## 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION

SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)

DATE: August 8, 2024

TO: Azuretale, Inc.; Azuretale Private Ltd.; Amazon.com, Inc.; and the public prosecutors

listed on the service list accompanying the attached proof of service.

FROM: APS&EE, LLC

### I. INTRODUCTION

APS&EE is an organization based in the State of California with an interest in protecting the environment, which includes promoting awareness of exposure to toxic chemicals and reducing exposure to hazardous substances found in consumer products. It is providing this Notice to the violators and the public agencies listed above pursuant to California Health & Safety Code §25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65"). APS&EE, LLC's address is 3334 E. Coast Hwy, Box 514, Corona Del Mar, CA 92625, Attn: Isabel Novak (member), 949-715-7885. Please direct all questions concerning this Notice to it through its designated person for the entity, its attorney: Lucas T. Novak, Esq., Law Offices of Lucas T. Novak, 8335 W Sunset Blvd., Suite 217, Los Angeles, CA 90069; Tel: (323) 337-9015; Email: lucas.nvk@gmail.com.

### II. NATURE OF THE VIOLATION

- A. <u>Violators</u>: Azuretale, Inc., 250 W El Camino Real #4302, Sunnyvale, CA 94087; Azuretale Private Ltd., Azuretale Private Limited, Ground Floor, K3/2, Vishnu Mandir CHS, Raghavan Pannikar Marg, Tooth Life, Goregaon West, Mumbai, Mumbai Suburban, Maharashtra, 400104; Amazon.com, Inc., 410 Terry Avenue North, Seattle, WA 98109.
- B. <u>Time Period of Exposure</u>: Violations have been occurring since at least August 8, 2023, and continue to occur to this day.
- C. Listed Chemicals: Lead
- D. <u>Types of Harm</u>: Lead is listed as known to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.
- E. <u>Types of Products</u>: The specific type of products causing the violations is BetterAlt Beet Root Powder, including but not limited to X0031KAC2X, being sold by Violators throughout California. All products within the type covered by this Notice shall be hereinafter referred to as the "products."
- F. <u>Routes of Exposure</u>: Ingestion, dermal contact, and inhalation.
- G. <u>Description of Exposure</u>: The sales of these products in California dating as far back as August 8, 2023 are subject to this notice. As a result of the sales of these products, exposures to the listed chemical have been occurring without clear and reasonable warnings as required by Proposition 65. Without proper warnings regarding the toxic

effects of exposures to the listed chemical, resulting from ingestion, dermal contact, and/or inhalation of the products, California citizens lack the information necessary to make informed decisions on whether and how to eliminate (or reduce) the risk of exposure to the toxic chemical from the reasonably foreseeable use of the products. California consumers, through the act of buying, acquiring or using the products, are exposed to the listed chemicals. By way of example but not limitation, exposures occur when California citizens use, ingest, or otherwise handle the products. These actions cause consumers to be exposed directly or indirectly through the routine eating, drinking, or touching of the parts or portions of the products containing readily available amounts of the listed chemical. Additionally, exposure can occur through the routine touching and ingesting of other materials that are contaminated with the listed chemical from the products. People likely to be exposed include both children and adults.

## III. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION

For the Violators' reference, attached is a copy of "Proposition 65: A Summary" which has been prepared by Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"). For more information concerning the provisions of Proposition 65, contact OEHHA at (916) 445-6900.

## IV. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

The retailer is hereby requested to promptly provide the names and contact information for the manufacturers, producers, packagers, importers, suppliers, and/or distributors of the products identified in this Notice. Cal. Code Regs. tit. 27, §25600.2(g).

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, the noticing party intends to file a Private Enforcer lawsuit against the alleged Violators unless such Violators enters into a binding written agreement to: (1) recall products already sold or undertake best efforts to ensure that the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to those who have received such products; (2) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the lead exposures; and (3) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b). If the alleged Violators are interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to expensive and time-consuming litigation, please feel free to contact counsel identified above. It should be noted that a Private Enforcer cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; or (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with me will resolve my claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

- I, Lucas Novak, Esq. hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code §25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings;
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party;
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action;
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute;
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2) (i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons).

2/11

	Mark
Dated: August 8, 2024	
	Lucas Novak Esa

### PROOF OF SERVICE

I, Lucas Novak, Esq., declare under penalty of perjury:

I am an active member of the California State Bar, a citizen of the United States over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action; my business address is 8335 W Sunset Blvd., Suite 217, Los Angeles, CA 90069.

On August 8, 2024, I served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d);

PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY (not sent to the public enforcement agencies);

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND** 

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS (served only on the Attorney General)** 

by placing a true copy thereof enclosed in a sealed envelope with postage for first class mail thereon fully prepaid in Los Angeles, California, in the United States mail addressed as follows, and to the public prosecutors listed in the attached service list:

Azuretale, Inc.	Azuretale Private Limited	
Attn: Current President or CEO	Ground Floor, K3/2, Vishnu Mandir CHS,	
250 W El Camino Real #4302	Raghavan Pannikar Marg, Tooth Life,	
Sunnyvale, CA 94087	Goregaon West, Mumbai,	
	Mumbai Suburban, Maharashtra, 400104	
	India	
Azuretale Private Limited	Amazon.com, Inc.	
c/o Azuretale, Inc.	c/o Corp Service Company	
Attn: Current President or CEO	300 Deschutes Way SW, Ste 208	
250 W El Camino Real #4302	MC-CSC1	
Sunnyvale, CA 94087	Tumwater, WA 98501	
Amazon.com, Inc.		
Attn: Current President or CEO		
410 Terry Avenue North		
Seattle, WA 98109		

Additionally, on this date, I uploaded the documents listed above to the California Attorney General via its website:

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 http://oag.ca.gov/prop65 Also on this date, I transmitted via electronic mail the documents listed above to the electronic mail addresses as follows:

D: 4: 4 A# CC C C	D' 4 ' 4 A44 CM	D' 4 ' 4 A44 CNI
District Attorney of Contra Costa County	District Attorney of Monterey	District Attorney of Napa
900 Ward Street	County	County
Martinez, CA 94553	PO Box 1131	1127 First Street, Suite C
sgrassini@contracostada.org	Salinas, CA 93902	Napa, CA 94559
	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us	CEPD@countyofnapa.org
District Attorney of Riverside County	District Attorney of Santa Clara	District Attorney of Sonoma
3072 Orange Street	County	County
Riverside, CA 92501	70 W Hedding St	600 Administration Dr
Prop65@rivcoda.org	San Jose, CA 95110	Sonoma, CA 95403
Tropod @rr. do minorg	epu@da.sccgov.org	jbarnes@sonoma-county.org
	epawaanseege vierg	Jeannes@senema ecunity.org
District Attorney of Tulare County	District Attorney of Ventura County	District Attorney of
221 S Mooney Blvd	800 S Victoria Ave	Stanislaus County
Visalia, CA 95370	Ventura, CA 93009	832 12th Street, Ste 300
1		
Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us	daspecialops@ventura.org	Modesto, CA 95354
District Attorners of V. 1. Compt.	District Attacks of the Control	Prop65@standa.org
District Attorney of Yolo County	District Attorney of Lassen County	District Attorney of
301 Second St.	220 S. Lassen Street	Sacramento County
Woodland, CA 95695	Susanville, CA 96130	901 G Street
cfepd@yolocounty.org	dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us	Sacramento, CA 95814
		Prop65@sacda.org
District Attorney of San Francisco	District Attorney of San Joaquin	District Attorney of San Luis
County	County	Obispo County
350 Rhode Island Street	222 E. Weber Avenue, Rm 202	County Government Center
San Francisco, CA 94103	Stockton, CA 95202	Annex
alethea.sargent@sfgov.org	DAConsumer.Environmental	4th Floor
	@sjcda.org	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408
		edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
District Attorney of Santa Cruz County	San Diego City Attorney's Office	District Attorney of Santa
701 Ocean Street, Rm. 200	1200 Third Avenue, Ste 1620	Barbara County
Santa Cruz, CA 95060	San Diego, CA 92101	1112 Santa Barbara St.
Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	CityAttyCrimProp65@sandiego.gov	Santa Barbara, CA 93101
	city i my crimit report (communego.go)	DAProp65@co.santa-
		barbara.ca.us
District Attorney of Alameda County	District Attorney of Calaveras	District Attorney of Inyo
1225 Fallon Street, Rm 900	County	County
Oakland, CA 94612	891 Mountain Ranch Road	168 North Edwards Street
CEPDProp65@acgov.org	San Andreas, CA 95249	Independence, CA 93526
CLI DI Topos (wategov.org	Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	inyoda@inyocounty.us
San Francisco City Attorney's Office	District Attorney of San Diego	District Attorney of
		Mariposa County
1390 Market Street, 7th Floor	County	1 2
San Francisco, CA 94102	330 West Broadway	5101 Jones St., P.O. Box 730
Prop65@sfcityatty.org	San Diego, CA 92101	Mariposa, CA 95338
District August 10	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org	mcda@mariposacounty.org
District Attorney of Merced County	District Attorney of Nevada County	District Attorney of Placer
2222 "M" Street	201 Commercial Street	County
Merced, CA 95340	Nevada City, CA 95959	10810 Justice Center Drive,
Prop65@countyofmerced.com	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us	Ste 240
		Roseville, CA 95678
		prop65@placer.ca.gov
District Attorney of Plumas County	San Jose City Attorney	District Attorney of Marin

520 Main Street, Rm. 404	200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	County
Quincy, CA 95971	San Jose, CA 96113	3501 Civic Center Dr, Rm.
davidhollister@countyofplumas.com	Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov	145
		San Rafael, CA 94903
		consumer@marincounty.org
District Attorney of Fresno County	District Attorney of El Dorado	
2100 Tulare Street	County	
Fresno, CA 93721	778 Pacific Street	
consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov	Placerville, CA 95667	
	EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us	

The electronic transmissions were reported as sent and without error.

Executed on August 8, 2024, at Los Angeles, California.

Lucas Novak, Esq.

# SERVICE LIST

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office 800 City Hall East 200 N. Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012	District Attorney of Alpine County 270 Laramie St., P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	District Attorney of Amador County 708 Court Street, Suite 202 Jackson, CA 95642
District Attorney of Butte County Administration Building 25 County Center Drive Oroville, CA 95965	District Attorney of Yuba County 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901	District Attorney of Colusa County 310 6th Street Colusa, CA 95932
District Attorney of Del Norte County	Sacramento City Attorney's Office	District Attorney of Shasta County
450 H Street, Ste 171	915 I Street, 4th Floor	1355 West Street
Crescent City, CA 95531	Sacramento, CA 95814	Redding, CA 96001
District Attorney of Glenn County	District Attorney of Humboldt County	District Attorney of Imperial County
P.O. Box 430	825 5th Street	940 W. Main Street, Ste 102
Willows, CA 95988	Eureka, CA 95501	El Centro, CA 92243
District Attorney of Trinity County	District Attorney of Kern County	District Attorney of Kings County
P.O. Box 310	1215 Truxtun Avenue	1400 West Lacey Blvd.
Weaverville, CA 96093	Bakersfield, CA 93301	Hanford, CA 93230
District Attorney of Lake County	District Attorney of Los Angeles County	District Attorney of Madera County
255 N. Forbes Street	211 W. Temple Street, Ste 1200	300 S G St. Suite 300
Lakeport, CA 95453	Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210	Madera, CA 93637
District Attorney of Siskiyou County	District Attorney of Modoc County	District Attorney of Mendocino County
P.O. Box 986	204 S. Court Street, Rm. 202	P.O. Box 1000
Yreka, CA 96097	Alturas, CA 96101-4020	Ukiah, CA 95482
District Attorney of Tehama County P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080	District Attorney of Orange County 300 N Flower St Santa Ana, CA 92703	District Attorney of Mono County P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517
District Attorney of Solano County	District Attorney of San Benito County	District Attorney of San Bernardino County
675 Texas Street, Ste 4500	419 Fourth Street, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor	316 N. Mountain View Avenue
Fairfield, CA 94533	Hollister, CA 95023	San Bernardino, CA 92415
District Attorney of Sierra County Courthouse 100 Courthouse Sq., 2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor Downieville, CA 95936	District Attorney of San Mateo County 400 County Center, 3 <sup>rd</sup> Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	District Attorney of Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370
District Attorney of Sutter County 463 2nd Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991		