

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

Hexavalent Chromium in Footwear Made with Leather Materials

December 21, 2023

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d).

- For general information regarding the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, see the attached summary provided by the California EPA (copies not provided to public enforcement agencies).
- This Notice is provided by the Center for Environmental Health ("CEH"), 2201 Broadway, Suite 508, Oakland, CA 94612, (510) 655-3900. CEH is a nonprofit corporation dedicated to protecting the environment, improving human health, and supporting environmentally sound practices. Kaya Allan Sugerman is the Illegal Toxic Threats Program Director of and a responsible individual within CEH.

Description of Violation:

- Violators: The names and addresses of the violators are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- Time Period of Exposure: The violations have been occurring since at least December 21, 2020, and are ongoing.
- Provision of Proposition 65: This Notice covers the "warning provision" of Proposition 65, which is found at California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6.
- Chemical(s) Involved: The name of the listed chemical involved in these violations is chromium (hexavalent compounds), which is also known as hexavalent chromium. Hexavalent chromium is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity. Exposures to hexavalent chromium occur from use of the products identified in this Notice.
- Type of Product: The specific type of product that is the subject of this Notice and is causing these violations is footwear made with leather materials. Non-exclusive examples of this specific type of product are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- Description of Exposure: This Notice addresses consumer exposures to hexavalent chromium. Use of the products identified in this Notice results in human exposures to hexavalent chromium. The routes of exposure for the

violations are: (1) dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers wear, touch, or handle the products or otherwise have direct skin to leather contact with the leather parts of the products; and (2) ingestion via hand to mouth contact after consumers wear, touch, or handle the products. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the carcinogenic or reproductive hazards of hexavalent chromium.

Resolution of Noticed Claims:

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, CEH intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against each alleged violator unless such violator agrees in a binding written instrument to: (1) recall products already sold; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the hexavalent chromium exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(b). If any alleged violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resort to expensive and time-consuming litigation, please feel free to contact CEH through its counsel identified below. It should be noted that CEH cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received CEH's 60-day Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with CEH will resolve its claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

Preservation of Relevant Evidence:

This Notice also serves as a demand that each alleged violator preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of hexavalent chromium in footwear; purchase and sales information for such products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to such products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of hexavalent chromium in such products; and representative exemplars of each unit of any such products sold by each alleged violator in the year preceding this Notice through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

Please direct any inquiries regarding this Notice to CEH's counsel Joseph Mann at Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117, (415) 913-7800, jmann@lexlawgroup.com.

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT
Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

I, Joseph Mann, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney with the Lexington Law Group, and I represent the noticing party, the Center for Environmental Health.

3. Members of my firm and I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that “reasonable and meritorious case for the private action” means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff’s case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of the Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), *i.e.*, (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

December 21, 2023



Joseph Mann
Attorney for CENTER FOR
ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

EXHIBIT 1
December 21, 2023 Notice of Violation
Hexavalent Chromium in Footwear Made with Leather Materials

Names and Addresses of Responsible Parties	Non-Exclusive Examples of the Products	Further Description of Non-Exclusive Exemplar Products
<p style="text-align: center;">Cels Enterprises, Inc. 3485 S. La Cienega Boulevard Los Angeles, CA 90016</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">42 Gold Charmed Leather Mule in Gold</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">UPC No. 7-85717-80893-3, SKU 9416781</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Bill Blass Group, LLC 3 East 44th Street, 6th Floor New York, NY 10017</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Bill Blass Women's Sybil Flat in Black</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">UPC No. 8-47535-04712-0, Style FSY-N001</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Marc Fisher LLC MB Fisher LLC 777 West Putnam Avenue Greenwich, CT 06830</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Zala Block Heel Pointy Toe Pump in Natural Suede</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">UPC No. 1-90360-14825-9</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Everlane, Inc. 2170 Folsom Street San Francisco, CA 94110</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">The Italian Leather Day Heel in Pale Pink</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">UPC No. 0-00001-01194-4, SKU No. F-FTWR-LTHR-HL- BAL-PNK</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Geox S.p.A. Via Feltrina Centro 16 31044 Biadene di Montebelluna Treviso, Italy</p> <p style="text-align: center;">S & A Retail, Inc. 530 7th Avenue, Suite 1005 New York NY 10018</p> <p style="text-align: center;">S & A Distribution, Inc. 530 7th Avenue, Suite 1005 New York NY 10018</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Geox Respira Gerbera High Sandal in Black</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">UPC No. 8-054730-891386, SKU No. WGERBERAHIGH5</p>

1 **PROOF OF SERVICE**

2
3 I, Lilian Macancela, declare:

4 I am a citizen of the United States and employed in the County of San Francisco, State of
5 California. I am over the age of eighteen (18) years and not a party to this action. My business
6 address is 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117 and my email address is
7 lmacancela@lexlawgroup.com.

8 On December 21, 2023, I served the following document(s) on all interested parties in
9 this action by placing a true copy thereof in the manner and at the addresses indicated below:

10 **NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND
11 TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT;**

12 **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT;** and

13 **THE SAFE DRINKING AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986
14 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY** (only sent to those on service list marked with an
15 asterisk).

16 **BY MAIL:** I am readily familiar with the firm's practice for collecting and processing mail
17 with the United States Postal Service ("USPS"). Under that practice, mail would be deposited
18 with USPS that same day with postage thereon fully prepaid at San Francisco, California in the
19 ordinary course of business. On this date, I placed sealed envelopes containing the above
20 mentioned documents for collection and mailing following my firm's ordinary business practices.

21 *Please see attached service list.*

22 **BY ELECTRONIC MAIL:** I transmitted a PDF version of the document(s) listed above via
23 email to the email address(es) indicated on the attached service list [or noted above] on the date
24 executed.

25 Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney
26 Contra Costa County
27 900 Ward Street
28 Martinez, CA 94553
sgrassini@contracostada.org

Bud Porter
Supervising Deputy District Attorney
Santa Clara County
70 West Hedding Street, West Wing
San Jose, CA 95110
epu@da.sccgov.org

Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney
168 North Edwards Street
Independence, CA 93526
inyoda@inyocounty.us

Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney
200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor
San Jose, CA 96113
Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov

Devin Chandler, Executive Assistant
Lassen County
220 S. Lassen Street
Susanville, CA 96130
dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us

Allison Haley, District Attorney
Napa County
1127 First Street, Suite C
Napa, CA 94559
CEPD@countyofnapa.org

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Stephan R. Passalacqua, District Attorney
Sonoma County
600 Administration Drive, Rm. 212J
Santa Rosa, CA 95403
jbarnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney
Tulare County
221 S. Mooney Avenue, Rm. 224
Visalia, CA 93291
Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney
Riverside County
4075 Main Street
Riverside, CA 92501
Prop65@rivcoda.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney
Yolo County
301 Second Street
Woodland, CA 95695
cfepd@yolocounty.org

Walter W. Hall, District Attorney
Mariposa County
P.O. Box 730
Mariposa, CA 95338
mcda@mariposacounty.org

Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney
Merced County
550 West Main Street
Merced, CA 95340
Prop65@countyofmerced.com

Jeannine M. Pacioni, Deputy DA
Monterey County
1200 Aguajito Road
Monterey, CA 93940
Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney
Nevada County
201 Commercial Street
Nevada City, CA 95959
DA.prop65@co.nevada.ca.us

Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney
Placer County
Roseville, CA 95678
Prop65@placer.ca.gov

David Hollister, District Attorney
Plumas County
520 Main Street
Quincy, CA 95971
davidhollister@countyofplumas.com

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney
San Joaquin County
222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202
Stockton, CA 95202
DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney, Santa Barbara County
1112 Santa Barbara Street
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Henry Lifton, Deputy City Attorney
1390 Market Street, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102
Prop65@sfcityatty.org

Summer Stephan, District Attorney
San Diego County
330 West Broadway
San Diego, CA 92101
SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcca.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
San Diego County
1200 Third Avenue
San Diego, CA 92101
CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney
Ventura County
800 South Victoria Avenue
Ventura, CA 93009
daspecialops@ventura.org

Alexandra Grayner, Assistant District Attorney
350 Rhode Island Street
San Francisco, CA 94103
alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney
Sacramento Country
901 G Street
Sacramento, CA 95814
Prop65@sacda.org

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney
San Luis Obispo County
County Government Center Annex, 4th
Floor
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408
edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney
Santa Cruz County
701 Ocean Street
Santa Cruz, CA 95060
Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney
2100 Tulare Street
Fresno, CA 93721
Phone: (559) 600-3141
consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov

Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney
Alameda County
7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650
Oakland, CA 94621
CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Barbara Yook, District Attorney
Calaveras County
891 Mountain Ranch Road
San Andreas, CA 95249
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on December 21, 2023 at San Francisco, California.



Lilian Macancela

SERVICE LIST

District Attorney of Alpine County
P.O. Box 248
Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney of Amador County
708 Court Street, Ste. 202
Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney of Butte County
Administration Building
25 County Center Drive, Suite 245
Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney of Colusa County
310 6th Street
Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney of Del Norte County
450 H Street, Ste. 171
Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney of El Dorado County
778 Pacific Street
Placerville, CA 95667

District Attorney of Glenn County
P.O. Box 430
Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney of Humboldt County
825 5th Street
Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney of Imperial County
939 Main Street, Ste. 102
El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney of Kern County
1215 Truxtun Avenue
Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney of Kings County
1400 West Lacey Blvd.
Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney of Lake County
375 3rd Street
Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney of Los Angeles County
211 W. Temple Street, Ste. 1200
Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210

District Attorney of Madera County
300 South G Street, Suite 300,
Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney of Marin County
3501 Civic Center Drive, Ste 145
San Rafael, CA 94903

District Attorney of Mendocino County
P.O. Box 1000
Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney of Modoc County
204 S. Court Street, Suite 202
Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney of Mono County
P.O. Box 2053
Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546

District Attorney of Orange County
300 N Flower Street
Santa Ana, CA 92703

District Attorney of San Benito County
419 Fourth Street, 2nd Fl.
Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney of San Bernardino County
303 West 3rd Street
San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502

District Attorney of San Mateo County
400 County Center, 3rd Fl.
Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney of Shasta County
1355 West Street
Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney of Sierra County
P.O. Box 457
Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney of Siskiyou County
311 Fourth Street, Room 204
Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney of Solano County
675 Texas Street, Ste. 4500
Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney of Stanislaus County
832 12th Street, Ste. 300
Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney of Sutter County
463 2nd Street, Suite 102
Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney of Tehama County
444 Oak Street, Room L
Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney of Trinity County
P.O. Box 310
11 Court Street
Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney of Tuolumne County
423 North Washington Street
Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney of Yuba County
215 Fifth Street, Suite 152
Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office
City Hall East
200 N. Main Street, Rm. 800
Los Angeles, CA 90012

San Jose City Attorney's Office
200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor
San Jose, CA 95113

Robert Goldman, CEO*
Cels Enterprises, Inc.
3485 S. La Cienega Boulevard
Los Angeles, CA 90016

President/CEO*
Bill Blass Group, LLC*
3 East 44th Street, 6th Floor
New York, NY 10017

President/CEO*
Bill Blass Group, LLC
236 5th Avenue
New York, NY 10001

Marc Fisher, CEO*
Marc Fisher LLC
777 West Putnam Avenue
Greenwich, CT 06830

Marc Fisher, CEO*
MB Fisher LLC
777 West Putnam Avenue
Greenwich, CT 06830

Andrea O'Donnell, CEO*
Everlane, Inc.
2170 Folsom Street
San Francisco, CA 94110

Livio Libralesso, CEO*
Geox S.p.A.
Via Feltrina Centro 16
31044 Biadene di Montebelluna
Treviso, Italy

President/CEO*
S & A Retail, Inc.
530 7th Avenue, Suite 1005
New York NY 10018

President/CEO*
S & A Retail, Inc.
29 W 34th Street, Floor 3
New York NY 10001

President/CEO*
S & A Retail, Inc.
334 S. Buckhout Street
Irvington, NY, 10533

President/CEO*
S & A Distribution, Inc.*
530 7th Avenue, Suite 1005
New York NY 10018

President/CEO*
S & A Distribution, Inc.*
334 S. Buckhout Street
Irvington, NY, 10533