# 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d) (PROPOSITION 65)

Date: September 9, 2024

To: Alfred David Stelzer, President, Azure Farms, Inc.;

California Attorney General's Office;

District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties; and

City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento & Los Angeles

From: Keep America Safe and Beautiful

#### I. INTRODUCTION

Keep America Safe and Beautiful is a California nonprofit corporation acting in the public interest pursuant to California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d). Keep America Safe and Beautiful seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold in California and, if possible, to improve human health by eliminating hazardous substances contained in such items, promoting corporate responsibility.

This 60-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice") is being provided to the alleged violator, Azure Farms, Inc. ("Notice Recipient"), as well as the California Attorney General's Office, the District Attorney's Offices for 58 Counties, and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, Sacramento and Los Angeles.

Keep America Safe and Beautiful provides this Notice after identifying violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, codified at California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq. ("Proposition 65"), based on the failure to provide a clear and reasonable health hazard warning in connection with the sale or use of the products, listed below, in the State of California. The Notice Recipient is hereby given notice it violated and continues to violate Proposition 65 with respect to the warning requirement, codified at California's Health & Safety Code § 25249.6: "No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving a clear and reasonable warning to such individual." Without proper warnings about the toxic effects of exposures to listed chemicals, citizens in California lack the information necessary to make an informed decision as to whether or how to eliminate or reduce their risk of exposure from the reasonably foreseeable use of products containing listed chemicals.

#### II. NATURE OF ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

**Product.** The specific type or category of products ("**Products**") that are the subject of this Notice are as follows:

Exemplar Product	Category/Type	Retailer	Manufacturer/Distributor
Azure Market Organics Flax	Flax Seeds	Azure Standard	Azure Farms, Inc.
Seeds, Organic, 33 oz.		azurestandard.com	
SKU: SE081			
Lot# nn00099			
UPC: 6 85051 55050 8			
Best By: 09/20/2024			

Identified above is a specific example of Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for sale or use in the State of California, within the *category* of offending products covered

by this Notice. The identified retailers, manufacturers and/or distributors of the Products are based on publicly available information.

The Exemplar Product is identified for the Notice Recipient's benefit to assist in its investigation into the alleged violations that are the subject of this Notice. The specific identified Exemplar Product is not intended to be an exhaustive list of all such products potentially in violation of Proposition 65. The Notice Recipient is now obligated to conduct a good faith investigation into other products within the category or of the type, identified above, that were manufactured, imported, sold or distributed for sale, or that have otherwise been in the Notice Recipient's custody or control during the relevant period, identified below, to ensure the requisite health hazard warnings are provided to individuals in California prior to purchase.

<u>Listed Chemical.</u> The chemical that is the subject of this Notice is the heavy metal, Cadmium (Cd). The State of California listed Cadmium as a chemical known to cause cancer on October 1, 1987, and as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity and male reproductive toxicity on May 1, 1997.

Routes of Exposure. The exposures subject to this Notice result from the purchase, acquisition and handling of Products containing Cadmium (Cd). Exposures occur when individuals, including children and women of childbearing age, eat, consume, or otherwise ingest flax seeds containing Cadmium (Cd) in accordance with the Products' reasonably foreseeable and intended uses, resulting in exposures through ingestion.

<u>Violations and Time Period of Exposure.</u> Keep America Safe and Beautiful alleges the Notice Recipient knowingly and intentionally exposed, and continues to knowingly and intentionally expose, individuals within the State of California to Cadmium (Cd) without first giving a health hazard warning regarding the chemical's toxic effects, as required by Proposition 65, by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings to consumers and users that the Products can expose users to Cadmium (Cd).

Exposures caused by the use of the Products have occurred each day since the Products were introduced into the California marketplace, but, at a minimum, since September 9, 2023, and, potentially, as far back as September 9, 2021. Because the Products lack clear and reasonable warnings regarding the toxic effects of exposures to Cadmium (Cd), each Product sold during this period and not accompanied by a warning constitutes a violation by the Notice Recipient and/or other sellers of the Products, whether sold directly through retailers located in, or with locations in, California, via the internet, or through catalog purchases by customers and individuals located in California. Moreover, these exposures are ongoing and will continue either until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to protect consumers and users or until these known toxic chemicals are removed from the Products or reduced to allowable levels.

#### III. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65, Keep America Safe and Beautiful seeks to pursue a constructive resolution of this matter to quickly rectify ongoing violations of California law. To that end, based on the allegations set forth in this Notice and pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d), Keep America Safe and Beautiful intends to file a private enforcement action in the public interest sixty (60) days after effective service of this Notice, unless the appropriate public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these allegations. If the Notice Recipient seeks to resolve the claims alleged in this Notice without litigation, it may contact Keep America Safe and Beautiful's counsel at the address listed below.

It should be noted neither Keep America Safe and Beautiful or its counsel can: (1) finalize any settlement until after the expiration of the 60-day Notice period; or (2) speak for the California

Attorney General or any District or City attorney in receipt of this Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with Keep America Safe and Beautiful will satisfy its claims, the agreement may not satisfy any public prosecutors.

#### IV. GENERAL INFORMATION AND SUMMARY OF PROPOSITION 65

A copy of a summary of Proposition 65's provisions, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("**OEHHA**") is enclosed with the copy of the Notice served on the Notice Recipient for its reference. For further general information concerning Proposition 65, contact OEHHA's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900.

#### V. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) and Cal. Code. Regs. tit 11, § 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto. A copy of the Notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the California Attorney General and marked "Attorney General Copy: Contains Official Information Pursuant to Evidence Code Section 1040" with all supporting documentation, as required by Cal. Code. Regs. tit 11, § 3102, attached thereto.

## VI. <u>CONTACT INFORMATION</u>

Please direct all questions, issues or communications regarding this 60-Day Notice of Violation and its potential resolution to Keep America Safe and Beautiful's counsel at the following address:

Keep America Safe and Beautiful c/o Kimberly Gates Johnson Seven Hills LLP 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400 San Francisco, California 94111 Telephone: (415) 926-7247

Email: kimberly@sevenhillsllp.com

Represented private enforcer's contact

information:

Lance Nguyen, CEO

Keep America Safe and Beautiful

10512 Sycamore Avenue Stanton, California 90680

Telephone: (657) 621-3809

<u>Attachments:</u> Certificate of Merit; Proof of Service; Appendix A: The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary (to Violator only); and Additional Confidential Supporting Information for Certificate of Merit (to Attorney General only.)

Printed on 100% Post-Consumer Recycled Paper.

# **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

Re: Keep America Safe and Beautiful's Notice of Proposition 65 Violations

- I, Kimberly Gates Johnson, hereby declare:
- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the party identified in the notice violated Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier and (2) the facts, studies or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: September 9, 2024

Kimberly Gates Johnson

## PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years of age and not a party to this case. Seven Hills LLP's business address is 4 Embarcadero Center, Suite 1400, San Francisco, CA 94111.

On September 9, 2024, I caused to be served the following:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY; and

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

XXXX by Certified First Class Mail through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, individually addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative:

Alfred David Stelzer, President Azure Farms, Inc. 79709 Dufur Valley Road Dufur, OR 97021

On September 9, 2024, I caused to be served true and correct copies of the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); and CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

XXXX by **First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each entity on the attached "Service List" and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Representative, with correct postage.

XXXX via Electronic Mail, by sending copies of the above documents, addressed individually, to the Recipients listed on the attached "Electronic Mail Service List".

On September 9, 2024, I caused to be served true and correct copies of the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; and** 

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS

XXXX via **Electronic Mail**, by uploading the documents, addressed to California Attorney General at their website address, listed under the "Electronic Upload Service List".

Executed on the 9<sup>th</sup> day of September 2024, at Folsom, California.

Wing Yee Mercier

# SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Michael Atwell Alpine County District Attorney P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120 The Honorable Michael Ramsey Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245	The Honorable Jackie Lacey Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple Street, Ste 1200 Los Angeles, CA, 90012 The Honorable Matthew R. Beauchamp Colusa County District Attorney 346 5th Street, Suite 101	The Honorable Todd Riebe Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street, #202 Jackson, CA 95642 Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531
Oroville, CA 95965  The Honorable Vern Pierson  El Dorado County District Attorney 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667  The Honorable Maggie Fleming Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, 4th Floor Eureka, CA 95501	Colusa, CA 95932 The Honorable Gilbert Otero Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243 The Honorable Donald Anderson Lake County District Attorney 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453	The Honorable Dwayne Stewart Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows CA 95988 The Honorable Lisa Green Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301
The Honorable Keith Fagundes Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Blvd. Hanford, CA 93230	The Honorable Mike Feuer Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles Kames K. Hahn Hall East 200 North Main Street, 8th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012	Sally O. Moreno, District Attorney Madera County Justice Center 300 South G Street, Suite 300 Madera, CA 93637
The Honorable Jordan Funk Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101	The Honorable Todd Spitzer Orange County District Attorney 300 North Flower Street Santa Ana, CA 92703	The Honorable C. David Eyster Mendocino County District Attorney P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 9548
The Honorable Birgit Fladager Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95353	The Honorable Candace Hooper San Benito District Attorney 419 4th Street Hollister, CA 95023	The Honorable Tim Kendall Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 2053 Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546
The Honorable Stephen Wagstaffe San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	The Honorable Michael Ramos San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 W. Third Street San Bernardino, CA 92415	The Honorable Stephanie Bridgett Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001
The Honorable James Kirk Andrus Siskiyou County District Attorney P.O. Box 986 Redding, CA 96097	The Honorable Krishna Abrams Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533	The Honorable Amanda Hopper Sutter County District Attorney 446 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991
The Honorable Laura Krieg Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370	The Honorable James Sanchez Office of the City Attorney, Sacramento 915 I Street, 4th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814	The Honorable Eric Heryford Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
The Honorable Lawrence Allen Sierra County District Attorney 100 Courthouse Square Downieville, CA 95936	The Honorable Gregg Cohen Tehama County District Attorney P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080	The Honorable Patrick McGrath Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901

# **ELECTRONIC MAIL SERVICE LIST**

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley	The Honorable Tori Verber Salzar	Honorable Anne Marie Schubert
Alameda County District Attorney	San Joaquin County District Attorney	Sacramento County District Attorney
7776 Oakport Street, Suite 650	222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202	901 G Street
Oakland, CA 94621	Stockton, CA 95202	Sacramento, CA 95814
CEPDProp65@acgiv.org	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	Prop65@sacda.org
The Honorable Allison Haley	The Honorable Jeffrey S. Rosell	The Honorable Summer Stephan
Napa County District Attorney	Santa Cruz County District Attorney	San Diego County District Attorney
1127 First St., Suite C	701 Ocean Street	300 West Broadway
Napa, CA 94559	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	San Diego, CA 92101
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	Prop65DA@santacruzeounty.us	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
The Honorable Jeff W. Reisig	Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
Yolo County District Attorney	Lassen County	City of San Diego
301 Second Street	220 S. Lassen Street	1200 Third Avenue
Woodland, CA 95695	Susanville, CA 96130	San Diego, CA 92101
cfepd@yolocounty.org	mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
Bud Porter	Alethea M. Sargent	Christopher Dalbey,
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Assistant District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney
Santa Clara County	San Francisco District Attorney's Office	Santa Barbara County
70 W Hedding Street	350 Rhode Island Street	1112 Santa Barbara Street
San Jose, CA 95110	San Francisco, CA 94103	Santa Barbara, CA 93101
EPU@da.sccgov.org	alethea.sargent@sfgov.org	DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
The Honorable Gregory D. Totten,	The Honorable Barbara Yook	Henry Lifton, Deputy City Attorney
Ventura County District Attorney	Calaveras County District Attorney	Office of the City Attorney
800 S Victoria Avenue	891 Mountain Ranch Road	1390 Market Street, 7th Floor
Ventura, CA 93009	San Andreas, CA 95249	San Francisco, CA 94102
daspecialops@ventura.org	Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	Prop65@sfcityatty.org
Stacey Grassini	Eric J. Dobroth	Jeannine M. Pacioni
Deputy District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney	Deputy District Attorney
Contra Costa County	San Luis Obispo County	Monterey County
900 Ward Street	County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor	1200 Aguajito Road
Martinez, CA 94553	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Monterey, CA 93940
sgrassini@contracostada.org	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
The Honorable Thomas Hardy	The Honorable Phillip J. Cline	The Honorable Clifford Newell
Inyo County District Attorney	Tulare County District Attorney	Nevada County District Attorney
168 N. Edwards Street	221 S Mooney Blvd	201 Commercial Street
Independence, CA 93526	Visalia, CA 95370	Nevada City, CA 95959
inyoda@inyocounty.us	Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us
The Honorable Paul E. Zellerbach	The Honorable Stephan Passalacqua	The Honorable David Hollister
Riverside County District Attorney	Sonoma County District Attorney	Plumas County District Attorney
3072 Orange Street	600 Administration Drive	520 Main Street, Room 404
Riverside, CA 92501	Sonoma, CA 95403	Quincy, CA 95971
Prop65@rivcoda.org	jbarnes@sonoma-county.org	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com
The Honorable Walter W. Wall	The Honorable Kimberly Lewis	The Honorable Morgan Briggs Gire
Mariposa County District Attorney	THE HOROTAGE KINDSHY LEWIS	
TIVIDELLA COMPLEX EXISTERS AND THEV	Merced County District Attorney	IPlacer ('ounty I hetriet Attorney
THE STATE OF THE S	Merced County District Attorney	Placer County District Attorney
P.O. Box 730	550 West Main Street	10810 Justice Center Drive
P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338	550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340	10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678
P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org	550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofinerced.com	10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov
P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney	550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofmerced.com Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney	10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov The Honorable Edward Berberian
P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofinerced.com Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney 2100 Tulare Street	10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov The Honorable Edward Berberian Marin County District Attorney
P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 96113	550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofmerced.com Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney 2100 Tulare Street Fresno, CA 93721	10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov The Honorable Edward Berberian Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130
P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338 mcda@mariposacounty.org Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340 Prop65@countyofinerced.com Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney 2100 Tulare Street	10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov The Honorable Edward Berberian Marin County District Attorney

# ELECTRONIC UPLOAD SERVICE LIST

Office of the California Attorney General
Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting
ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator
P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice