

Telephone: (323)744-1671 padilla@avjustice.com antonio@avjustice.com http://www.avjustice.com

December 19, 2024

## NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 *ET SEQ.* (PROPOSITION 65)

Dear Alleged Violators and the Appropriate Public Enforcement Agencies:

We represent Keep America Safe and Beautiful ("KASB"), 10512 Sycamore Ave Stanton, CA 90680, (**657-621-3809**). KASB's Chief Executive Officer is Lance Nguyen. KASB is a California non-profit corporation dedicated to, among other causes, helping safeguard the public from health hazards by bringing about a reduction in the use and misuse of hazardous and toxic chemicals, facilitating a safe environment for consumers and employees, and encouraging corporate responsibility.

KASB has identified violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), which is codified at California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq., with respect to the products identified below. These violations have occurred and continue to occur because the alleged Violators identified below failed to provide required clear and reasonable warnings with these products. This letter serves as a notice of these violations to the alleged Violators and the appropriate public enforcement agencies. Pursuant to Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d), KASB intends to pursue a private enforcement action in the public interest 60 days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

### **General Information about Proposition 65.**

A copy of a summary of Proposition 65, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, is enclosed with this letter served to the alleged Violators identified below.

### Alleged Violators.

The names of the person/company covered by this notice that violatedProposition 65 (hereinafter the "Violators") are:

Nordic Ware and Northland Aluminum Products, Inc. 5005 Country Road 25 Minneapolis, Minnesota 2274

Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com Services LLC 410 Terry Avenue N. Seattle, Washington 98109

#### **Consumer Products and Listed Chemical.**

The products that are the subject of this notice and the chemical in those products identified as exceeding allowable levels are: Nordic Ware Cinnamon Spice Bundt Cake Mix.

On May 1, 1997, the State of California officially listed cadmium as a chemicalknown to cause developmental toxicity, and male reproductive toxicity. On October 1, 1987, the State of California officially listed cadmium and cadmium compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer

It should be noted that KASB may continue to investigate other products that mayreveal further violations and result in subsequent notices of violations.

#### **Route of Exposure.**

The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the recommended use of these products. Consequently, the route of exposure to this chemical has been and continues to be through ingestion.

#### Approximate Time Period of Violations.

Ongoing violations have occurred every day since at least January 29, 2024, as well as every day since the products were introduced into the California marketplace and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided to product purchasers and users or until this known toxic chemical is either removed from or reduced to allowable levels in the products. Proposition 65requires that a clear and reasonable warning be provided prior to exposure to the identified chemical. The method of warning should be a warning that appears on the product label. The Violators violated Proposition 65 because they failed to provide persons ingesting these products with appropriate warnings that they are being exposed to this chemical.

Consistent with the public interest goals of Proposition 65 and a desire to have these ongoing violations of California law quickly rectified, KASB is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by the Violators to: (1) reformulate the identified products so as to eliminate further exposures to theidentified chemical, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these products; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings compliant with Proposition 65 to all persons located in California who purchased the above products in the last three years. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer

KASB has retained us as legal counsel in connection with this matter. **Please direct all** communications regarding this Notice of Violation to my attention at the law office address and telephone number indicated on the letterhead or at padilla@avjustice.com

Sincerely,

alfill

Arturo Padilla

Attachments:

Certificate of Merit Certificate of Service OEHHA Summary (to Alleged Violators only) Factual Information in Support of Certificate of Merit (to AG only)



Telephone: (323)744-1671 padilla@avjustice.com antonio@avjustice.com http://www.avjustice.com

December 19, 2024

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

# Re: Keep America Safe and Beautiful's Notice of Proposition 65 Violation by Lee Kum Kee (USA), Inc., Nordic Ware and Northland Aluminum Products, Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com Services LLC

I, Arturo Padilla, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached 60-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice violated California Health & Safety Code Section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who have reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the notice.
- 4. I have reviewed the laboratory testing results for the chemical subject to the Notice and rely on these results. The testing was conducted by a reputable accredited testing laboratory and by experienced scientists with doctoral and other degrees in relevant sciences. The facts, studies and other data derived through this investigation overwhelmingly demonstrate that the alleged violators have exposed persons to the listed chemical that is the subject of the Notice and is known to the State of California to cause reproductive and/or developmental harm, and/or cancer.
- 5. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established, and that the information did not prove that the alleged Violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 6. Along with the copy of this Certificate of Merit-served on the Attorney General is attached additional factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in California Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (I) the identities or persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: December 19, 2024

fill

Arturo Padilla padilla@avjustice.com

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States and over the age of 18 years of age. My business address is 591 Plaza Dr. West Covina, CA 91790. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at Los Angeles, California.

On December 19, 2024, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Standard Time, I served the following documents: NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 *ET SEQ.;* CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" on the following parties by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties listed below and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by Certified First Class Mail:

Nordic Ware and Northland Aluminum Products, Inc. 5005 Hwy 7 Minneapolis, Minnesota 55416

Amazon.com, Inc. and Amazon.com Services LLC 410 Terry Avenue N. Seattle, Washington 98109

Executed on December 19, 2024, in Los Angeles, California.

Yessenia Ramirez

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States and over the age of 18 years of age. My business address is 591 Plaza Dr. West Covina, CA 91790. I am a resident or employed in thecounty where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at West Covina, California.

On December 19, 2024 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Standard Time, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5** *ET SEQ.;* CERTIFICATE OF MERIT INCLUDING A SUMMARY OF CONFIDENTIAL FACTUAL INFORMATION; ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING INFORMATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF MERIT AS REQUIRED

**BY CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.7(d)(1)** were served on the following party when a true and correct copy thereof was uploaded on the California Attorney General's website, which can be accessed at <u>https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice\_</u>:

Office of the California Attorney General Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting 1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000 Oakland, CA 94612-0550

Executed on December 19, 2024, in Los Angeles, California

Yessenia Ramirez

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States and over the age of 18 years of age. My business address is 591 Plaza Dr. West Covina, CA 91790. I am a resident or employed in thecounty where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at West Covina, California.

On December 19, 2024 between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Standard Time, I verified the following documents **NOTICE OF VIOLATIONS, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** were served on the following parties when a true and correct copy thereof was sent via electronic mail to each of the parties listed below:

Pamela Price, District Attorney	Barbara Yook, District Attorney
Alameda County	Calaveras County
7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650	891 Mountain Ranch Road
Oakland, CA 94621	San Andreas, CA 95249
CEPDProp65@acgov.org	Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us
Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney	James Clinchard
Contra Costa County	El Dorado County
900 Ward Street	778 Pacific Street
Martinez, CA 94553	Placerville, CA 95667
sgrassini@contracostada.org	edcdaprop65@EDCDA.US
sgrassini@contracostada.org	cacapiopos@EDEDA.05
Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney	Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney
Fresno County	Inyo County
2100 Tulare Street	168 North Edwards Street
Fresno, CA 93721	Independence, CA 93526
Consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov	inyoda@inyocounty.us
<u>Consumerprotection@nesh0eountyeu.gov</u>	<u>myoda@myocounty.us</u>
Michelle Latimer, Program Coordinator	Lori Frugoli, District Attorney
Lassen County	Marin County 3501
220 S. Lassen Street	Civic Center Drive, Room 145
Susanville, CA 96130	San Rafael, CA 94903
mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us	consumer@marincounty.gov
Walter W. Wall, District Attorney	Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney
Mariposa County	Merced County
P.O. Box 730	550 West Main Street
Mariposa, CA 95338	Merced, CA 95340
mcda@mariposacounty.orgv	Prop65@countyofmerced.com
Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney	Alison Haley, District Attorney
Monterey County	Napa County
1200 Aguajito Road	1127 First Street, suite C
Monterey, Ca 93940	Napa CA 94559
Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.gov	<u>CEPD@countyofnapa.org</u>

Clifford H. Newell, District	Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney
	Placer County
Attorney Neve de Country	10810 Justice Center Drive
Nevada County	Roseville, CA 95678
201 Commercial Street	Prop65@placer.ca.gov
Nevada City, CA 95959	<u>110p05(apracer.ea.gov</u>
DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us	
David Hollister, District Attorney	Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney
Plumas County	Riverside County
520 Main St	3072 Orange Street
Quincy, CA 95971	Riverside, CA 92501
davidhollister@countyofplumas.com	Prop65@rivcoda.org
Anne Marie Schubert,	Summer Stephan, District Attorney
District Attorney	San Diego County
Sacramento County	330 West Broadway
901 G. Street	San Diego, CA 92101
Sacramento, CA 95814	SanDiegoDAprop65@sdcda.org
Prop65@sacda.org	
Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City	Alexander Grayner, Asst. District
AttorneySan Diego City Attorney	Attorney
1200 Third Avenue	San Francisco County
San Diego, CA	350 Rhode Island Street
92101	San Francisco, CA 94103
CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov	alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org
Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney	Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney
San Joaquin County	San Luis Obispo County
222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202 Stackton, CA 05202	County Government
Stockton, CA 95202 DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	Center Annex, 4th Floor
DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	San Luis Obispo, CA
	93408
	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
Christopher Dalbey, Deputy District Attorney	Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy District AttorneySanta
Santa Barbara County	Clara County
1112 Santa Barbara	70 W Hedding St San Jose,
StreetSanta Barbara,	CA 95110
CA 93101	EPU@da.sccgov.org
DAProp65@co.santa-	
barbara.ca.us	
Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney	Jefferey S. Rosell, District Attorney
200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16 <sup>th</sup> Floor	Santa Cruz County
San Jose, CA 96113	701 Ocean Street
Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.g	Santa Cruz, CA 95060
<u>ov</u>	Prop65@santacruzcounty.us
<u> </u>	1 10p05/(0,5antacruzeounty.u5
Lill Powitch District Attorney	Dhillin I Cling District Atterney Tylers
Jill Ravitch, District Attorney	Phillip J. Cline, District AttorneyTulare
Sonoma County	County 221 S. Mooney Plud Viselia
600 Administration Dr	221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia,
Santa Rosa, CA 95403	CA 95370
Jeannie.Barenes@sono	Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
ma-county.org	

Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney Ventura County 800 S Victoria Ave Ventura, CA 93009 daspecialops@ventura.org Jeff W. Reisig, District AttorneyYolo County 30 I Second Street Woodland, CA 95695 cfepd@yolocounty.org

Executed December 19, 2024, in Los Angeles, California

Yessenia Ramirez

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States and over the age of 18 years of age. My business address is 591 Plaza Dr. West Covina, CA 91790. I am a resident or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. The envelope or package was placed in the mail at West Covina, California.

On December 19, 2024, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m. Pacific Standard Time, I served the following documents: **NOTICE OF VIOLATION, CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.; CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** on each parties on the Service List attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the Service List attached hereto, and depositing it at a U.S. Postal Service Office with the postage fully prepaid for delivery by First Class Mail.

Robert Priscaro, District Attorney Alpine County P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	Todd Riebe, District Attorney Amador County 708 Court Street, #202 Jackson, CA 905642	Michael L. Ramsey, District Attorney Butte County 25 Country Center Drive – Administration Building Orville, CA 95965
Brenden Farrell, District Attorney	Katherine Micks, District Attorney	Dwayne Stewart, District Attorney
Colusa County	Del Notre County	Glenn County
310 6 <sup>th</sup> Street	450 H Street, Room 171	P.O. Box 430
Colusa, CA 95932	Crescent City, CA 95531	Willows, CA 95988
Stacey Eads, District Attorney	George Marquez, District Attorney	Cynthia Zimmer, District Attorney
Humboldt County	Imperial County	Kern County
825 5 <sup>th</sup> Street	940 W. main St, Suite 102	1215 Truxtun Avenue
Eureka, CA 95501	El Centro, CA 92243	Bakersfield, CA 93301
Sarah Hacker, District Attorney	Susan Krones, District Attorney	George Gascon, District Attorney
Kings County	Lake County	Los Angeles County
1400 West Lacey Blvd.	255 N. Forbes Street	211 W. Temple Street, Suite 1200
Hanford, CA 93230	Lakeport, CA 95453	Los Angeles, CA 90012
Sally O. Moreno, District Attorney	C. David Eyster, District Attorney	District Attorney of
Madera County	Mendocino County	Modoc County
300 South G. Street, Suite 300	P.O. Box 1000	204 S. Court Street Room 202
Madera, CA 93637	Ukiah, CA 95482	Alturas, CA 96101

# Service List

David Anderson, District Attorney Mono County P.O. Box 2053 Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546	Todd Spitzer, District Attorney Orange County 300 N. Flower Street Santa Ana, CA 92703	Joel Buckingham, District Attorney San Benito County 419 4 <sup>th</sup> Street Hollister, CA 95023
Jason Anderson, District Attorney San Bernardino County 303 W. Third Street San Bernardino, CA 92415	James Kirk Andrus, District Attorney San Mateo County 400 County Center, Third Floor Redwood City, CA 94063	Stephanie A. Bridgette, District Attorney Shasta County 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001
Sandra Groven, District Attorney Sierra County 100 Courthouse Square Downievillie, CA 95936	James Kirk Andrus, District Attorney Siskiyou County P.O. Box 986 Yreka, CA 96097	Krishna, A. Abrams District Attorney Solano County 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533
Jeff Laugero, District Attorney Stanislaus County 832 12 <sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95353	Jennifer Dupre, District Attorney Sutter County 462 2 <sup>nd</sup> Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991	Matthew Rogers, District Attorney Tehama County P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080
David Brady, District Attorney Trinity County P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093	Cassandra Jenecke, District Attorney Tuolumne County 423 N. Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370	Clint Curry, District Attorney Yuba County 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901
Mike Feuer, District Attorney City of Los Angeles 200 N. Main St. Los Angeles, CA 90012		

Executed December 19, 2024, in Los Angeles, California

Yessenia Ramirez