## VOORHEES & BAILEY, LLP 839 Emerson Street Palo Alto, CA 94301 650-313-2154

#### 60-Day Notice of Violation - California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

#### December 20, 2023

| Notice Recipients:       | Home Essentials & Beyond, Inc.;<br>Burlington Stores, Inc. |
|--------------------------|--|
| Noticing Party:          | Audrey Kallander   |
| <b>Covered Products:</b> | Ceramic Mugs With Exterior Designs                         |
| Listed Chemical:         | Lead   |
| Routes of Exposure:      | Ingestion; Dermal  |
| Potential Harm:          | Birth Defects and Other Reproductive Harm                  |

#### I. INTRODUCTION

This Sixty-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice") is provided by Audrey Kallander. Ms. Kallander is a private enforcer acting in the public interest pursuant to California Health & Safety Code section 25249.7(d). Ms. Kallander seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold and used in California and, if possible, to eliminate such exposures.

This Notice is provided to the alleged violators, Home Essentials & Beyond, Inc., and Burlington Stores, Inc. (the "Notice Recipients"), as well as the California Attorney General's Office, the District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties, and the City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose and Los Angeles.

The Notice Recipients are hereby given notice that they have violated and continue to violate provisions of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, which is codified at California Health & Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq. ("Proposition 65"). Specifically, the Notice Recipients have violated and continue to violate the warning requirement of section 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code, which provides, "No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual...." The alleged violations that are the subject of this Notice are provided below.

#### II. ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

<u>Product Types/Categories</u>: The specific types or categories of products that are causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are Ceramic Mugs With Exterior Designs ("Covered Products").

Identified below are specific examples of Covered Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California (the "Exemplar Products"). Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors, and/or manufacturers of the Exemplar Products are also provided.

The Exemplar Products are identified for the Notice Recipients' benefit to assist in their investigation of the allegations set forth in this Notice. The Exemplar Products are not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product falling within the specific types or categories of Covered Products at issue in this Notice. It is the private enforcer's position that the Notice Recipients are obligated to conduct a good-faith investigation into other specific products falling within the type or category of Covered Products that have been manufactured, imported, distributed, sold, shipped, stored, or are otherwise within the Notice Recipients' custody or control, so as to ensure the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

| Covered Products           | Exemplar Products Information                       |  |
|----------------------------|---|--|
| Ceramic Mugs with Exterior | Home Essentials Sugar Skulls Mug – Orange Eyes      |  |
| Designs                    | Style #: 78607A0                                    |  |
|                            | LIN 16 411 35076821 2                               |  |
|                            | Retailer: Burlington Stores, Inc. (Modesto, CA)     |  |
|                            | Manufacturer/Distributor: Home Essentials & Beyond, |  |
|                            | Inc.  |  |
|                            | Home Essentials Sugar Skulls Mug – Red Eyes         |  |
|                            | Style #: 78607A0                                    |  |
|                            | LIN 16 411 35076821 2                               |  |
|                            | Retailer: Burlington Stores, Inc. (Modesto, CA)     |  |
|                            | Manufacturer/Distributor: Home Essentials & Beyond, |  |
|                            | Inc.  |  |

<u>Listed Chemical</u>: The alleged violations involve exposures to the Proposition 65-listed chemical lead. Lead is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. Lead is hereinafter referred to as the "Listed Chemical".

<u>Statement of Violations</u>: The Notice Recipients knowingly and intentionally exposed, and continue to knowingly and intentionally expose, consumers within the State of California to lead, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm, without first giving clear and reasonable warning of this exposure to such individuals. In

particular, the Notice Recipients failed to provide a clear and reasonable warning to consumers that the Covered Products expose consumers to lead.

<u>Route of Exposure</u>: California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the Covered Products, are exposed to the Listed Chemical. Consumers ingest the Listed Chemical when their lips and mouth come into contact with the Covered Products. Consumers also ingest the Listed Chemical when they touch and handle the Covered Products, transfer the Listed Chemical from the Covered Products onto their fingers and hands, and transfer the Listed Chemical from their fingers and hands to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after contact with the Covered Products. Consumers are exposed to the Listed Chemical through direct dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle or touch the Covered Products.

<u>Number and Duration of Violations</u>: Each and every sale of a Covered Product to a consumer in California without a clear and reasonable warning is a violation, including transactions made over-the-counter, through the internet, and/or via catalogue by the Notice Recipients and any other sellers of the Covered Products. These violations have been occurring since at least December 20, 2022, as well as every day since the Covered Products were first introduced and sold in the State of California, as far back as December 20, 2020. The violations are ongoing.

## III. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) and Title 11, California Code of Regulations, section 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto. A second copy of the entire notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the Attorney General with all supporting documentation required by Section 3102 attached thereto.

# IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION – A SUMMARY

A summary of Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead agency designated under Proposition 65, is enclosed with the copy of the Notice served on the Notice Recipients.

# V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Ms. Kallander intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the Notice Recipients upon the expiration of the sixty-day notice period, provided no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

If the Notice Recipients are interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to timeconsuming and expensive litigation, they should contact counsel at the address provided below. It should be noted that no settlement may be finalized before the sixty-day notice period has expired and only if no public prosecutor has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the alleged violation.

## VI. PRESERVATION OF EVIDENCE

This Notice also serves as a demand that the Notice Recipients preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in the Covered Products; purchase and sales information for Covered Products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to the Covered Products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical; and representative exemplars of each specific model falling within the Covered Products. This demand applies to all relevant evidence for Covered Products sold in the State of California, as far back as December 20, 2020, through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

## VII. CONTACT INFORMATION

Audrey Kallander, whose address is 35 Miller Ave. #140, Mill Valley, CA 94941, and whose phone number is 415-702-5449, has retained me as legal counsel in this matter. Please direct all communications related to this Notice of Violation to the following:

Troy Bailey, Esq. Voorhees & Bailey, LLP 839 Emerson Street Palo Alto, CA 94301 troy@voorheesbailey.com

Sincerely,

David Joshua Voorhees Voorhees & Bailey, LLP Attorneys for Audrey Kallander

cc: California Attorney General's Office; District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose and Los Angeles

Attachments: Certificate of Merit; Proof of Service; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary (*Home Essentials & Beyond, Inc., and Burlington Stores, Inc. only*); and Confidential Information in Support of Certificate of Merit (*Attorney General Only*)

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, David Joshua Voorhees, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) certain facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: December 20, 2023

David Joshua Voorhees

#### **PROOF OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within action. I am employed in Santa Clara County, California. My business address is 839 Emerson Street, Palo Alto, CA 94301.

On December 20, 2023, I caused to be served the following documents:

# 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND**

# THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

XXXX **By First Class Certified Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative.

Current President/ CEO Home Essentials & Beyond, Inc. 200 Theodore Conrad Drive Jersey City, NJ 07305 Burlington Stores Inc. c/o Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801

Current President/CEO Burlington Stores Inc. 2006 Route 130 N Burlington, NJ 08016

On December 20, 2023, I caused to be served the following documents:

# 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); AND

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

XXXX **By First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each entity on the attached "U.S. Mail Service List" and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative, postage prepaid.

XXXX **By Electronic Mail** by sending true and correct copies of the above documents to the electronic notification (Email) address(es) on the attached "Electronic Mail Service List".

On December 20, 2023, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND** 

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS**

XXXX **By Electronic Upload** by causing true and correct copies of the above documents to be uploaded to the California Attorney General's website at the web address on the attached "Electronic Upload Service List".

Executed on December 20, 2023, at Palo Alto, California.

Cesar Gonzalez

# U.S. Mail Service List

| Alpine County District Attorney                  | Los Angeles County District Attorney                                     | Solano County District Attorney                   |
|--|--|---|
| P.O. Box 248                                     | 211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200                                       | 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500                      |
| Markleeville, CA 96120                           | Los Angeles, CA 90012  | Fairfield, CA 94533                               |
| Amador County District Attorney                  | Madera County District Attorney  | Stanislaus County District Attorney               |
| 708 Court Street                                 | 209 West Yosemite Avenue   | 832 12th Street, Suite 300                        |
| Jackson, CA 95642                                | Madera, CA 93637   | Modesto, CA 95354                                 |
| Butte County District Attorney                   | Mendocino County District Attorney                                       | Sutter County District Attorney                   |
| 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245                | P.O. Box 1000  | 463 Second Street, Suite 102                      |
| Oroville, CA 95965                               | Ukiah, CA 95482  | Yuba City, CA 95991                               |
| Colusa County District Attorney                  | Modoc County District Attorney   | Tehama County District Attorney                   |
| 346 Fifth Street, Suite 101                      | 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202   | 444 Oak Street, Room L                            |
| Colusa, CA 95932                                 | Alturas, CA 96101  | Red Bluff, CA 96080                               |
| Del Norte County District Attorney               | Mono County District Attorney  | Trinity County District Attorney                  |
| 450 H Street, Room 171                           | P.O. Box 617   | P.O. Box 310                                      |
| Crescent City, CA 95531                          | Bridgeport, CA 93517   | Weaverville, CA 96093                             |
| Glenn County District Attorney                   | Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles                                 | Tuolumne County District Attorney                 |
| P.O. Box 430                                     | James K. Hahn City Hall East   | 423 North Washington Street                       |
| Willows, CA 95988                                | 200 North Main Street, 8th Floor<br>Los Angeles, CA 90012                | Sonora, CA 95370                                  |
| Humboldt County District Attorney                | San Benito County District Attorney                                      | Yuba County District Attorney<br>215 Fifth Street |
| 825 5th Street, Fourth Floor<br>Eureka, CA 95501 | 419 4th Street<br>Hollister, CA 95023                                    | Marysville, CA 95901                              |
| Imperial County District Attorney                | San Bernardino County District Attorney                                  |   |
| 940 West Main Street, Suite 102                  | 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor   |   |
| El Centro, CA 92243                              | San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502  |   |
| Kern County District Attorney                    | Sierra County District Attorney  |   |
| 1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4th Floor                   | P.O. Box 457   |   |
| Bakersfield, CA 93301                            | Downieville, CA 95936  |   |
| Kings County District Attorney                   | Siskiyou County District Attorney  |   |
| 1400 West Lacey Boulevard                        | 311 4th Street   |   |
|  | Yreka, CA 96097  |   |
| Hanford, CA 93230                                |  |   |
| Lake County District Attorney                    | Shasta County District Attorney  |   |
|  | Shasta County District Attorney<br>1355 West Street<br>Redding, CA 96001 |   |

# **Electronic Upload Service List**

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

# Electronic Mail Service List

| Pamela Y. Price, District Attorney                     | Paul E. Zallarbach, District Attornov                                   | Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney    |
|--|---|--|
| Alameda County District Attorney                       | Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney<br>Riverside County               | San Luis Obispo County                       |
| 7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650                         | 3072 Orange Street  | County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor          |
| Oakland, CA 94621                                      | Riverside, CA 92501   | San Luis Obispo, CA 93408                    |
| CEPDProp65@acgov.org                                   | Prop65@rivcoda.org  | edobroth@co.slo.ca.us                        |
|  | The poster moduling   | Cubiotine co.sio.cu.us                       |
| Allison Haley, District Attorney                       | Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney                                  | Jill Ravitch, District Attorney              |
| Napa County  | San Joaquin County  | Sonoma County                                |
| 1127 First Street, Suite C                             | 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202   | 600 Administration Dr                        |
| Napa, CA 94559   | Stockton, CA 95202  | Santa Rosa, CA 95403                         |
| CEPD@countyofnapa.org                                  | DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org                                      | Jeannie.barnes@sonoma-county.org             |
| Alexandra Grayner, Assistant DA                        | Jeffrey S. Rosell , District Attorney                                   | Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney       |
| San Francisco County                                   | Santa Cruz County   | Monterey County                              |
| 350 Rhode Island Street                                | 701 Ocean Street  | 1200 Aguajito Road                           |
| San Francisco, CA 94103                                | Santa Cruz, CA 95060  | Monterey, CA 93940                           |
| alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org                            | Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us   | Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us                   |
|  |   |  |
| Bud Porter   | Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney                                       | Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney           |
| Supervising Deputy District Attorney                   | Yolo County   | City of San Diego                            |
| Santa Clara County                                     | 301 Second Street   | 1200 Third Avenue                            |
| 70 W Hedding St  | Woodland, CA 95695  | San Diego, CA 92101                          |
| San Jose, CA 95110                                     | cfepd@yolocounty.org  | CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov                  |
| EPU@da.sccgov.org                                      |   |  |
| Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney                   | Devin Chandler, Executive Assistant                                     | Christopher Dalbey,                          |
| Ventura County   | Lassen County   | Deputy District Attorney                     |
| 800 S Victoria Ave                                     | 220 S. Lassen Street  | Santa Barbara County                         |
| Ventura, CA 93009                                      | Susanville, CA 96130  | 1112 Santa Barbara St.                       |
| daspecialops@ventura.org                               | dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us   | Santa Barbara, CA 93101                      |
|  |   | DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us              |
| Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney              | Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney                                  | Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney          |
| Contra Costa County                                    | Sacramento County   | Tulare County                                |
| 900 Ward Street  | 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814                                       | 221 S Mooney Blvd                            |
| Martinez, CA 94553                                     | Prop65@sacda.org  | Visalia, CA 95370                            |
| sgrassini@contracostada.org                            |   | Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us                       |
| Barbara Yook, District Attorney                        | Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney                                      | Henry Lifton, Deputy City Attorney           |
| Calaveras County                                       | Inyo County   | City of San Francisco                        |
| 891 Mountain Ranch Road.                               | 168 North Edwards Street  | 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor                |
| San Andreas, CA 95249                                  | Independence, CA 93526  | San Francisco, CA 94102                      |
| Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us                           | inyoda@inyocounty.us  | Prop65@sfcityatty.org                        |
|  |   |  |
| Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney                      | Walter W. Wall, District Attorney                                       | Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney        |
| Merced County  | Mariposa County   | Nevada County                                |
| 550 W. Main Street                                     | P.O. Box 730  | 201 Commercial Street                        |
| Merced, CA 95340                                       | Mariposa, CA 95338  | Nevada City, CA 95959                        |
| Prop65@countyofmerced.com                              | mcda@mariposacounty.org   | DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us                    |
| Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney                  | David Hollister, District Attorney                                      | Summer Stephan, District Attorney            |
| Placer County  | Plumas County   | San Diego County                             |
| 10810 Justice Center Drive                             | 520 Main Street   | 330 W. Broadway Street                       |
| Roseville, CA 95678                                    | Quincy, CA 95971  | San Diego, CA 92101                          |
| prop65@placer.ca.gov                                   | davidhollister@countyofplumas.com                                       | SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org                   |
|  |   |  |
| Orange County District Attorney                        | Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney<br>200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor | Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney         |
| 300 North Flower Street                                |   | 2100 Tulare Street                           |
| Santa Ana, CA 92703<br>Pronés AltoriNotico @ocdana.org | San Jose, CA 96113<br>Proposition65 poticos@conjosoco.gov               | Fresno, CA 93721                             |
| Prop65AlToriNotice@ocdapa.org.                         | Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov                                      | consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov        |
|  |   |  |
| Lori E. Frugoli, Marin County                          | Stephen M, Wagstaffe, San Mateo County                                  | James Clinchard, Assistant District Attorney |
| District Attorney                                      | District Attorney   | 778 Pacific Street                           |
| -  | 100 Country Conton  | Placerville, CA 95667                        |
| 3501 Civic Center Drive, Suite 145                     | 400 County Center   |  |
| -  | Redwood City, CA 94063<br>PROP65@smcgov.org                             | EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us                         |