

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act

Bisphenol S in Thermal Labels, including but not limited to, Thermal Adhesive Paper, Sticky-Back Thermal Paper, and Thermal Stickers

June 27, 2025

This Notice of Violation (the "Notice") is provided to you pursuant to and in compliance with California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(d).

- For general information regarding the California Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, see the attached summary provided by the California EPA (copies not provided to public enforcement agencies).
- This Notice is provided by the Center for Environmental Health ("CEH"), 2201 Broadway, Suite 508, Oakland, CA 94612, (510) 655-3900. CEH is a nonprofit corporation dedicated to protecting the environment, improving human health, and supporting environmentally sound practices. Shakoora Azimi-Gaylon is the Senior Director of the Toxic Exposures and Pollution Prevention program of and a responsible individual within CEH.

Description of Violation:

- Violators: The names and addresses of the violators are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- Time Period of Exposure: The violations have been occurring since at least December 29, 2024 and are continuing to this day.
- Provision of Proposition 65: This Notice covers the exposure/warning provision of Proposition 65, which is found at California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.6.
- Chemical(s) Involved: The name of the listed chemical involved in these violations is bisphenol S ("BPS"). Exposures to BPS occur from handling of the products identified in this Notice.
- Type of Product: The specific type of product causing these violations is thermal labels, including but not limited to, thermal adhesive paper, sticky-back thermal paper, and thermal sticker labels ("Thermal Labels"). Non-exclusive examples of this specific type of product are identified on the attached Exhibit 1.
- Description of Exposure: This Notice addresses consumer exposures to BPS. Use of the products identified in this Notice results in human exposures to BPS. BPS is found on the surface of the products. Thermal Labels are treated with a surface coating of BPS. The routes of exposure for the violations are dermal absorption directly through the skin when consumers touch or handle the

products, and ingestion via hand-to-mouth contact after consumers touch or handle the products. No clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning is provided with these products regarding the presence of BPS in the products.

Resolution of Noticed Claims:

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, CEH intends to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the alleged violators unless such violators agree in a binding written instrument to: (1) provide clear and reasonable warnings for products sold or otherwise provided to consumers in the future or reformulate such products to eliminate the BPS exposures; and (2) pay an appropriate civil penalty based on the factors enumerated in California Health and Safety Code Section 25249.7(b). If the alleged violators are interested in resolving this dispute without resort to litigation, please feel free to contact CEH through its counsel identified below. It should be noted that CEH cannot: (1) finalize any settlement until after the 60-day notice period has expired; nor (2) speak for the Attorney General or any District or City Attorney who received CEH's 60-day Notice. Therefore, while reaching an agreement with CEH will resolve its claims, such agreement may not satisfy the public prosecutors.

Preservation of Relevant Evidence:

This Notice also serves as a demand that the alleged violators preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to the presence or potential presence of BPS in Thermal Labels; purchase and usage information for such products; efforts to comply with Proposition 65 with respect to such products; communications with any person relating to the presence or potential presence of BPS in such products; and representative exemplars of any such products provided to customers or consumers by the alleged violator in the year preceding this Notice through the date of any trial of the claims alleged in this Notice.

Please direct any inquiries regarding this Notice to CEH's counsel Patrick Carey or Joseph Mann at Lexington Law Group, 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117, (415) 913-7800, pcarey@lexlawgroup.com, jmann@lexlawgroup.com.

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT
Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d)

I, Patrick Carey, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice has violated Health & Safety Code §25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney at Lexington Law Group, LLP, and I represent the noticing party, the Center for Environmental Health.

3. Members of my firm and I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposures to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that “reasonable and meritorious case for the private action” means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiff’s case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violators will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of the Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health & Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

June 27, 2025



Patrick Carey
Attorney for CENTER FOR
ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

EXHIBIT 1
June 27, 2025 Notice of Violation
Bisphenol S in Thermal Labels, including but not limited to, Thermal Adhesive Paper,
Sticky-Back Thermal Paper, and Thermal Sticker Labels

Names and Addresses of Responsible Parties	Non-Exclusive Examples of the Products	Further Description of Non-Exclusive Exemplar
Raley's 500 West Capitol Avenue West Sacramento, CA 95605	Raley's Adhesive Food Label from Raley's at 6845 Douglas Blvd. Granite Bay, CA 95746 (received June 10, 2025)	Store 412 Item: Columbus Oven Roasted Chicken Breast
Cardenas Markets LLC 2501 E. Guasti Road Ontario, CA 91761	Cardenas Adhesive Food Label from Cardenas at 2100 Railroad Ave. Pittsburg, CA 94565 (received June 9, 2025)	Store 207 Item: Tilapia Fish Fillet TP

1 **PROOF OF SERVICE**

2 I, Owen Sutter, declare:

3 I am a citizen of the United States and employed in the County of San Francisco, State of
4 California. I am over the age of eighteen (18) years and not a party to this action. My business
5 address is 503 Divisadero Street, San Francisco, CA 94117 and my email address is
osutter@lexlawgroup.com.

6 On June 27, 2025, I served the following document(s) on all interested parties in this
7 action by placing a true copy thereof in the manner and at the addresses indicated below:

8 **NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA SAFE DRINKING WATER AND
TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT;**

9 **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT;** and

10 **THE SAFE DRINKING AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986**
11 **(PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY** (only sent to those on service list marked with an
asterisk).

12 ☒ **BY MAIL:** I am readily familiar with the firm's practice for collecting and processing mail
13 with the United States Postal Service ("USPS"). Under that practice, mail would be deposited
14 with USPS that same day with postage thereon fully prepaid at San Francisco, California in the
ordinary course of business. On this date, I placed sealed envelopes containing the above
mentioned documents for collection and mailing following my firm's ordinary business practices.

15 *Please see attached service list.*

16 ☒ **BY ELECTRONIC UPLOAD:** I transmitted a PDF version of the document(s) listed above,
17 as well as a Confidential Supporting Certificate of Merit, to the Office of the Attorney General of
California via the Proposition 65 60-Day Notice Search website at [https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/60-](https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/60-day-notice-search)
18 [day-notice-search](https://oag.ca.gov/prop65/60-day-notice-search).

19 ☒ **BY ELECTRONIC MAIL:** I transmitted a PDF version of the document(s) listed above via
20 email to the email address(es) indicated on the attached service list [or noted above] before 5 p.m.
on the date executed.

21 Pamela Y. Price, Alameda District Attorney
22 7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650
Oakland, CA 94621
CEPDProp65@acgov.org

James Clinchard, El Dorado Assistant
District Attorney
778 Pacific Street
Placerville, CA 95667
EDCDAPROP65@edcda.us

23 Barbara Yook, Calaveras District Attorney
24 891 Mountain Ranch Rd.
San Andreas, CA 95249
Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us

Lisa A. Smittcamp, Fresno District Attorney
2100 Tulare Street
Fresno, CA 93721
consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov

25 Stacey Grassini, Contra Costa Deputy
26 District Attorney
900 Ward Street
Martinez, CA 94553
27 sgrassini@contracostada.org
28

Thomas L. Hardy, Inyo District Attorney
168 North Edwards Street
Independence, CA 93526
inyoda@inyocounty.us

1	Devin Chandler, Lassen Program Coordinator	Anne Marie Schubert, Sacramento District Attorney
2	2950 Riverside Dr	901 G Street
3	Susanville, CA 96130	Sacramento, CA 95814
	dchandler@co.lassen.ca.us	Prop65@sacda.org
4	Lori E. Frugoli, Marin District Attorney	Summer Stephan, San Diego District Attorney
5	3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 145	330 West Broadway
6	San Rafael, CA 94903	San Diego, CA 92101
	consumer@marincounty.gov	SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org
7	Walter W. Wall, Mariposa District Attorney	Mark Ankorn, San Diego Deputy City Attorney
8	P.O. Box 730	1200 Third Avenue
	Mariposa, CA 95338	San Diego, CA 92101
	mcda@mariposacounty.org	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
9	Kimberly Lewis, Merced District Attorney	Henry Lifton, San Francisco Deputy City Attorney
10	550 West Main Street	1390 Market Street, 7th Floor
11	Merced, CA 95340	San Francisco, CA 94102
	Prop65@countyofmerced.com	Prop65@sfcityatty.org
12	Jeannine M. Pacioni, Monterey District Attorney	Alexandra Grayner, San Francisco Assistant District Attorney
13	1200 Aguajito Road	350 Rhode Island Street
14	Monterey, CA 93940	San Francisco, CA 94103
	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us	alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org
15	Allison Haley, Napa District Attorney	Tori Verber Salazar, San Joaquin District Attorney
16	1127 First Street, Suite C	222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202
	Napa, CA 94559	Stockton, CA 95202
	CEPD@countyofnapa.org	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org
17	Clifford H. Newell, Nevada District Attorney	Eric J. Dobroth, San Luis Obispo Deputy District Attorney
18	201 Commercial Street	County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor
19	Nevada City, CA 95959	San Luis Obispo, CA 93408
	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us	edobroth@co.slo.ca.us
20	Morgan Briggs Gire, Placer District Attorney	Christopher Dalbey, Santa Barbara Deputy District Attorney
21	10810 Justice Center Drive	1112 Santa Barbara St.
22	Roseville, CA 95678	Santa Barbara, CA 93101
	prop65@placer.ca.gov	DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us
23	David Hollister, Plumas District Attorney	Nora V. Frimann, Santa Clara City Attorney
24	520 Main St.	200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor
25	Quincy, CA 95971	San Jose, CA 96113
	davidhollister@countyofplumas.com	Proposition65notices@sanjoseca.gov
26	Paul E. Zellerbach, Riverside District Attorney	
27	3072 Orange Street	
28	Riverside, CA 92501	
	Prop65@rivcoda.org	

1 Bud Porter, Supervising Santa Clara, Deputy
2 District Attorney
3 70 W Hedding St
4 San Jose, CA 95110
5 EPU@da.sccgov.org

Phillip J. Cline, Tulare District Attorney
221 S Mooney Blvd
Visalia, CA 95370
Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us

4 Jeffrey S. Rosell, Santa Cruz District
5 Attorney
6 701 Ocean Street
7 Santa Cruz, CA 95060
8 Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us

Gregory D. Totten, Ventura District
Attorney
800 S Victoria Ave
Ventura, CA 93009
daspecialops@ventura.org

7 Jill Ravitch, Sonoma District Attorney
8 600 Administration Drive
9 Santa Rosa, CA 95403
10 ECLD@sonoma-county.org

Jeff W. Reisig, Yolo District Attorney
301 Second Street
Woodland, CA 95695
cfepd@yolocounty.org

10 Todd Spitzer, District Attorney of Orange County
11 300 N Flower St
12 Santa Ana, CA 92703
13 Prop65Notice@ocdapa.org

13 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the
14 foregoing is true and correct.

14 Executed on June 27, 2025 at San Francisco, California.

16 

17 Owen Sutter

SERVICE LIST

District Attorney of Alpine County
P.O. Box 248
Markleeville, CA 96120

District Attorney of Amador County
708 Court St, Ste. 202
Jackson, CA 95642

District Attorney of Butte County
Administration Building
25 County Center Dr, Ste 245
Oroville, CA 95965

District Attorney of Colusa County
310 6th St
Colusa, CA 95932

District Attorney of Del Norte County
450 H St, Ste. 171
Crescent City, CA 95531

District Attorney of Glenn County
P.O. Box 430
Willows, CA 95988

District Attorney of Humboldt County
825 5th St
Eureka, CA 95501

District Attorney of Imperial County
940 W. Main St, Ste. 102
El Centro, CA 92243

District Attorney of Kern County
1215 Truxtun Ave
Bakersfield, CA 93301

District Attorney of Kings County
1400 West Lacey Blvd.
Hanford, CA 93230

District Attorney of Lake County
375 3rd St
Lakeport, CA 95453

District Attorney of Los Angeles County
211 W. Temple St, Ste. 1200
Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210

District Attorney of Madera County
300 South G St, Ste 300,
Madera, CA 93637

District Attorney of Mendocino County
P.O. Box 1000
Ukiah, CA 95482

District Attorney of Modoc County
204 S. Court St, Ste 202
Alturas, CA 96101-4020

District Attorney of Mono County
P.O. Box 2053
Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546

District Attorney of San Benito County
419 Fourth St, 2nd Fl.
Hollister, CA 95023

San Bernardino County
District Attorney's Office
303 W. 3rd St
San Bernardino, CA 92415-0502

District Attorney of San Mateo County
400 County Center, 3rd Fl.
Redwood City, CA 94063

District Attorney of Shasta County
1355 West St
Redding, CA 96001

District Attorney of Sierra County
P.O. Box 457
Downieville, CA 95936

District Attorney of Siskiyou County
311 Fourth St, Rm 204
Yreka, CA 96097

District Attorney of Solano County
675 Texas St, Ste. 4500
Fairfield, CA 94533

District Attorney of Stanislaus County
832 12th St, Ste. 300
Modesto, CA 95354

District Attorney of Sutter County
463 2nd St, Ste 102
Yuba City, CA 95991

District Attorney of Tehama County
444 Oak St, Rm L
Red Bluff, CA 96080

District Attorney of Trinity County
P.O. Box 310
11 Court St
Weaverville, CA 96093

District Attorney of Tuolumne County
423 N Washington St
Sonora, CA 95370

District Attorney of Yuba County
215 Fifth St, Ste 152
Marysville, CA 95901

Los Angeles City Attorney's Office
City Hall East
200 N. Main St, Rm. 800
Los Angeles, CA 90012

President/CEO*
Raley's
500 West Capitol Avenue
West Sacramento, CA 95605

Suzanne L. Monford, CEO*
Cardenas Markets LLC
2501 E. Guasti Road
Ontario, CA 91761