# VOORHEES & BAILEY, LLP 839 Emerson Street Palo Alto, CA 94301 650-313-2154

## 60-Day Notice of Violation - California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

November 8, 2024

Notice Recipient: Daiso USA LLC

Noticing Party: Dennis Johnson

Covered Products: Vinyl Bags With Handles

**Listed Chemical:** Di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP)

Routes of Exposure: Ingestion; Dermal

**Potential Harm:** Birth Defects and Other Reproductive Harm

#### I. INTRODUCTION

This Sixty-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice") is provided by Dennis Johnson. Mr. Johnson is a private enforcer acting in the public interest pursuant to California Health & Safety Code section 25249.7(d). Mr. Johnson seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold and used in California and, if possible, to eliminate such exposures.

This Notice is provided to the alleged violator, Daiso USA LLC (the "Notice Recipient"), as well as the California Attorney General's Office, the District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties, and the City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, and Los Angeles.

The Notice Recipient is hereby given notice that it has violated and continues to violate provisions of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, which is codified at California Health & Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq. ("Proposition 65"). Specifically, the Notice Recipient has violated and continues to violate the warning requirement of section 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code, which provides, "No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual...." The alleged violations that are the subject of this Notice are provided below.

#### II. ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

<u>Product Type/Category</u>: The specific type or category of products that are causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are Vinyl Bags With Handles ("Covered Products").

Identified below is a specific example of Covered Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California (the "Exemplar Product"). Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors, and/or manufacturers of the Exemplar Product is also provided.

The Exemplar Product is identified for the Notice Recipient's benefit to assist in its investigation of the allegations set forth in this Notice. The Exemplar Product is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product falling within the specific type or category of Covered Products at issue in this Notice. It is the private enforcer's position that the Notice Recipient is obligated to conduct good-faith investigations into other specific products falling within the type or category of Covered Products that have been manufactured, imported, distributed, sold, shipped, stored, or are otherwise within the Notice Recipient's custody or control, so as to ensure the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

Covered Products	Exemplar Product Information	
Vinyl Bags With Handles	Daiso Clear Vinyl Bag	
	UPC: 4 549131 676358	
	Retailer: Daiso USA LLC (Sacramento, CA)	
	Manufacturer/Distributor: Daiso USA LLC	

<u>Listed Chemical</u>: The alleged violation involves exposures to the Proposition 65-listed chemical di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP), hereinafter the "Listed Chemical". On October 24, 2003, the State of California listed DEHP as a chemical known to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

<u>Statement of Violations</u>: The Notice Recipient knowingly and intentionally exposed, and continue to knowingly and intentionally expose, consumers within the State of California to DEHP, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm, without first giving clear and reasonable warning of this exposure to such individuals. In particular, the Notice Recipient failed to provide a clear and reasonable warning to consumers that the Covered Products expose consumers to DEHP.

<u>Route of Exposure</u>: California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the Covered Products, are exposed to the Listed Chemical. Children, men, and women of childbearing age ingest the Listed Chemical when they touch and handle the Covered Products, transfer the Listed Chemical from the Covered Products onto their fingers and hands, and

transfer the Listed Chemical from their fingers and hands to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after contact with the Covered Product. Children, men, and women of childbearing age are exposed to the Listed Chemical through direct dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle or touch the Covered Products.

<u>Number and Duration of Violations</u>: Each and every sale of a Covered Product to a consumer in California without a clear and reasonable warning is a violation, including transactions made over-the-counter, through the internet, and/or via catalogue by the Notice Recipient and any other sellers of the Covered Products. These violations have been occurring since at least November 8, 2023, as well as every day since the Covered Products were first introduced and sold in the State of California, as far back as November 8, 2021. The violations are ongoing.

#### III. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) and Title 11, California Code of Regulations, section 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto. A second copy of the entire notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the Attorney General, with all supporting documentation required by Section 3102 attached thereto.

#### IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION – A SUMMARY

A summary of Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead agency designated under Proposition 65, is enclosed with the copy of the Notice served on the Notice Recipient.

## V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Mr. Johnson intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the Notice Recipient upon the expiration of the sixty-day notice period, provided no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

If the Notice Recipient is interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and expensive litigation, it should contact counsel at the address provided below. It should be noted that no settlement may be finalized before the sixty-day notice period has expired and then only if no public prosecutor has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the alleged violation.

### VI. PRESERVATION OF EVIDENCE

This Notice also serves as a demand that the Notice Recipient preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the

presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in the Covered Products; purchase and sales information for the Covered Products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to the Covered Products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in Covered Products; and representative exemplars of each specific model falling within the Covered Products. This demand applies to all relevant evidence for Covered Products sold in the State of California, as far back as November 8, 2021, through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

# VII. DEMAND FOR RETAILER, PURSUANT TO 27 C.C.R. 25600.2(g), TO IDENTIFY MANUFACTURER, PRODUCER, PACKAGER, IMPORT, SUPPLIER AND DISTRIBUTOR OF THE COVERED PRODUCTS

Pursuant to 27 C.C.R. 25600.2(g), "[t]he retail seller of a product that may cause a consumer product exposure shall promptly provide the name and contact information for the manufacturer, producer, packager, importer, supplier, and distributor of the product to ... [a]ny person who has served notice under Section 25249.7(d)(1) of the Act alleging that the consumer product causes an exposure that requires a warning under the Act."

Please accept this Notice as a formal demand for any non-manufacturing seller or distributor receiving this notice to promptly provide the name and contact information for the manufacturer, producer, packager, importer, supplier, and distributor of the product(s) so identified in Section II. This information may and should be communicated in a letter from the retailer delivered via electronic mail to counsel as indicated in Section VIII below.

#### VIII. CONTACT INFORMATION

Dennis Johnson, whose address is 1618 Alhambra Blvd., # 162022, Sacramento, CA 95816 and whose phone number is (916) 800-2182, has retained me as legal counsel in this matter. Please direct all communications related to this Notice of Violation to the following:

Troy Bailey, Esq.
Voorhees & Bailey, LLP
839 Emerson Street
Palo Alto, CA 94301
troy@voorheesbailey.com

Sincerely

David Joshua Voorhees Voorhees & Bailey, LLP

Attorneys for Dennis Johnson

cc: California Attorney General's Office; District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties;

and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose, and Los Angeles

Attachments: Certificate of Merit; Proof of Service; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic

Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary (*Daiso USA LLC only*); and Confidential Information in Support of Certificate of Merit (*Attorney General* 

Only)

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

# I, David Joshua Voorhees, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice has violated Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established, and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) certain facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: November 8, 2024

David Joshua Voorhees

#### PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within action. I am employed in Santa Clara County, California. My business address is 839 Emerson Street, Palo Alto, CA 94301.

On November 8, 2024, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND** 

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

XXXX **By First Class Certified Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative.

Daiso USA LLC c/o National Registered Agent 330 N Brand Boulevard Glendale, CA 91203

On November 8, 2024, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); AND

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** 

XXXX **By First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each entity on the attached "U.S. Mail Service List" and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative, postage prepaid.

XXXX **By Electronic Mail** by sending true and correct copies of the above documents to the electronic notification (Email) address(es) on the attached "Electronic Mail Service List".

On November 8, 2024, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND** 

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS**

XXXX **By Electronic Upload** by causing true and correct copies of the above documents to be uploaded to the California Attorney General's website at the web address on the attached "Electronic Upload Service List".

Executed on November 8, 2024, at Palo Alto, California.

David Joshua Voorhees

# **U.S. Mail Service List**

Alpine County District Attorney P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012	Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533
Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642	Madera County District Attorney 300 South G Street, Suite 300 Madera, CA 93637	Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354
Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965	Mendocino County District Attorney P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482	Sutter County District Attorney 463 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991
Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932	Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101	Tehama County District Attorney 444 Oak Street, Room L Red Bluff, CA 96080
Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531	Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517	Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988	Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles James K. Hahn City Hall East 200 North Main Street, 8th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012	Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370
Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, Fourth Floor Eureka, CA 95501	San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th Street Hollister, CA 95023	Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901
Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243	San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	
Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4th Floor Bakersfield, CA 93301	Sierra County District Attorney P.O. Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936	
Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230	Siskiyou County District Attorney 311 4th Street Yreka, CA 96097	
Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453	Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001	

# **Electronic Upload Service List**

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

# **Electronic Mail Service List**

Pamela Y. Price, District Attorney	Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney	Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney
Alameda County District Attorney	Riverside County	San Luis Obispo County
7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650	3072 Orange Street	County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor
·		
Oakland, CA 94621	Riverside, CA 92501	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408
CEPDProp65@acgov.org	Prop65@rivcoda.org	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
Allison Haley, District Attorney	Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney	Jill Ravitch, District Attorney
Napa County	San Joaquin County	Sonoma County
•		•
1127 First Street, Suite C	222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202	600 Administration Dr
Napa, CA 94559	Stockton, CA 95202	Santa Rosa, CA 95403
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	Jeannie.barnes@sonoma-county.org
Alexandra Grayner, Assistant DA	Jeffrey S. Rosell , District Attorney	Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney
San Francisco County	Santa Cruz County	Monterey County
350 Rhode Island Street	701 Ocean Street	1200 Aguajito Road
San Francisco, CA 94103	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	Monterey, CA 93940
alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org	Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
Bud Porter	Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Yolo County	City of San Diego
	•	,
Santa Clara County	301 Second Street	1200 Third Avenue
70 W Hedding St	Woodland, CA 95695	San Diego, CA 92101
San Jose, CA 95110	cfepd@yolocounty.org	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
EPU@da.sccgov.org		
Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney	Devin Chandler, Executive Assistant	Christopher Dalbey,
Ventura County	Lassen County	Deputy District Attorney
•	•	· · ·
800 S Victoria Ave	2950 Riverside Drive	Santa Barbara County
Ventura, CA 93009	Susanville, CA 96130	1112 Santa Barbara St.
daspecialops@ventura.org	dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us	Santa Barbara, CA 93101
		DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney	Anna Maria Schuhart District Attarnay	Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney
	Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney	
Contra Costa County	Sacramento County	Tulare County
900 Ward Street	901 G Street	221 S Mooney Blvd
Martinez, CA 94553	Sacramento, CA 95814	Visalia, CA 95370
sgrassini@contracostada.org	Prop65@sacda.org	Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
Barbara Yook, District Attorney	Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney	Henry Lifton, Deputy City Attorney
-		
Calaveras County	Inyo County	City of San Francisco
891 Mountain Ranch Road.	168 North Edwards Street	1390 Market Street, 7th Floor
San Andreas, CA 95249	Independence, CA 93526	San Francisco, CA 94102
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	inyoda@inyocounty.us	Prop65@sfcityatty.org
Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney	Walter W. Wall, District Attorney	Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney
• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	1	•
Merced County	Mariposa County	Nevada County
550 W. Main Street	P.O. Box 730	201 Commercial Street
Merced, CA 95340	Mariposa, CA 95338	Nevada City, CA 95959
Prop65@countyofmerced.com	mcda@mariposacounty.org	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us
	8 111 111 2 2 1 1 1 1 1	
Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney	David Hollister, District Attorney	Summer Stephan, District Attorney
Placer County	Plumas County	San Diego County
10810 Justice Center Drive	520 Main Street	330 W. Broadway Street
Roseville, CA 95678	Quincy, CA 95971	San Diego, CA 92101
	1 **	<b>3</b> ,
prop65@placer.ca.gov	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
Orange County District Attorney	Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney	Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney
300 North Flower Street	Santa Clara County	Fresno County
Santa Ana, CA 92703	200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	2100 Tulare Street
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· ·	
Prop65Notice@ocdapa.org	San Jose, CA 96113	Fresno, CA 93721
	Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov	consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov
Lori E. Frugoli, Marin County	Stephen M, Wagstaffe, San Mateo County	James Clinchard, Assistant District Attorney
District Attorney	District Attorney	El Dorado County
•	•	
3501 Civic Center Drive, Suite 145	400 County Center	778 Pacific Street
San Rafael, CA 94903	Redwood City, CA 94063	Placerville, CA 95667
· ·	· ·	
consumer@marincounty.gov	PROP65@smcgov.org	EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us