# SIXTY-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION

#### SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)

**DATE:** November 2, 2023

To: Alibaba Group Holding Ltd – Chief Executive Officer
Alibaba Group (U.S.) Inc. – Chief Executive Officer
California Attorney General's Office;
District Attorneys and Certain City Attorneys Throughout California

**FROM:** Jay Epps

My name is Jay Epps. I am a citizen of the State of California acting in furtherance of the public interest. I seek to promote awareness of exposures to certain toxic chemicals in products sold in California and, if possible, to improve human health by reducing hazardous substances contained in such items. This notice is provided to the public agencies listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code §25249.6 *et seq.* (Proposition 65). As noted above, this letter is also being provided to the alleged violators, Alibaba Group Holding Ltd and Alibaba Group (U.S.) Inc., which are persons in the course of doing business in California (collectively the "Violator"). The violations covered by this notice consist of the product exposure, routes of exposure and types of harm potentially resulting from exposure to the hazardous substance identified below (listed chemical), as follows:

Products:	Fishing Weights, Including Kits Containing Such Items
Listed chemical:	Lead
Routes of Exposure:	Ingestion and Dermal
Types of Harm:	Cancer and Birth Defects and Other Reproductive Harm

### I. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATION (CONSUMER PRODUCT EXPOSURE)

The specific types of products that are causing consumer exposures and potentially occupational exposures, in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this letter shall be referred to hereinafter as the "Products." Exposures to the listed chemical from the use of the Products have been occurring without the "clear and reasonable warning" required by Proposition 65, dating as far back as July 1, 2021. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical resulting from the use of the Products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the listed chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Products.

California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring, receiving or utilizing the Products, are exposed to the listed chemical. By way of example, consumers, and other individuals, including women of childbearing age, ingest the listed chemical when they, among other activities, touch the Products and transfer the listed chemical from the Products to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after one or more contacts with the Products ceases.

Additionally, consumers and other individuals, including women of childbearing age, are exposed to the listed chemical through direct dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle, touch or otherwise use the Products. Further, there are reasonably foreseeable uses of the Products that result in direct ingestion of the toxic metal.

The California State Plan for Occupational Safety and Health incorporates the provisions of Proposition 65, as approved by Federal OSHA on June 6, 1997. This approval specifically placed certain conditions with regard to occupational exposures on Proposition 65, including that it does not apply to the conduct of manufacturers, by which the Products are branded (e.g. manufacturer's name appears on Product label), occurring outside the State of California so long as the named manufacturer is in the United States. The approval also provides that a United States employer may use the means of compliance in the general hazard communication requirements to comply with Proposition 65. It also requires that supplemental enforcement be subject to the supervision of the California Occupational Safety and Health Administration.

Any settlement, civil complaint or substantive court orders in this matter must be submitted to the state Attorney General. It is important to note that the sale of the Products through online means of transaction must provide the customer with a clear and reasonable warning for the risk of cancer and reproductive toxicity pursuant to Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations, even if the Violator's role is limited that of an online retail seller.

### II. CONTACT INFORMATION

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to me through my counsel's office at the following address, email and/or telephone number:

Jay Epps c/o Clifford A. Chanler Chanler, LLC 72 Huckleberry Hill Road New Canaan, CT 06840-3801 clifford@chanlerllc.com Telephone: (475) 277-2932

## III. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For general information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's (OEHHA) Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900. For the Violator's reference, I have attached a copy of "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary" which has been prepared by OEHHA.

### IV. POTENTIAL RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the assertions set forth in this notice, I intend to file a citizen enforcement action against the Violator unless such alleged person in the course of doing business enters into a binding written agreement (and/or upstream party such as a supplier enters into an agreement which would resolve one or more of the Products at issue shipped to the Violator) to: (a) recall Products already sold; (b) provide "clear and reasonable warnings" for Products to be sold in the future or, preferably, reformulate such Products to eliminate the lead exposures (or undertake best efforts to ensure upstream selling entities in the chain of commerce such as manufacturers, exporters, importers or distributors do so); and (c) pay an appropriate civil fine, if any, based on the factors enumerated in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b). If the alleged Violator is particularly interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to litigation, please feel free to contact my counsel identified in Section II above. It should be noted that neither my counsel nor I can finalize any settlement with the Violator until after the statutory sixty-day notice period has expired for the covered Products; nor speak for the state Attorney General, any state district attorney or the city attorneys who received this notice.

## V. ADDITIONAL NOTICE INFORMATION

Examples of Products that were recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California that are within the Product categories covered by this notice are identified on Exhibit A. I allege that the sale of the offending Products has also occurred without the requisite Proposition 65 "clear and reasonable warning."<sup>1 2</sup>

The examples on the attachments are for the recipient's benefit to assist in its investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the listed chemical from other items within the definition of Products. These examples are <u>not</u> meant to be an exhaustive list of each specific offending Product. Further, it is this citizen's position that the alleged Violator is obligated to continue to conduct in good faith an investigation into other specific Products within the type or category described above that may have been manufactured, imported, distributed, facilitated for sale, sold, shipped, stored, or was otherwise within the notice recipient's custody or control during the relevant period so as to ensure that the requisite toxic warnings were and continue to be provided to California citizens prior to purchase, especially if the upstream vendor (i.e., party with whom the Violator entered into a contract to sell the Products at issue) is exempt from a duty to warn or enforcement under Proposition 65.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> If an applicable manufacturer, supplier, seller, and/or importer of one or more of the Products does not have a known agent for process of service in California and/or employs less than ten people as defined by the operative regulation, then the Violator is alleged to have heightened regulatory responsibilities beyond 27 CCR §25600.2(d) especially if it is also an importer and/or fulfills additional roles in the commercial marketplace such as being a "drop shipper" of the Product.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> In accordance with 27 CCR §25600.2(g), please "promptly" answer the questions on **Exhibit B**, and return with receipt confirmation to Jay Epps c/o Clifford Chanler, Chanler, LLC, 72 Huckleberry Hill Road, New Canaan, CT 06840, or via email to clifford@chanlerllc.com on or before **November 27, 2023**.

# EXHIBIT A

Exemplar of Products	Item#
Fishing Sinker Weight Kit 100pcs Removable Fishing Split Shot Sinker Fishing Egg Weight Round Split Shot Sinker Fishing Tackle	3256805760907938
JYJ a box 1g 1.5g 2g 3g 3.5g fishing hook jig round head hook with mix colors, fishing tackle hook for soft grub worm baits	3256805246197519
5pcs 2g-30g Fishing Weight Sinker Fishing Olive Shape Rig Sinkers Fishing Weights Split Shot Sink Fishing Tackle Tool Accessory	3256805826179298
10pcs Fishing Weight Sinkers 3.5g 5g 7g 10g 14g 20g Bullet Sinker Fishing Tackle Accessories	3256803195503850

# EXHIBIT B

As it relates to *each* of the Products, including those identified on **Exhibit A**, provide the full legal entity name and any known contact information (on or before November 27, 2023) for:

- (a) Any and all manufacturers
- (b) Any and all producers
- (c) Any and all packagers
- (d) Any and all direct vendors
- (e) Any and all exporters
- (f) Any and all shippers, and
- (g) Any and all sellers

Please email (or send via overnight delivery) the above-requested information to the address provided in Section II. Thank you.

## **PROOF OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within action. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 72 Huckleberry Hill Road, New Canaan, CT 06840.

On November 2, 2023, I caused to be served the following documents:

### SIXTY-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

XXXX **By First Class Certified Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service representative.

Alibaba Group Holding Ltd Chief Executive Officer 400 South El Camino Real, Suite 400 San Mateo, CA 94402

XXXX **By Federal Express** I deposited in a box inside of the FedEx Office Print & Ship Center located at 464 Main Avenue, Norwalk, CT 06851, maintained by Federal Express, an express carrier service, for collection and overnight mailing, a true and correct copy of the foregoing documents, in a sealed envelope designated by said express service carrier addressed to each interested party as set forth below, with delivery fees paid or provided for.

CT Corporation System Attn: Agent for Service of Process For Alibaba Group (U.S.) Inc. 818 Seventh Street, Suite 930 Los Angeles, CA 90017

On November 2, 2023, I caused to be served the following documents:

#### SIXTY-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); AND CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

XXXX **By Electronic Mail** by sending true and correct copies of the above documents to the electronic notification addresses on the attached "Email Service List" and email courtesy copy to counsel: Carey Ramos, Esq., Quinn Emanuel, careyramos@quinnemanuel.com.

On November 2, 2023, I caused to be served the following documents:

### SIXTY-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS

XXXX **By Electronic Upload** by causing true and correct copies of the above documents to be uploaded to the California Attorney General's website at the web address on the attached "Electronic Upload Service List."

Executed on November 2, 2023, in New Canaan, Connecticut.

Aprico M.

Lorent Guimaraes

# CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d)

I, Clifford A. Chanler, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice has violated Health and Safety Code §25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings;
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party;
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the *alleged* exposure to the listed chemical that are the subject of this action and/or the listed chemical in substantially similar products and exposes individuals through the same potential routes;
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged Violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute;
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate under Health and Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2) including (i) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (ii) certain facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: November 2, 2023

Clifford A. Chanler

# **EMAIL SERVICE LIST**

The Honorable Michael Atwell Alpine County District Attorney P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120 daoffice@alpinecountyca.gov

The Honorable Todd Riebe Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642 amadorda@amadorgov.org

The Honorable Michael Ramsey Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965 DA@ButteCounty.net

Michelle Latimer Lassen County Program Coordinator 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us

The Honorable David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971 davidhollister@countyofplumas.com

The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721 damail@fresnocountyca.gov

The Honorable Maggie Fleming Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, Fourth Floor Eureka, CA 95501 districtattorney@co.humboldt.ca.us

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney Alameda County 7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Allison Haley, District Attorney Napa County 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

The Honorable Phillip J. Cline Tulare County District Attorney 221 South Mooney Boulevard Visalia, CA 93291-4593 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar San Joaquin County District Attorney P.O. Box 990 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95201 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

The Honorable Clifford Newell Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959 DA.Prop65@cco.nevada.ca.us The Honorable Donna Daly Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 11 Court Street Weaverville, CA 96093 trinityjournal@dcacable.net

The Honorable Sally O. Moreno Madera County District Attorney 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637 Sally.Moreno@co.madera.ca.gov

The Honorable Thomas Hardy Inyo County District Attorney P.O. Box Drawer D Independence, CA 93526 inyoda@inyocounty.us

Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor San Francisco, CA 94102 Valerie.Lopez@sfcityatty.org

The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendocino County District Attorney 100 North State Street, Room G-10 P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482 enviroh@mendocinocounty.org

The Honorable Kimberly Lewis Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofmerced.com

The Honorable Samuel D. Kyllo Modoc County District Attorney 204 South Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101 da@co.modoc.ca.us

The Honorable Tim Kendall Mono County District Attorney 278 Main Street P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517 districtattorney@mono.ca.gov

The Honorable Jeannine M. Pacioni Monterey County District Attorney 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

The Honorable Jill R. Ravitch Sonoma County District Attorney 600 Administration Drive Sonoma, CA 95403 jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney Office of the City Attorney, San Diego 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org

The Honorable Jason Anderson San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502 da@sbcda.org

Alexandra Grayner, Assistant DA San Francisco District Attorney's Office 350 Rhode Island Street N. Bldg., 400N San Francisco, CA 94103 alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org

The Honorable Laura L. Krieg Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370 da@tuolumnecounty.ca.gov

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

The Honorable Susan J. Krones Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453 Susan.Krones@lakecountyca.gov

The Honorable Jeffrey S. Rosell Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

The Honorable Summer Stephan San Diego County District Attorney 330 West Broadway Street San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org

The Honorable Sandra Groven Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square, Room B1 P.O. Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936 sgroven@sierracounty.ca.gov

The Honorable Walter Wall Mariposa County District Attorney 5085 Bullion Street P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara St. Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

The Honorable Barbara Yook Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Rd. San Andreas, CA 95249 Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org

The Honorable Cynthia Zimmer Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Bakersfield, CA 93301 CZimmer@kernda.org

The Honorable Gregory D. Totten Ventura County District Attorney 800 South Victoria Avenue, Suite 314 Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org

The Honorable Morgan Briggs Gire Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678 Prop65@placer.ca.gov

The Honorable Richard Doyle Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113 cao.main@sanjoseca.gov

The Honorable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney 311 4<sup>th</sup> Street Yreka, CA 96097 da@siskiyouda.org

The Honorable Krishna A. Abrams Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533 SolanoDA@solanocounty.com

Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 West Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

The Honorable Susan Alcala Wood Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 I Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814 clerk@cityofsacramento.org

# **ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST**

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice