

Environmental Research Center

3111 Camino Del Rio North, Suite 400 San Diego, CA 92108 619-500-3090

March 14, 2024

NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ. (PROPOSITION 65)

Dear Alleged Violator and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

I am the In-House Counsel for Environmental Research Center, Inc. ("ERC"). ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

ERC has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*, with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violator identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violator and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Section 25249.7(d) of the statute, ERC intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

<u>General Information about Proposition 65</u>. A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is attached with the copy of this letter served to the alleged Violator identified below.

<u>Alleged Violator</u>. The name of the company covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the "Violator") is:

Profile Products, LLC

<u>Consumer Products and Listed Chemical</u>. The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

- 1. HMR 70 Plus Chocolate Shake and Pudding Mix Lead
- 2. HMR 800 Chocolate Shake Mix Lead

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.* March 14, 2024 Page 2

- 3. HMR Double Chocolate Chip Flavored Bar Lead
- 4. HMR Iced Oatmeal Flavored Bar Lead
- 5. HMR 120 Chocolate Shake Mix Lead
- 6. HMR 70 Plus Vanilla Shake and Pudding Mix Lead
- 7. HMR 800 Vanilla Shake Mix Lead

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

It should be noted that ERC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

Route of Exposure. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the recommended use of these products. Consequently, the route of exposure to this chemical has been and continues to be through ingestion.

Approximate Time Period of Violations. Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least March 14, 2021, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemical. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violator violated Proposition 65 because it failed to provide persons ingesting these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to this chemical.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, ERC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violator to: (1) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemical, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings compliant with Proposition 65 to all persons located in California who purchased the above products in the last three years. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemical, as well as expensive and time-consuming litigation.

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.* March 14, 2024 Page 3

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to my attention, or Chris Heptinstall, Executive Director of ERC, at the above listed address and telephone number.

Sincerely,

Charles Poss In-House Counsel Environmental Research Center

Attachments

Certificate of Merit

Certificate of Service

OEHHA Summary (to Profile Products, LLC and its Registered Agent for Service of Process only)

Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Re: Environmental Research Center, Inc.'s Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Profile Products, LLC

I, Charles Poss, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice in which it is alleged the party identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
 - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: March 14, 2024

Charles Poss

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.* March 14, 2024 Page 5

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE PURSUANT TO 27 CCR § 25903

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States and over the age of 18 years of age. My business address is 306 Joy Street, Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia 30742. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

On March 14, 2024, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE \$25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties listed below and depositing it in a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Current President or CEO Profile Products, LLC 1305 W 18th Street Sioux Falls, SD 57105 Cogency Global Inc. (Registered Agent for Profile Products, LLC) 326 N Madison Ave Pierre, SD 57501

Current President or CEO Profile Products, LLC PO Box 5039 Sioux Falls, SD 57117

On March 14, 2024, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I verified the following documents NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1) were served on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was uploaded on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Post Office Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On March 14, 2024, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** were served on the following parties when a true and correct copy thereof was sent via electronic mail to each of the parties listed below:

Pamela Y. Price, District Attorney Alameda County 7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Barbara Yook, District Attorney Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249 Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

James Clinchard, Assistant District Attorney El Dorado County 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667 EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.* March 14, 2024

Page 6

Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney

Fresno County 2100 Tulare Street Fresno, CA 93721

consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov

Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney

Invo County

168 North Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526 inyoda@inyocounty.us

Devin Chandler, Program Coordinator

Lassen County 2950 Riverside Dr Susanville, CA 96130 dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us

Lori E. Frugoli, District Attorney

Marin County

3501 Civic Center Drive, Suite 145

San Rafael, CA 94903 consumer@marincounty.org

Walter W. Wall, District Attorney

Mariposa County P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org

Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney

Merced County 550 West Main St Merced, CA 95340

Prop65@countyofmerced.com

Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney

Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940

Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Allison Haley, District Attorney

Napa County

1127 First Street, Ste C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney

Nevada County 201 Commercial St Nevada City, CA 95959 DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us Todd Spitzer, District Attorney

Orange Couty 300 N Flower St Santa Ana, CA 92703 Prop65notice@ocdapa.org

Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney

Placer County

10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 Prop65@placer.ca.gov

David Hollister, District Attorney

Plumas County 520 Main St Quincy, CA 95971

davidhollister@countyofplumas.com

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney

Riverside County 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney

Sacramento County 901 G Street

Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org

Summer Stephan, District Attorney

San Diego County 330 West Broadway San Diego, CA 92101

SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney

San Diego City Attorney 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101

CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

Alexandra Grayner, Assistant District Attorney San Francisco District Attorney's Office

350 Rhode Island Street San Francisco, CA 94103

Alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org

Henry Lifton, Deputy City Attorney San Francisco City Attorney 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor San Francisco, CA 94102

Prop65@sfcityatty.org

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. March 14, 2024 Page 7

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org

Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney Santa Clara City Attorney 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 96113 Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

Jill Ravitch, District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Dr Sonoma, CA 95403 Jeannie.Barnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org

On March 14, 2024, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it with the U.S. Postal Service with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by First Class Mail.

Executed on March 14, 2024, in Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

Phyllis Dunwoody

Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. March 14, 2024 Page 8

Service List

District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 17300 Hwy 89

Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney, Amador

708 Court Street, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney, Butte

County

25 County Center Drive, Suite

Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney, Colusa

310 6th St

Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney, Del Norte

450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney, Glenn

County

Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney, Humboldt

County

825 5th Street 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney, Imperial

940 West Main Street, Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney, Kings

County

1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney, Los Angeles County

Hall of Justice

211 West Temple St., Ste 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney, Madera

209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney, Mendocino County

Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney, Modoc

County

204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney, Mono

County

Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney, San Benito

County

419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor

Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney,San Bernardino County 303 West Third Street San Bernadino, CA 92415

District Attorney, San Mateo

400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney, Shasta

County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney, Sierra

County

Post Office Box 457

100 Courthouse Square, 2nd

Floor

Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney, Siskiyou

County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney, Solano

County

675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney, Stanislaus

County

832 12th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney, Sutter

County 463 2nd Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney, Tehama

County

Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080 District Attorney, Trinity County

Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney, Tuolumne

423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney, Yuba

County

215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's

Office

City Hall East

200 N. Main Street, Suite 800

Los Angeles, CA 90012