#### **60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION**

# SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)

DATE: July 18, 2024

TO: Iovate Health Sciences U.S.A., Inc.; Walmart, Inc.; and the public prosecutors listed on

the service list accompanying the attached proof of service.

FROM: APS&EE, LLC

#### I. INTRODUCTION

APS&EE is an organization based in the State of California with an interest in protecting the environment, which includes promoting awareness of exposure to toxic chemicals and reducing exposure to hazardous substances found in consumer products. It is providing this Notice to the violators and the public agencies listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code §25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65"). APS&EE, LLC's address is 3334 E. Coast Hwy, Box 514, Corona Del Mar, CA 92625, Attn: Isabel Novak (member), 949-715-7885. Please direct all questions concerning this Notice to it through its designated person for the entity, its attorney: Lucas T. Novak, Esq., Law Offices of Lucas T. Novak, 8335 W Sunset Blvd., Suite 217, Los Angeles, CA 90069; Tel: (323) 337-9015; Email: lucas.nvk@gmail.com.

#### II. NATURE OF THE VIOLATION

- A. <u>Violators</u>: Iovate Health Sciences U.S.A., Inc., 1100 North Market St, Suite 4071, Wilmington, DE 19801; Walmart, Inc., 702 SW 8th Street, Bentonville, AR 72716.
- B. <u>Time Period of Exposure</u>: Violations have been occurring since at least July 18, 2023, and continue to occur to this day.
- C. Listed Chemicals: Lead
- D. <u>Types of Harm</u>: Lead is listed as known to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.
- E. <u>Types of Products</u>: The specific type of products causing the violations is Purely Inspired Organic Greens With Superfood Blend, including but not limited to 6-31656-70883-7, being sold by Violators throughout California. All products within the type covered by this Notice shall be hereinafter referred to as the "products."
- F. Routes of Exposure: Ingestion, dermal contact, and inhalation.
- G. <u>Description of Exposure</u>: The sales of these products in California dating as far back as July 18, 2023 are subject to this notice. As a result of the sales of these products, exposures to the listed chemical have been occurring without clear and reasonable warnings as required by Proposition 65. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to the listed chemical, resulting from ingestion, dermal contact, and/or inhalation of the products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of

exposure to the toxic chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the products. California consumers, through the act of buying, acquiring or using the products, are exposed to the listed chemicals. By way of example but not limitation, exposures occur when California citizens use, ingest, or otherwise handle the products. These actions cause consumers to be exposed directly or indirectly through the routine eating, drinking, or touching of the parts or portions of the products containing readily available amounts of the listed chemical. Additionally, exposure can occur through the routine touching and ingesting of other materials that are contaminated with the listed chemical from the products. People likely to be exposed include both children and adults.

### III. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, attached is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" which has been prepared by Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at (916) 445-6900.

### IV. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

The retailer is hereby requested to promptly provide the names and contact information for the manufacturers, producers, packagers, importers, suppliers, and/or distributors of the products identified in this Notice. Cal. Code Regs. tit. 27, §25600.2(g).

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, the noticing party intends to file a Private Enforcer lawsuit against the alleged Violators unless such Violators enters into a binding written agreement to: (1) recall products already sold or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those who have received such products; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the lead exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b). If the alleged Violators are interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to expensive and time-consuming litigation, please feel free to contact counsel identified above. It should be noted that a Private Enforcer cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; or (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with me will resolve my claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

# **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

- I, Lucas Novak, Esq. hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code §25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings;
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party;
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action;
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute;
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2) (i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons).

2/10

	Menl	
Dated: July 18, 2024		
	Lucas Novak, Esq	

#### PROOF OF SERVICE

I, Lucas Novak, Esq., declare under penalty of perjury:

I am an active member of the California State Bar, a citizen of the United States over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action; my business address is 8335 W Sunset Blvd., Suite 217, Los Angeles, CA 90069.

On July 18, 2024, I served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d);

PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY (not sent to the public enforcement agencies);

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND** 

# **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS (served only on the Attorney General)**

by placing a true copy thereof enclosed in a sealed envelope with postage for first class mail thereon fully prepaid in Los Angeles, California, in the United States mail addressed as follows, and to the public prosecutors listed in the attached service list:

Iovate Health Sciences U.S.A., Inc.	Iovate Health Sciences U.S.A., Inc.
Attn: Current President or CEO	c/o C T Corporation System
1100 North Market St, Suite 4071	330 N Brand Blvd. #700
Wilmington, DE 19801	Glendale, CA 91203
Walmart, Inc.	Walmart, Inc.
Attn: Current President or CEO	c/o C T Corporation System
702 SW 8th Street	330 N Brand Blvd. #700
Bentonville, AR 72716	Glendale, CA 91203

Additionally, on this date, I uploaded the documents listed above to the California Attorney General via its website:

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 http://oag.ca.gov/prop65

Also on this date, I transmitted via electronic mail the documents listed above to the electronic mail addresses as follows:

District Attorney of Contra Costa Co	unty District Attorney of Monterey	District Attorney of Napa

000 W 1 C	T.C	
900 Ward Street	County	County
Martinez, CA 94553	PO Box 1131	1127 First Street, Suite C
sgrassini@contracostada.org	Salinas, CA 93902	Napa, CA 94559
	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us	CEPD@countyofnapa.org
Division (D)	District August 200	Division Ave
District Attorney of Riverside County	District Attorney of Santa Clara	District Attorney of Sonoma
3072 Orange Street	County	County
Riverside, CA 92501	70 W Hedding St	600 Administration Dr
Prop65@rivcoda.org	San Jose, CA 95110	Sonoma, CA 95403
	epu@da.sccgov.org	jbarnes@sonoma-county.org
District Attorney of Tulare County	District Attorney of Ventura County	District Attorney of
221 S Mooney Blvd	800 S Victoria Ave	Stanislaus County
Visalia, CA 95370	Ventura, CA 93009	832 12th Street, Ste 300
Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us	daspecialops@ventura.org	Modesto, CA 95354
District Attorney of Vola County	District Attorney of Lassen County	Prop65@standa.org District Attorney of
District Attorney of Yolo County 301 Second St.	220 S. Lassen Street	Sacramento County
Woodland, CA 95695	Susanville, CA 96130	901 G Street
I	dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us	
cfepd@yolocounty.org	denandier@co.iassen.ca.us	Sacramento, CA 95814 Prop65@sacda.org
District Attorney of San Francisco	District Attorney of San Joaquin	District Attorney of San Luis
County	County	Obispo County
350 Rhode Island Street	222 E. Weber Avenue, Rm 202	County Government Center
San Francisco, CA 94103	Stockton, CA 95202	Annex
alethea.sargent@sfgov.org	DAConsumer.Environmental	4th Floor
alctica.sargent@sigov.org	@sjcda.org	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408
	w.sjeda.org	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
District Attorney of Santa Cruz County	San Diego City Attorney's Office	District Attorney of Santa
701 Ocean Street, Rm. 200	1200 Third Avenue, Ste 1620	Barbara County
Santa Cruz, CA 95060	San Diego, CA 92101	1112 Santa Barbara St.
Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	CityAttyCrimProp65@sandiego.gov	Santa Barbara, CA 93101
1 Topos Di Nasantaerazeoanty. as	City/ittyCillin Topo3@sandicgo.gov	DAProp65@co.santa-
		barbara.ca.us
District Attorney of Alameda County	District Attorney of Calaveras	District Attorney of Inyo
1225 Fallon Street, Rm 900	County	County
Oakland, CA 94612	891 Mountain Ranch Road	168 North Edwards Street
CEPDProp65@acgov.org	San Andreas, CA 95249	Independence, CA 93526
1	Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	inyoda@inyocounty.us
San Francisco City Attorney's Office	District Attorney of San Diego	District Attorney of
1390 Market Street, 7th Floor	County	Mariposa County
San Francisco, CA 94102	330 West Broadway	5101 Jones St., P.O. Box 730
Prop65@sfcityatty.org	San Diego, CA 92101	Mariposa, CA 95338
1 - 0 7 7 -8	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org	mcda@mariposacounty.org
District Attorney of Merced County	District Attorney of Nevada County	District Attorney of Placer
2222 "M" Street	201 Commercial Street	County
Merced, CA 95340	Nevada City, CA 95959	10810 Justice Center Drive,
Prop65@countyofmerced.com	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us	Ste 240
		Roseville, CA 95678
		prop65@placer.ca.gov
District Attorney of Plumas County	San Jose City Attorney	District Attorney of Marin
520 Main Street, Rm. 404	200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	County
Quincy, CA 95971	San Jose, CA 96113	3501 Civic Center Dr, Rm.
davidhollister@countyofplumas.com	Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov	145
		San Rafael, CA 94903

		consumer@marincounty.org
District Attorney of Fresno County	District Attorney of El Dorado	
2100 Tulare Street	County	
Fresno, CA 93721	778 Pacific Street	
consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov	Placerville, CA 95667	
	EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us	

The electronic transmissions were reported as sent and without error.

Executed on July 18, 2024, at Los Angeles, California.

Lucas Novak, Esq.

# SERVICE LIST

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office 800 City Hall East 200 N. Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012	District Attorney of Alpine County 270 Laramie St., P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	District Attorney of Amador County 708 Court Street, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642
District Attorney of Butte County Administration Building 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965	District Attorney of Yuba County 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901	District Attorney of Colusa County 310 6th Street Colusa, CA 95932
District Attorney of Del Norte County 450 H Street, Ste 171 Crescent City, CA 95531 District Attorney of Glenn County	Sacramento City Attorney's Office 915 I Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814 District Attorney of Humboldt County	District Attorney of Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001 District Attorney of Imperial County
P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988 District Attorney of Trinity County	825 5 <sup>th</sup> Street Eureka, CA 95501 District Attorney of Kern County	940 W. Main Street, Ste 102 El Centro, CA 92243 District Attorney of Kings County
P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093	1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301	1400 West Lacey Blvd. Hanford, CA 93230
District Attorney of Lake County 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453	District Attorney of Los Angeles County 211 W. Temple Street, Ste 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210	District Attorney of Madera County 300 S G St. Suite 300 Madera, CA 93637
District Attorney of Siskiyou County P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097	District Attorney of Modoc County 204 S. Court Street, Rm. 202 Alturas, CA 96101-4020	District Attorney of Mendocino County P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482
District Attorney of Tehama County P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080	District Attorney of Orange County 300 N Flower St Santa Ana, CA 92703	District Attorney of Mono County P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517
District Attorney of Solano County 675 Texas Street, Ste 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533	District Attorney of San Benito County 419 Fourth Street, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor Hollister, CA 95023	District Attorney of San Bernardino County 316 N. Mountain View Avenue San Bernardino, CA 92415
District Attorney of Sierra County Courthouse 100 Courthouse Sq., 2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor Downieville, CA 95936	District Attorney of San Mateo County 400 County Center, 3 <sup>rd</sup> Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	District Attorney of Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370
District Attorney of Sutter County 463 2nd Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991		