

AMENDED NOTICE OF VIOLATION

California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

Nicotine Exposures Resulting from Use of Nicotine Pouches

April 30, 2024

This Notice of Violation amends the notice dated April 3, 2024 (AG No. 2024-01343). This Amended Notice is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d).

- For general information regarding the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, see the attached summary provided by the California EPA (copies not provided to public enforcement agencies).
- This Amended Notice is provided by the Center for Environmental Health (“CEH”), 2201 Broadway, Suite 508, Oakland, CA 94612, (510) 655-3900. CEH is a nonprofit corporation dedicated to protecting the environment, improving human health and supporting environmentally sound practices. Emily Reder is the Senior Manager of the Consumer Protection Team and a responsible individual within CEH.

Description of Violation:

- Violator: The names and addresses of the violators are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- Time Period of Exposure: The violations have been occurring since at least April 3, 2021, and are continuing to this day.
- Provision of Proposition 65: This Notice of Violation covers the “warning provision” of Proposition 65, which is found at California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6.
- Chemical(s) Involved: The name of the listed chemical involved in these violations is nicotine. Exposures to nicotine occur from use of the products identified in this Notice. Nicotine is a chemical known to cause developmental and reproductive harm.
- Types of Products: The specific types of products causing these violations are Nicotine Pouches. Non-exclusive examples of these specific product types are listed in Exhibit 1.
- Description of Exposure: This Notice addresses consumer exposures to nicotine. Use of the nicotine pouches identified in this Notice results in human exposures to nicotine. The products contain significant amounts of nicotine to which users are exposed when the products are used in the intended manner. The primary routes of exposure for the violations are inhalation and direct ingestion when consumers place the Nicotine pouches in their mouths. These exposures occur in homes, workplaces and everywhere else throughout

California where the products are used. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the reproductive and developmental toxicity of nicotine.

Resolution of Noticed Claims:

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, CEH intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the alleged violator unless such violator agrees in a binding written instrument to: (1) recall products already sold; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(b). If the alleged violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resort to expensive and time-consuming litigation, please feel free to contact CEH through its counsel identified below. It should be noted that CEH cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received CEH's 60-day Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with CEH will resolve its claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

Preservation of Relevant Evidence:

This Notice also serves as a demand that the alleged violator preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to nicotine in nicotine pouches; actual or potential exposures to nicotine from use of such products; purchase and sales information for such products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to such products; communications with any person relating to actual or potential exposures to nicotine from use of such products; and representative exemplars of each unit of any such products sold by the alleged violator since April 3, 2021, through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

Please direct any inquiries regarding this Notice to CEH's counsel Mark N. Todzo at Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117, (415) 913-7800, mtodzo@lexlawgroup.com.

EXHIBIT 1
April 30, 2024 Notice of Violation
Nicotine Exposures Resulting From Use of Nicotine Pouches

Name and Address of Responsible Party	Non-Exclusive Exemplar Products
<p style="text-align: center;">Helix Innovations LLC 6601 W Broad St., Richmond, CA 23230</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Altria Group Distribution Company 6601 W Broad St., Richmond, CA 23230</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">On! Mint Nicotine Pouches (20 pouches); 4 mg; UPC No. 8-55022-00524-9; R166 U0810</p> <p style="text-align: center;">On! Nicotine Pouches (20 pouches); 4 mg; UPC No. 8-55022-00538-6; M318 J1916; Rewards No. NXD93-6RY7-NTWW</p> <p style="text-align: center;">On! Nicotine Pouches (20 pouches); 8 mg; UPC No. 8-55022-00539-3; M109 J0023; Rewards No. NWF6F-YD3D-WN7D</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Walgreen Co. 108 Wilmot Road Deerfield, IL 60015</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">On! Nicotine Pouches (20 pouches); 4 mg; UPC No. 8-55022-00538-6; M318 J1916; Rewards No. NXD93-6RY7-NTWW</p> <p style="text-align: center;">ZYN Smooth Nicotine Pouches (15 pouches); 6 mg; UPC No. 6-09249-91402-6; ZYN rewards No: pWPF8f4tWG; Expiration 24 Oct 2024; J24412 22:21</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Swedish Match North America LLC Two James Center 1021 E. Cary Street, Suite 1600 Richmond VA 23219</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Philip Morris USA Inc. 6601 W Broad Street Richmond VA 23230</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Pinkerton Tobacco Co. L.P. 1021 E Cary Street, Ste 1600 Richmond, VA 23219</p> <p style="text-align: center;">GoBrands, Inc. 537 N 3rd Street Philadelphia, PA 19123</p> <p style="text-align: center;">GoBrands, Inc. 454 N 12th Street Philadelphia, PA 19123</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">ZYN Chill Nicotine Pouches (15 pouches); 6 mg; UPC No. 6-09249-92022-5; ZYN rewards No: 2k3CTccwjQ; Expiration 04 Jan 2025; A0459 08:35</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Rite Aid Corporation 200 Newberry Commons Etters, PA 17319</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Rite Aid Corporation 1200 Intrepid Avenue, 2nd Floor Philadelphia, PA 19112</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">ZYN Chill Nicotine Pouches (15 pouches); 6 mg; UPC No. 6-09249-92022-5; ZYN rewards No. g5mxxZCtWq; Expiration 27 Dec 2024; L2749 14:40</p>

Name and Address of Responsible Party	Non-Exclusive Exemplar Products
<p>Northerner Scandinavia Inc. 631 Highway 90A Missouri City, TX, 77489</p>	<p>ZYN Wintergreen Nicotine Pouches; (5 cans); 6 mg; UPC No. 6-09249-90342-6; ZYN rewards No: rbMxgwzmttd; Expiration 15 Feb 2025; B1555 16:12</p>
<p>Lucky Stores LLC 250 E Parkcenter Blvd Boise, ID 83706</p> <p>Save Mart Supermarkets LLC 1800 Standiford Ave Modesto, CA 95350</p>	<p>On! Nicotine Pouches (20 pouches); 8 mg; UPC No. 8-55022-00539-3; M109 J0023; Rewards No. NWF6F-YD3D-WN7D</p>

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT
Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

I, Mark N. Todzo, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice has violated Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney with the Lexington Law Group, and I represent the noticing party, the Center for Environmental Health.

3. Members of my firm and I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that “reasonable and meritorious case for the private action” means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff’s case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of the Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e. (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies or other data reviewed by those persons.

April 30, 2024



Mark N. Todzo
Attorney for CENTER FOR
ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

1 **PROOF OF SERVICE**

2 I, Star Beltman, declare:

3
4 I am a citizen of the United States and employed in the County of San Francisco, State of
5 California. I am over the age of eighteen (18) years and not a party to this action. My business
6 address is 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117 and my email address is
7 sbeltman@lexlawgroup.com.

8 On April 30, 2024, I served the following document(s) on all interested parties in this
9 action by placing a true copy thereof in the manner and at the addresses indicated below:

10 **AMENDED NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING
11 WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT;**

12 **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT;** and

13 **THE SAFE DRINKING AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986**
14 **(PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY** (only sent to those on service list marked with an
15 asterisk).

16 **BY MAIL:** I am readily familiar with the firm's practice for collecting and processing mail
17 with the United States Postal Service ("USPS"). Under that practice, mail would be deposited
18 with USPS that same day with postage thereon fully prepaid at San Francisco, California in the
19 ordinary course of business. On this date, I placed sealed envelopes containing the above
20 mentioned documents for collection and mailing following my firm's ordinary business practices.

21 *Please see attached service list.*

22 **BY ELECTRONIC MAIL:** I transmitted a PDF version of the document(s) listed above via
23 email to the email address(es) indicated on the attached service list [or noted above] before 5 p.m.
24 on the date executed.

25 Pamela Y. Price, Alameda District Attorney
26 7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650
27 Oakland, CA 94621
28 CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Lisa A. Smittcamp, Fresno District Attorney
2100 Tulare Street
Fresno, CA 93721
consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov

Barbara Yook, Calaveras District Attorney
891 Mountain Ranch Rd.
San Andreas, CA 95249
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

Thomas L. Hardy, Inyo District Attorney
168 North Edwards Street
Independence, CA 93526
inyoda@inyocounty.us

Stacey Grassini, Contra Costa Deputy
District Attorney
900 Ward Street
Martinez, CA 94553
sgrassini@contracostada.org

Devin Chandler, Lassen Program
Coordinator
2950 Riverside Dr
Susanville, CA 96130
dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us

James Clinchard, El Dorado Assistant
District Attorney
778 Pacific Street
Placerville, CA 95667
EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us

Lori E. Frugoli, Marin District Attorney
3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 145
San Rafael, CA 94903
consumer@marincounty.org

1 Walter W. Wall, Mariposa District Attorney
P.O. Box 730
2 Mariposa, CA 95338
mcda@mariposacounty.org
3
4 Kimberly Lewis, Merced District Attorney
550 West Main Street
Merced, CA 95340
5 Prop65@countyofmerced.com
6
7 Jeannine M. Pacioni, Monterey District
Attorney
1200 Aguajito Road
Monterey, CA 93940
8 Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
9
10 Allison Haley, Napa District Attorney
1127 First Street, Suite C
Napa, CA 94559
CEPD@countyofnapa.org
11
12 Clifford H. Newell, Nevada District
Attorney
201 Commercial Street
Nevada City, CA 95959
13 DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us
14
15 Morgan Briggs Gire, Placer District
Attorney
10810 Justice Center Drive
Roseville, CA 95678
16 prop65@placer.ca.gov
17
18 David Hollister, Plumas District Attorney
520 Main St.
Quincy, CA 95971
19 davidhollister@countyofplumas.com
20
21 Paul E. Zellerbach, Riverside District
Attorney
3072 Orange Street
Riverside, CA 92501
22 Prop65@rivcoda.org
23
24 Anne Marie Schubert, Sacramento District
Attorney
901 G Street
Sacramento, CA 95814
25 Prop65@sacda.org
26
27 Summer Stephan, San Diego District
Attorney
330 West Broadway
San Diego, CA 92101
28 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdca.org

Mark Ankcorn, San Diego Deputy City
Attorney
1200 Third Avenue
San Diego, CA 92101
CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

Henry Lifton, San Francisco Deputy City
Attorney
1390 Market Street, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102
Prop65@sfcityatty.org

Alexandra Grayner, San Francisco Assistant
District Attorney
350 Rhode Island Street
San Francisco, CA 94103
alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org

Tori Verber Salazar, San Joaquin District
Attorney
222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202
Stockton, CA 95202
DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

Eric J. Dobroth, San Luis Obispo Deputy
District Attorney
County Government Center Annex, 4th
Floor
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408
edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Christopher Dalbey, Santa Barbara Deputy
District Attorney
1112 Santa Barbara St.
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Nora V. Frimann, Santa Clara City Attorney
200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor
San Jose, CA 96113
Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov

Bud Porter, Supervising Santa Clara, Deputy
District Attorney
70 W Hedding St
San Jose, CA 95110
EPU@da.sccgov.org

Jeffrey S. Rosell, Santa Cruz District
Attorney
701 Ocean Street
Santa Cruz, CA 95060
Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

1 Jill Ravitch, Sonoma District Attorney
600 Administration Drive
2 Santa Rosa, CA 95403
Jeannie.Barnes@sonoma-county.org
3

4 Phillip J. Cline, Tulare District Attorney
221 S Mooney Blvd
Visalia, CA 95370
5 Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
6

Gregory D. Totten, Ventura District
Attorney
800 S Victoria Ave
Ventura, CA 93009
daspecialops@ventura.org

Jeff W. Reisig, Yolo District Attorney
301 Second Street
Woodland, CA 95695
cfepd@yolocounty.org

7

8 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the
foregoing is true and correct.

9 Executed on April 30, 2024 at San Francisco, California.

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28



Star Beltman

SERVICE LIST

District Attorney of Alpine County
P.O. Box 248
Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney of Amador County
708 Court St, Ste. 202
Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney of Butte County
Administration Building
25 County Center Dr, Ste 245
Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney of Colusa County
310 6th St
Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney of Del Norte County
450 H St, Ste. 171
Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney of Glenn County
P.O. Box 430
Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney of Humboldt County
825 5th St
Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney of Imperial County
939 Main St, Ste. 102
El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney of Kern County
1215 Truxtun Ave
Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney of Kings County
1400 West Lacey Blvd.
Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney of Lake County
375 3rd St
Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney of Los Angeles County
211 W. Temple St, Ste. 1200
Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210

District Attorney of Madera County
300 South G St, Ste 300,
Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney of Mendocino County
P.O. Box 1000
Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney of Modoc County
204 S. Court St, Ste 202
Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney of Mono County
P.O. Box 2053
Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546

District Attorney of Orange County
300 N Flower St
Santa Ana, CA 92703

District Attorney of San Benito County
419 Fourth St, 2nd Fl.
Hollister, CA 95023

District Attorney of San Bernardino County
303 West 3rd St
San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502

District Attorney of San Mateo County
400 County Center, 3rd Fl.
Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney of Shasta County
1355 West St
Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney of Sierra County
P.O. Box 457
Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney of Siskiyou County
311 Fourth St, Rm 204
Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney of Solano County
675 Texas St, Ste. 4500
Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney of Stanislaus County
832 12th St, Ste. 300
Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney of Sutter County
463 2nd St, Ste 102
Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney of Tehama County
444 Oak St, Rm L
Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney of Trinity County
P.O. Box 310
11 Court St
Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney of Tuolumne County
423 N Washington St
Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney of Yuba County
215 Fifth St, Ste 152
Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office
City Hall East
200 N. Main St, Rm. 800
Los Angeles, CA 90012

Thomas Hayes, President*
Swedish Match North America LLC
Two James Center 1021
E. Cary Street, Suite 1600
Richmond VA 23219

Jon Moore, President*
Philip Morris USA Inc.
6601 W Broad Street
Richmond VA 23230

Rafael Ilishayev, CEO*
GoBrands, Inc.
537 N 3rd Street
Philadelphia, PA 19123

Rafael Ilishayev, CEO*
GoBrands, Inc.
454 N 12th Street
Philadelphia, PA 19123

Nick MacPhee, General Manager*
Helix Innovations LLC
6601 W Broad St.,
Richmond, CA 23230

Billy Gifford, CEO*
Altria Group Distribution Company
6601 W Broad St.,
Richmond, CA 23230

Gavin O'Dowd, CEO*
Northerner Scandinavia Inc.
631 Highway 90A
Missouri City, TX, 77489

Christopher McGarry, CEO*
Lucky Stores LLC
250 E Parkcenter Blvd
Boise, ID 83706

Christopher McGarry, CEO*
Save Mart Supermarkets LLC
1800 Standiford Ave
Modesto, CA 95350

Tracey Brown, CEO*
Walgreen Co.
108 Wilmot Road
Deerfield, IL 60015

Jeffrey S. Stein, CEO*
Rite Aid Corporation
200 Newberry Commons
Etters, PA 17319

Jeffrey S. Stein, CEO*
Rite Aid Corporation
1200 Intrepid Avenue, 2nd Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19112

Thomas Hayes, President*
Pinkerton Tobacco Co. L.P.
1021 E Cary Street, Ste 1600
Richmond, VA 23219