# **60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION**

SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249. 7(d)

**DATE:** June 28, 2024

**TO:** Brian Miller, CEO - Geppetto's Inc.;

Jessica Luo, or current owner - Bewaltz;

California Attorney General's Office;

District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and

City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los Angeles

FROM: Susan Davia

**RE:** Bewaltz Novelty Bags with Vinyl Components

#### I. INTRODUCTION

My name is Susan Davia. I am a citizen of the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. I seek to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and, if possible, to improve human health by reducing hazardous substances contained in such items. This Notice is provided to the public agencies listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65"). As noted above, notice is also being provided to the alleged violators Bewaltz and Geppetto's Inc. (collectively, "Violator"). The violations covered by this Notice consist of the product exposures, routes of exposure, and types of harm potentially resulting from exposure to the toxic chemical ("listed chemical") identified below, as follows:

Product Exposure: See Section VII. Exhibit A

Listed Chemical: Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate (DEHP), diisononyl phthalate (DINP), di-n-butyl

phthalate (DBP)

Routes of Exposure: Inhalation, Ingestion, Dermal

Types of Harm: Cancer, Birth Defects and other Reproductive Harm

#### II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATION (PRODUCT EXPOSURE)

The specific types of products that are causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are listed under "Product Category/Type" in Exhibit A in Section VII below. All products within the type covered by this Notice shall be referred to hereinafter as "products." The sales of these products in California dating at least as far back as June 2022, are subject to this Notice. As a result of the sales of these products, exposures to each identified listed chemical have been occurring without clear and reasonable warnings as required by Proposition 65. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposure to the listed chemical resulting from contact with the products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the toxic chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the products.

#### CONSUMER PRODUCT EXPOSURE

California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the products, are exposed to the identified listed chemical(s). As the product naturally degrades through repeat manipulation and exposure to heat, airflow, light radiation, etc., the listed chemical diffuses to and collects on the surface of the product. Children, men and women (especially those of childbearing age) are exposed to the listed chemical through direct dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle or touch the products during packing, unpacking and use or otherwise come into direct dermal contact during use of the products. Children, men and women (especially those of childbearing age) ingest the listed chemical when they transfer the listed chemical from the products to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after contact with the products stops. This hand-to-mouth activity may come directly from the had or indirectly through hand contact with another item (such as a food item, cigarette or writing device) that is then ingested or placed in the mouth. Children, men and women (especially those of childbearing age) will also directly ingest the listed chemical anytime they place the soft vinyl components of the products directly in their mouths to hold or otherwise mouth the product. Children, men and women (especially those of childbearing age) will additionally suffer dermal absorption exposure to the product as a result of direct contact between the product and skin during product handling and use. Children, men and women (especially those of childbearing age) will also suffer inhalation exposure to the listed chemical as it evaporates from the product surface into the air/gas phase.

#### III. CONTACT INFORMATION

Please direct all questions concerning this notice to me through my counsel's office at the following address:

Susan Davia c/o Gregory Sheffer, Esq. Sheffer Law Firm 232 E. Blithedale Avenue, Suite 210 Mill Valley, CA 94941 gregs@sheffer-law.net 415-388-0911

#### IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For general information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, please feel free to contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's ("OEHHA") Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900. For the Violator's reference, I have attached a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" which has been prepared by OEHHA.

#### V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, I intend to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the alleged Violator unless such Violator enters into a binding written agreement to: (1) recall products already sold or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those who have received such products; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the listed chemical exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7 (b). If the alleged Violator is interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and expensive litigation, please feel free to contact my counsel identified in Section III above. It should be

noted that neither my counsel nor I can: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with me will resolve my claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

#### VI. ADDITIONAL NOTICE INFORMATION

Identified below is a specific example of a product recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California that is within the category or type of offending product covered by this Notice. Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors and/or manufacturers of the examples within the categories or types of product are also provided below. I believe and allege that the sale of the offending products also has occurred without the requisite Proposition 65 "clear and reasonable warnings" at one or more locations and/or via other means including, but not limited to, transactions made over-the-counter, business-to-business, through the internet and/or via a catalog by the Violator and other retailers and distributors of the manufacturer.

Product*	Retailer	Manufacturer/Distributor
Bewaltz Novelty Bags with Vinyl Components	Geppetto's LaJolla	Bewaltz

#### VII. EXHIBIT A

Product Category/Type	Such As*	Toxins
Bewaltz Novelty Bags with Vinyl Components	Bewaltz Tootsie Roll Bag 102363	DEHP, DINP, DBP

\*The specifically identified example of the category or type of product that is subject to this Notice is for the recipient's benefit to assist in its investigation of, among other things, the magnitude of potential exposure to the listed chemical from other items within the product category/type listed in Exhibit A. It is important to note that this example is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product of the type listed under "Product Category/Type" in Exhibit A. Further, it is this citizen's position that the alleged Violator is obligated to continue to conduct in good faith an investigation into other specific products within the type or category described above that may have been manufactured, distributed, sold, shipped, stored (or otherwise within the notice recipient's custody or control) during the relevant period so as to ensure that the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

#### VIII. DEMAND TO PRESERVE EVIDENCE

Please also accept this Notice as formal demand that the Violators preserve – in the same manner and form as created, prepared and as completed - all witness statements, diagrams, pictures, videotapes, sketches, reports, or other documentation regarding this claim or the facts, circumstances or other information surrounding this claim. Please preserve all documents relating to the products and exemplars that are identified herein and the subject of this Notice. Please preserve all electronic mail communications regarding or relating to the products, product testing and Proposition 65 compliance attempts and all electronically stored data that depicts, describes or otherwise relates to the subject Notice, the claims contained herein and related information. Please preserve all documents related to the products, packaging and design, including all correspondence relating to Proposition 65, phthalate content of the products and chemical warnings. Please preserve all documentation relating to the

purchase and receipt of the Noticed products, as well as the further sale and delivery of the products, including all sales correspondence, purchase orders, shipping orders, invoices, vendor purchase agreements, etc. Please preserve all inventory control information and documentation relating to the products and the amount of each product in your possession from your original receipt until your final sale, distribution or disposal. Please understand this demand is comprehensive and relates to all documentation and information regarding the products, Proposition 65 and phthalates. Please understand that these requests are intended to include, but not be limited to, all documents or other "writings" as that term is defined by Evidence Code Section 250. Please preserve a minimum of 5 examples of each style of each noticed product type and exemplar identified in Section VII. Recipient may suffer adverse consequences if you choose to ignore this request to preserve evidence. Destruction of evidence *in anticipation of a discovery request* "would surely be a misuse of discovery within the meaning of Code of Civil Procedure section 2023" thereby exposing that party to a wide range of sanctions, including default and dismissal. (*Cedars Sinai Med. Ctr. v. Sup.Ct. (Bowyer)* (1998) 18 Cal.4<sup>th</sup> 1, 12.)

# IX. DEMAND FOR RETAILER TO IDENTIFY MANUFACTURER, PRODUCER, PACKAGER, IMPORTER, SUPPLIER, AND DISTRIBUTOR

Pursuant to 27 C.C.R. 25600.2(g), "[t]he retail seller of a product that may cause a consumer product exposure shall promptly provide the name and contact information for the manufacturer, producer, packager, importer, supplier, and distributor of the product to ... [a]ny person who has served notice under Section 25249.7(d)(1) of the Act alleging that the consumer product causes an exposure that requires a warning under the Act." This notice includes both the description of the specific product type that is subject to this notice as well as one or more specific examples of the product in Section VII.

Please accept this Notice as a formal demand for any non-manufacturing seller or distributor receiving this notice to promptly provide the name and contact information for the manufacturer, producer, packager, importer, supplier, and distributor of the product(s) so identified. This information may and should be communicated on a letter from the retailer delivered via electronic mail to my counsel as indicated in Section III of this notice.

# **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

## I, Gregory M. Sheffer, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice has violated Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged Violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2) (i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons).

Dated: June 28, 2024 Sheffer Law Firm

Gregory M. Sheffer

#### PROOF OF SERVICE

I am employed in the County of Marin, State of California. I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action. My business address is 232 E. Blithedale Ave., Suite 210, Mill Valley, CA 94941.

On the date indicated below, I served the following documents, described as:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY (SERVED ONLY ON THE NOTICED VIOLATORS);

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND** 

## CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS (SERVED ONLY ON THE ATTORNEY GENERAL)

(1) on each entity or other mandatory recipient listed below with a complete postal mailing address by placing a true and correct copy of the foregoing document(s) in a sealed envelope addressed to each interested party as set forth hereafter and depositing each such envelope, with postage thereon fully prepaid, for collection and mailing with the United States Postal Service or agent authorized to accept mail on behalf of the United States Postal Service and (2) on each entity or other mandatory recipient listed below with an electronic mail address by electronically mailing PDF copies of the foregoing documents to them at such designated electronic address (with delivery confirmation requested and without receiving any unresolved return message of failed delivery).

Jessica Luo or current owner	Brian Miller, CEO
Bewaltz	Geppetto's Inc.
1550 S. Milliken Ave, Ste. E	8744 Nottingham Place
Ontario, CA 91761	La Jolla, CA 92037
The District Attorney for Each of the 58 counties in	The City Attorney for Los Angeles, San Diego, San
California	Jose, San Francisco and Sacramento
(see attached list of addresses)	(see attached list of addresses)
	,

I also caused to be served the same documents on the Attorney General of the State of California by electronically uploading a copy to the California Attorney General's Website at <a href="https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice">https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice</a>,

Executed this 28th day of June 2024, at Mill Valley, California. I declare under the penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Heidi Boissonneau

## SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Pamela Y Price Alameda County District Attorney CEPDProp65@acgov.org

The Honorable Michael Atwell Alpine County District Attorney PO BOX 248 Markleeville, CA 96120

The Honorable Todd Riebe Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642

The Honorable Michael Ramsey Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965

The Honorable Barbara Yook Calaveras County District Attorney Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

The Honorable Mathew Beauchamp Colusa County District Attorney 310 Sixth Street Colusa, CA 95932

The Honorable Stacey Grassini, DDA Contra Costa County Dist. Attorney <a href="mailto:sgrassini@contracosta.da.org">sgrassini@contracosta.da.org</a>

The Honorable Dale Trigg Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531

The Honorable James Clinchard El Dorado County ADAttorney EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us

The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp Fresno County District Attorney consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.g ov

The Honorable Dwayne Stewart Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988

The Honorable Maggie Fleming Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, Fourth Floor Eureka, CA 95501

The Honorable Gilbert Otero Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243

The Honorable Thomas Hardy Inyo County District Attorney inyoda@inyocounty.us

The Honorable Cynthia Zimmer Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4<sup>th</sup> Fl. Bakersfield, CA 93301

The Honorable Keith Fagundes Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230

The Honorable Susan Krones Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453 The Honorable Stacey Montgomery Lassen County District Attorney c/o Devin Chandler dchandler@co.lassen.ca.gov The Honorable George Gascon Los Angeles County Dist. Attorney 211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable Sally Moreno Madera County District Attorney 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637

The Honorable Lori Frugoli Marin County District Attorney consumer@marincounty.org

The Honorable Walter W. Wall Mariposa County District Attorney mcda@mariposacounty.org

The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendocino County District Attorney P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482

The Honorable Kimberly Lewis Merced County District Attorney <u>Prop65@countyofmerced.com</u>

The Honorable Cynthia Campbell Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101

The Honorable Tim Kendall Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 2053 Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546

The Honorable Jeannine Paccioni Monterey County District Attorney <u>Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us</u>

The Honorable Allison Haley Napa County District Attorney CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney Nevada County District Attorney DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us

The Honorable Todd Spitzer Orange County District Attorney 300 North Flower Street Santa Ana, CA 92701

Morgan Briggs Gire Placer County District Attorney prop65@placer.ca.gov

David Hollister, District Attorney Plumas County District Attorney davidhollister@countyofplumas.com

The Honorable Paul E. Zellerbach Riverside County District Attorney <u>Prop65@rivcoda.org</u>

The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County District Attorney Prop65@sacda.org

The Honorable Candice Hooper San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th Street, Second Floor Hollister, CA 95203

The Honorable Jason Anderson San Bernardino County Dist. Atty. 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502 Summer Stephan, District Attorney San Diego County District Attorney SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Atty San Diego CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

Henry Lifton ADA San Francisco, CA 94103 alethea.sargent@sfgov.org

Honorable Henry Lifton, DCA San Francisco, CA 94102 <u>Prop65@sfcityatty.org</u>

The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar San Joaquin County District Attorney DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

Nora V. Frimann, City Atty 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 216<sup>th</sup> Fl. San Jose, CA proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov

The Honorable Eric Dobroth San Luis Obispo County Deputy District Attorney edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063

The Honorable Joyce Dudley Santa Barbara County Dist. Attorney c/o Christopher Dalby, DDA DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Nora Frimman, City Atty. SanJose, CA 96113 Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov

The Honorable Bud Porter Supervising Deputy District Attorney Santa Clara County EPU@da.sccgov.org

The Honorable Jeff Rosell Santa Cruz County District Attorney <u>Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us</u>

The Honorable Stephanie Bridgett Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001

The Honorable Sandra Groven Sierra County District Attorney PO Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936

The Honorable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097

The Honorable Kristina Abrams Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533

The Honorable Jill Ravitch Sonoma County District Attorney jeanine.barnes@sonoma-county.org

The Honorable Birgit Fladager Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354 The Honorable Amanda Hopper Sutter County District Attorney 463 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991

The Honorable Matt Rogers Tehama County District Attorney 444 Oak Street, Room L Red Bluff, CA 96080

The Honorable David Brady Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093

The Honorable Phillip J. Cline Tulare County District Attorney <u>Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us</u>

The Honorable Laura Krieg Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370

The Honorable Gregory Totten Ventura County District Attorney daspecialops@ventura.org

The Honorable Jeff Reisig Yolo County District Attorney <a href="mailto:cfepd@yolocounty.org">cfepd@yolocounty.org</a>

The Honorable Clint Curry Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901

The Honorable Mike Feuer Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles 200 North Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012

The Honorable Susan Wood Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 I Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814

The Honorable Mara Elliott Office of the City Attorney, San Diego 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1620 San Diego, CA 92101

The Honorable Dennis Herrera Office of the City Attorney, San Francisco 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

The Honorable Nora Friman Office of the City Attorney, San Jose 200 East Santa Clara Street,16th Floor San Jose, CA 95113

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting Via Electronic filing https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60day-notice