

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

Hexavalent Chromium in Footwear Made with Leather Materials

March 8, 2024

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d).

- For general information regarding the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, see the attached summary provided by the California EPA (copies not provided to public enforcement agencies).
- This Notice is provided by the Center for Environmental Health ("CEH"), 2201 Broadway, Suite 508, Oakland, CA 94612, (510) 655-3900. CEH is a nonprofit corporation dedicated to protecting the environment, improving human health, and supporting environmentally sound practices. Emily Reder is the Illegal Toxic Threats Senior Program Manager of and a responsible individual within CEH.

Description of Violation:

- Violators: The names and addresses of the violators are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- Time Period of Exposure: The violations have been occurring since at least March 8, 2021, and are ongoing.
- Provision of Proposition 65: This Notice covers the "warning provision" of Proposition 65, which is found at California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6.
- Chemical(s) Involved: The name of the listed chemical involved in these violations is chromium (hexavalent compounds), which is also known as hexavalent chromium. Hexavalent chromium is listed under Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and reproductive toxicity. Exposures to hexavalent chromium occur from use of the products identified in this Notice.
- Type of Product: The specific type of product that is the subject of this Notice and is causing these violations is footwear made with leather materials. Non-exclusive examples of this specific type of product are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- Description of Exposure: This Notice addresses consumer exposures to hexavalent chromium. Use of the products identified in this Notice results in human exposures to hexavalent chromium. The routes of exposure for the violations are: (1) dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers

wear, touch, or handle the products or otherwise have direct skin to leather contact with the leather parts of the products; and (2) ingestion via hand to mouth contact after consumers wear, touch, or handle the products. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the carcinogenic or reproductive hazards of hexavalent chromium.

Resolution of Noticed Claims:

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, CEH intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against each alleged violator unless such violator agrees in a binding written instrument to: (1) recall products already sold; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the hexavalent chromium exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(b). If any alleged violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resort to expensive and time-consuming litigation, please feel free to contact CEH through its counsel identified below.

For any alleged violators that are interested in potentially resolving this dispute by way of reformulating the products at issue rather than providing warnings, there is an opt-in procedure by which entities may agree to the terms of a prior CEH settlement requiring the adoption of state-of-the-art protocols designed to prevent the formation of hexavalent chromium on the surface of the products. For more information on this opt-in procedure, please visit the website established at <https://prop65hexchromesettlement.com/>. However, please note that the deadline to opt in is **May 21, 2024**.

It should be noted that CEH cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received CEH's 60-day Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with CEH will resolve its claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

Preservation of Relevant Evidence:

This Notice also serves as a demand that each alleged violator preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of hexavalent chromium in footwear; purchase and sales information for such products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to such products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of hexavalent chromium in such products; and representative exemplars of each unit of any such products sold by each alleged violator in the year preceding this Notice through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

Please direct any inquiries regarding this Notice to CEH's counsel Joseph Mann at Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117, (415) 913-7800, jmann@lexlawgroup.com.

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT
Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

I, Joseph Mann, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney with the Lexington Law Group, and I represent the noticing party, the Center for Environmental Health.

3. Members of my firm and I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that “reasonable and meritorious case for the private action” means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff’s case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of the Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), *i.e.*, (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

March 8, 2024



Joseph Mann
Attorney for CENTER FOR
ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

EXHIBIT 1
March 8, 2024 Notice of Violation
Hexavalent Chromium in Footwear Made with Leather Materials

Names and Addresses of Responsible Parties	Non-Exclusive Examples of the Products	Further Description of Non-Exclusive Exemplar Products
<p>Off-White Operating S.r.L. Via Filippo Turati 12 20121 Milano (MI) Italy</p> <p>Off-White, LLC 1920 Adelia Street, #300 Nashville, TN 37212</p> <p>Off-White Operating Holding Corp. 350 5th Avenue, 41st Floor New York, NY 10118</p>	Off-White Bookish Leather Sponge Slider in Beige Brown	UPC No. 1-96629-56728-1 Style No. OWIT001823LEA0016160
<p>Dolce & Gabbana USA Inc. 546 5th Avenue, 10th Floor New York, NY 10036</p>	Dolce & Gabbana Leather Pump in Black	UPC No. 40020226570 Style No. CG0037A1294
<p>Manolo Blahnik Americas LLC 717 Madison Avenue New York, NY 10065</p> <p>Manolo Blahnik USA, Ltd. 31 West 54th Street New York, NY 10019</p>	Manolo Blahnik Designer Heels in Green	UPC No. 5059879143108
<p>Roger Vivier S.p.A. Via Filippo Della Valle 1 63811 Sant'Elpidio a Mare (FM) Italy</p> <p>Cal. Del. U.S.A. Inc. 555 Madison Avenue, 20th Floor New York, NY 10022</p>	Roger Vivier Strass Buckle Rope Wedge	UPC No. 193563300127 Style No. RVW61931050F
<p>Brunello Cucinelli, USA, Inc. 466 Saw Mill River Road Ardsley, NY 10502</p>	Brunello Cucinelli Leather Sandals in Black	UPC No. 8055722465103 Style No. MZOPC2145-22

1 **PROOF OF SERVICE**

2 I, Lilian Macancela, declare:

3 I am a citizen of the United States and employed in the County of San Francisco, State of
4 California. I am over the age of eighteen (18) years and not a party to this action. My business
5 address is 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117 and my email address is
6 Lmacancela@lexlawgroup.com.

7 On March 8, 2024, I served the following document(s) on all interested parties in this
8 action by placing a true copy thereof in the manner and at the addresses indicated below:

9 **NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND
10 TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT;**

11 **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT;** and

12 **THE SAFE DRINKING AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986**
13 **(PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY** (only sent to those on service list marked with an
14 asterisk).

15 ☒ **BY MAIL:** I am readily familiar with the firm's practice for collecting and processing mail
16 with the United States Postal Service ("USPS"). Under that practice, mail would be deposited
17 with USPS that same day with postage thereon fully prepaid at San Francisco, California in the
18 ordinary course of business. On this date, I placed sealed envelopes containing the above-
19 mentioned documents for collection and mailing following my firm's ordinary business practices.

20 *Please see attached service list.*

21 ☒ **BY ELECTRONIC MAIL:** I transmitted a PDF version of the document(s) listed above via
22 email to the email address(es) indicated on the attached service list [or noted above] the date
23 executed.

24 Nancy O'Malley, District Attorney
25 Alameda County
26 7677 Oakport St. Ste 650
27 Oakland, CA 94621
28 CEPDProp65@acgov.org

James Clinchard, Assistant District Attorney
El Dorado County
778 Pacific St., Placerville, CA 95667
EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us

Barbara Yook, District Attorney
Calaveras County
891 Mountain Ranch Rd.
San Andreas, CA 95249
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney
Fresno County
2100 Tulare St., Fresno, CA 93721
consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney
Contra Costa County
900 Ward St.
Martinez, CA 94553
sgrassini@contracostada.org

Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney
Inyo County
168 North Edwards St.
Independence, CA 93526
inyoda@inyocounty.us

1	Devin Chandler, Program Coordinator Lassen County 2950 Riverside Dr. Susanville, CA 96130 dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us	Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County 3072 Orange St. Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org
4	Lori E. Frugoli, District Attorney Marin County 3501 Civic Center Dr, Rm 145 San Rafael, CA 94903 consumer@marincounty.org	Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney Sacramento County 901 G St. Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org
7	Walter W. Wall, District Attorney Mariposa County P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org	Summer Stephan, District Attorney San Diego County 330 West Broadway San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org Mark Ankorn, Deputy City Attorney 1200 Third Ave. San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
10	Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney Merced County 550 West Main St. Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofmerced.com	
13	Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Rd Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us	Henry Lifton, Deputy City Attorney San Francisco County 1390 Market Street, 7th Fl San Francisco, CA 94102 Prop65@sfcityatty.org Alexandra Grayner, Assistant District Attorney 350 Rhode Island St San Francisco, CA 94103 alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org
16	Allison Haley, District Attorney Napa County 1127 First Street, Ste C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Ave., Rm 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org
19	Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney Nevada County 201 Commercial St. Nevada City, CA 95959 DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us	Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Government Center Annex, 4th Fl San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
22	Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney Placer County 10810 Justice Center Dr. Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov	Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara St. Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
25	David Hollister, District Attorney Plumas County 520 Main St. Quincy, CA 95971 davidhollister@countyofplumas.com	
28		

1 Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney
2 Santa Clara County
3 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Fl
4 San Jose, CA 96113
5 Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov
6 Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District
7 Attorney
8 70 W Hedding St
9 San Jose, CA 95110
10 EPU@da.sccgov.org

11 Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney
12 Santa Cruz County
13 701 Ocean St.
14 Santa Cruz, CA 95060
15 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

16 Jill Ravitch, District Attorney
17 Sonoma County
18 600 Administration Dr

Santa Rosa, CA 95403
Jeannie.barnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney
Tulare County
221 S Mooney Blvd
Visalia, CA 95370
Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney
Ventura County
800 S Victoria Ave.
Ventura, CA 93009
daspecialops@ventura.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney
Yolo County
301 Second St.
Woodland, CA 95695
cfepd@yolocounty.org

19 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the
20 foregoing is true and correct.

21 Executed on March 8, 2024 at San Francisco, California.



Lilian Macancela

SERVICE LIST

District Attorney of Alpine County
P.O. Box 248
Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney of Amador County
708 Court St, Ste. 202
Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney of Butte County
Administration Building
25 County Center Dr, Ste 245
Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney of Colusa County
310 6th St
Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney of Del Norte County
450 H St, Ste. 171
Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney of Glenn County
P.O. Box 430
Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney of Humboldt County
825 5th St
Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney of Imperial County
939 Main St, Ste. 102
El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney of Kern County
1215 Truxtun Ave
Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney of Kings County
1400 West Lacey Blvd.
Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney of Lake County
375 3rd St
Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney of Los Angeles County
211 W. Temple St, Ste. 1200
Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210

District Attorney of Madera County
300 South G St, Ste 300,
Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney of Mendocino County
P.O. Box 1000
Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney of Modoc County
204 S. Court St, Ste 202
Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney of Mono County
P.O. Box 2053
Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546

District Attorney of Orange County
300 N Flower St
Santa Ana, CA 92703

District Attorney of San Benito County
419 Fourth St, 2nd Fl.
Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney of San Bernardino County
303 West 3rd St
San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502

District Attorney of San Mateo County
400 County Center, 3rd Fl.
Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney of Shasta County
1355 West St
Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney of Sierra County
P.O. Box 457
Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney of Siskiyou County
311 Fourth St, Rm 204
Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney of Solano County
675 Texas St, Ste. 4500
Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney of Stanislaus County
832 12th St, Ste. 300
Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney of Sutter County
463 2nd St, Ste 102
Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney of Tehama County
444 Oak St, Rm L
Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney of Trinity County
P.O. Box 310
11 Court St
Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney of Tuolumne County
423 N Washington St
Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney of Yuba County
215 Fifth St, Ste 152
Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office
City Hall East
200 N. Main St, Rm. 800
Los Angeles, CA 90012

President/CEO*
Off-White Operating S.r.L.
Via Filippo Turati 12
20121 Milano (MI)
Italy

President/CEO*
Off-White, LLC
1920 Adelicia Street, #300
Nashville, TN 37212

President/CEO*
Off-White Operating Holding Corp.
350 5th Avenue, 41st Floor
New York, NY 10118

Alberto Candellero, CEO*
Dolce & Gabbana USA Inc.
546 5th Avenue, 10th Floor
New York, NY 10036

President/CEO*
Manolo Blahnik Americas LLC
717 Madison Avenue
New York, NY 10065

President/CEO*
Manolo Blahnik Americas LLC
c/o C T Corporation System
28 Liberty Street
New York, NY 10005

President/CEO*
Manolo Blahnik USA, Ltd.
31 West 54th Street
New York, NY 10019

President/CEO*
Roger Vivier S.p.A.
Via Filippo Della Valle 1
63811 Sant'Elpidio a Mare (FM)
Italy

Roberto Lorenzini, CEO*
Cal. Del. U.S.A. Inc.
555 Madison Avenue, 20th Floor
New York, NY 10022

Ignazio Massimo Caronna, CEO*
Brunello Cucinelli, USA, Inc.
466 Saw Mill River Road
Ardsley, NY 10502