

November 22, 2023

# SIXTY-DAY NOTICE OF INTENT TO SUE FOR VIOLATION OF THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq.) ("Proposition 65")

Re: Violations of Proposition 65 concerning Spaghetti containing Lead.

Dear Alleged Violators and Public Enforcement Agencies:

Berj Parseghian ("Claimant"), serves this Notice of Violation ("Notice") on Ethical Brands Inc.; and Sprouts Farmers Market, Inc. (collectively "Violators") pursuant to and in compliance with Proposition 65. KJT Law Group, LLP represents Berj Parseghian (Claimant). This Notice satisfies a prerequisite for Claimant to commence an action against Violators in any Superior Court of California to enforce Proposition 65. The violations addressed by this Notice occurred at numerous locations in each county in California as reflected in the district attorney addresses listed in the attached distribution list. Claimant is serving this Notice upon each person or entity responsible for the alleged violations, the California Attorney General, the district attorney for each county where alleged violations occurred, and the City Attorney for each city with a population (according to the most recent decennial census) of over 750,000 located within counties where the alleged violations occurred.

Claimant is a citizen of the State of California, dedicated to protecting the consumer environment, improving human health, and supporting environmentally sound commercial practices. Berj Parseghian's contact information is the following: Phone number; 626.604.1779 | Address: c/o KJT Law Group, LLP – Attn: Tro Krikorian, Esq. – 230 N. Maryland Avenue, Suite 306, Glendale, CA 91206. By sending this notice of violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.5 *et seq.*, claimant is acting "in the public interest" pursuant to Proposition 65.

This Notice concerns violations of the warning prong of Proposition 65, which states that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual . . ." *Cal. Health & Safety Code* § 25249.6.

Pursuant to § 25249.7(d) of the statute, Claimant intends to bring an enforcement action against the Violators sixty (60) days after the effective service of this notice unless public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations. A summary of the statute and its implementing regulations, which was prepared by the Office of Environmental Hazard Assessment, the lead agency designated under the State, is enclosed with the copy of this notice served upon the violators ("Proposition 65: A Summary"). The specific details of the violations that are the subject of this notice are provided below.





## Consumer Product and Chemical(s) Involved

Claimant has discovered that Spaghetti contains lead. Lead is known to the State of California to cause cancer. "Lead and lead compounds" have been listed as carcinogens since October 1, 1992 and "lead" has been listed as a developmental toxicant for males and females since February 27, 1987. On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

# Identifiers for the Spaghetti include but are not limited to: **"Explore Cuisine – Organic Edamame & Spirulina Spaghetti; UPC #: 8 55433 00823 5**

This Notice addresses consumer products exposures. A "'[c]onsumer products exposure' is an exposure which results from a person's acquisition, purchase, storage, consumption, or other reasonably foreseeable use of a consumer good, or any exposure that results from receiving a consumer service." Cal. Code Regs. 27 tit. § 25602(b).

### **Description of Violation**

Violators caused consumer product exposures in violation of Proposition 65 by producing or making available Spaghetti for distribution or sale in California to consumers. The packaging for Spaghetti (meaning any label or other written, printed or graphic matter affixed to or accompanying the product or its container or wrapper) contains no Proposition 65-compliant warning. Nor did Violator, with regard to Spaghetti, provide a system of signs, public advertising identifying the system and toll-free information services, or any other system, which provided clear and reasonable warnings. Nor did Violator, with regard to Spaghetti, provide identification of the product at retail outlets in a manner that provided a warning through shelf labeling, signs, menus, or a combination thereof.

#### Route of Exposure

Use of the product identified above results in human exposure to lead. The primary route of lead exposure to consumers is through direct ingestion when consumers eat the Spaghetti. These exposures take place throughout the State of California. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with regards to the carcinogenic and/or reproductive hazard of lead as required by State law.

#### **Duration of Violations**

These violations have been occurring every day between since at least November 22, 2022, and every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided with regards to the carcinogenic and/or reproductive hazard of lead as required by State law or until these known toxic chemicals are removed or reduced to allowable levels in the products.

#### <u>Counsel</u>

The Claimant is represented in connection with this matter by and may be contacted through:





230 N. Maryland Ave. Suite 306 Glendale, CA 91206 **P**: 818.507.8525 **F**: 818.507.8588 info@KJTLawGroup.com

## Tro Krikorian, Esq. KJT Law Group, LLP 230 N. Maryland Avenue, Suite 306, Glendale, CA 91206 Telephone: (818) 507-8525 Email: Tro@KJTLawGroup.com

In keeping with the public interest goals of the statute and the objective of protecting individuals and the community at-large from further toxic exposures, **KJT** Law Group, **LLP** is interested in seeking a constructive and immediate resolution of this matter in order to avoid continuing unwarned exposure to listed chemicals.

Proposition 65 requires that notice of intent to sue be given to the violator(s) sixty (60) days before the suit is filed. *Cal. Health & Safety Code* § 25249.7(d)(1). With this letter, Claimant gives notice of the alleged violations to Violator and the appropriate governmental authorities. In absence of any action by the appropriate governmental authorities within sixty (60) calendar days of the sending of this notice (plus ten (10) calendar days because the place of address is beyond the State of California but within the United States), Claimant may file suit. *See Cal. Code Civ. Proc.* § 1013; *Cal. Health & Safety Code* § 25249.7(d)(1); and *Cal. Code Regs.* tit. 27 § 25903(d)(1). Claimant remains open and willing to discussing the possibility of resolving its grievances short of formal litigation.

All communications regarding this notice may be made to Tro Krikorian, Esq. at the above listed firm address and telephone number.

Regards,

Tro Krikorian, Esq. KJT Law Group, LLP

Attachments:

Certificate of Merit Supporting Documentation for Certificate of Merit (to Attorney General Only) Proposition 65: A Summary Proof of Service (including DA Service List)





#### Spaghetti containing Lead CERTIFICATE OF MERIT Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et. seq.

I, Tro Krikorian, hereby declare:

- 1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty (60) day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2) I am the attorney for the noticing parties.
- 3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- 4) Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e. (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: November 22, 2023

Tro Krikorian, Esq. KJT Law Group, LLP



	1	PROOF OF SERVICE			
	2	I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the			
	3 4	following is true and correct: I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the action. I am employed in the County of Los Angeles, State of California; my business address is 230 N. Maryland Avenue,			
	5	Suite 306 Glendale CA 91206			
	6	60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY			
	7	on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed the party listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by			
	8	Certified Mail:			
	9	Ethical Brands Inc.	egistered Agent for Service of Process: Ethical Brands Inc.		
	10 11	Attn: Legal Department280 State Route 35, Suite 201	<b>Attn: Elizabeth Tashiro</b> 1155 S. Barrington Avenue, APT 306		
TLAWGROUP 1.1.P Jivalagian   Thomassian	10	Red Bank, NJ 07701   Entity Address:	Los Angeles, CA 90049 egistered Agent for Service of Process:		
	12	Sprouts Farmers Market, Inc.	Sprouts Farmers Market, Inc.		
	13	5455 E. High Street, Suite 111 Phoenix, AZ 85054	c/o Corporate Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive		
/GR	14		Wilmington, DE 19808		
<b>KJT</b> LA	15 16	On November 22, 2023 I served the following documents: 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; SUPPORTING DOCUMENTATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY			
	17	on the following parties by uploading the foregoing	documents at the webpage listed below:		
	18	1515 Clay Street, Ste. 2000   Post Office Bo	ox 70550   Oakland, California 94612-0550		
	19	https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice On November 22, 2023 I served the following documents:			
	20 21	60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY			
		by sending a true and correct copy via electronic mail to			
	22		trict Attorney's Office		
	23	The Honorable Pamela Y. Price 1225 Fallon Street, Suite 900, Oakland, CA 94612   CEPDProp65@acgov.org			
	24	Executed under penalty of perjury pursuant to the California on <b>November 22, 2023.</b>	he laws of the State of California in Glendale,		
	25		V-t-		
	26 27		(-b-f-e-i		
			Vache Thomassian		
	28	PROOF OF	SERVICE		

#### **PROOF OF SERVICE AFFIDAVIT**

CCP 1013(a), CCP 1013(b), and CCP 1013a(3)

# STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

My name is David Birdsall.

I am over the age of 18 and not a party to the related cause(s).

I am employed at DocuCents in the county of Los Angeles, State of California, which is where the mailing occurred.

My business address is: 960 S Village Oaks Dr, Covina, CA 91724, which is where I placed the correspondence described herein for deposit in the United States Postal Service unless otherwise stated.

I am readily familiar with the business' practice for collection and processing of correspondence for mailing with the United States Postal Service.

The following correspondence will be deposited with the United States Postal Service this same day in the ordinary course of business.

Each envelope was sealed and placed for collection and mailing on 11/22/2023, following ordinary business practices.

The exact TITLE of the document(s) served and the name(s) and address(s) of the people or entities being served are listed on the following attached Service List(s). This affidavit may include multiple Service Lists for documents which were mailed to many different parties on unrelated causes as part of the ordinary course of services.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing and all information contained in the attached Service List(s) is true and correct.

Printed na	me: David Birdsall		
Dated: 11	/22/2023		
Χ	1.H	5	·
	David Birdsal	II	
A.(. )			

Attachments: Service List(s) included as part of this affidavit.

#### SERVICE LIST

ALPINE COUNTY The Honorable Michael Atwell District Attorney P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

AMADOR COUNTY The Honorable Todd Riebe District Attorney 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642

BUTTE COUNTY The Honorable Michael Ramsey District Attorney 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

CALAVERAS COUNTY The Honorable Barbara Yook District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249

COLUSA COUNTY The Honorable Matthew Beauchamp The Honorable Sally Moreno District Attorney 310 6th Street Colusa, CA 95932

CONTRA COSTA COUNTY The Honorable Diana Becton District Attorney 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553

DEL NORTE COUNTY The Honorable Krishna A. Abrams District Attorney 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

EL DORADO COUNTY The Honorable Vernon Pierson District Attorney 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667

FRESNO COUNTY The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp District Attorney 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721

GLENN COUNTY The Honorable Dwavne Stewart District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

HUMBOLDT COUNTY The Honorable Maggie Fleming District Attorney 825 5th Street Eureka, CA 95501

IMPERIAL COUNTY The Honorable Gilbert G. Otero District Attorney 940 W. Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243

INYO COUNTY The Honorable Thomas L. Hardy District Attorney 168 N. Edwards Independence, CA 93526

KERN COUNTY The Honorable Cythia Zimmer District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

KINGS COUNTY The Honorable Keith Fagundes District Attorney 1400 W. Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

LAKE COUNTY The Honorable Susan Krones District Attorney 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

LASSEN COUNTY The Honorable Melyssah Rios District Attorney 2950 Riverside Drive, Suite 102 Susanville, CA 96130

LOS ANGELES COUNTY The Honorable Jackie Lacey District Attorney 211 W. Temple Street, Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012

MADERA COUNTY District Attorney 209 W. Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

MARIN COUNTY The Honorable Lori Frugoli District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903

MARIPOSA COUNTY The Honorable Walter Wall District Attorney P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338

MENDOCINO COUNTY The Honorable C. David Eyster District Attorney P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

MERCED COUNTY The Honorable Nicole A. Silveira District Attorney 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340

MODOC COUNTY The Honorable Iordan Funk District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101

MONO COUNTY The Honorable Samuel Kyllo District Attorney P.O. Box 2053 Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546

MONTEREY COUNTY The Honorable Jeannine Pacioni District Attorney 1200 Aguajito Rd. Room 301 Monterrey, CA 93940

NAPA COUNTY The Honorable Allison Haley District Attorney 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559

NEVADA COUNTY The Honorable Clifford Newell District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959

ORANGE COUNTY The Honorable Todd Spitzer District Attorney 300 North Flower St. Santa Ana, CA 92703

PLACER COUNTY The Honorable R. Morgan Gire District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240 Redding, CA 96001 Roseville, CA 95678

PLUMAS COUNTY The Honorable David Hollister District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971

RIVERSIDE COUNTY The Honorable Michael Hestrin District Attorney 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501

SACRAMENTO COUNTY The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert District Attorney District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95812

SAN BENITO COUNTY The Honorable Joel Buckingham District Attorney 419 4th Street Hollister, CA 95023

SAN BERNARDINO COUNTY The Honorable Jason Anderson District Attorney 303 W. Third Street San Bernardino, CA 92415

SAN DIEGO COUNTY The Honorable Summer Stephan District Attorney 330 W. Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101

SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY The Honorable Chesa Boudin District Attorney 350 Rhode Island Street North Building, Suite 400N San Francisco, CA 94103

SAN IOAOUIN COUNTY The Honorable Ron Freitas District Attorney P.O. Box 990 Stockton, CA 95202

SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY The Honorable Dan Dow District Attorney Courthouse Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

SAN MATEO COUNTY The Honorable Stephen M. Wagstaffe Sonora, CA 95370 District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

SANTA BARBARA COUNTY The Honorable Joyce Dudley District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

SANTA CLARA COUNTY The Honorable Jeffrey Rosen District Attorney 70 W. Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 95110 SANTA CRUZ COUNTY

The Honorable Jeff Rosell District Attorney 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060

SHASTA COUNTY The Honorable Stephanie A. Bridgett The Honorable Matthew Rogers District Attorney 1355 West Street

SIERRA COUNTY The Honorable Sandra Groven District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square Downieville, CA 95936

SISKIYOU COUNTY The Honorable James Kirk Andrus District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

SOLANO COUNTY The Honorable Krishna A. Abrams 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

SONOMA COUNTY The Honorable Jill Ravitch District Attorney 600 Administration Drive, Room 212J CITY OF SAN JOSE Santa Rosa, CA 95403

STANISLAUS COUNTY The Honorable Birgit Fladager District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95353

SUTTER COUNTY The Honorable Amanda L. Hopper 463 Second St, Yuba City, CA 95991

TRINITY COUNTY The Honorable Donna Daly District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

TULARE COUNTY The Honorable Tim Ward District Attorney 221 S. Mooney Boulevard, Suite 224 Visalia, CA 93291

SUTTER COUNTY District Attorney 446 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991

TUOLUMNE COUNTY The Honorable Cassandra Ann Jenecke District Attorney 423 No. Washington Street

VENTURA COUNTY The Honorable Gregory Totten District Attorney 800 S. Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009

YOLO COUNTY The Honorable Jeffery Reisig District Attorney 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695

YUBA COUNTY

The Honorable Clint Curry District Attorney 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

TEHAMA COUNTY District Attorney P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

CITY OF LOS ANGELES City Attorney's Office 200 N. Main Street, Room 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

CITY OF SACRAMENTO Office of the City Attorney 915 I Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814

CITY OF SAN DIEGO City Attorney's Office 1200 3rd Avenue, Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO City Attorney's Office City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr. Carlton B Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

City Attorney's Office 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113

CITY OF OAKLAND City Attorney's Office City Hall, 6th Floor 1 Frank Ogawa Plaza Oakland, CA 94612