

April 9, 2025

### Re: Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 to § 25249.14 ("Proposition 65") and Notice of Intent to Sue

Dear Glanbia Nutritionals, Inc., Grass Advantage, LLC d/b/a Amazing Grass, and the appropriate public enforcement agencies:

My firm represents WHEN Justice ("WHEN") in this matter, and I submit this Notice of Violation and Notice of Intent to Sue ("Notice") of Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 to 25249.14 (hereinafter "Proposition 65"), pursuant to Health & Safety Code § 25249.7, on its behalf. This letter serves as a notice to Glanbia Nutritionals, Inc. and Grass Advantage, LLC d/b/a Amazing Grass ("Alleged Violator(s)") and the appropriate public enforcement agencies.

Also enclosed please find the Certificate of Merit<sup>1</sup>, Additional Supporting Information<sup>2</sup> thereto, and Proof of Service<sup>3</sup> enclosed herein.

WHEN is a California nonprofit public benefit corporation dedicated to building a cleaner, safer, and more just world by advocating for stronger health, environmental, and safety laws, regulations, and policies. Through impact litigation, education, and advocacy, WHEN mobilizes a community of passionate supporters to drive meaningful, long-lasting change.

# I. Notice of Intent to Sue Provided No Public Enforcement Actions against Alleged Violator(s)

If a public enforcement agency has not commenced a diligent prosecution within sixty (60) days of this Notice, in addition to time allotted for method of service, WHEN intends to file a private enforcement action against Alleged Violator(s) in the public interest, pursuant to Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d).

### II. Proposition 65 Legal Background

Under Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, "[n]o person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> *The Certificate of Merit has been provided to the Alleged Violator(s) and Attorney General.* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The Additional Supporting Information for the Certificate of Merit as required by Cal. Code Regs. tit. 11, § 3102 has only been provided to the Attorney General.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The Proof of Service has been provided to all recipients of this Notice.

state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual," subject to exceptions. Additionally, pursuant to Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.8, the State of California has published a list of chemicals known to the State to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity within the meaning of Proposition 65.<sup>4</sup> Listed chemicals relevant to this Notice include: lead<sup>5</sup>, <sup>6</sup> and cadmium<sup>7</sup> For guidance, the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment created a summary ("Summary") of Proposition 65 which includes general information about Proposition 65. A true and correct copy of the Summary is appended hereto as Attachment D.<sup>8</sup>

#### III. Alleged Violator(s) and Consumer Products with Listed Proposition 65 Chemicals

The names of Alleged Violator(s) encompassed within this Notice for violations of Proposition 65 are:

- Glanbia Nutritionals, Inc. and
- Grass Advantage, LLC d/b/a Amazing Grass.

WHEN has identified violations of Proposition 65 by Alleged Violator(s) in regard to the products ("Covered Products") identified below in Table 1. Alleged Violator(s) sell or otherwise provide consumer products directly to consumers by any means, including via the internet, in the State of California that contain listed chemicals without the required clear and reasonable warnings and/or in exceedance of allowable limits.

Table 1
---------

Covered Products	Listed Chemical(s)	Uniform Product Code ("UPC")
Amazing Grass – Greens Blend – KIDZ Superfood – Protein and	Cadmium, Lead	829835006885
Probiotics – Strawberry Blast		
("Product 1")		
Amazing Grass - Greens Blend -	Lead	829835000033
KIDZ Superfood Blend - Berry		
Blast ("Product 2")		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See the Proposition 65 list here: <u>https://oehha.ca.gov/proposition-65/proposition-65-list</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> On February 27, 1987, the State of California officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause developmental toxicity, and male and female reproductive toxicity.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> On May 1, 1997, the State of California officially listed cadmium compounds as chemicals known to cause developmental toxicity and male reproductive toxicity.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Attachment A has only been provided to the Alleged Violator(s).

Amazing Grass - KIDZ	Lead	829835543731
Superfood Blend - Outrageous		
Chocolate ("Product 3")		
Amazing Grass - Greens Blend -	Lead	829835937004
Superfood Berry ("Product 4")		
Amazing Grass - Greens Blend -	Lead	829835009008
Immunity – Elderberry		
("Product 5")		
Amazing Grass - Greens Blend -	Lead	829835001699
Immunity - Tangerine ("Product		
6")		

These violations have occurred and are continuing every day since at least February 28, 2025. Upon information and belief, the Covered Products identified in Table 1 have been in violation of Proposition 65 since the products were introduced into the State of California's marketplace and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are produced and until these chemicals are either removed from, or reduced to allowable levels, in the Covered Products.

#### IV. Route of Exposure

Exposure is through ingestion by following the recommended use of the products.

#### V. Preservation of Relevant Evidence

Alleged Violator(s) are obliged to maintain and preserve all documents in their possession that relate in any way to the activities underlying the allegations in this Notice. Document and evidence preservation includes, but is not limited to, the suspension of any document deletion and/or destruction with respect to all documents in Alleged Violator(s)' possession, custody, or control. "Document" or "documents" includes, but is not limited to, all hard copy writings as defined in Cal. Evid. Code § 250 ("'writing' means handwriting, typewriting, printing, photostating, photographing, photocopying, transmitting by electronic mail or facsimile, and every other means of recording upon any tangible thing, any form of communication or representation, including letters, words, pictures, sounds, or symbols, or combinations thereof, and any record thereby created, regardless of the manner in which the record has been stored") and all Electronically Stored Information ("ESI") as defined in Cal. Code Civ. Proc. § 2016.020 ("(d) 'Electronic' means relating to technology having electrical, digital, magnetic, wireless, optical, electromagnetic, or similar capabilities" and "(e) 'Electronically stored information' means information that is stored in an electronic medium"). See also Cedars-Sinai Medical Center v. Superior Court, 18 Cal. 4th 1, 8, 954 P.2d 511, 515 (1998).

WHEN may continue to investigate these Covered Products and other products that may reveal additional violations and result in successive notices of violation.

#### VI. Conclusion

Consistent with the public interest and community right to know goals of Proposition 65, and a desire to have these ongoing violations rectified, WHEN is interested in seeking a resolution of this matter that includes an enforceable written agreement by Alleged Violator(s) to: (1) reformulate the Covered Products so as to eliminate further exposures to the identified chemicals, or provide appropriate warnings on the labels of these Covered Products; (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty; and (3) provide clear and reasonable warnings compliant with Proposition 65, and its applicable regulations, to all persons located in California who purchased the above products in the last three (3) years. Such a resolution will prevent further unwarned consumer exposures to the identified chemicals, as well as expensive and time-consuming litigation.

Please direct any inquiries or correspondence regarding this Notice to the below listed individual:

Jacqueline E. Biner, Esq. Soteria Law 3540 Wilkinson Lane #8 Lafayette, CA 94549 jackie@soterialaw.com

Sincerely,

Jacqueline E. Biner, Esq. Founder, Managing Partner Soteria Law

Enclosures and/or Attachments:

- Certificate of Merit (to all recipients);
- Additional Supporting Information (to Attorney General only);
- Proof of Service (to all recipients); and
- Appendix A: OEHHA Summary (to Alleged Violator(s) only).

#### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

## Re: Glanbia Nutritionals, Inc. and Grass Advantage, LLC d/b/a Amazing Grass's Notice of Proposition 65 violations

I, Jacqueline E. Biner, hereby declare and certify:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty (60) day Notice in which it is alleged that the party(ies) identified in the notice violated Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 by exposing individuals to chemical(s) known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning(s) to such individual(s).
- 2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience and have assembled evidence attached to the copy of the notice for the California Attorney General as Exhibit 1 "Additional Supporting Information" to this Certificate of Merit regarding the lack of warnings for the listed chemical(s) that is/are the subject of the Notice.
- 4. Based on the information obtained and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff's case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the California Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Cal. Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(h)(2) (i.e. the identity of the person(s) consulted with and relied on by the certifier and the facts, studies, and data reviewed by that person).

Dated: April 9, 2025

Jacqueline E. Biner, Esq.

#### **PROOF OF SERVICE**

## Re: Glanbia Nutritionals, Inc. and Grass Advantage, LLC d/b/a Amazing Grass's Notice of Proposition 65 violations

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury:

I am over the age of eighteen (18) years and not a party to this case. I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred. My business address is 3540 Wilkinson Lane #8, Lafayette, CA 94549.

On April 9, 2025, I caused to be served the following:

- 1. SIXTY (60) DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CAL. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);
- 2. THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 ("PROPOSITION 65"): A SUMMARY; AND
- 3. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT.

by **Certified First Class Mail** through the United States Postal Service by placing true and correct copies of the above documents in a sealed envelope, individually addressed to each Alleged Violator listed below, and providing such envelope to a United States Postal Service representative:

Glanbia Nutritionals, Inc.	Glanbia Nutritionals, Inc.
121 4 <sup>th</sup> Avenue South	227 W Monroe St., Suite
Twin Falls, ID 83301	5100 Chicago, IL 60606
Grass Advantage, LLC	Grass Advantage, LLC
d/b/a Amazing Grass	d/b/a Amazing Grass
230 Newport Center Drive, Suite 300	3500 Lacey Road Suite 1200
Newport Beach, CA 92660	Downers Grove, IL 60515

On April 9, 2025, I caused to be served true and correct copies of the following documents:

## 1. SIXTY (60) DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CAL. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d); and

2. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT.

via **Electronic Mail**, by sending true and correct copies of the above documents, addressed individually, to the recipients listed on the "Electronic Mail Service List" as contained on the Office of the Attorney General Website located at <u>https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/electronic-service</u> and listed below:

Pamela Y. Price, District Attorney	Barbara Yook, District Attorney	Stacey Grassini, Deputy District
Alameda County	Calaveras County	Attorney
7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650	891 Mountain Ranch Road	Contra Costa County
Oakland, CA 94621	San Andreas, CA 95249	900 Ward Street
CEPDProp65@acgov.org	Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	Martinez, CA 94553
CEFDF10p05@acgov.org	rioposenv@co.calaveras.ca.us	
Lenner Clincher 1 Assistent	Line A. Covillandor District	sgrassini@contracostada.org
James Clinchard, Assistant	Lisa A. Smittcamp, District	Thomas L. Hardy, District
District Attorney	Attorney	Attorney
El Dorado County	Fresno County	Inyo County
778 Pacific Street	2100 Tulare Street	168 North Edwards Street
Placerville, CA 95667	Fresno, CA 93721	Independence, CA 93526
EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us	consumerprotection@fresnocount	inyoda@inyocounty.us
	<u>yca.gov</u>	
Devin Chandler, Program	Lori E. Frugoli, District Attorney	Walter W. Wall, District Attorney
Coordinator	Marin County	Mariposa County
Lassen County	3501 Civic Center Drive	P.O. Box 730
2950 Riverside Drive	Room 145	Mariposa, CA 95338
Susanville, CA 96130	San Rafael, CA 94903	mcda@mariposacounty.org
dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us	consumer@marincounty.gov	
Kimberly Lewis, District Attorney	Jeannine M. Pacioni, District	Allison Haley, District Attorney
Merced County	Attorney	Napa County
550 West Main Street	Monterey County	1127 First Street, Suite C
Merced, CA 95340	1200 Aguajito Road	Napa, CA 94559
Prop65@countyofmerced.com	Monterey, CA93940	CEPD@countyofnapa.org
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us	
Clifford H. Newell, District	Todd Spitzer, District Attorney	Morgan Briggs Gire, District
Attorney	Orange County	Attorney
Nevada County	300 N. Flower Street	Placer County
201 Commercial Street	Santa Ana, CA 92703	10810 Justice Center Drive
Nevada City, CA 95959	Prop65notice@ocdapa.org	Roseville, CA 95678
DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us		Prop65@placer.ca.gov
David Hollister, District Attorney	Paul E. Zellerbach, District	Anne Marie Schubert, District
Plumas County	Attorney	Attorney
520 Main Street	Riverside County	Sacramento County
Quincy, CA 95971	3072 Orange Street	901 G Street
davidhollister@countyofplumas.c	Riverside, CA 92501	Sacramento, CA 95814
om	Prop65@rivcoda.org	Prop65@sacda.org
Summer Stephan, District	Mark Ankcorn, Deputy City	Alexandra Grayner, Asisstant
Attorney	Attorney	District Attorney
San Diego County	San Diego City Attorney	San Francisco County
330 West Broadway	1200 Third Avenue	350 Rhode Island Street
San Diego, CA 92101	San Diego, CA 92101	San Francisco, CA 94103
SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov	alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org
	Tori Verber Salazar, District	Eric J. Dobroth, Deputy District
Henry Lifton, Deputy City		- 1 5
Attorney	Attorney	Attorney

	1	
San Francisco City Attorney	San Juaquin County	San Luis Obispo County
1390 Market Street, 7th Floor	222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202	County Government Center
San Francisco, CA 94102	Stockton, CA 95202	Annex, 4 <sup>th</sup> Floor
Prop65@sfcityatty.org	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjc	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408
	<u>da.org</u>	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
Christopher Dalbey, Deputy	Bud Porter, Supervising Deputy	Nora V. Frimann, City Attorney
District Attorney	District Attorney	Santa Clara City Attorney
Santa Barbara County	Santa Clara County	200 E. Santa Clara Street
1112 Santa Barbara Street	70 W. Hedding Street	16 <sup>th</sup> Floor
Santa Barbara, CA 93101	San Jose, CA 95110	San Jose, CA 96113
DAProp65@co.santa-	EPU@da.sccgov.org	Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.g
<u>barbara.ca.us</u>		<u>ov</u>
Jeffrey S. Rosell, District Attorney	Carla Rodriguez, District	Phillip J. Cline, District Attorney
Santa Cruz County	Attorney	Tulare County
701 Ocean Street	Sonoma County	221 S. Mooney Boulevard
Santa Cruz, CA 95060	600 Administration Drive, Room	Visalia, CA 95370
Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	212J	Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
	Santa Rosa, CA 95403	-
	ECLD@sonoma-county.org	
Gregory D. Totten, District	Jeff W. Reisig, District Attorney	
Attorney	Yolo County	
Ventura County	301 Second Street	
800 S. Victoria Avenue	Woodland, CA 95695	
Ventura, CA 93009	cfepd@yolocounty.org	
daspecialops@ventura.org		

On April 9, 2025, I caused to be served true and correct copies of the following documents:

## 1. SIXTY (60) DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH CAL. HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(d);

2. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; AND

### 3. CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS.

by **Electronic Upload**, by uploading true and correct copies of the documents, addressed to the California Attorney General at their website address, listed under the "Electronic Upload Service List," located at <u>https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/add-60-day-notice</u>, the office of which is physically located at:

Office of the California Attorney General
Prop 65 Enforcement Reporting
1515 Clay Street, Suite 2000
Oakland, CA 94612-0550

Executed on April 9, 2025 at Lafayette, California.

\_\_\_\_

Jacqueline E. Biner, Esq.