

LAW OFFICES  
**BRODSKY SMITH**

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900  
BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212  
877.534.2590  
www.brodskysmith.com

**NEW JERSEY OFFICE**  
1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY  
CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934  
856.795.7250

**NEW YORK OFFICE**  
240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD  
MINEOLA, NY 11501  
516.741.4977

**PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE**  
TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805  
BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004  
610.667.6200

December 22, 2023

President/CEO Michael's Stores, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington, DE 19808	President/CEO Michael's Stores, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company da CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service Company 211 E. 7 <sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 620 Austin, TX 78701
President/CEO Michaels Stores Procurement Company, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington, DE 19808	President/CEO The Michaels Companies, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington, DE 19808

**60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act<sup>1</sup>**

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Gabriel Espinoza ("Espinoza"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Espinoza has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

---

<sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

## **I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION**

1. **Enforcer:** Gabriel Espinoza, 3924 Carlin Ave., Lynwood, CA 90262-5204; (Ph) 424-285-4896.
2. **Alleged Violator(s):** Michael's Stores, Inc.; Michaels Stores Procurement Company, Inc.; The Michaels Companies, Inc.
3. **Time Period of Exposure:** Violations have been occurring since at least December 22, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
4. **Listed Chemical:** Di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP). DEHP is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defect or other reproductive harm.
5. **Product:**

<b>Product<sup>2</sup></b>	<b>Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product</b>
Mesh Vinyl Bag	Busoha Large Clear Mesh Vinyl Bag X002A00NRB

6. **Description of Exposure:** The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

## **II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION**

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

## **III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS**

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Espinoza against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Espinoza is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

---

<sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Espinoza's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

Espinoza has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. **Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.**

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Evan J. Smith', written over a horizontal line.

Evan J. Smith

**Attachments**

Certificate of Merit

Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**  
Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

I, Evan J. Smith, hereby declare:

- (1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- (2) I am the attorney for the noticing party, Gabriel Espinoza.
- (3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- (4) Based on the information obtained through these consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator(s) will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- (5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: December 22, 2023



\_\_\_\_\_  
Evan J. Smith  
Attorney for Gabriel Espinoza

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within action. My business address is 2 Bala Plaza, Suite 805, Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania. I am employed in Montgomery County where the mailing occurred.

On December 22, 2023 I served the following documents: **Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary** on the following entities and individuals listed below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

President/CEO Michael's Stores, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington, DE 19808	President/CEO Michael's Stores, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company da CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service Company 211 E. 7 <sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 620 Austin, TX 78701
President/CEO Michaels Stores Procurement Company, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington, DE 19808	President/CEO The Michaels Companies, Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington, DE 19808

On December 22, 2023, I served the following documents: **Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary** on each of the individuals on the service list attached hereto as Appendix B by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed December 22, 2023, in Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania.



\_\_\_\_\_  
Evan J. Smith

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley Alameda County District Attorney 7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acajiv.org	The Honorable Lori Vayher Sefzer San Antonio County District Attorney 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 EASefzer@sanantocounty.org	Honorable Arne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org
The Honorable Allison Haley Napa County District Attorney 1127 First St., Suite C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org	The Honorable Jeffrey S. Rosell Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@sanatacruzcounty.us	The Honorable Summer Stephan San Diego County District Attorney 900 West Broadway San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
The Honorable Jeff W. Reisig Yolo County District Attorney 801 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 jreid@yolocounty.org	Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator Lassen County 220 S. Lassen Street Susanville, CA 96130 mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	Mark Ancona, Deputy City Attorney City of San Diego 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
Bud Porter Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 W Hedding Street San Jose, CA 95110 BPorter@sccgov.org	Aletha M. Sargent Assistant District Attorney San Francisco District Attorney's Office 350 Rhode Island Street San Francisco, CA 94103 aletha.sargent@sfgov.org	Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
The Honorable Gregory D. Totten, Ventura County District Attorney 800 S Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009 gastpecialops@ventura.org	The Honorable Barbara Yoock Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249 Prop65Att@co.calaveras.ca.us	Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney Office of the City Attorney 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor San Francisco, CA 94102 Valerie.Lopez@sfoityatny.org
Stacey Grassini Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@conraccostada.org	Eric J. Dobroth Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	Jeanine M. Pasioni Deputy District Attorney Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
The Honorable Thomas Hardy Inyo County District Attorney 168 N. Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526 t Hardy@inyocounty.us	The Honorable Phillip J. Cline Plumas County District Attorney 221 S Meany Blvd Visalia, CA 93270 Prop65@co.plumas.ca.us	The Honorable Clifford Newell Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959 DAProp65@co.nevada.ca.us
The Honorable Paul E. Zslerbach Riverside County District Attorney 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 PaulEZ@rivsoda.org	The Honorable Stephan Passalacqua Sonoma County District Attorney 500 Administration Drive Sonoma, CA 95403 StephanP@sonomacounty.org	The Honorable David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971 sdavidhollister@countyofplumas.com
The Honorable Walter W. Wall Mariposa County District Attorney P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 wwall@marripcounty.org	The Honorable Kimberly Lewis Merced County District Attorney 550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofmerced.com	The Honorable Morgan Briggs Gre Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov
Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 96113 Proposition65Notices@sanjosoca.gov	Lisa A. Shultkamp, District Attorney 2100 Tulare Street Fresno, CA 93721 consumersprotection@fresnocountyca.gov	

### ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST

Office of the California Attorney General  
Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting  
ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator  
P.O. Box 70550  
Oakland, CA 94612-0550  
<https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice>

# SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley Alameda County District Attorney 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612	The Honorable Stacy Montgomery Lassen County District Attorney 220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8 Susanville, CA 95130	The Honorable Candice Hooper San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th Street, Second Floor Hollister, CA 95023	The Honorable Gregg Cohen Tahama County District Attorney 444 Oak Street, Room L Red Bluff, CA 96080
The Honorable Terese Orabec Alpine County District Attorney 270 Laramie Street, PO BOX 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	The Honorable Jackie Lacey Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012	The Honorable Michael Ramos San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West 3rd Street, 8th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	The Honorable Eric Naylor Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
The Honorable Todd Rieba Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642	The Honorable David Linn Madera County District Attorney 208 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 98637	The Honorable Bonnie Dumanis San Diego County District Attorney 330 W. Broadway Street San Diego, CA 92101	The Honorable Tim Ward Tulare County District Attorney 221 South Mooney Boulevard, Rm 224 Visalia, CA 93281-4433
The Honorable Michael Ramsay Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965	The Honorable Edward Beizerlan Marin County District Attorney 9501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903	The Honorable George Gascón San Francisco County District Attorney 850 Bryant Street, Room 322 San Francisco, CA 94103	The Honorable Laura Krieg Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 North Washington Street Sonoma, CA 95370
The Honorable Barbara Yook Calaveras County District Attorney 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249	The Honorable Thomas Cooke Mariposa County District Attorney 5101 Jones Street, P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338	The Honorable Tari Verber Salazar San Joaquin County District Attorney 222 East Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95201	The Honorable Gregory Totten Ventura County District Attorney 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009
The Honorable John Poyner Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street Colusa, CA 95932	The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendocino County District Attorney 100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482	The Honorable Dan Dow San Luis Obispo County District Atty 1095 Palm Street, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	The Honorable Jeff Palsig Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695
The Honorable Mark Peterson Contra Costa County District Attorney 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553	The Honorable Larry Morse II Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main Street Merced, CA 95340	The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	The Honorable Patrick McGrath Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901
The Honorable Dale Trigg Del Norte County District Attorney 450 N Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531	The Honorable Jordan Funk Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 99101	The Honorable Joyce Dudley Santa Barbara County District Attorney 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101	The Honorable Mike Faur Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles 800 City Hall East 200 North Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012
The Honorable Vern Pearson El Dorado County District Attorney 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667	The Honorable Tim Kendall Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 817 Bridgeport, CA 93617	The Honorable Jeffrey Rosen Santa Clara County District Attorney 70 West Hedding Street, West Wing San Jose, CA 95110	The Honorable James Sanchez Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 I Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814
The Honorable Lisa Smitkamp Fresno County District Attorney 2220 Tulare Street, #1000 Fresno, CA 93728	The Honorable Dean Pippo Monterey County District Attorney P.O. Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902	The Honorable Jeff Resell Santa Cruz County District Attorney 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060	The Honorable Jan Goldsmith Office of the City Attorney, San Diego 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101
The Honorable Dwayne Stewart Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 490 Willows, CA 95998	The Honorable Allison Haley Napa County District Attorney 1127 First Street, Suite C Napa, CA 94559	The Honorable Stephen Carlton Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001	The Honorable Dennis Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102
The Honorable Maggie Fleming Humboldt County District Attorney 828 5th Street, Fourth Floor Eureka, CA 95501	The Honorable Clifford Newell Nevada County District Attorney 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959	The Honorable Lawrence Allan Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square Downsville, CA 95935	The Honorable Richard Doyle Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113
The Honorable Robert Stego Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243	The Honorable Tony Rackauckas Orange County District Attorney 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701	The Honorable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097	Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0560
The Honorable Thomas Hardy Inyo County District Attorney P.O. Drawer D Independence, CA 93526	The Honorable R. Scott Owens Placer County District Attorney 10810 Justice Center Drive, Suite 240 Roseville, CA 95678	The Honorable Krishna Abrams Salano County District Attorney 575 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533	
The Honorable Lisa Green Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301	The Honorable David Hollister Plumas County District Attorney 920 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971	The Honorable Jill Ravitch Sonoma County District Attorney 300 Administration Drive, Room 212J Santa Rosa, CA 95403	
The Honorable Keith Fagundes Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230	The Honorable Michael Haslrin Riverside County District Attorney 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501	The Honorable Birgit Pfadager Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354	
The Honorable Donald Anderson Lake County District Attorney 235 North Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453	The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814	The Honorable Amanda Hopper Sutter County District Attorney 463 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991	

APPENDIX A

OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT  
CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986  
(PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and OEHHA implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information.

FOR INFORMATION CONCERNING THE BASIS FOR THE ALLEGATIONS IN THE NOTICE RELATED TO YOUR BUSINESS, CONTACT THE PERSON IDENTIFIED ON THE NOTICE.

The text of Proposition 65 (Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13) is available online at: <http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65law72003.html>. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 25102 through 27001.<sup>1</sup> These implementing regulations are available online at: <http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65Regs.html>.

*WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?*

**The "Proposition 65 List."** Under Proposition 65, the lead agency (OEHHA) publishes a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or reproductive toxicity. Chemicals are placed on the Proposition 65 list if they are known to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, such as damage to

---

<sup>1</sup> All further regulatory references are to sections of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations unless otherwise indicated. The statute, regulations and relevant case law are available on the OEHHA website at: <http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html>.



female or male reproductive systems or to the developing fetus. This list must be updated at least once a year. The current Proposition 65 list of chemicals is available on the OEHHA website at: [http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65\\_list/Newlist.html](http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65_list/Newlist.html).

Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under Proposition 65. Businesses that produce, use, release or otherwise engage in activities involving listed chemicals must comply with the following:

**Clear and reasonable warnings.** A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical unless an exemption applies. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed to that chemical. Some exposures are exempt from the warning requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

**Prohibition from discharges into drinking water.** A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Some discharges are exempt from this requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

#### *DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?*

Yes. You should consult the current version of the statute and regulations (<http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html>) to determine all applicable exemptions, the most common of which are the following:

**Grace Period.** Proposition 65 warning requirements do not apply until 12 months after the chemical has been listed. The Proposition 65 discharge prohibition does not apply to a discharge or release of a chemical that takes place less than 20 months after the listing of the chemical.

**Governmental agencies and public water utilities.** All agencies of the federal, state or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

**Businesses with nine or fewer employees.** Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employs a total of nine or fewer employees. This includes all employees, not just those present in California.

**Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer.** For chemicals that are listed under Proposition 65 as known to the State to cause cancer, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "No Significant Risk Levels" (NSRLs) for many listed carcinogens. Exposures below these levels are exempt from the warning requirement. See OEHHA's website at: <http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html> for a list of NSRLs, and Section 25701 *et seq.* of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

**Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question.** For chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level" divided by 1,000. This number is known as the Maximum Allowable Dose Level (MADL). See OEHHA's website at: <http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html> for a list of MADLs, and Section 25801 *et seq.* of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

**Exposures to Naturally Occurring Chemicals in Food.** Certain exposures to chemicals that naturally occur in foods (i.e., that do not result from any known human activity, including activity by someone other than the person causing the exposure) are exempt from the warning requirements of the law. If the chemical is a contaminant<sup>2</sup> it must be reduced to the lowest level feasible. Regulations explaining this exemption can be found in Section 25501.

**Discharges that do not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering any source of drinking water.** The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the listed chemical has not, does not, or will not pass into or probably pass into a source of drinking water, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" level for chemicals that cause cancer or that is 1,000 times below the "no observable effect" level for chemicals that cause reproductive toxicity, if an individual were exposed to that amount in drinking water.

---

<sup>2</sup> See Section 25501(a)(4).

## HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys. Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. The notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in Section 25903 of Title 27 and sections 3100-3103 of Title 11. A private party may not pursue an independent enforcement action under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an enforcement action within sixty days of the notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court to stop committing the violation.

A private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. For the following types of exposures, the Act provides an opportunity for the business to correct the alleged violation:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

If a private party alleges that a violation occurred based on one of the exposures described above, the private party must first provide the alleged violator a notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form.

A copy of the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form is included in Appendix B and can be downloaded from OEHHA's website at:  
<http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/p65law72003.html>.

*FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...*

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at [P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov](mailto:P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov).

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.

APPENDIX B

OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT  
CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986  
(PROPOSITION 65): SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE

This Appendix B contains the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). Under the Act, a private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. These exposures are:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

A private party may not file an action against the alleged violator for these exposures, or recover in a settlement any payment in lieu of penalties any reimbursement for costs and attorney's fees, if the alleged violator has done *all* of the following within 14 days of being served notice:

- Corrected the alleged violation;
- Agreed to pay a civil penalty of \$500 (subject to change in 2019 and every five years thereafter) to the private party within 30 days; and

- Notified the private party serving the notice in writing that the violation has been corrected.

An alleged violator may satisfy these conditions only one time for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility or on the same premises. The satisfaction of these conditions does not prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney of a city of greater than 750,000 population, or any full-time city prosecutor with the consent of the district attorney, from filing an enforcement action against an alleged violator.

When a private party sends a notice of alleged violation that alleges one or more of the exposures listed above, the notice must include a notice of special compliance procedure, and a proof of compliance form to be completed by the alleged violator as directed in the notice.

The notice and proof of compliance form is reproduced here:

Date:

Page 1

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

**SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE**  
**PROOF OF COMPLIANCE**

You are receiving this form because the Noticing Party listed above has alleged that you are violating California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 (Prop. 65).

**The Noticing Party may not bring any legal proceedings against you for the alleged violation checked below if:**

- (1) You have actually taken the corrective steps that you have certified in this form.
- (2) The Noticing Party has received this form at the address shown above, accurately completed by you, postmarked within 14 days of your receiving this notice.
- (3) The Noticing Party receives the required \$500 penalty payment from you at the address shown above postmarked within 30 days of your receiving this notice.
- (4) This is the first time you have submitted a Proof of Compliance for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility on the same premises.

**PART 1: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE NOTICING PARTY OR ATTORNEY FOR THE NOTICING PARTY**

The alleged violation is for an exposure to: (check one)

\_\_\_ Alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent on-site consumption is permitted by law.

\_\_\_ A chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises for immediate consumption on or off premises to the extent: (1) the chemical was not intentionally added; and (2) the chemical was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination.

\_\_\_ Environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises.

\_\_\_ Chemicals known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking noncommercial vehicles.

**IMPORTANT NOTES:**

- (1) You have no potential liability under California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 if your business has nine (9) or fewer employees.
- (2) Using this form will NOT prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney, or a prosecutor in whose jurisdiction the violation is alleged to have occurred from filing an action over the same alleged violations, and that in any such action, the amount of civil penalty shall be reduced to reflect any payment made at this time.

Date:

Page 2

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

**PART 2: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE ALLEGED VIOLATOR OR AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE**

**Certification of Compliance**

Accurate completion of this form will demonstrate that you are now in compliance with California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 for the alleged violation listed above. You must complete and submit the form below to the Noticing Party at the address shown above, postmarked within 14 days of you receiving this notice.

I hereby agree to pay, within 30 days of completion of this notice, a civil penalty of \$500 to the Noticing Party only and certify that I have complied with Health and Safety Code §25249.6 by (check only one of the following):

- Posting a warning or warnings about the alleged exposure that complies with the law, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises;
- Posting the warning or warnings demanded in writing by the Noticing Party, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; OR
- Eliminating the alleged exposure, and attaching a statement accurately describing how the alleged exposure has been eliminated.

**Certification**

My statements on this form, and on any attachments to it, are true, complete, and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and are made in good faith. I have carefully read the instructions to complete this form. I understand that if I make a false statement on this form, I may be subject to additional penalties under the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65).

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature of alleged violator or authorized representative      Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
Name and title of signatory

*FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...*

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at [P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov](mailto:P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov).

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.