



RACHEL S. DOUGHTY  
2748 Adeline Street, Suite A  
Berkeley, CA 94703  
Phone: (510) 900-9502, ext. 706  
Email: [rdoughty@greenfirelaw.com](mailto:rdoughty@greenfirelaw.com)  
[www.greenfirelaw.com](http://www.greenfirelaw.com)

March 15, 2024

*By Electronic Mail and U.S. Mail*

Etsy, Inc.  
117 Adams St  
Brooklyn, NY 11202  
ATTN: Josh Silverman, CEO  
[jsilverman@etsy.com](mailto:jsilverman@etsy.com)  
ATTN: Colin Stretch, Chief Legal Officer  
[cstretch@etsy.com](mailto:cstretch@etsy.com)  
ATTN: Etsy Regulatory Request for Regulators or Government Officials  
[regulatory-intake@etsy.com](mailto:regulatory-intake@etsy.com)

Maria Villaseñor  
dba Capirotada Store  
3721 S. 6000 W.  
W. Valley City, UT 84128

Sherley Sajous  
Registered Agent for  
Oceans Beauty & Wellness LLC  
573 NW 101 St  
Miami, FL 33150  
[sajous85@gmail.com](mailto:sajous85@gmail.com)

**RE: 60-Day Notice of Violation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65) & Demand for Supply Chain Identification**

Dear Mr. Silverman and Mr. Stretch, et.al:

This firm represents As You Sow (“Noticing Party”) in connection with this notice of violations of California’s Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, which is codified at California Health & Safety Code section 25249.5, et seq. (“Proposition 65”). As You Sow is a non-profit organization working to create a safe, just, and sustainable world in which protecting the environment and human rights is central to corporate decision making.

This letter constitutes notice to the addressees that they have violated and continue to violate provisions of Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations. Specifically, the alleged Violators to which this letter is addressed have violated and continue to violate the warning requirement at section 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code, which provides, “No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual[.]”

As to Etsy, Inc., this letter serves as a supplemental 60-Day Notice and does not replace the January 18, 2024 60-Day Notice sent to Etsy, Inc.

Pursuant to California Health & Safety Code section 25249.7, subdivision (d), the Noticing Party, as defined in that section, intends to bring an enforcement action against the Violators sixty (60) days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies listed in the attached Certificate of Service have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations. A summary of Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead agency designated under Proposition 65, is enclosed with the copy of this notice served to the Violators. The specific details of the violations that are the subject of this Notice are provided below.

### **Description of Violations**

The Violators have contravened the warning requirement at section 25249.6 of the California Health and Safety Code, which provides, “[no] person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving a clear and reasonable warning to such individual.” Violators have manufactured, produced, packaged, imported, supplied, distributed, sold or otherwise provided the consumer products containing mercury listed below directly to consumers through Etsy.com’s website without providing the clear and reasonable warnings required by Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations, dating at least as far back as January 2, 2023, and continuing each day through the present.

- Time Period of Exposure: The violations have been occurring since at least January 2, 2023 and are continuing to this day.
- Provision of Proposition 65 Implicated: This Notice of Violation covers the “warning provision” of Proposition 65, which is found at California Health and Safety Code, section 25249.6, and its implementing regulations.
- Chemical Involved: The listed chemical involved in this notice of violation is mercury and mercury compounds. This chemical is recognized by the State of California as a developmental toxin. Exposure to mercury or mercury compounds occurs through ingestion, inhalation, and dermal absorption when skin-lightening creams, sold on Etsy.com’s website, are applied.
- Types of Products: The specific types of products causing the violations are skin-lightening, whitening, and “smoothing” creams containing 1 ppm or more mercury or mercury compounds, including but not limited to those products specifically listed below in **Table 1**.

**Table 1**

Product	Thumbnail of Product	Etsy Storefront <sup>1</sup>	Parties Noticed
Deluxe Nadinola Bleaching Cream		PureJamaicanStore	Etsy, Inc.
Jing Zhuang Jinyiqi (“Yiqi”)		IGOTBEAUTYSTORE	Etsy, Inc.
La Tia Mana Crema		NaturalByLLC	Etsy, Inc.
La Tia Mana Crema		CapirotadaStore	Etsy, Inc. Maria Villaseñor dba Capirotada Store
La Tia Mana Crema		TruVaShopTreasures	Etsy, Inc.
Magia Blanca de Michelle Marie Crema Blanqueadora		OceansBeautyWellness	Etsy, Inc. Oceans Beauty & Wellness LLC
Miss Key Crema Blanqueadora		OceansBeautyWellness	Etsy, Inc. Oceans Beauty & Wellness LLC
Parley Beauty Cream		GoldieCosmetics	Etsy, Inc.
Parley Beauty Cream		DYSHOPPINGCENTER	Etsy, Inc.

<sup>1</sup> This Supplemental Notice covers all skin-lightening, whitening, and “smoothing” creams containing mercury or mercury compounds, including those products listed in Table 1, whether or not sold presently at the storefront listed.

- **Description of Exposures:** This Notice addresses consumer product exposures to mercury and mercury compounds resulting from the acquisition, purchase, storage, consumption, or reasonably foreseeable use of cosmetics used to lighten, whiten, or “smooth” skin. Mercury is an additive or active ingredient in such cosmetics. Use of the items listed above in Table 1, as well as other items containing mercury as an active ingredient, results in human exposures to mercury.<sup>2</sup> Mercury exposure occurs in three main routes: ingestion, inhalation, or dermal absorption. Ingestion may occur post-application due to insufficient hand washing prior to eating or preparing food or touching of the mouth. Inhalation may occur due to the significant amount of mercury vapor produced by use of these creams, which can affect all household members. Dermal absorption may occur as these products are designed and specifically marketed for direct contact with skin. These exposures occur in residences throughout California where the products are used. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the developmental toxicity of using these products or specifically of mercury.

Pursuant to California Code of Regulations, title 11, section 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached.<sup>3</sup>

### **Resolution of Claims Being Noticed**

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, the Noticing Party intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the Violator unless it agrees to remedy the violations set forth above. If the Violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resort to expensive and time-consuming litigation, please contact the Noticing Party through its counsel identified below.

### **Preservation of Relevant Evidence**

This Notice also serves as a demand that the Violator preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to mercury released from or during the storage, shipment, and use of skin lightening creams; purchases and sales information for such products; communications with any person relating to actual or potential exposures to mercury from the use of such products; representative exemplars of each unit of any of the brands listed above in Table 1 sold since January 2022; the content of internet displays for the products causing the violations; and all communications regarding the alleged violations.

### **Parties**

This Notice is provided on behalf of the following person and organization:

As You Sow  
2201 Broadway  
Oakland, CA 94612  
(510) 735-8158

---

<sup>2</sup> These products are also illegal adulterated cosmetics sold in violation of FDA regulations (see 21 C.F.R. § 700.13(d)), and California’s Sherman Act.

<sup>3</sup> A second copy of the entire notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the Attorney General, clearly marked “Attorney General Copy: Contains Official Information Pursuant to Evidence Code Section 1040” with all supporting documentation required by 11 Cal. Code Regs., § 3102 attached thereto.

The Noticing Parties can be contacted through counsel as identified below:

Rachel Doughty  
Greenfire Law, PC  
2748 Adeline Street, Suite A  
Berkeley, CA 94703  
(510) 900-9502  
rdoughty@greenfirelaw.com

### **Demand for Supply Chain Contacts**

Pursuant to California Code of Regulations title 27, article 6, section 25600.2, subdivision (g) you must promptly provide As You Sow (through its counsel) with the names and contact information for each of the manufacturers, producers, packagers, importers, suppliers, and distributors of each of the products listed above in Table 1. **We expect to receive this information within a week.**

Sincerely,



Rachel S. Doughty  
Greenfire Law, PC

Attachments:

Certificate of Merit (All Recipients)

Certificate of Merit Support (Attorney General only)

Certificate of Service (All Recipients)

*The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary* (“Summary”)  
(Noticed Parties Only)

### **Certificate of Merit**

California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.7, Subdivision (d)

I, Rachel Doughty, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.
3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: March 15, 2024

Greenfire Law, PC

By:



Rachel Doughty