## VOORHEES & BAILEY, LLP 839 Emerson Street Palo Alto, CA 94301 650-313-2154

## 60-Day Notice of Violation - California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

April 4, 2025

Notice Recipients: I World LLC;

Five Below, Inc.

Noticing Party: Dennis Johnson

**Covered Products:** Sports Balls With PVC Components

**Listed Chemical:** Di-n-butyl phthalate (DBP)

Routes of Exposure: Ingestion; Dermal

**Potential Harm:** Birth Defects and Other Reproductive Harm

#### I. INTRODUCTION

This Sixty-Day Notice of Violation ("Notice") is provided by Dennis Johnson. Mr. Johnson is a private enforcer acting in the public interest pursuant to California Health & Safety Code section 25249.7(d). Mr. Johnson seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals in products sold and used in California and, if possible, to eliminate such exposures.

This Notice is provided to the alleged violators, I World LLC, and Five Below, Inc. (the "Notice Recipients"), as well as the California Attorney General's Office, the District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties, and the City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose and Los Angeles.

The Notice Recipients are hereby given notice that they have violated and continue to violate provisions of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, which is codified at California Health & Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq. ("Proposition 65"). Specifically, the Notice Recipients have violated and continue to violate the warning requirement of section 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code, which provides, "No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual...." The alleged violations that are the subject of this Notice are provided below.

### II. ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

<u>Product Types/Categories</u>: The specific types or categories of products that are causing consumer exposures in violation of Proposition 65, and that are covered by this Notice, are Sports Balls With PVC Components ("Covered Products").

Identified below is a specific example of Covered Products recently purchased and witnessed as being available for purchase or use in California (the "Exemplar Product"). Based on publicly available information, the retailers, distributors, and/or manufacturers of the Exemplar Product is also provided.

The Exemplar Product is identified for the Notice Recipients' benefit to assist in their investigation of the allegations set forth in this Notice. The Exemplar Product is not meant to be an exhaustive or comprehensive identification of each specific offending product falling within the specific types or categories of Covered Products at issue in this Notice. It is the private enforcer's position that the Notice Recipients are obligated to conduct a good-faith investigation into other specific products falling within the type or category of Covered Products that have been manufactured, imported, distributed, sold, shipped, stored, or are otherwise within the Notice Recipients' custody or control, so as to ensure the requisite toxic warnings were and are provided to California citizens prior to purchase.

Covered Products	Exemplar Product Information	
Sports Balls With PVC	I World Rebel Basketball Mini Hoop With Ball	
Components	UPC: 1 95207 09701 1	
	Retailer: Five Below, Inc. (Sacramento, CA)	
	Manufacturer/Distributor: I World LLC	

<u>Listed Chemical</u>: The alleged violations involve exposures to the Proposition 65-listed chemical Di-n-butyl phthalate (DBP). DBP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. DBP is hereinafter referred to as the "Listed Chemical".

<u>Statement of Violations</u>: The Notice Recipients knowingly and intentionally exposed, and continue to knowingly and intentionally expose, consumers within the State of California to DBP, a chemical known to the State of California to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm, without first giving clear and reasonable warning of this exposure to such individuals. In particular, the Notice Recipients failed to provide a clear and reasonable warning to consumers that the Covered Products expose consumers to DBP.

Route of Exposure: California citizens, through the act of buying, acquiring or utilizing the Covered Products, are exposed to the Listed Chemical. Consumers ingest the Listed Chemical when they touch and handle the Covered Products, transfer the Listed Chemical from the Covered Products onto their fingers and hands, and transfer the Listed Chemical from their fingers and hands to their mouths through hand-to-mouth activities that may continue to occur for a significant period after contact with the Covered Products. Consumers are exposed to the Listed Chemical through direct dermal contact when they, among other activities, handle or touch the Covered Products.

<u>Number and Duration of Violations</u>: Each and every sale of a Covered Product to a consumer in California without a clear and reasonable warning is a violation, including transactions made over-the-counter, through the internet, and/or via catalogue by the Notice Recipients and any other sellers of the Covered Products. These violations have been occurring since at least April 4, 2024, as well as every day since the Covered Products were first introduced and sold in the State of California, as far back as April 4, 2022. The violations are ongoing.

#### III. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

Pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d) and Title 11, California Code of Regulations, section 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto. A second copy of the entire notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the Attorney General with all supporting documentation required by Section 3102 attached thereto.

#### IV. PROPOSITION 65 INFORMATION – A SUMMARY

A summary of Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead agency designated under Proposition 65, is enclosed with the copy of the Notice served on the Notice Recipients.

#### V. RESOLUTION OF NOTICED CLAIMS

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, Mr. Johnson intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the Notice Recipients upon the expiration of the sixty-day notice period, provided no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

If the Notice Recipients are interested in resolving this dispute without resorting to time-consuming and expensive litigation, they should contact counsel at the address provided below. It should be noted that no settlement may be finalized before the sixty-day notice period has expired and only if no public prosecutor has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the alleged violation.

#### VI. PRESERVATION OF EVIDENCE

This Notice also serves as a demand that the Notice Recipients preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in the Covered Products; purchase and sales information for Covered Products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to the Covered Products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of the Listed Chemical in Covered products; and representative exemplars of each specific model falling within the Covered Products. This demand applies to all relevant

evidence for Covered Products sold in the State of California, as far back as April 4, 2022, through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

# VII. DEMAND FOR RETAILER, PURSUANT TO 27 C.C.R. 25600.2(g), TO IDENTIFY MANUFACTURER, PRODUCER, PACKAGER, IMPORT, SUPPLIER AND DISTRIBUTOR OF THE COVERED PRODUCTS

Pursuant to 27 C.C.R. 25600.2(g), "[t]he retail seller of a product that may cause a consumer product exposure shall promptly provide the name and contact information for the manufacturer, producer, packager, importer, supplier, and distributor of the product to ... [a]ny person who has served notice under Section 25249.7(d)(1) of the Act alleging that the consumer product causes an exposure that requires a warning under the Act."

Please accept this Notice as a formal demand for any non-manufacturing seller or distributor receiving this notice to promptly provide the name and contact information for the manufacturer, producer, packager, importer, supplier, and distributor of the product(s) so identified in Section II. This information may and should be communicated in a letter from the retailer delivered via electronic mail to counsel as indicated in Section VIII below.

#### VIII. CONTACT INFORMATION

Dennis Johnson, whose address is 1618 Alhambra Blvd., # 162022, Sacramento, CA 95816 and whose phone number is (916) 800-2182, has retained me as legal counsel in this matter. Please direct all communications related to this Notice of Violation to the following:

Troy Bailey, Esq. Voorhees & Bailey, LLP 839 Emerson Street Palo Alto, CA 94301 troy@voorheesbailey.com

Sincerely,

David Joshua Voorhees Voorhees & Bailey, LLP

Attorneys for Dennis Johnson

cc: California Attorney General's Office; District Attorney's Office for 58 Counties;

and City Attorneys for San Francisco, San Diego, San Jose and Los Angeles.

Attachments: Certificate of Merit; Proof of Service; The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic

Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary (*I World LLC, and Five Below, Inc. only*); and Confidential Information in Support of Certificate of Merit

(Attorney General Only)

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d)

## I, David Joshua Voorhees, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
- 2. I am the attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of this action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including information identified in Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) certain facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: April 4, 2025

David Joshua Voorhees

#### PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within action. I am employed in Santa Clara County, California. My business address is 839 Emerson Street, Palo Alto, CA 94301.

On April 4, 2025, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND** 

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

XXXX **By First Class Certified Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each alleged violator listed below and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative.

Five Below, Inc. c/o Lawyers Incorporating Service 2710 Gateway Oaks Drive; Suite 150N Sacramento, CA 95833 Current President/CEO I World LLC 65 West 36<sup>th</sup> Street; 11<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, NY 10018

Kenneth R. Bull or Current CEO Five Below, Inc. 701 Market Street Philadelphia, PA 19106

On April 4, 2025, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); AND

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT** 

XXXX **By First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, addressed to each entity on the attached "U.S. Mail Service List" and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service Representative, postage prepaid.

XXXX **By Electronic Mail** by sending true and correct copies of the above documents to the electronic notification (Email) address(es) on the attached "Electronic Mail Service List".

On April 4, 2025, I caused to be served the following documents:

60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

**CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND** 

## **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS**

XXXX **By Electronic Upload** by causing true and correct copies of the above documents to be uploaded to the California Attorney General's website at the web address on the attached "Electronic Upload Service List".

Executed on April 4, 2025, at Palo Alto, California.

David **J**oshua Voorhees

# **U.S. Mail Service List**

Alpine County District Attorney P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	Los Angeles County District Attorney 211 West Temple Street, Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012	Solano County District Attorney 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533
Amador County District Attorney 708 Court Street Jackson, CA 95642	Madera County District Attorney 300 South G Street, Suite 300 Madera, CA 93637	Stanislaus County District Attorney 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95354
Butte County District Attorney 25 County Center Drive, Suite 245 Oroville, CA 95965	Mendocino County District Attorney P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482	Sutter County District Attorney 463 Second Street, Suite 102 Yuba City, CA 95991
Colusa County District Attorney 346 Fifth Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932	Modoc County District Attorney 204 S. Court Street, Suite 202 Alturas, CA 96101	Tehama County District Attorney 444 Oak Street, Room L Red Bluff, CA 96080
Del Norte County District Attorney 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531	Mono County District Attorney P.O. Box 617 Bridgeport, CA 93517	Trinity County District Attorney P.O. Box 310 Weaverville, CA 96093
Glenn County District Attorney P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988	Office of the City Attorney, Los Angeles James K. Hahn City Hall East 200 North Main Street, 8th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90012	Tuolumne County District Attorney 423 North Washington Street Sonora, CA 95370
Humboldt County District Attorney 825 5th Street, Fourth Floor Eureka, CA 95501	San Benito County District Attorney 419 4th Street Hollister, CA 95023	Yuba County District Attorney 215 Fifth Street Marysville, CA 95901
Imperial County District Attorney 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243	San Bernardino County District Attorney 303 West 3rd Street, 6th Floor San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502	
Kern County District Attorney 1215 Truxtun Avenue, 4th Floor Bakersfield, CA 93301	Sierra County District Attorney P.O. Box 457 Downieville, CA 95936	
Kings County District Attorney 1400 West Lacey Boulevard Hanford, CA 93230	Siskiyou County District Attorney 311 4th Street Yreka, CA 96097	
Lake County District Attorney 255 North Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453	Shasta County District Attorney 1355 West Street Redding, CA 96001	

# **Electronic Upload Service List**

Office of the California Attorney General Proposition 65 Enforcement Reporting ATTN: Prop 65 Coordinator P.O. Box 70550 Oakland, CA 94612-0550 https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice

# **Electronic Mail Service List**

	T	T
Pamela Y. Price, District Attorney	Paul E. Zellerbach, District Attorney	Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District Attorney
Alameda County District Attorney	Riverside County	San Luis Obispo County
7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650	3072 Orange Street	County Govt Center Annex, 4th Floor
Oakland, CA 94621	Riverside, CA 92501	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408
CEPDProp65@acgov.org	Prop65@rivcoda.org	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
CEI DI Topos & acgov.org	110pos@11vcodd.org	caobiotil@co.sio.ca.as
Allison Haley, District Attorney	Tori Verber Salazar, District Attorney	Carla Rodriguez, District Attorney
Napa County	San Joaquin County	Sonoma County
1127 First Street, Suite C	222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202	600 Administration Drive, Room 212J
•	·	· ·
Napa, CA 94559	Stockton, CA 95202	Santa Rosa, CA 95403
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org	ECLD@sonoma-county.org
Alexandra Grayner, Assistant DA	Jeffrey S. Rosell , District Attorney	Jeannine M. Pacioni, District Attorney
		-
San Francisco County	Santa Cruz County	Monterey County
350 Rhode Island Street	701 Ocean Street	1200 Aguajito Road
San Francisco, CA 94103	Santa Cruz, CA 95060	Monterey, CA 93940
alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org	Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
		1
Bud Porter	Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City Attorney
Supervising Deputy District Attorney	Yolo County	City of San Diego
Santa Clara County	301 Second Street	1200 Third Avenue
70 W Hedding St	Woodland, CA 95695	San Diego, CA 92101
San Jose, CA 95110	cfepd@yolocounty.gov	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
EPU@da.sccgov.org	dispace yourseame, igo	City, itty, repose samategoiger
Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney	Devin Chandler, Executive Assistant	Christopher Dalbey,
Ventura County	Lassen County	Deputy District Attorney
•		· · ·
800 S Victoria Ave	2950 Riverside Drive	Santa Barbara County
Ventura, CA 93009	Susanville, CA 96130	1112 Santa Barbara St.
daspecialops@ventura.org	dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us	Santa Barbara, CA 93101
		DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
Stacey Grassini, Deputy District Attorney	Anne Marie Schubert, District Attorney	Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney
Contra Costa County	Sacramento County	Tulare County
•	· 1	•
900 Ward Street	901 G Street	221 S Mooney Blvd
Martinez, CA 94553	Sacramento, CA 95814	Visalia, CA 95370
sgrassini@contracostada.org	Prop65@sacda.org	Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
Barbara Yook, District Attorney	Thomas L. Hardy, District Attorney	Henry Lifton, Deputy City Attorney
Calaveras County	Inyo County	City of San Francisco
•		•
891 Mountain Ranch Road.	168 North Edwards Street	1390 Market Street, 7th Floor
San Andreas, CA 95249	Independence, CA 93526	San Francisco, CA 94102
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	inyoda@inyocounty.us	Prop65@sfcityatty.org
Kimbarly Lawis District Attarnay	Walter W Wall District Attorney	Clifford H. Nowell District Attorney
Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney	Walter W. Wall, District Attorney	Clifford H. Newell, District Attorney
Merced County	Mariposa County	Nevada County
550 W. Main Street	P.O. Box 730	201 Commercial Street
Merced, CA 95340	Mariposa, CA 95338	Nevada City, CA 95959
Prop65@countyofmerced.com	mcda@mariposacounty.org	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us
Morgan Briggs Gire, District Attorney	David Hollister, District Attorney	Summer Stephan, District Attorney
Placer County	Plumas County	San Diego County
10810 Justice Center Drive	520 Main Street	330 W. Broadway Street
10010 Justice Center Drive		•
	Quincy, CA 95971	San Diego, CA 92101
Roseville, CA 95678	Quincy, CA 95971 davidhollister@countyofplumas.com	San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
	Quincy, CA 95971 davidhollister@countyofplumas.com	San Diego, CA 92101 SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
Roseville, CA 95678	**	9 '
Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov Orange County District Attorney 300 North Flower Street	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com  Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney Santa Clara County	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org  Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney Fresno County
Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov  Orange County District Attorney 300 North Flower Street Santa Ana, CA 92703	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com  Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney Santa Clara County 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org  Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney Fresno County 2100 Tulare Street
Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov Orange County District Attorney 300 North Flower Street	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com  Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney Santa Clara County 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 96113	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org  Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney Fresno County 2100 Tulare Street Fresno, CA 93721
Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov  Orange County District Attorney 300 North Flower Street Santa Ana, CA 92703	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com  Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney Santa Clara County 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org  Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney Fresno County 2100 Tulare Street
Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov  Orange County District Attorney 300 North Flower Street Santa Ana, CA 92703 Prop65Notice@ocdapa.org	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com  Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney Santa Clara County 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 96113 Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org  Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney Fresno County 2100 Tulare Street Fresno, CA 93721
Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov  Orange County District Attorney 300 North Flower Street Santa Ana, CA 92703 Prop65Notice@ocdapa.org  Lori E. Frugoli, Marin County	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com  Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney Santa Clara County 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 96113 Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov  Stephen M, Wagstaffe, San Mateo County	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org  Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney Fresno County 2100 Tulare Street Fresno, CA 93721 consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov  James Clinchard, Assistant District Attorney
Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov  Orange County District Attorney 300 North Flower Street Santa Ana, CA 92703 Prop65Notice@ocdapa.org  Lori E. Frugoli, Marin County District Attorney	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com  Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney Santa Clara County 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 96113 Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov  Stephen M, Wagstaffe, San Mateo County District Attorney	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org  Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney Fresno County 2100 Tulare Street Fresno, CA 93721 consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov  James Clinchard, Assistant District Attorney El Dorado County
Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov  Orange County District Attorney 300 North Flower Street Santa Ana, CA 92703 Prop65Notice@ocdapa.org  Lori E. Frugoli, Marin County District Attorney 3501 Civic Center Drive, Suite 145	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com  Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney Santa Clara County 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 96113 Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov  Stephen M, Wagstaffe, San Mateo County District Attorney 400 County Center	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org  Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney Fresno County 2100 Tulare Street Fresno, CA 93721 consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov  James Clinchard, Assistant District Attorney El Dorado County 778 Pacific Street
Roseville, CA 95678 prop65@placer.ca.gov  Orange County District Attorney 300 North Flower Street Santa Ana, CA 92703 Prop65Notice@ocdapa.org  Lori E. Frugoli, Marin County District Attorney	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com  Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney Santa Clara County 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor San Jose, CA 96113 Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov  Stephen M, Wagstaffe, San Mateo County District Attorney	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org  Lisa A. Smittcamp, District Attorney Fresno County 2100 Tulare Street Fresno, CA 93721 consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov  James Clinchard, Assistant District Attorney El Dorado County