# ADAMS BROADWELL JOSEPH & CARDOZO

A PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

#### ATTORNEYS AT LAW

601 GATEWAY BOULEVARD, SUITE 1000 SOUTH SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94080-7037

TEL: (650) 589-1660 FAX: (650) 589-5062 rfranco@adamsbroadwell.com SACRAMENTO OFFICE

520 CAPITOL MALL, SUITE 350 SACRAMENTO, CA 95814-4721

TEL: (916) 444-6201 FAX: (916) 444-6209

Of Counsel
MARC D. JOSEPH
DANIEL L. CARDOZO

ARIANA ABEDIFARD

KEVIN T. CARMICHAEL CHRISTINA M. CARO

THOMAS A. ENSLOW

KELILAH D. FEDERMAN

RICHARD M. FRANCO

ANDREW J. GRAF

TANYA A. GULESSERIAN

DARION N. JOHNSTON

RACHAEL E. KOSS AIDAN P. MARSHALL TARA C. RENGIFO

April 10, 2024

### VIA CERTIFIED MAIL

Current President or CEO Project Healthy Living, Inc., individually and dba Aloha 154 W 14<sup>th</sup> Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor New York, NY 10011

Current President or CEO Project Healthy Living, Inc., individually and dba Aloha 30 Corbin Dr, Ste 1052 Darien, CT 06820

Current President or CEO Project Healthy Living, Inc., individually and dba Aloha 8361 Sangre De Cristo Rd Littleton, CO 80127

Corporation Service Company (Registered Agent for Project Healthy Living, Inc., individually and dba Aloha) 251 Little Falls Dr Wilmington, DE 19808

## **VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL**

Pamela Y. Price, District Attorney Alameda County 7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acgov.org

#### VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL

Barbara Yook, District Attorney Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249 Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

James Clinchard, Assistant District Attorney El Dorado County 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667 EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us

Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney
Fresno County
2100 Tulare Street
Fresno, CA 93721
consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov

Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney Inyo County 168 North Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526 inyoda@inyocounty.us

# **VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL**

Devin Chandler, Program Coordinator Lassen County 2950 Riverside Dr Susanville, CA 96130 dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us

Lori E. Frugoli, District Attorney Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Suite 145 San Rafael, CA 94903 consumer@marincounty.org

Walter W. Wall, District Attorney Mariposa County P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org

Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney Merced County 550 West Main St Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofmerced.com

Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Allison Haley, District Attorney Napa County 1127 First Street, Ste C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney Nevada County 201 Commercial St Nevada City, CA 95959 DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us

## **VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL**

Todd Spitzer, District Attorney Orange County 300 N Flower St Santa Ana, CA 92703 Prop65notice@ocdapa.org

Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 Prop65@placer.ca.gov

David Hollister, District Attorney Plumas County 520 Main St Quincy, CA 95971 davidhollister@countyofplumas.com

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney Sacramento County 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org

Summer Stephan, District Attorney San Diego County 330 West Broadway San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney San Diego City Attorney 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

# **VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL**

Alexandra Grayner, Assistant District Attorney San Francisco District Attorney's Office 350 Rhode Island Street San Francisco, CA 94103 Alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org

Henry Lifton, Deputy City Attorney San Francisco City Attorney 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor San Francisco, CA 94102 Prop65@sfcityatty.org

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org

### **VIA ONLINE SUBMISSION**

Office of the California Attorney General

#### **VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL**

Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney Santa Clara City Attorney 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor San Jose, CA 96113 Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

Jill Ravitch, District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Dr Sonoma, CA 95403 Jeannie.Barnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org

### VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL

District Attorneys of Select California Counties and Select City Attorneys (See Attached Certificate of Service)

# Re: Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq.

#### Dear Addressees:

I represent the Environmental Research Center, Inc. ("ERC") in connection with this Notice of Violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, which is codified at California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 *et seq.* and also referred to as Proposition 65.

ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

The name of the Company covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the "Violator") is:

# Project Healthy Living, Inc., individually and dba Aloha

The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemicals in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:

- 1. Aloha Organic Protein Bar Peanut Butter Chocolate Chip Plant-Based Protein Lead
- 2. Aloha Organic Protein Bar Chocolate Fudge Brownie Plant-Based Protein Lead, Cadmium
- 3. Aloha Organic Protein Bar Coconut Chocolate Almond Plant-Based Protein Lead
- 4. Aloha Organic Protein Bar Chocolate Chip Cookie Dough Plant-Based Protein Lead, Cadmium
- 5. Aloha Limited Edition Organic Protein Bar Maple Sea Salt Plant-Based Protein Lead
- 6. Aloha Limited Edition Organic Protein Bar Peppermint White Chocolate Plant-Based Protein - Lead
- 7. Aloha Special Edition Organic Protein Bar The Kona Bar Plant-Based Protein Lead

On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

Cadmium was officially listed as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity and male reproductive toxicity on May 1, 1997, while cadmium and cadmium compounds were listed as chemicals known to the State of California to cause cancer on October 1, 1987.

This letter is a notice to the Violator and the appropriate governmental authorities of the Proposition 65 violations concerning the listed products. This notice covers all violations of Proposition 65 involving the Violator currently known to ERC from the information now available. ERC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations. A summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is enclosed with the copy of this letter to the Violator.

The Violator has manufactured, marketed, distributed, and/or sold the listed products, which has exposed and continues to expose numerous individuals within California to the identified chemicals, lead and cadmium. The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the recommended use of these products by consumers. The route of exposure to lead and/or cadmium has been through ingestion. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to lead and/or cadmium. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product's label. The Violator violated Proposition 65 because it failed to provide an appropriate warning to persons ingesting these products that they are being exposed to lead and/or cadmium. Each of these ongoing violations has occurred on every day since April 10, 2021, as well as every day since the products were introduced in the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users.

Pursuant to Section 25249.7(d) of the statute, ERC intends to file a citizen enforcement action sixty days after effective service of this notice unless the Violator agrees in an enforceable written instrument to: (1) reformulate the listed products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings compliant with Proposition 65 to all persons located in California who purchased the above products in the last three years. Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and my client's objectives in pursuing this notice, ERC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution to this matter. Such resolution will avoid both further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemicals and expensive and time consuming litigation.

ERC's Executive Director is Chris Heptinstall, and is located at 3111 Camino Del Rio North, Suite 400, San Diego, CA 92108; Tel. 619-500-3090. ERC has retained me in connection with this matter. We suggest that communications regarding this Notice of Violations should be directed to my attention at the above listed law office address and telephone number.

Sincerely,

Rick Franco

#### Attachments

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service

OEHHA Summary (to Project Healthy Living, Inc., individually and dba Aloha and its Registered Agent for Service of Process only)

Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Re: Environmental Research Center, Inc.'s Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by Project Healthy Living, Inc., individually and dba Aloha

- I, Rick Franco, declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the party identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: April 10, 2024

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE PURSUANT TO 27 CCR § 25903

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States and over the age of 18 years of age. My business address is 306 Joy Street, Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia 30742. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

On April 10, 2024, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties listed below and depositing it in a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Current President or CEO Project Healthy Living, Inc., individually and dba Aloha 154 W 14<sup>th</sup> Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor New York, NY 10011

Current President or CEO Project Healthy Living, Inc., individually and dba Aloha 30 Corbin Dr, Ste 1052 Darien, CT 06820 Current President or CEO Project Healthy Living, Inc., individually and dba Aloha 8361 Sangre De Cristo Rd Littleton, CO 80127

Corporation Service Company (Registered Agent for Project Healthy Living, Inc., individually and dba Aloha) 251 Little Falls Dr Wilmington, DE 19808

On April 10, 2024, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I verified the following documents NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1) were served on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was uploaded on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

On April 10, 2024 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.*; **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** were served on the following parties when a true and correct copy thereof was sent via electronic mail to each of the parties listed below:

Pamela Y. Price, District Attorney Alameda County 7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650 Oakland, CA 94621 CEPDProp65@acgov.org Barbara Yook, District Attorney Calaveras County 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249 Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney Contra Costa County 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553 sgrassini@contracostada.org

James Clinchard, Assistant District Attorney El Dorado County 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667 EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us

Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney Fresno County 2100 Tulare Street Fresno, CA 93721 consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov

Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney Inyo County 168 North Edwards Street Independence, CA 93526 inyoda@inyocounty.us

Devin Chandler, Program Coordinator Lassen County 2950 Riverside Dr Susanville, CA 96130 dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us

Lori E. Frugoli, District Attorney Marin County 3501 Civic Center Drive, Suite 145 San Rafael, CA 94903 consumer@marincounty.org

Walter W. Wall, District Attorney Mariposa County P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org

Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney Merced County 550 West Main St Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofmerced.com

Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney Monterey County 1200 Aguajito Road Monterey, CA 93940 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us Allison Haley, District Attorney Napa County 1127 First Street, Ste C Napa, CA 94559 CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney Nevada County 201 Commercial St Nevada City, CA 95959 DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us

Todd Spitzer, District Attorney Orange County 300 N Flower St Santa Ana, CA 92703 Prop65notice@ocdapa.org

Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney Placer County 10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 Prop65@placer.ca.gov

David Hollister, District Attorney Plumas County 520 Main St Quincy, CA 95971 davidhollister@countyofplumas.com

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney Riverside County 3072 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501 Prop65@rivcoda.org

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney Sacramento County 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org

Summer Stephan, District Attorney San Diego County 330 West Broadway San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney San Diego City Attorney 1200 Third Avenue San Diego, CA 92101 CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

Alexandra Grayner, Assistant District Attorney San Francisco District Attorney's Office 350 Rhode Island Street San Francisco, CA 94103 Alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org

Henry Lifton, Deputy City Attorney San Francisco City Attorney 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor San Francisco, CA 94102 Prop65@sfcityatty.org

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney San Joaquin County 222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney San Luis Obispo County County Government Center Annex, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney Santa Barbara County 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County 70 W Hedding St San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney Santa Clara City Attorney 200 E. SantaClara Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor San Jose, CA 96113 Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney Santa Cruz County 701 Ocean Street Santa Cruz, CA 95060 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

Jill Ravitch, District Attorney Sonoma County 600 Administration Dr Sonoma, CA 95403 Jeannie.Barnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney Tulare County 221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney Yolo County 301 Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org

On April 10, 2024, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it with the U.S. Postal Service with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by First Class Mail.

Executed on April 10, 2024, in Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

Phyllis Dunwoody

Page 10

**Service List** 

District Attorney, Alpine P.O. Box 248 17300 Hwy 89 Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney, Amador County

708 Court Street, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney, Butte County

25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney, Colusa

County 310 6th St Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney, Del Norte 450 H Street, Room 171

Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney, Glenn

Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney, Humboldt

County

825 5th Street 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney, Imperial

County

940 West Main Street, Ste

102

El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney, Kern

County

1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney, Kings

1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney, Los Angeles County Hall of Justice

211 West Temple St., Ste

1200

Los Angeles, CA 90012

District Attorney, Madera

209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney, Modoc

204 S Court Street, Room

202

Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney, Mono

County

Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517

District Attorney, San Benito

County

419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney,San

Bernardino County 303 West Third Street San Bernadino, CA 92415

District Attorney, San Mateo 400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney, Shasta

County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney, Sierra County

Post Office Box 457

100 Courthouse Square, 2nd

Floor

Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney, Siskiyou

Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney, Solano

675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney, Stanislaus County

832 12th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney, Sutter County 463 2<sup>nd</sup> Street Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney, Tehama

County

Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney, Trinity

Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney, Tuolumne

423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney, Yuba

215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's City Hall East

200 N. Main Street, Suite

Los Angeles, CA 90012