## LAW OFFICES BRODSKY SMITH

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., STE. 900 BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212 877,534,2590 www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE 1310 NORTH KINGS HIGHWAY CHERRY HILL, NJ 08934 856.795.7250 NEW YORK OFFICE 240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD MINEOLA, NY 11501 516.741.4977 PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE TWO BALA PLAZA, STE. 805 BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004 610.667.6200

#### January 10, 2024

President/CEO	President/CEO
Pearhead, Inc.	Pearhead, Inc.
c/o James K. Sakaguchi	67 35 <sup>th</sup> Street, B-642
100 Spectrum Center Drive, Suite 900	Brooklyn, NY 11232
Irvine, CA 92618	
President/CEO	President/CEO
Pearhead, Inc.	Nordstrom, Inc.
100 Jay Street, 20F	c/o CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service
Brooklyn, NY 11201	2710 Gateway Oaks Drive, Suite 150N
	Sacramento, CA 95833
President/CEO	President/CEO
Nordstrom, Inc.	Nordstrom, Inc.
c/o Corporation Service Company	c/o Corporation Service Company
300 Deschutes Way SW, Suite 208	251 Little Falls Drive
MC-CSC1	Wilmington, DE 19808
Turnwater, WA 98501	-
President/CEO	President/CEO
NIHC, Inc.	NIHC, Inc. dba Nordstrom rack
c/o Corporation Service Company	c/o Corporation Service Company
1900 W. Little Blvd.	1900 W. Little Blvd.
Littleton, CO 80120	Littleton, CO 80120

#### 60-Day Notice of Violation of California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act1

To Whom It May Concern:

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

Brodsky Smith represents Ema Bell ("Bell"), a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals from use of consumer products sold in California and to improve human health and the environment by reducing hazardous substances.

With respect to the Product herein, Bell has identified a violation of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65") codified at Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5, et seq. This violation has occurred and continues to occur because the alleged Violator(s) failed to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the Product in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public enforcement agencies that have been served with copies of this Notice are identified in the attached distribution list accompanying the Certificate of Service.

California. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 provides that "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first providing a clear and reasonable warning to such individual ..." Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the Listed Chemical resulting from use of the Product, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and/or how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the Listed Chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the Product.

#### I. DESCRIPTION OF THE VIOLATION

- Enforcer: Ema Bell, 222 S. Figueroa St. Apt. 1212, Los Angeles, CA 90012-2581; (Ph) 424-332-3817.
- 2. Alleged Violator(s): Pearhead, Inc.; Nordstrom, Inc.; NIHC, Inc.; NIHC, Inc. dba Nordstrom rack
- 3. Time Period of Exposure: Violations have been occurring since at least January 10, 2024 and are continuing to this day.
- **4. Listed Chemical**: Lead. Lead is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

#### 5. Product:

Product <sup>2</sup>	Non- Exclusive Examples of the Product
Cookie and Milk Set	Pearhead Santa's Cookie & Milk Set
	UPC# 698904511762

6. Description of Exposure: The exposures that are the subject of this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition, handling and recommended use of the Product. The primary route of exposure to the Listed Chemical is through dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers use, touch, or handle the Products. Some amount of exposure through ingestion can occur by touching the Product with subsequent touching of the user's hand to mouth. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with the Products regarding the health hazards of exposure to the Listed Chemical.

#### II. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, enclosed is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" that has been prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at 916.445.6900.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The specifically identified example of the Product in this Notice is to assist the recipients' investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposures to the Listed Chemical from other items within the definition of Products. This example is not intended to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending Product. It is Bell's position that the alleged Violators are obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other Products that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the alleged Violators' custody or control) during the relevant period to ensure that requisite health hazard warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase and use.

#### III. RESOLUTION OF THE CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Brodsky Smith intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit on behalf of Bell against the alleged Violator(s) unless such Violator(s) agree in a binding written agreement to: (1) recall Products already sold; (2) provide Proposition 65 compliant exposure warnings for Products sold in the future or reformulate the Products to eliminate exposures to the Listed Chemical; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(b). Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and the desire to have these violations of California law quickly rectified, Bell is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of the claims in this Notice without engaging in costly and protracted litigation.

Bell has retained me as legal counsel in connection with this Notice. Please direct all communications regarding this Notice to my attention at Brodsky Smith, 9595 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 900, Beverly Hills, CA 90212, (877) 534-2590, esmith@brodskysmith.com.

Sincerely

Evan J. Smith

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit
Certificate of Service
The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

#### I, Evan J. Smith, hereby declare:

- (1) This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- (2) I am the attorney for the noticing party, Ema Bell.
- (3) I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- (4) Based on the information obtained through these consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator(s) will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- (5) The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: January 10, 2024

Evan J. Smith Attorney for Ema Bell

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years of age, and am not a party to the within action. My business address is 2 Bala Plaza, Suite 805, Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania. I am employed in Montgomery County where the mailing occurred.

On January 10, 2024 I served the following documents: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary on the following entities and individuals listed below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
President/CEO	President/CEO
Pearhead, Inc.	Pearhead, Inc.
c/o James K. Sakaguchi	67 35 <sup>th</sup> Street, B-642
100 Spectrum Center Drive, Suite 900	Brooklyn, NY 11232
Irvine, CA 92618	
President/CEO	President/CEO
Pearhead, Inc.	Nordstrom, Inc.
100 Jay Street, 20F	c/o CSC-Lawyers Incorporating Service
Brooklyn, NY 11201	2710 Gateway Oaks Drive, Suite 150N
	Sacramento, CA 95833
President/CEO	President/CEO
Nordstrom, Inc.	Nordstrom, Inc.
c/o Corporation Service Company	c/o Corporation Service Company
300 Deschutes Way SW, Suite 208	251 Little Falls Drive
MC-CSC1	Wilmington, DE 19808
Turnwater, WA 98501	
President/CEO	President/CEO
NIHC, Inc.	NIHC, Inc. dba Nordstrom rack
c/o Corporation Service Company	c/o Corporation Service Company
1900 W. Little Blvd.	1900 W. Little Blvd.
Littleton, CO 80120	Littleton, CO 80120

On January 10, 2024 I served the following documents: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5, et seq.; Certificate of Merit; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Action of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary on each of the individuals on the service list attached hereto as Appendix B by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the person or entity listed below and depositing it in a US Postal Service Office with postage fully prepaid for delivery by Priority Mail.

Executed January 10, 2024, in Bala Cynwyd, Pennsylvania.

Evan J. Smith

Malley O'Malley	Mit. or other and the second	
Mineria County District Attorney	The Monachite Tool Verber Salzar San longuin Councy District Attorney	Honorable Anne Marie Schubert
Vakport Street, Suite 650		Sacramento County District Attorney 901 G Street
Oakland, CA 94621	Stockien, CA \$5202	Sacramento, CA 95814
CEPPP mp65@aceiv.org	DACquather Environmental@side.org	Prop63@secda.org
The Honorable Allison Haley	The Honorable Jeffrey S. Rosell	The Honorable Summer Stephan
Napa County District Attorney 1127 First St., Suite C	Sunta Cruz County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney
Napa, CA 94559	101 Ocean Street	300 West Broadway
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Sunt; Cruz, CA 95060	San Diego, CA 92101
The User 16 state of g	Proptistia Granda carze o unity us	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
The Honorable Jeff W. Reisig	Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
Yolo County District Attorney 301 Second Street	Eassen County	City of San Diego
Woodland, CA 95695	220 S. Lassen Street	1200 Third Avenue
ofending, CA 95695	Susagrifte, CA 96130	San Disgo, CA 92101
Sud Porter	minimum@co.jussen_eo.us	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
	Aleihea M. Sargont	Christopher Dulbey,
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Assistant District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney
Santa Clara County	San Francisco District Attorney's Office	Sam Barbara County
70 W Hedding Street	350 Rhode Island Street	I I I 2 Santa Barbara Street
Sen Jose, CA 95110	San Francisco, CA 94103	Santa Barbara, CA 93101
EPUBES SEOROV OCE	alethen, surgenti@aftery.org	DAProposition senta-barbara.ca,us
The Honorable Gregory D. Totten,	The Honorable Barbara Yook	Valerie Lopez, Deputy City Attorney
14 CHUITA COUNTY District Actorna	Calmens County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney
1900 S Viotoria Avenue	891 Mountain Ranch Road	1390 Market Street, 7th Flour
Ventura, CA 93009	San Andreas, CA 95249	
despecialons@ventura.org	Propisitav@co.calaveros.ca.us	San Francisco, CA 94102
pitacey Grassini	Bate J. Dobroth	Valorie Lopez@afertyatty.org
Deputy District Attorney	Denuy District Adorney	Jessnine M. Paeioni
A contra Costa Comply	Sen I nie Obi	Deputy District Attorney
200 Ward Street	San Luis Obispo County	Monterey County
Martinez, CA 94553	Comy Govt Center Annex, 4" Floor	1200 Aguajito Road
seranini@contracostada.org	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Monterey, CA 93940
The Honorable Thomas Hardy	guolmothauco.sto.co.us	PrepasDA@co.montercy.ca.us
Lingo County District Attorney	The Remarkle Phillip 1. Cine	The Honorable Clifford Newell
168 M. Edwards Street	Tillure County District Assuracy	Nevada County District Attorney
Independence, CA 93526	22 i S Mooney Blwd	281 Commercial Street
ayoda(Anwacoonty, us	Visalia, CA 955-70	Nevada City, CA 95959
The Honorable Paul E. Zeilerbach	Propósideo adese, co. us	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us
Riverside County District Aftorney	The biomorable Stephan Passalacqua	The Honorable David Hollister
3072 Orange Street	Battoma County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney
Riverside CA 92501	600 Administration Drive	\$20 Main Street, Room 404
Provide CA 92501	5000mg, CA, 95403	Quincy, CA 95971
Panpas@rivceda.org	buneal@sonome-county.org	stavidiscillatera decunty of plumas, som
The Honorable Walter W. Wall	The Monomble Kimpherly Lowis	The Honorable Morgan Briggs Gire
Mariposa County District Attorney	Menced County District Atterney	Placer County District Attorney
F.U. BOX /3()	550 West Main Street	
Mariposa, CA 95338	Merced, CA 95349	10810 Justice Center Drive
meda@moriposucaemty.org	Division of the state of the st	Roseville, CA 95678
Mora V. Frimann City Attended	Propos@countyrobusecod.com	prop65@placer.ca.gov
200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	Lin A. Smilteamp, District Attemey	
San Jose, CA 96113	2100 Twine Steet	
rapposition 65 mail 19	Fresno, CA 93721	
Proposition6Snotices@sanjeseca.gov	consumerosofication (a) freshingen by care governments	*

## ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST

Office of the California Attorney General
Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting
ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator
P.O. Box, 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

## SERVICE LIST

The Marian			
The Honosoble Nancy O'Malkey Alameda County District Attorney	The Honorable Stacey Montgomery Lassen County District Atterney	The Honorable Candice Hooper	The Honorable Gragg Cohen Tehame County District Attorney
1220 Pallon Street, Poorti 900	220 South Lassen Street, Ste. 8	San Banito County District Attorney 419 4th Street, Second Floor	444 Oak Street, Room L
Gakland, CA 94612	Susanville, CA 96130	Hollister, CA 95203	Red Bluff, CA 96080
The Honorable Terese Orabec		l	
Alpine County District Attorney	The Honorable Jackie Lacey	The Honorable Michael Ramos	The Honorable Eric Harylord
270 Laramie Street, PO SOX 248	Los Angeles County District Attorney	San Bernardino County District Attorney	Tsinity County Olstrict Attorney P.O. Box 310
Markleeville, CA 96120	211 West Temple Street, Sulte 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012	303 West 3rd Street, 8th Floor Sen Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	Weaverulle, CA 96093
The Honorable Todd Riebe			
Amader County District Attorney	The Henorable David Linn	The Honorable Sonnie Dumanis	The Honorable Tim Ward
708 Court Street	Madera County District Attorney	San Olego County District Attorney	Tulare County District Altomey 221 South Mouney Boulevard, Rm 224
Jackson, CA affair	209 West Yosemite Avenue Madere, CA 98637	330 W. Broadway Street	Visalia, CA 93291-4593
The Honorophia Webmint Starright	The Hondrable Edward Belbeslan	San Diego, CA 92101	The Honorable Laura Kring
Vermotte Salield William	Marin County District Afforney	The Handrable George Gascon	Tudiumne County District Attorney
as County Center Origa	3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130	San Francisco County District Attorney 850 Bryant Street, Room 322	423 North Washington Street
Oroville, CA 95955	San Raigel, CA 94903	San Francisco, CA 94103	Senera, CA 95370
The Hondrable Sarbers Yook	The Honorable Thomas Cooke	The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar	The Honorable Gregory Tolten
Galayeras County Dietake Artes	Mariposa County District Attorney	San Jeaquin County Olsirict Afterney	Ventura County District Attorney
101 William Hands Road	5101 Janes Street, P.O. Box 730	222 East Weber Avenue, Room 202	800 South Victoria Avenue
San Andress, CA 95249	Marigosa, CA 95338	Stockton, CA 95201	Ventura, CA 93009
The Honorable John Poyner Column County District	The Renorable C. Cauld Funtar	The Honorable Can Dow	The Honorable Jaff Reisig
Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street	Mendaging County District Attornay	San Luis Obispo County District Ally	Yala County District Altamoy
Celusa, CA 95932	100 North State Street, P.O. Box 1000	1035 Palm Street, 4th Floor	301 Second Street
The Honorable Mark Patersons	J Ulain, CA 95482	San Luis Obiseo, CA 93408	Wondland, CA 99695
Confra Costa County District Adorson	The Honorable Larry Morse II	The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe	The Henerable Patrick McGrath
ann adata attabl	Merced County District Attorney 550 W. Main Street	San Mateo County District Attorney	Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street
Marlinez, CA 94553	Merced, CA 95840	409 County Center, Third Floor	Marusville, CA 35901
The Honocable Date Tales	The Honorable Jordan Funk	Redwood City, CA 94069	The Honorable Mike Feuer
10) Pipelie Genina Platelal Assessment	Madec County District Attorney	The Yongrable Joyce Dudley Santa Barbara County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles
100 A Shear Hoom 171	204 S. Court Street, Suite 202	1112 Santa Barbara Street	800 City Hall East
Crescent City, CA 95531	Alturas, CA 99101	Santa Barbara, CA 93101	200 North Main Street
The Honerable Vern Plerson			Les Angeles, CA 99912.
El Devete County District Attorney	The Honorable Tim Kendall	The Ronorable Jeffray Rosen	The Honorable James Sanchez
778 Paellic Street	Mono County Olstrict Attorney	Santa Clara County District Attorney	Office of the City Attomey, Sacramento
lacerville, CA greez	P.O. Box 817	70 West Hedding Street, West Wing	915 I Street, 4th Floor
the remomble Like Course	Bridgepurt, CA 93517	San Jose, CA 95110	Sacramento, CA 95814
1951 W Later of Higher Attacage	The Henorable Oean Flippo	The Honorable Jeff Rosell	The Honorable Jan Goldsmith Office of the City Attorney, San Diego
COUNTY STORY MINOR	Monterey County District Altorney P.O. Box 1131	Santa Cruz County District Attorney	1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620
1890A DA 98724	Salinus, CA 93502	701 Ocean Street; Room 200	San Diego, CA 92101
he Henerable Owayne Stewart	The Honorable Allison Haley	Sania Cruz, CA 95080	The Hangrable Dennis Herrera
STERRY COUNTY DISTRICT Attorney	Napa County District Attorney	The Honorable Stephen Carlton Sheste County District Attorney	Office of the City Altomey, San
OBP XOE U.	1127 First Street, Suite C	1355 West Street	Francisco
Villows, CA 95988	Napa, GA 94559	Redding, CA 96001	1 Or. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
tin Wasser to 187		1	San Francisco, CA 94102
he Mongrable Maggle Fleming Lundoldt County Blattlot Attorney	The Honorable Clifford Newell	The Honorable Lawrence Atlen	The Honorable Richard Doyle
26 3th Street, Fourth Floor	Navada County District Attorney	Siena County District Attorney	Office of the City Allomey, San Jose
ureka, CA 95581	201 Commercial Street	100 Courlhouse Square	200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor
he Monoreble Colonel Otorio	Nevada City, OA 95959	Downleville, CA 95936	San Jese, CA 95113
HIDERIAL CONSTITUTE ENABLES AND	The Honorable Tony Rackauckes	The Honorable James Kirk Andrus	Office of the California Attorney General
40 West Wash Street Suite 100	Orange County District Attorney	Slskiyoù County District Attorney	Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting
Centro, CA 92243	401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701	P.O. Box 986	ATTN: Frop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000
	Jana Mia, CA 92701	Yraka, QA 96097	Oakland, OA 94912-0550
he Honorable Thomas Hardy	The Hungrable R. Scott Owens	The Honorable Krishna Abrems	1 Aminimi Astrada Managar
tyo Gounty District Attorney	Placer County District Atterney	Salano County Olstriat Attorney	3
.U. Urawar O	10810 Justice Center Orive, Suite 240	675 Texas Street, Suite 4500	1
dependence, CA 93526	Agsaville, CA 95678	Fairfield, CA 94593	1
ng Hongrabla Liga Green	The Honorable David Hollister	The Hangratile Jill Ravitoh	1
BIT COUNTY District Strong	Plumas County District Atterney	Senoma County District Astomey	1
215 Fruxim Average	520 Main Street, Room 404	560 Administration Onive, Room 212J	1
akarshaid, CA 9990-	Quincy, CA 95971	Santa Rusa, CA 95403	1
ne Honorable Keith Fagundas	The Honorable Michael Hestrin	The Kongrabie Birgit Fladager	
HIGS LABORAL PROPERTY ASSESSMENT	Riverside County District Attorney	Stanislaus County District Attorney	=
Way Trest Easay Boulavant	3960 Orange Street		1
aniord, CA 98280	Riverside, CA 92501	892 12th Street, Suite 300	1
të Honorabie Conald Andorres		Modesto, CA 95354	
IKE COUNTY DISERCE Attorney	The Hungrable Anne Marie Schubert	The Hondrable Amanda Hopper	1
55 North Forbes Street	Sagramento County Olstrict Attorney 901 G Street	Suller County District Attorney	
akeport CA 95453	Sacramento CA 95814	463 Second Street, Sulte 102	1
10000	1 PEER WY ONIGHTED AND	Yuba City CA 95991	3

#### APPENDIX A

# OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and OEHHA implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information.

FOR INFORMATION CONCERNING THE BASIS FOR THE ALLEGATIONS IN THE NOTICE RELATED TO YOUR BUSINESS, CONTACT THE PERSON IDENTIFIED ON THE NOTICE.

The text of Proposition 65 (Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13) is available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65law/2003.html. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 25102 through 27001.1 These implementing regulations are available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65Regs.html.

## WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

The "Proposition 65 List." Under Proposition 65, the lead agency (OEHHA) publishes a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or reproductive toxicity. Chemicals are placed on the Proposition 65 list if they are known to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, such as damage to

All further regulatory references are to sections of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations unless otherwise indicated. The statute, regulations and relevant case law are available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html.

female or male reproductive systems or to the developing fetus. This list must be updated at least once a year. The current Proposition 65 list of chemicals is available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65\_list/Newlist.html:

Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under Proposition 65. Businesses that produce, use, release or otherwise engage in activities involving listed chemicals must comply with the following:

Clear and reasonable warnings. A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical unless an exemption applies. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed to that chemical. Some exposures are exempt from the warning requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

Prohibition from discharges into drinking water. A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Some discharges are exempt from this requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

### DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. You should consult the current version of the statute and regulations (http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html) to determine all applicable exemptions, the most common of which are the following:

Grace Period. Proposition 65 warning requirements do not apply until 12 months after the chemical has been listed. The Proposition 65 discharge prohibition does not apply to a discharge or release of a chemical that takes place less than 20 months after the listing of the chemical.

Governmental agencies and public water utilities. All agencies of the federal, state or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

Businesses with nine or fewer employees. Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employe a total of nine or fewer employees. This includes all employees, not just those present in California.

Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer. For chemicals that are listed under Proposition 65 as known to the State to cause cancer, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "No Significant Risk Levels" (NSRLs) for many fisted carcinogens. Exposures below these levels are exempt from the warning requirement. See OEHHA's website at:

http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of NSRLs, and Section 25701 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question. For chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level" divided by 1,000. This number is known as the Maximum Allowable Dose Level (MADL). See OEHHA's website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of MADLs, and Section 25801 et seq. of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated

Exposures to Naturally Occurring Chemicals in Food. Certain exposures to chemicals that naturally occur in foods (i.e., that do not result from any known human activity, including activity by someone other than the person causing the exposure) are exempt from the warning requirements of the law. If the chemical is a contaminant<sup>2</sup> it must be reduced to the lowest level feasible. Regulations explaining this exemption can be found in Section 25501.

entering any source of drinking water. The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the listed chemical has not, does not, or will not pass into or probably pass into a source of drinking water, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" level for chemicals that cause cancer or that is 1,000 times below the "no observable effect" level for chemicals that cause reproductive toxicity, if an individual were exposed to that amount in drinking water.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Section 25501(a)(4).

### HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys. Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. The notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in Section 25903 of Title 27 and sections 3100-3103 of Title 11. A private party may not pursue an independent enforcement action under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an enforcement action within sixty days of the notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court to stop committing the violation.

A private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. For the following types of exposures, the Act provides an opportunity for the business to correct the alleged violation:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

If a private party alleges that a violation occurred based on one of the exposures described above, the private party must first provide the alleged violator a notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form.

A copy of the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form is included in Appendix B and can be downloaded from OEHHA's website at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/p65law72003.html.

# FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.

#### APPENDIX B

# OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE

This Appendix 8 contains the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). Under the Act, a private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. These exposures are:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure
  occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily
  intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

A private party may not file an action against the alleged violator for these exposures, or recover in a settlement any payment in lieu of penalties any reimbursement for costs and attorney's fees, if the alleged violator has done all of the following within 14 days of being served notice:

- Corrected the alleged violation;
- \* Agreed to pay a civil penalty of \$500 (subject to change in 2019 and every five years thereafter) to the private party within 30 days; and

Notified the private party serving the notice in writing that the violation has been corrected

An alleged violator may satisfy these conditions only one time for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility or on the same premises. The satisfaction of these conditions does not prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney of a city of greater than 750,000 population, or any full-time city prosecutor with the consent of the district attorney, from filing an enforcement action against an alleged violator.

When a private party sends a notice of alleged violation that alleges one or more of the exposures listed above, the notice must include a notice of special compliance procedure, and a proof of compliance form to be completed by the alleged violator as directed in the notice.

The notice and proof of compliance form is reproduced here:

Date:

Page 1

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

### SPECIAL COMPLIANCE PROCEDURE PROOF OF COMPLIANCE

You are receiving this form because the Noticing Party listed above has alleged that you are violating California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 (Prop. 65).

The Noticing Party may not bring any legal proceedings against you for the alleged violation checked below if:

- (1) You have actually taken the corrective steps that you have certified in this
- (2) The Noticing Party has received this form at the address shown above, accurately completed by you, postmarked within 14 days of your receiving this
- (3) The Noticing Party receives the required \$500 penalty payment from you at the address shown above postmarked within 30 days of your receiving this notice.
- (4) This is the first time you have submitted a Proof of Compliance for a violation arising from the same exposure in the same facility on the same premises.

### PART 1: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE NOTICING PARTY OR ATTORNEY FOR THE **NOTICING PARTY**

The alleged violation is for an exposure to: (check one)

Alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent on-site consumption is permitted by law.	
A chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in a food of beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises for immediate consumption on or off premises to the extent: (1) the chemical was not intentionally added; and (2) the chemical was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination.	
Environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted a any location on the premises.	s) at
Chemicals known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking noncommercial vehicles.	a

## IMPORTANT NOTES:

(1) You have no potential liability under California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 if your business has nine (9) or fewer employees.

(2) Using this form will NOT prevent the Attorney General, a district attorney, a city attorney, or a prosecutor in whose jurisdiction the violation is alleged to have occurred from filing an action over the same alleged violations, and that in any such action, the amount of civil penalty shall be reduced to reflect any payment made at this time.

Date:

Name of Noticing Party or attorney for Noticing Party:

Address:

Phone number:

## PART 2: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE ALLEGED VIOLATOR OR AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE

Certification of Compliance

Page 2

Accurate completion of this form will demonstrate that you are now in compliance with California Health and Safety Code §25249.6 for the alleged violation listed above. You must complete and submit the form below to the Noticing Party at the address shown above, postmarked within 14 days of you receiving this notice.

I hereby agree to pay, within 30 days of completion of this notice, a civil penalty of \$500 to the Noticing Party only and certify that I have complied with Health and Safety Code §25249.6 by (check only one of the following):

[] Posting a warning or warnings about the alleged exposure that complies with the law, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; [] Posting the warning or warnings demanded in writing by the Noticing Party, and attaching a copy of that warning and a photograph accurately showing its placement on my premises; OR
[] Eliminating the alleged exposure, and attaching a statement accurately describing how the alleged exposure has been eliminated.
My statements on this form, and on any attachments to it, are true, complete, and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief and are made in good faith. I have carefully read the instructions to complete this form. I understand that if I make a false statement on this form, I may be subject to additional penalties under the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65).
Signature of alleged violator or authorized representative Date
Name and title of signatory
FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS
Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at

Revised: May 2017

P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.