VIA CERTIFIED FIRST CLASS MAIL

Manager or Managing Member Bumble Bee Foods, LLC 280 10th Avenue San Diego, CA 92101

Manager or Managing Member Bumble Bee Foods, LLC The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, New Castle, DE 19801

Bumble Bee Holding Company 1, Manager or Managing Member Bumble Bee Foods, LLC 280 10th Avenue San Diego, CA 92101

Bumble Bee Holding Company 1, Manager or Managing Member Bumble Bee Foods, LLC 280 10th Avenue San Diego, CA 92101

Current President or CEO Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com Services LLC c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Dr. Wilmington, DE 19808

Current President or CEO Amazon.com Services LLC 410 Terry Avenue N. Seattle, Washington 981095

Current Manager or CEO Shopfoodex.com 1948 Franklin Rd SW Ste B201, Roanoke, Virginia 24014

VIA ELECTRONIC FILING

State of California Department of Justice Office of Attorney General of California Filing link: oag.ca.gov/prop65

VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL

District Attorneys of California Counties and City Attorneys, as in the Certificate of Service

VIA E-MAIL

District Attorneys of California Counties and City Attorneys, as in the Certificate of Service



New York 282 11th Avenue, Suite 2612 New York, NY 10001 www.poulsenlaw.org +1 646 766 5999



California 15303 Ventura Blvd, Suite 900 Los Angeles, CA 91403 contact@poulsenlaw.org +1 646 766 5999

RE: Cadmium, lead and lead compounds in Bumble Bee Holding Company 1, Bumble Bee Foods, LLC, Amazon.com, Inc. Amazon.com Services LLC, and Shopfoodex.com products

July 23, 2024

THIS IS A SECOND NOTICE OF INTENT TO SUE Connected notice (same violator, identical and different shellfish products): AG NO 2022-02710 of 11.7.22

for violations of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986

Dear alleged violators and public enforcement agencies,

The undersigned counsel represents The Chemical Toxin Working Group, Inc., a California non-profit corporation, doing business as Healthy Living Foundation Inc., 1801 Chart Trail, Topanga, California 90290, telephone number 310 403 6995 ("HLF," "Noticing Party"). The undersigned counsel is specifically designated as a responsible person within HLF, in the meaning of Cal. Code Regs., tit. 27, § 25903(A)(1), to resolve this issue.

HLF implements measures to reduce the amount of chemical toxins in consumer products posing targeted dangers to fetuses, children, pregnant women, and women of childbearing age; acts in the interest of the people with a mission to bring truth and transparency to consumer product labeling and advertising; improves safety for workers by reducing their exposure to chemicals; publishes consumer health articles, periodicals, books, comparative test results and educates the public. HLF has achieved reformulation and removal of egregiously carcinogenic products from the market.

HLF has enforced a large number of Cal. Health & Safety Code violations in the public interest and developed an extensive expertise in prosecuting manufacturers and distributors of food and consumer products for violations of health and consumer safety laws. These cases have resulted in significant public benefit, including reformulation of products to remove toxic chemicals to make them safer, and putting label and online warnings on products tested as contaminated with lead cadmium, acrylamide, dioxane, or removing them from the California market.

HLF's Chief Officer David W. Steinman is a publisher, health and environmental journalist, and bestselling author of *Raising Healthy Kids: Protecting Your Children from Hidden*



Chemical Toxins (Skyhorse 2024), *Diet For A Poisoned Planet* (Crown Ed., 1990, Ballantine 2d Ed., 1992, Running Press 3d Ed., 2007). Among his other books are: *The Safe Shoppers' Bible* (Macmillan Ed., 1995, Wiley 2d Ed., 2000) and *The Breast Cancer Prevention Program* (Macmillan Ed., 1997). Mr. Steinman represented the public interest at the National Academy of Sciences on the Safe Seafood Committee that produced *Seafood Safety* (Washington, D.C.: National Academies Press, 1991), advised Congress on related legislation, testified before Congress as an expert witness on food safety, was an early proponent of Proposition 65, and a child victim of exposure to toxic chemicals.

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, codified in the California Health & Safety Code sections 25249.5, et seq. ("Proposition 65"), requires that a 60-day notice of intent to sue be provided to a violator of Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6.

With this notice of violation ("Notice," "NOV") HLF gives a written notice of the alleged violation, bringing this action in the public interest, as defined under the Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d), seeking to prosecute the alleged continuing noncompliance, and to warn consumers about their exposure to the violative chemical(s), or reduce and/or eliminate consumer exposures from product(s) (collectively, the "Specified Products" and each a "Specified Products") listed in the table below, which are manufactured, distributed and/or sold by Bumble Bee Holding Company 1, Bumble Bee Foods, LLC, Amazon.com, Inc., Amazon.com Services LLC, and Shopfoodex.com (referred to as the "Noticed Party[ies]").

This Notice covers the violations of Proposition 65 that are currently known to the Noticing Party from information now available as specifically related to the violating products listed below and manufactured, distributed or/and sold by and through the Noticed Parties. HLF is continuing its investigation that may reveal further violations.

The Specified Product(s) subject to this Notice, the chemical(s) in the Specified Product(s) identified as exceeding allowable levels, and the Noticed Parties responsible for sales of the Specified Products, are as follows:

Specified Products	Violative chemical	Noticed Party
Bumble Bee Hardwood Smoked Oysters (ShopFoodEx)	Cadmium, lead and lead compounds	Bumble Bee Holding Company 1, Bumble Bee Foods, LLC, Amazon.com, Inc., Amazon.com Services LLC, and Shopfoodex.com
Bumble Bee Hot & Spicy Smoked Oysters (Amazon.com/Universal Supermarket)	Cadmium, lead and lead compounds	Bumble Bee Holding Company 1, Bumble Bee Foods, LLC, Amazon.com, Inc., Amazon.com Services LLC, and Shopfoodex.com

Lead and lead compounds ("lead") are listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause developmental toxicity, reproductive toxicity and cancer.

Cadmium ("cadmium") is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause developmental toxicity, reproductive toxicity and cancer.



Noticed Parties have manufactured, produced, marketed, distributed and/or sold the Specified Products which, according to the test results, have exposed and continue to expose consumers within the State of California to cadmium, lead and lead compounds.

The primary route of exposure has been through ingestion.

Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 requires that a "clear and reasonable" warning be provided prior to exposure to a chemical listed under Proposition 65. The Noticed Parties are in violation of Proposition 65 because the Noticed Parties have failed to provide a warning to consumers that consumers are being exposed to cadmium, lead and lead compounds.

HLF alleges that while in the course of doing business, the Noticed Parties are knowingly and intentionally exposing consumers to cadmium, lead and lead compounds without first providing a "clear and reasonable" warning.

The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product's label. See Cal. Code Regs. tit. 27, § 25602, subd. (a)(3), and subd. (b) for internet purchases also at the point of sale, as applicable. The Noticed Parties have not provided Proposition 65 warnings as required by law that persons handling, ingesting and/or otherwise using the Specified Products are being exposed to cadmium, lead and lead compound.

With respect to the Specified Products listed above, the violation commenced on the latter of the date that the Specified Product was first offered for sale in California, or July 23, 2021; has continued every day since the relevant date the violation commenced; and will continue every day henceforth until cadmium, lead and lead compounds are removed from the Specified Products, reduced to allowable levels, or the Specified Product(s) are removed from the California market, or until a "clear and reasonable" warning is provided to consumers by the Noticed Parties, as applicable, in accordance with the law.

Pursuant to Title 27, C.C.R. § 25903(b), copies of the following documents are attached hereto for reference by the Notices Parties:

(i) "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary."

Pursuant to Title 11, C.C.R. § 3100, the "Certificate of Merit" is attached hereto.

HLF offers to resolve the issue swiftly and intends to file a lawsuit after 60 days based on the facts set forth in this Notice if the resolution is not reached by the parties to this Notice. Meanwhile we encourage a prompt resolution of this matter within the said period of 60 days where the Noticed Parties agree in a written agreement to (1) eliminate or reduce cadmium and lead and lead compounds to an allowable level in the Specified Products or, or remove the Specified Product(s) from the California market or, as an alternative, (2) provide a Proposition 65- compliant warning on the label of the Specified Products and online, where applicable, and/or at the point of sale; and (3) pay applicable civil penalties and costs of bringing this action.

Demand to Preserve Evidence

As stated above, if the issue is not resolved, HLF intends to file a lawsuit, in which Noticed Party[ies] will be named as defendants. When a lawsuit is anticipated, California requires a prospective party to take all reasonable steps to preserve documents, tangible things, and electronically stored information (ESI) that are potentially relevant to the anticipated lawsuit and that are in the prospective party's possession, custody, or control. The duty applies equally to hard copy documents, other tangible things and to ESI.



1. <u>Electronically Stored Information</u>

As ESI can be easily deleted, corrupted, or modified in the normal operations of a business, preservation measures must be implemented immediately. These measures include, but are not limited to, those explained herein.

ESI that may be subject to a duty to preserve includes information electronically, digitally, magnetically, or optically stored. Magnetic, optical and other storage media, including archival and backup media, are also potential locations of ESI.

ESI that is potentially relevant to the contemplated action, and that the Noticed Party[ies] should preserve, includes ESI generated during the relevant time period of alleged violations and relating to the allegations in this Notice.

To satisfy its preservation duties, the Noticed Party[ies] must take all reasonable measures to preserve all hard copy documents, tangible things, and ESI that are potentially relevant to the aforementioned anticipated lawsuit, including the ESI described above. These measures include:

- Halting the Noticed Party[ies]'s routine document preservation or retention policies and its backup recycling policies.
- Instituting a litigation hold and monitoring compliance with the hold on an ongoing basis until this legal matter is fully resolved. A litigation hold ensures that all sources of potentially relevant information are identified and preserved.
- Documents and tangible things must be preserved in their original, unmodified condition. ESI must be preserved in the form in which it is normally maintained (its native format) with all metadata, both system metadata and application metadata, intact.
- Preserving all hardware, portable and personal storage devices, and any other electronic storage devices that contain potentially relevant information. Such devices need not be in current use. They may include devices no longer in use and legacy hardware if there is no other way to view potentially relevant legacy data. The Noticed Party[ies]'s shall not replace, destroy, or modify such hardware and other electronic storage devices in any manner that could delete, damage, or alter the ESI they store.
- Preserving all support information needed to access potentially relevant ESI. Support information includes, but is not limited to, operating systems, installation disks, legacy and other software, operating and user manuals, user IDs, passwords, security and license keys, and encryption/decryption information.
- 2. <u>Preservation Duties Extend to Departing Employees</u>

The Noticed Party[ies]'s preservation duties extend to potentially relevant information in the possession of officers, directors, and employees who depart from employment by the Noticed Party[ies]. Caution should be taken to preserve the ESI of departing officers, directors, and employees whose data is subject to litigation hold requirements.

3. <u>Preservation Duties Extend to Information Controlled, but Not Actually Possessed by</u> <u>the Noticed Party[ies]</u>

Since a potential party "controls" documents or information when it has the legal right to obtain them on demand, The Noticed Party[ies]'s preservation duties extend to ESI possessed by its current and former attorneys, accountants, third party information technology vendors,



business service providers, and other agents and contractors, and may extend to its subsidiaries, affiliates, and divisions.

Prompt action of the Noticed Parties on this Notice will prevent further consumer exposures to a highly dangerous chemical without warning, therefore rectifying these alleged ongoing violations of the California law, and will afford the Noticed Parties the opportunity to avoid increasing costs associated with noncompliance and costly litigation.

Please contact HLF's designated agent for the purpose of resolving the issue, the undersigned counsel, as soon as possible.

Sincerely,

he

Aida Poulsen | Managing attorney | NY | CA <u>contact@poulsenlaw.org</u>

15303 Ventura Blvd, Suite 900 Los Angeles, CA 91403



ATTACHMENTS

- 1. Certificate of Merit;
- 2. Confidential Factual Information supporting Certificate of Merit (to Attorney General only);
- 3. Certificate of Service;
- 4. Appendix "A" "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary" (to the Noticed Parties only).



New York 282 11th Avenue, Suite 2612 New York, NY 10001 www.poulsenlaw.org +1 646 766 5999



California 15303 Ventura Blvd, Suite 900 Los Angeles, CA 91403 contact@poulsenlaw.org +1 646 766 5999

To:	California Attorney General
Notice of Violation:	July 23, 2024
Noticing Party:	Chemical Toxin Working Group Inc. dba Healthy Living Foundation Inc.
Noticed Parties:	Bumble Bee Holding Company 1, Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com Services LLC, and Shopfoodex.com

July 23, 2024

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

To the Notice of Violation

I, Aida Poulsen, attorney at law, hereby declare:

This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice(s) in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notices have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

I am the attorney for the Noticing Party.

I have reviewed the facts of this case and have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience and expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, and/or other data regarding the alleged exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the attached Notice of Violation dated July 23, 2024 (the "Notice").

I have reviewed the laboratory testing results for the chemical subject to the Notice and rely on these results. The testing was conducted by a reputable accredited testing laboratory and by experienced scientists with doctoral and other degrees in relevant sciences. The facts, studies and other data derived through this investigation overwhelmingly demonstrate that the alleged violators have exposed persons to the listed chemical that is the subject of the Notice and is known to the State of California to cause reproductive and/or developmental harm, and/or cancer.

Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.



The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: July 23, 2024

By:

fre

Aida Poulsen | Managing attorney | NY | CA contact@poulsenlaw.org

NOTICE OF VIOLATION/CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Jesus Abundis, am over the age of eighteen years and am not a party to the action, process or case related to or arising out of the Notice of Violation being served under this Certificate of Service. My address is 1031 W 7th Street, Apt 2, Oxnard, CA 93030.

On July 23, 2024 between 11:00 a.m. and 9:00 p.m. Pacific Time, I served the following documents:

- 1. Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq. by Bumble Bee Holding Company 1, Bumble Bee Foods, LLC, Amazon.com, Inc., Amazon.com Services LLC, and Shopfoodex.com
- 2. Certificate of Merit;
- 3. Appendix "A" "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary;"

on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the parties below, and causing it to be deposited at a United States Postal Service Office in Los Angeles County, California, for delivery by Certified Mail:

Bumble Bee Holding Company 1, Manager or	Bumble Bee Holding Company 1,
Managing Member	Manager or Managing Member
Bumble Bee Foods, LLC	Bumble Bee Foods, LLC
280 10th Avenue	280 10th Avenue
San Diego, CA 92101	San Diego, CA 92101
Current President or CEO Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com Services LLC c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Dr. Wilmington, DE 19808	Current President or CEO Amazon.com Services LLC 410 Terry Avenue N. Seattle, Washington 981095
Current Manager or CEO	Manager or Managing Member
Shopfoodex.com	Bumble Bee Foods, LLC
1948 Franklin Rd SW Ste B201,	280 10th Avenue
Roanoke, Virginia 24014	San Diego, CA 92101
Manager or Managing Member Bumble Bee Foods, LLC The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, New Castle, DE 19801	

NOTICE OF VIOLATION/CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

On July 23, 2024 between 11:00 a.m. and 11:30 p.m. Pacific Time, I served the following documents:

1. Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq. by Bumble Bee Holding Company 1, Bumble Bee Foods, LLC, Amazon.com, Inc., Amazon.com Services LLC, and Shopfoodex.com on the following parties by filing electronically a true and correct copy thereof as permitted through the website of the California Office of the Attorney General via link at oag.ca.gov/prop65:

State of California Department of Justice; Office of the Attorney General of California.

On July 23, 2024 between 11:00 a.m. and 9:00 p.m. Pacific Time, I served the following documents:

- 1. Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq. by Gelson's Markets, Instacart, Instacart Inc., and Maplebear Inc
- 2. Certificate of Merit

on the following parties below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the District Attorney and City Attorney offices listed below, and causing each envelope to be deposited at a United States Postal Service mail box for delivery by First Class Mail:

District Attorney	District Attorney	District Attorney
Alpine County	Lake County	Sierra County
PO Box 248	255 North Forbes Street	PO Box 457
Markleeville, CA 96120	Lakeport, CA 95453	Downieville, CA 95936
District Attorney	District Attorney	District Attorney's Office
Amador County	Los Angeles County	Siskiyou County Courthouse
708 Court Street, Suite 202	Hall of Justice 211 West	311 Fourth Street, Room 204
Jackson, CA 95642	Temple St. Ste 1200	Yreka, CA 96097
	Los Angeles, CA 90012	
District Attorney	District Attorney	District Attorney
Butte County	Madera County	Solano County
25 County Center Drive,	209 West Yosemite Avenue	675 Texas Street, Ste 4500
Suite 245	Madera, CA 93637	Fairfield, CA 94533
Oroville, CA 95965		
District Attorney	District Attorney	District Attorney
Colusa County	Modoc County	Stanislaus County
310 6 th Street	204 S Court Street, Room	832 12th Street, Ste 300
Colusa, CA 95932	202	Modesto, CA 95354
	Alturas, CA 96101-4020	
District Attorney	District Attorney	District Attorney
Del Norte County	Orange County	Sutter County
450 H Street, Suite 171	300 N Flower St.	446 Second Street
Crescent City, CA 95531	Santa Ana, CA 92703	Yuba City, CA 95991

NOTICE OF VIOLATION/CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

District Attorney	District Attorney	District Attorney
EL Dorado County	San Benito County	Tehama County
778 Pacific Street	419 4 th Street	PO Box 519
Placerville, CA 95667	Hollister, CA 95023	Red Bluff, CA 96080
District Attorney	District Attorney	District Attorney
Fresno County	San Bernardino County	Trinity County
2220 Tulare Street	316 No. Mountain View	Post Office Box 310
Suite 1000	Avenue	Weaverville, CA 96093
Fresno, CA 93721	San Bernardino, CA 92415	
District Attorney	District Attorney	District Attorney
Glenn County	San Mateo County	Tuolumne County
Post Office Box 430	400 County Ctr., 3rd Floor	423 North Washington St.
Willows, CA 95988	Redwood City, CA 94063	Sonora, CA 95370
District Attorney	District Attorney	District Attorney
Humboldt County	Shasta County	Yuba County
825 5th Street 4 th Floor	1355 West Street	215 Fifth Street, Suite 152
Eureka, CA 95501	Redding, CA 96001	Marysville, CA 95901
District Attorney	District Attorney	Los Angeles City Attorney's
Imperial County	Mono County	Office
940 West Main Street, Suite	Post Office Box 617	City Hall East
102	Bridgeport, CA 93517	200 N. Main Street, Suite
El Centro, CA 92243		800
		Los Angeles, CA 90012
District Attorney	District Attorney	San Jose City Attorney's
Kern County	Kings County	Office
1215 Truxtun Avenue	1400 West Lacey Blvd.	200 East Santa Clara Street,
Bakersfield, CA 93301	Hanford, CA 93230	16 th Floor
,		San Jose, CA 95113
District Attorney		
Mendocino County		
5		
PO Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482		

On July 23, 2024, between 11:00 a.m. and 11:30 p.m. Pacific Time, I served the following documents:

- 1. Notice of Violations of California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.5 et seq. by Bumble Bee Holding Company 1, Bumble Bee Foods, LLC, Amazon.com, Inc., Amazon.com Services LLC, and Shopfoodex.com
- 2. Certificate of Merit

on each of the parties below, all of which have requested electronic service only via the following email addresses:

Alameda County District Attorney	Calaveras County District Attorney
Prop65@acgov.org	Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

NOTICE OF VIOLATION/CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Inyo County District Attorney
inyoda@inyocounty.us
Mariposa County District Attorney
mcda@mariposacounty.org
Monterey County District Attorney
Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
Nevada County District Attorney
DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us
Plumas County District Attorney
davidhollister@countyofplumas.com
Sacramento County District Attorney
Prop65@sacda.org
San Diego County District Attorney
SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
San Francisco City Attorney
Prop65@sfcityatty.org
San Luis Obispo County District Attorney
edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
Santa Clara County District Attorney
EPU@da.sccgov.org
Sonoma County District Attorney
jbarnes@sonoma-county.org
Ventura County District Attorney
daspecialops@ventura.org
consumer@marincounty.gov

I, Jesus Abundis, declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Signature

o Abundis esu

_1031 W 7th Street, Apt 2 Oxnard, CA 93030

July 23, 2024

NOTICE OF VIOLATION/CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE