



Matthew Maclear  
[mcm@atalawgroup.com](mailto:mcm@atalawgroup.com)  
415-568-5200

Anthony Barnes  
[amb@atalawgroup.com](mailto:amb@atalawgroup.com)  
917-371-8293

June 28, 2024

**NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF  
CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ.  
(PROPOSITION 65)**

Dear Alleged Violator and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

I represent Environmental Research Center, Inc. (“ERC”), 3111 Camino Del Rio North, Suite 400, San Diego, CA 92108; Tel. (619) 500-3090. ERC’s Executive Director is Chris Heptinstall. ERC is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees and encouraging corporate responsibility.

ERC has identified violations of California’s Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (“Proposition 65”), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*, with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violator identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violator and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), ERC intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

**General Information about Proposition 65.** A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is enclosed with this letter served to the alleged Violator identified below.

**Alleged Violator.** The name of the company covered by this notice that violated Proposition 65 (hereinafter the “Violator”) is:

**KinderFarms LLC**

**Consumer Products and Listed Chemical.** The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are:



Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*  
June 28, 2024  
Page 2

- 1. Kindersprout Organic Plant Protein Kids Nutrition Shake Chocolate Naturally Flavored - Perfluorooctanoic Acid (PFOA)**
- 2. Kindersprout Organic Plant Protein Kids Nutrition Shake Vanilla Naturally Flavored - Perfluorooctanoic Acid (PFOA)**

On November 10, 2017, the State of California officially listed Perfluorooctanoic Acid (PFOA) as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity. On February 25, 2022, the State of California officially listed Perfluorooctanoic Acid (PFOA) as a chemical known to cause cancer.

It should be noted that ERC may continue to investigate other products that may reveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

**Route of Exposure.** The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the recommended use of these products. Consequently, the route of exposure to this chemical has been and continues to be through ingestion.

**Approximate Time Period of Violations.** Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least June 28, 2021, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until these known toxic chemicals are either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemicals. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violator violated Proposition 65 because it failed to provide persons ingesting these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to these chemicals.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, ERC is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violator to: (1) recall the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemical, and/or (2) affix clear and reasonable Prop 65 warning labels for products sold in the future while reformulating such products to eliminate the exposures, and (3) conduct bio-monitoring of all California consumers that have ingested the identified chemical in the listed products, and (4) pay an appropriate civil penalty. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemical, as well as an expensive and time-consuming litigation.



Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*  
June 28, 2024  
Page 3

ERC has retained ATA Law Group as legal counsel in connection with this matter. **Please direct all communications regarding this Notice of Violation to my attention, or the attention of ATA partner Anthony Barnes, using the address or contact information indicated on the letterhead.**

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Matthew Maclear". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, stylized initial "M".

---

Matthew Maclear  
**AQUA TERRA AERIS LAW GROUP**

Attachments

- Certificate of Merit
- Certificate of Service
- OEHHA Summary (to KinderFarms LLC and its Registered Agents for Service of Process only)
- Additional Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to AG only)



Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*  
June 28, 2024  
Page 4

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

**Re: Environmental Research Center, Inc.'s Notice of Proposition 65 Violations by KinderFarms LLC**

I, Matthew Maclear, declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultants, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: June 28, 2024

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Matthew Maclear".

Matthew Maclear



Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*  
June 28, 2024  
Page 5

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE PURSUANT TO 27 CCR § 25903**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States and over the age of 18 years of age. My business address is 306 Joy Street, Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia 30742. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

On June 28, 2024, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; “THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY”** on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties listed below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified Mail:

Current President or CEO  
KinderFarms LLC  
409 N Pacific Coast Hwy, Ste 451  
Redondo Beach, CA 90277

VCorp Agent Services, Inc.  
(Registered Agent for KinderFarms LLC)  
1010 Dale St, N  
Saint Paul, MN 55117

Current President or CEO  
KinderFarms LLC  
407 N Pacific Coast Hwy, Ste 451  
Redondo Beach, CA 90277

VCorp Services, LLC  
(Registered Agent for KinderFarms LLC)  
701 S Carson St, Ste 200  
Carson City, NV 89701

Jeremiah Adams  
(Registered Agent for KinderFarms LLC)  
409 N Pacific Coast Hwy, Ste 451  
Redondo Beach, CA 90277

VCorp Services, LLC  
(Registered Agent for KinderFarms LLC)  
108 W 13<sup>th</sup> St, Ste 100  
Wilmington, DE 19801

On June 28, 2024, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1)** were served on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was uploaded on the California Attorney General’s website, which can be accessed at <https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice> :

Office of the California Attorney General  
Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting  
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000  
Oakland, CA 94612-0550



Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*  
June 28, 2024  
Page 6

On June 28, 2024, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** were served on the following parties when a true and correct copy thereof was sent via electronic mail to each of the parties listed below:

Pamela Y. Price, District Attorney  
Alameda County  
7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650  
Oakland, CA 94621  
CEPDProp65@acgov.org

Lori E. Frugoli, District Attorney  
Marin County  
3501 Civic Center Drive, Suite 145  
San Rafael, CA 94903  
consumer@marincounty.org

Barbara Yook, District Attorney  
Calaveras County  
891 Mountain Ranch Road  
San Andreas, CA 95249  
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

Walter W. Wall, District Attorney  
Mariposa County  
P.O. Box 730  
Mariposa, CA 95338  
mcda@mariposacounty.org

Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney  
Contra Costa County  
900 Ward Street  
Martinez, CA 94553  
sgrassini@contracostada.org

Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney  
Merced County  
550 West Main St  
Merced, CA 95340  
Prop65@countyofmerced.com

James Clinchard, Assistant District Attorney  
El Dorado County  
778 Pacific Street  
Placerville, CA 95667  
EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us

Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney  
Monterey County  
1200 Aguajito Road  
Monterey, CA 93940  
Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us

Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney  
Fresno County  
2100 Tulare Street  
Fresno, CA 93721  
conumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov

Allison Haley, District Attorney  
Napa County  
1127 First Street, Ste C  
Napa, CA 94559  
CEPD@countyofnapa.org

Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney  
Inyo County  
168 North Edwards Street  
Independence, CA 93526  
inyda@inyocounty.us

Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney  
Nevada County  
201 Commercial St  
Nevada City, CA 95959  
DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us

Devin Chandler, Program Coordinator  
Lassen County  
2950 Riverside Dr  
Susanville, CA 96130  
dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us

Todd Spitzer, District Attorney  
Orange County  
300 N Flower St  
Santa Ana, CA 92703  
Prop65notice@ocdapa.org



Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*

June 28, 2024

Page 7

Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney  
Placer County  
10810 Justice Center Drive  
Roseville, CA 95678  
Prop65@placer.ca.gov

David Hollister, District Attorney  
Plumas County  
520 Main St  
Quincy, CA 95971  
davidhollister@countyofplumas.com

Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney  
Riverside County  
3072 Orange Street  
Riverside, CA 92501  
Prop65@rivcoda.org

Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney  
Sacramento County  
901 G Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Prop65@sacda.org

Summer Stephan, District Attorney  
San Diego County  
330 West Broadway  
San Diego, CA 92101  
SanDiegoDAProp65@sdca.org

Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney  
San Diego City Attorney  
1200 Third Avenue  
San Diego, CA 92101  
CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov

Alexandra Grayner, Assistant District Attorney  
San Francisco District Attorney's Office  
350 Rhode Island Street  
San Francisco, CA 94103  
Alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org

Henry Lifton, Deputy City Attorney  
San Francisco City Attorney  
1390 Market Street, 7th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Prop65@sfcityatty.org

Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney  
San Joaquin County  
222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202  
Stockton, CA 95202  
DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org

Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney  
San Luis Obispo County  
County Government Center Annex, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408  
edobroth@co.slo.ca.us

Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney  
Santa Barbara County  
1112 Santa Barbara Street  
Santa Barbara, CA 93101  
DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us

Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District Attorney  
Santa Clara County  
70 W Hedding St  
San Jose, CA 95110  
EPU@da.sccgov.org

Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney  
Santa Clara City Attorney  
200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Jose, CA 96113  
Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov

Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney  
Santa Cruz County  
701 Ocean Street  
Santa Cruz, CA 95060  
Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

Jill Ravitch, District Attorney  
Sonoma County  
600 Administration Dr  
Sonoma, CA 95403  
Jeannie.Barnes@sonoma-county.org

Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney  
Tulare County  
221 S Mooney Blvd  
Visalia, CA 95370  
Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us



Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*  
June 28, 2024  
Page 8

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney  
Ventura County  
800 S Victoria Ave  
Ventura, CA 93009  
daspecialops@ventura.org

Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney  
Yolo County  
301 Second Street  
Woodland, CA 95695  
cfepd@yolocounty.org

On June 28, 2024, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** on each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by First Class Mail.

Executed on June 28, 2024, in Fort Oglethorpe, Georgia.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Phyllis Dunwoody". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Phyllis Dunwoody





Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.*

June 28, 2024

Page 9

**Service List**

District Attorney, Alpine County P.O. Box 248 17300 Hwy 89 Markleeville, CA 96120	District Attorney, Modoc County 204 S Court Street, Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020	District Attorney, Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901
District Attorney, Amador County 708 Court Street, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642	District Attorney, Mono County Post Office Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517	Los Angeles City Attorney's Office City Hall East 200 N. Main Street, Suite 800 Los Angeles, CA 90012
District Attorney, Butte County 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965	District Attorney, San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2nd Floor Hollister, CA 95023	
District Attorney, Colusa County 310 6 <sup>th</sup> St Colusa, CA 95932	District Attorney, San Bernardino County 303 West Third Street San Bernardino, CA 92415	
District Attorney, Del Norte County 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531	District Attorney, San Mateo County 400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	
District Attorney, Glenn County Post Office Box 430 Willows, CA 95988	District Attorney, Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001	
District Attorney, Humboldt County 825 5th Street 4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Eureka, CA 95501	District Attorney, Sierra County Post Office Box 457 100 Courthouse Square, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor Downieville, CA 95936	
District Attorney, Imperial County 940 West Main Street, Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243	District Attorney, Siskiyou County Post Office Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097	
District Attorney, Kern County 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301	District Attorney, Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533	
District Attorney, Kings County 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230	District Attorney, Stanislaus County 832 12th Street, Ste 300 Modesto, CA 95354	
District Attorney, Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453	District Attorney, Sutter County 463 2 <sup>nd</sup> Street Yuba City, CA 95991	
District Attorney, Los Angeles County Hall of Justice 211 West Temple St., Ste 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012	District Attorney, Tehama County Post Office Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080	
District Attorney, Madera County 300 South G Street, Ste 300 Madera, CA 93637	District Attorney, Trinity County Post Office Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093	
District Attorney, Mendocino County Post Office Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482	District Attorney, Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370	