig, Yolo District Attorney  
301 Second Street  
Woodland, CA 95695  
cfepd@yolocounty.org

7  
8 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the  
foregoing is true and correct.

9 Executed on October 25, 2023 at San Francisco, California.

10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28



---

Star Beltman

## SERVICE LIST

District Attorney of Alpine County  
P.O. Box 248  
Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney of Amador County  
708 Court Street, Ste. 202  
Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney of Butte County  
Administration Building  
25 County Center Drive, Suite 245  
Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney of Colusa County  
310 6th Street  
Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney of Del Norte County  
450 H Street, Ste. 171  
Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney of El Dorado County  
778 Pacific Street  
Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney of Glenn County  
P.O. Box 430  
Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney of Humboldt County  
825 5th Street  
Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney of Imperial County  
939 Main Street, Ste. 102  
El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney of Kern County  
1215 Truxtun Avenue  
Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney of Kings County  
1400 West Lacey Blvd.  
Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney of Lake County  
375 3rd Street  
Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney of Los Angeles County  
211 W. Temple Street, Ste. 1200  
Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210

District Attorney of Madera County  
300 South G Street, Suite 300,  
Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney of Marin County  
3501 Civic Center Drive, Ste 145  
San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney of Mendocino County  
P.O. Box 1000  
Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney of Modoc County  
204 S. Court Street, Suite 202  
Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney of Mono County  
P.O. Box 2053  
Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546

District Attorney of Orange County  
300 N Flower Street  
Santa Ana, CA 92703

District Attorney of San Benito County  
419 Fourth Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Fl.  
Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney of San Bernardino County  
303 West 3rd Street  
San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502

District Attorney of San Mateo County  
400 County Center, 3<sup>rd</sup> Fl.  
Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney of Shasta County  
1355 West Street  
Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney of Sierra County  
P.O. Box 457  
Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney of Siskiyou County  
311 Fourth Street, Room 204  
Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney of Solano County  
675 Texas Street, Ste. 4500  
Fairfield, CA 94533



District Attorney of Stanislaus County  
832 12th Street, Ste. 300  
Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney of Sutter County  
463 2nd Street, Suite 102  
Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney of Tehama County  
444 Oak Street, Room L  
Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney of Trinity County  
P.O. Box 310  
11 Court Street  
Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney of Tuolumne County  
423 North Washington Street  
Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney of Yuba County  
215 Fifth Street, Suite 152  
Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office  
City Hall East  
200 N. Main Street, Rm. 800  
Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Jose City Attorney's Office  
200 East Santa Clara Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Jose, CA 95113

Linda Rendle, CEO\*  
The Clorox Company  
1221 Broadway  
Oakland, CA 94612

Steven Shweky, CEO\*  
Brand Buzz, LLC  
1407 Broadway, Suite 601  
New York, NY 10018

President/CEO\*  
Family Dollar, LLC  
500 Volvo Parkway  
Chesapeake, VA 23320

Luis Lavin Castañeda, CEO\*  
Industrias Lavin de Mexico S.A. de C.V.  
C.I.V.A.C., Calle 9  
Este No. 24 Jiutepec, Morelos Mexico C.P.62578