# LAW OFFICES BRODSKY SMITH

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877,534.2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856,795,7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

### December 18, 2023

President/CEO Warstic Sports Inc. c/o The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801	President/CEO Warstic Sports Inc. c/o OneFastBuffalo Corp. 9514 Crestedge Drive Dallas, TX 75238
President/CEO Warstic Sports Inc. 2900 Main Street Dallas, TX 75226-1503	Member/Manager American Sports Licensing LLC c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington, DE 19808
President/CEO American Sports Licensing, Inc. c/o Delaware incorporators & Registration Service, LLC 301 North Market Street, Suite 1410 Farmers Bank Bldg. Wilmington, DE 19801	President/CEO Dick's Sporting Goods, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington, DE 19808
President/CEO Dick's Sporting Goods, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company Which Will Do Business In California As CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service 2710 Gateway Oaks Drive, Suite 150N Sacramento, CA 95833	

### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Gabriel Espinoza ("Espinoza"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

With respect to the Product herein, Espinoza has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Gabriel Espinoza, 3924 Carlin Ave., Lynwood, CA 90262-5204; (Ph) (424)285-4896
- **2.** Alleged Violator(s): Warstic Sports Inc.; American Sports Licensing LLC; American Sports Licensing, Inc.; Dick's Sporting Goods, Inc.
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least December 18, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
- **4. Listed Chemical**: Chromium (VI). Chromium (VI) is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

### 5. Product:

Product<sup>2</sup> Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product

Batting Gloves Warstic Workman III Batting Gloves
UPC# 810058380166

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Espinoza's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

### **II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION**

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Espinoza against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Espinoza is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Espinoza has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely

Evan J. Smith

### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

#### Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

### I, Evan J. Smith, hereby declare:

- (1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- (2) I am the attorney for the noticing party, Gabriel Espinoza.
- (3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- (4) Based on the information obtained through these consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator(s) will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- (5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: December 18, 2023 Evan J. Smith

Attorney for Gabriel Espinoza

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within action. My business address is 2 Bala Plaza, Suite 805, Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania. I am employed in Montgomery County where the mailing occurred.

On December 18, 2023 I served the following documents: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary on the following entities and individuals listed below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

President/CEO	President/CEO
Warstic Sports Inc.	Warstic Sports Inc.
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o OneFastBuffalo Corp.
Corporation Trust Center	9514 Crestedge Drive
1209 Orange Street	Dallas, TX 75238
Wilmington, DE 19801	
President/CEO	Member/Manager
Warstic Sports Inc.	American Sports Licensing LLC
2900 Main Street	c/o Corporation Service Company
Dallas, TX 75226-1503	251 Little Falls Drive
,	Wilmington, DE 19808
President/CEO	President/CEO
American Sports Licensing, Inc.	Dick's Sporting Goods, Inc.
c/o Delaware incorporators & Registration Service,	c/o Corporation Service Company
LLC	251 Little Falls Drive
301 North Market Street, Suite 1410	Wilmington, DE 19808
Farmers Bank Bldg.	
President/CEO	
Dick's Sporting Goods, Inc.	
c/o Corporation Service Company Which Will Do	
Business In California As CSC-Lawyers	
Incorporating Service	
2710 Gateway Oaks Drive, Suite 150N	
Sacramento, CA 95833	
301 North Market Street, Suite 1410 Farmers Bank Bldg. Wilmington, DE 19801  President/CEO Dick's Sporting Goods, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company Which Will Do Business In California As CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service 2710 Gateway Oaks Drive, Suite 150N	

On December 18, 2023, I served the following documents: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary on each of the individuals on the service list attached hereto as Appendix B by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed December 18, 2023, in Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania.

Evan J. Smith

The Figure 2 County O'Malley Alemeda County District Attorney 7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621	The Romenishs Tool Verher Salzar San Jospoin Councy District Activacy 222 L. Weber Avenue, Roma 202 Stockion, CA 55502	Sacramento, CA 95814
CEPDPmp65@acgiv.org	ElACompiner Envisourmental (Asiada, eng	Prop63@sauda.org
The Honorable Allison Haley	The Roserable Jeffrey S. Rosell	The Honorable Summer Stephan
Nava County District Attorney	Sunta Cruz County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney
1127 First St., Suite C Napa, CA 94559	201 Ocean Street	800 West Broadway
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Sunta Cruz, CA 95060	San Diego, CA 92101
The II	PrepiSDA@santienzeounty.us	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
The Honorable Jeff W Reisig	Michella Latimer, Program Coordinator	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street	Lassen County	City of San Diego
Woodlesd Charles	220 S. Lassen Street	1200 Third Avenue
Woodland, CA 95695	Susanville, CA 96130	San Diego, CA 92101
efend@yolecounty.org	milatimes@co.lassen_co.us	City Arty Prop65@sandiego.gov
Bud Porter	Alethea M. Sargent	Christopher Dalbey,
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Assistant District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney
Danta Clara County	San Francisco District Attorney's Office	Santa Barbara County
70 W Hedding Street	350 Rhode Island Street	1112 Santa Barbara Street
San Jose, CA 95110	San Francisco, CA 94103	1
EPU@ds.sccgov_ocg	plethun sargani@afgery.org	Santa Barbora, CA 93101
The Honorable Gregory D. Totten	The Honorable Barbara Yook	DAProgest@co.santa-barbera.ca.us
Ventura County District Attorney	Chiaman Control Barbara Yook	Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney
VU S Victoria Avenue	Caleveras County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney
entura, CA 93009	891 Mountain Ranch Road	1390 Market Street, 7th Floor
aspecialops@ventura.org	San Andreas, CA 95249	San Francisco, CA 94102
tacey Grassini	Propissiny deco. outavegos. on. us	Valorie Lepez@afcityatty.org
Deputy District Actorney	Brie J. Dobroth	Jeannine M. Pacioni
Contra Costa County	Denny District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney
00 Ward Street	Luis Obispo County	Monterey County
fartinez, CA 94553	Comey Govt Center Annex 4º Floor	1200 Aguajito Road
manufactor (A 94333	San Luis Obispo, C.A. 93408	Montarry, CA 93940
rassini@contracostada.org	edolaroth@co.sto.ca.es	Prop65DA@co.montercy.ca.us
he Honorable Thomas Hardy	The Remarable Phillip I. Office	The Honogable Clifford Newell
No County District Attorney	Talore County District Astroney	Nevada County District Attorney
18 M. Edwards Street	221 S Mountay Blvd	201 Commercial Street
dependence CA 93526	Visulia, CA 95370	Nevada City, CA 95959
veda@invecounty.us	Fronti-Co.miari.co.us	Market Control of the
te Honorable Paul E. Zellerhach	The Hosorable Stephan Passalacqua	DA Propfi@co.nevada.ca.us
TOTSKIE County District & Horney	Suppose County District Attorney	The Honorable David Hollister
	FOR A delicited by District Attorney	Plamas County District Attorney
verside CA 92501	act Administration Drive	\$20 Main Street, Room, 404
uras@rivcoda.org	Somme, CA, 95403	Quincy, CA 95971
Honorable Walter W. Wall	ibusics@sonoma-county.org	davida ollisteriks ounty of plumas, com
Finesa County Division Wall	The Honorable Kimherly Lewis	The Honorable Morgan Briggs Gire
Fipesa County District Attorney  District Attorney	Morred County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney
Thomas Classical	950 West Main Street	10810 Justice Center Drive
ariposa, CA 95338	Mercod, CA 95340	Roseville CA 95678
da@paringsnegsaty.org	Pronds@countyofmercod.com	proposi@placer.ca.gcv
Ra V. Frimane City Attorney	Lita A. Smilloamp, Diseriet Attomsy	anyparadunada, da.gov
C Santa Clara Street Lifth Floor	TENATURE OF THE PROPERTY OF TH	1
Jose, CA 96113	2 100 Telare Street	
pesition6Snotices@sanjeseca.gov	Fresno, CA 93721	
Taxticumus striposeca, gov	consumerorate oriental frostrogen place go	4 1 Y

# **ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST**

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60 day-notice

# SERVICE LIST

The transfer of			
The Honorable Nancy O'sfelley Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612	The Honorable Stacey Montgomery Lassen County Clatriot Attorney 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8	The Honorable Candice Hooper San Benito County District Altomey 419 4th Street, Second Floor	The Honorable Gregg Cohen Tshams County District Attorney 444 Oak Street, Room L
Canada, CA 94612	Susanville, CA 96130	Hallister, CA 95203	Red Bluff, CA 96080
The Honorable Terese Drabac Alpine County District Attorney 270 Laramie Street, PO BOX 248 Markleaville, CA 95120	The Honorable Jackie Lacey Los Angeles County District Attorney 21   West Temple Street, Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012	The Honorable Michael Ramos San Bernardino Gounly Olstrict Attorney 303 Wast 3rd Street, 6th Floor San Barmardino, CA 92415-0502	The Hanorable Eric Herylard Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
	1	daji dajilalditio, OA 32913-0302	
The Honorable Todd Riebe Amader County District Attorney 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 96642	The Henerable David Linn Madera County District Attorney 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637	The Honorable Bannie Dumanis San Olego County Dishter Attorney 330 W. Broadway Street San Dlego, CA 92101	The Honorable Tim Ward Tulars County District Altomay 221 South Mooney Sculevard, Rm 224 Visalla, CA 93891 4563
The Henerable Michael Planteny	The Honorable Edward Berbeslan	The Hanorable George Gascon	The Honorable Caura Krieg
Butte County Clathiot Attorney 25 County Canter Drive Oroville, CA 95965	Marin County Olshick Attorney 9501 Civic Center Orive, Room 130 San Rafgel, CA 94909	San Francisco County District Attorney 850 Bryant Street, Room 322 San Francisco, CA 94103	Tuolumne County Oistrict Altorney 423 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370
The Honorable Barbera Yook	The Honorable Thomas Cooks	The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar	The Honorable Gregory Tolten
Calaveres County District Attorney 881 Mountain Ranch Road	Mariposa County District Attorney 5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730	San Joaquin County District Attorney 222 East Weber Avenue, Room 202	Ventura County District Attorney 800 South Victoria Avenue
San Andress, GA 95249 The Honorable John Poyner	Marinosa, CA 95398	Stackton, CA 95201	Ventura, CA 93809
Column County District Attorney 346 Pitth Street	The Konorable C. David Eyster Mendodno County District Attorney	The Honorable Dan Dow San Luis Obispo County District Ally	The Handrable Jelf Raisig Yola County District Altomey
Celusa, CA 95932	100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000	1095 Palm Street, 4th Floor	301 Second Sized Woodland, CA 95595
The Honorable Mark Patarage	The Honorable Larry Morse II	San Luis Obisso, CA 98408	The Honorable Patrick McGrath
300 Ward Street	Merced County District Attorney	The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe San Mateo County District Altorney	Yuba County District Attorney
Marlinez, OA 94559	550 W Main Street Merced, CA 95340	400 County Center, Third Floor	215 Fifth Street Manysville, CA 95901
he Hoporable Date Teles	The Honerable Jerdan Funk	Redwood City, CA 94063 The Rongrable Joyce Oudley	The Honorable Mike Fauer
al Plante County Obstrict Attorney 50 H Street, Room 171	Modec County District Attorney	Santa Barbara County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney Los Angeles
rescent City, CA 95531	204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 99101	1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101	800 City Hall East 200 North Main Street
he Honerable Vern Plerson	-		Las Angeles, CA 99012
Libration Dietain Continue	The Honorable Tim Kendall	The Honorable Jeffray Hosen	The Ronmable James Senchez Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento
(O PERHIDENDA)	Mono County Oletrict Attorney P.O. Bex 617	Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing	915 I Street, 4th Floor
lacerville, CA 95667	Bridgeport, CA 93517	San Jose, CA 95110	Sacramento, CA 95814
he Hendrable Liab Smitteamp	The Honorable Dean Flippo	The Honorable Jeff Rosell	The Honorable Jan Goldsmith
resno County District Astorney 220 Yulaya Street, #1000	Monterey County District Altorney	Santa Gruz County District Attorney	Office of the City Attomey, San Diego
Centor Cal 93791	P.O. Box 1131 Salines, CA 93902	701 Ocean Street, Room 200	1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1520 San Diego, CA 92101
he Henryahle Champer Co	The Honorable Allison Haley	Santa Cruz, CA 95050	The Hunerable Dennis Herrera
Henry County District Attorney	Napa County District Attorney	The Honorable Stephen Carlon Shesta County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney, San
O Box 480 ///lows, CA 95988	1127 First Street, Suite C	1355 West Street	Frandsco
MINNS, CA 95988	Napa, CA 34559	Redding, CA 96001	1 Dr. Callton 8. Goodlelt Place San Francisco, CA 94102
he Hengrable Maggle Fleming	The Honorable Ollford Newell	The Uneverled Leuteness Office	The Henerable Richard Doyle
CONSUMER CAMBO PROPERT AND	Nevada County district Attorney	The Honorable Lawrence Allen Slena County District Attorney	Office of the City Allomey, San Jose
26 ath Street, Fourth Flact ureka, CA 95561	201 Commercial Street	100 Courlhouse Square	200 East Santa Clara Street, 19th Floor
ne Monerable Generi Otero	Meyada City, OA 95959	Downleville, CA 95936	San Jese, CA 95113
HOSEST CERTIFICATION AND AND ADDRESS OF THE PERSON IN	The Honorable Tony Rackauckas	The Honorable James Kirk Andrus	Office of the California Alforney General Proposition of Enforcement Reporting
TO WHEN MAIN SHOW SHIP 100	Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Orive West	Siskiyoti County District Attorney P.O. Bex 966	ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator
Centro, CA 92249	Santa Ana, CA 92701	Yraka, GA 96097	1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550
he Honorable Thomas Hardy	The Henerable R. Scott Owens	The Honorable Kilshina Abrems	Contains on systematic
lyo County District Attorney	Placer County District Atlanta	Salano County District Altorney	I
.O. Drawer D ideoendence, CA 93526	10810 Justice Center Orive, Suite 240	675 Texas Street, Sulte 4500	
he Honorable Lisa Green	Rosaville, CA 95678	Paidfeld, CA 94535	
am County District Attorney	The Honorable David Hollister	The Honorable Jill Havitoh	1
215 Fillyddio Avonus	Plumas County Diatriot Attorney	Seroma County District Astomey	1
akersheld. Ca gagart	\$20 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971	500 Administration Orive, Floom 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403	1
Te Honorable Kalife Enguestes	The Honorable Michael Hestrin	The Honorabie Birgit Fladager	
HIGH LAURDY PROPRIET ASSESSMENT	Hiverside County Dietrict Attorney	Stanislave County Olstrick Attorney	Ti and the second secon
TOTAL SECTION Houleward	3960 Orange Street	832 12th Street, Suite 300	1
antord, CA 99230	Riverside, CA 92501	Modesto, CA 95954	
nė Honorable Donald Anderson	The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert	The Honorable Amanda Hopper	
ike County Olstrict Attorney	Sagramento County District Attorney	Sutter County District Attorney	1
95 North Forbes Street akeport CA 99453	901 G Street	463 Second Street, Sulte 102	I .
- 10433	Sagramento CA 95814	Yuba City CA 95991	

### APPENDIX A

# OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and OEHHA implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information.

FOR INFORMATION CONCERNING THE BASIS FOR THE ALLEGATIONS IN THE NOTICE RELATED TO YOUR BUSINESS, CONTACT THE PERSON IDENTIFIED ON THE NOTICE.

The text of Proposition 65 (Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13) is available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65law72003.html. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 25102 through 27001.1 These implementing regulations are available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65Regs.html.

## WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

The "Proposition 65 List." Under Proposition 65, the lead agency (OEHHA) publishes a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or reproductive toxicity. Chemicals are placed on the Proposition 65 list if they are known to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, such as damage to

All further regulatory references are to sections of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations unless otherwise indicated. The statute, regulations and relevant case law are available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html.

female or male reproductive systems or to the developing fetus. This list must be updated at least once a year. The current Proposition 65 list of chemicals is available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65\_list/Newlist.html.

Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under Proposition 65. Businesses that produce, use, release or otherwise engage in activities involving listed chemicals must comply with the following:

Clear and reasonable warnings. A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical unless an exemption applies. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed to that chemical. Some exposures are exempt from the warning requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

**Prohibition from discharges into drinking water.** A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Some discharges are exempt from this requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

### DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. You should consult the current version of the statute and regulations (http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html) to determine all applicable exemptions, the most common of which are the following:

Grace Period. Proposition 65 warning requirements do not apply until 12 months after the chemical has been listed. The Proposition 65 discharge prohibition does not apply to a discharge or release of a chemical that takes place less than 20 months after the listing of the chemical.

Governmental agencies and public water utilities. All agencies of the federal, state or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

Businesses with nine or fewer employees. Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employee a total of nine or fewer employees. This includes all employees, not just those present in California.

Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer. For chemicals that are listed under Proposition 65 as known to the State to cause cancer, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "No Significant Risk Levels" (NSRLs) for many listed carcinogens. Exposures below these levels are exempt from the warning requirement. See OEHHA's website at:

http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of NSRLs, and Section 25701 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question. For chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level" divided by 1,000. This number is known as the Maximum Allowable Dose Level (MADL). See OEHHA's website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of MADLs, and Section 25801 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures to Naturally Occurring Chemicals in Food. Certain exposures to chemicals that naturally occur in foods (i.e., that do not result from any known human activity, including activity by someone other than the person causing the exposure) are exempt from the warning requirements of the law. If the chemical is a contaminant<sup>2</sup> it must be reduced to the lowest level feasible. Regulations explaining this exemption can be found in Section 25501.

entering any source of drinking water. The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the listed chemical has not, does not, or will not pass into or probably pass into a source of drinking water, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" level for chemicals that cause cancer or that is 1,000 times below the "no observable effect" level for chemicals that cause reproductive toxicity, if an individual were exposed to that amount in drinking water.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Section 25501(a)(4).

### HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys. Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. The notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in Section 25903 of Title 27 and sections 3100-3103 of Title 11. A private party may not pursue an independent enforcement action under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an enforcement action within sixty days of the notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court to stop committing the violation.

A private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. For the following types of exposures, the Act provides an opportunity for the business to correct the alleged violation:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

If a private party alleges that a violation occurred based on one of the exposures described above, the private party must first provide the alleged violator a notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form.

A copy of the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form is included in Appendix B and can be downloaded from OEHHA's website at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/p65law72003.html.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.

### APPENDIX B

# OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE

This Appendix B contains the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). Under the Act, a private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. These exposures are:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure
  occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily
  intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

A private party may not file an action against the alleged violator for these exposures, or recover in a settlement any payment in lieu of penalties any reimbursement for costs and attorney's fees, if the alleged violator has done all of the following within 14 days of being served notice:

- Corrected the alleged violation;
- Agreed to pay a civil penalty of \$500 (subject to change in 2019 and every five years thereafter) to the private party within 30 days; and

Notified the private party serving the notice in writing that the violation has been corrected

An alleged violator may satisfy these conditions only one time for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility or on the same premises. The satisfaction of these conditions does not prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney of a city of greater than 750,000 population, or any full-time city prosecutor with the consent of the district attorney, from filing an enforcement action against an alleged violator.

When a private party sends a notice of alleged violation that alleges one or more of the exposures listed above, the notice must include a notice of special compliance procedure, and a proof of compliance form to be completed by the alleged violator as directed in the notice.

The notice and proof of compliance form is reproduced here:

Date:

Page 1

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

### SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE PROOF OF COMPLIANCE

You are receiving this form because the Noticing Party listed above has alleged that you are violating California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 (Prop. 65).

The Noticing Party may not bring any legal proceedings against you for the alleged violation checked below if:

- (1) You have actually taken the corrective steps that you have certified in this form.
- (2) The Noticing Party has received this form at the address shown above, accurately completed by you, postmarked within 14 days of your receiving this notice.
- (3) The Noticing Party receives the required \$500 penalty payment from you at the address shown above postmarked within 30 days of your receiving this notice.
- (4) This is the first time you have submitted a Proof of Compliance for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility on the same premises.

## PART 1: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE NOTICING PARTY OR ATTORNEY FOR THE **NOTICING PARTY**

The alleged violation is for an exposure to: (check one)

extent on-site consumption is permitted by law.
A chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in a food of beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises for immediate consumption on or off premises to the extent: (1) the chemical was not intentionally added; and (2) the chemical was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination.
Environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employee on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted any location on the premises.

### IMPORTANT NOTES:

(1) You have no potential liability under California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 if your business has nine (9) or fewer employees.

alleged violator and primarily intended for parking noncommercial vehicles.

Chemicals known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the

(2) Using this form will NOT prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney, or a prosecutor in whose jurisdiction the violation is alleged to have occurred from filing an action over the same alleged violations, and that in any such action, the amount of civil penalty shall be reduced to reflect any payment made at this time.

Date:

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

## PART 2: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE ALLEGED VIOLATOR OR AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE

Certification of Compliance

Page 2

Accurate completion of this form will demonstrate that you are now in compliance with California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 for the alleged violation listed above. You must complete and submit the form below to the Noticing Party at the address shown above, postmarked within 14 days of you receiving this notice.

I hereby agree to pay, within 30 days of completion of this notice, a civil penalty of \$500 to the Noticing Party only and certify that I have complied with Health and Safety Code §25249.6 by (check only one of the following):

[] Posting a warning or warnings about the alleged exposure that complies with the law, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; [] Posting the warning or warnings demanded in writing by the Noticing Party, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; OR [] Eliminating the alleged exposure, and attaching a statement accurately describing how the alleged exposure has been eliminated.
My statements on this form, and on any attachments to it, are true, complete, and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and are made in good faith. I have carefully read the instructions to complete this form. I understand that if I make a false statement on this form, I may be subject to additional penalties under the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65).
Signature of alleged violator or authorized representative Date
Name and title of signatory

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.